

**Wiley Series in Systems Engineering
and Management**

Andrew P. Sage, Founding Editor

Trade-off Analytics

Creating and Exploring
the System Tradespace



Edited by Gregory S. Parnell

WILEY

TRADE-OFF ANALYTICS

WILEY SERIES IN SYSTEMS ENGINEERING AND MANAGEMENT

Andrew P. Sage, Editor

ANDREW P. SAGE and JAMES D. PALMER
Software Systems Engineering

WILLIAM B. ROUSE
Design for Success: A Human-Centered Approach to Designing Successful Products and Systems

LEONARD ADELMAN
Evaluating Decision Support and Expert System Technology

ANDREW P. SAGE
Decision Support Systems Engineering

YEFIM FASSER and DONALD BRETINER
Process Improvement in the Electronics Industry, Second Edition

WILLIAM B. ROUSE
Strategies for Innovation

ANDREW P. SAGE
Systems Engineering

HORST TEMPELMEIER and HEINRICH KUHN
Flexible Manufacturing Systems: Decision Support for Design and Operation

WILLIAM B. ROUSE
Catalysts for Change: Concepts and Principles for Enabling Innovation

UPING FANG, KEITH W. HIPEL, and D. MARC KILGOUR
Interactive Decision Making: The Graph Model for Conflict Resolution

DAVID A. SCHUM
Evidential Foundations of Probabilistic Reasoning

JENS RASMUSSEN, ANNELISE MARK PEJTERSEN, and LEONARD P. GOODSTEIN
Cognitive Systems Engineering

ANDREW P. SAGE
Systems Management for Information Technology and Software Engineering

ALPHONSE CHAPANIS
Human Factors in Systems Engineering

YACOV Y. HAIMES
Risk Modeling, Assessment, and Management, Third Edition

DENNIS M. SUEDE
The Engineering Design of Systems: Models and Methods, Second Edition

ANDREW P. SAGE and JAMES E. ARMSTRONG, Jr.
Introduction to Systems Engineering

WILLIAM B. ROUSE
Essential Challenges of Strategic Management

YEFIM FASSER and DONALD BRETTNER
Management for Quality in High-Technology Enterprises

THOMAS B. SHERIDAN
Humans and Automation: System Design and Research Issues

ALEXANDER KOSSIAKOFF and WILLIAM N. SWEET
Systems Engineering Principles and Practice

HAROLD R. BOOHER
Handbook of Human Systems Integration

JEFFREY T. POLLOCK and RALPH HODGSON
Adaptive Information: Improving Business Through Semantic Interoperability, Grid Computing, and Enterprise Integration

ALAN L. PORTER and SCOTT W. CUNNINGHAM
Tech Mining: Exploiting New Technologies for Competitive Advantage

REX BROWN
Rational Choice and Judgment: Decision Analysis for the Decider

WILLIAM B. ROUSE and KENNETH R. BOFF (editors)
Organizational Simulation

HOWARD EISNER
Managing Complex Systems: Thinking Outside the Box

STEVE BELL
Lean Enterprise Systems: Using IT for Continuous Improvement

J. JERRY KAUFMAN and ROY WOODHEAD
Stimulating Innovation in Products and Services: With Function Analysis and Mapping

WILLIAM B. ROUSE
Enterprise Transformation: Understanding and Enabling Fundamental Change

JOHN E. GIBSON, WILLIAM T. SCHERER, and WILLIAM F. GIBSON
How to Do Systems Analysis

WILLIAM F. CHRISTOPHER
Holistic Management: Managing What Matters for Company Success

WILLIAM W. ROUSE
People and Organizations: Explorations of Human-Centered Design

MOJAMSHIDI
System of Systems Engineering: Innovations for the Twenty-First Century

ANDREW P. SAGE and WILLIAM B. ROUSE

Handbook of Systems Engineering and Management, Second Edition

JOHN R. CLYMER

Simulation-Based Engineering of Complex Systems, Second Edition

KRAG BROTBY

Information Security Governance: A Practical Development and Implementation Approach

JULIAN TALBOT and MILES JAKEMAN

Security Risk Management Body of Knowledge

SCOTT JACKSON

Architecting Resilient Systems: Accident Avoidance and Survival and Recovery from Disruptions

JAMES A. GEORGE and JAMES A. RODGER

Smart Data: Enterprise Performance Optimization Strategy

YORAM KOREN

The Global Manufacturing Revolution: Product-Process-Business Integration and Reconfigurable Systems

AVNER ENGEL

Verification, Validation, and Testing of Engineered Systems

WILLIAM B. ROUSE (editor)

The Economics of Human Systems Integration: Valuation of Investments in People's Training and Education, Safety and Health, and Work Productivity

ALEXANDER KOSSIAKOFF, WILLIAM N. SWEET, SAM SEYMOUR, and STEVEN M. BIEMER

Systems Engineering Principles and Practice, Second Edition

GREGORY S. PARRELL, PATRICK J. DRISCOLL, and DALE L. HENDERSON (editors)

Decision Making in Systems Engineering and Management, Second Edition

ANDREW P. SAGE and WILLIAM W. ROUSE

Economic Systems Analysis and Assessment: Intensive Systems, Organizations, and Enterprises

BOHDAN W. OPPENHEIM

Lean for Systems Engineering with Lean Enablers for Systems Engineering

LEV M. KLYATIS

Accelerated Reliability and Durability Testing Technology

BJOERN BARTELS, ULRICH ERMEL, MICHAEL PECHT, and PETER SANDBORN
Strategies to the Prediction, Mitigation, and Management of Product Obsolescence

LEVANT YILMAS and TUNCER OREN

Agent-Directed Simulation and Systems Engineering

ELSAYED A. ELSAYED

Reliability Engineering, Second Edition

BEHNAM MALAKOOTI

Operations and Production Systems with Multipme Objectives

MENG-LI SHIU, JUI-CHIN JIANG, and MAO-HSIUNG TU

Quality Strategy for Systems Engineering and Management

ANDREAS OPELT, BORIS GLOGER, WOLFGANG PFARL, and RALF

MITTERMAYER

Agile Contracts: Creating and Managing Successful Projects with Scrum

KINJI MORI

Concept-Oriented Research and Development in Information Technology

KAILASH C. KAPUR and MICHAEL PECHT

Reliability Engineering

MICHAEL TORTORELLA

Reliability, Maintainability, and Supportability: Best Practices for Systems Engineers

DENNIS M. BUEDE and WILLIAM D. MILLER

The Engineering Design of Systems: Models and Methods, Third Edition

JOHN E. GIBSON, WILLIAM T. SCHERER, WILLIAM F. GIBSON, and MICHAEL C. SMITH

How to Do Systems Analysis: Primer and Casebook

GREGORY S. PARNELL, Editor

Trade-off Analytics: Creating and Exploring the System Tradespace

TRADE-OFF ANALYTICS

Creating and Exploring the System Tradespace

Edited by

GREGORY S. PARNELL

WILEY

Copyright © 2017 by John Wiley & Sons, Inc. All rights reserved

Published by John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Hoboken, New Jersey

Published simultaneously in Canada

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning, or otherwise, except as permitted under Section 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act, without either the prior written permission of the Publisher, or authorization through payment of the appropriate per-copy fee to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, (978) 750-8400, fax (978) 750-4470, or on the web at www.copyright.com. Requests to the Publisher for permission should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 111 River Street, Hoboken, NJ 07030, (201) 748-6011, fax (201) 748-6008, or online at <http://www.wiley.com/go/permission>.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and author have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. No warranty may be created or extended by sales representatives or written sales materials. The advice and strategies contained herein may not be suitable for your situation. You should consult with a professional where appropriate. Neither the publisher nor author shall be liable for any loss of profit or any other commercial damages, including but not limited to special, incidental, consequential, or other damages.

For general information on our other products and services or for technical support, please contact our Customer Care Department within the United States at (800) 762-2974, outside the United States at (317) 572-3993 or fax (317) 572-4002.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic formats. For more information about Wiley products, visit our web site at www.wiley.com.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data:

Names: Parnell, Gregory S., editor.

Title: Trade-off analytics : creating and exploring the system tradespace /

[edited by] Gregory S. Parnell.

Description: Hoboken, New Jersey : John Wiley & Sons Inc., [2017] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016023582 | ISBN 9781119237532 (cloth) | ISBN 9781119238300 (epub) | ISBN 9781119237556 (Adobe PDF)

Subjects: LCSH: Systems engineering—Decision making. | Multiple criteria decision making.

Classification: LCC TA168 .T73 2017 | DDC 620.0068/4—dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016023582>

Typeset in 10/12pt TimesLTStd by SPi Global, Chennai, India

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

CONTENTS

List of Contributors	xix
About the Authors	xxi
Foreword	xxxii
Preface	xxxiii
Acknowledgments	xli
About the Companion Website	xlv
1 Introduction to Trade-off Analysis	1
<i>Gregory S. Parnell, Matthew Cilli, Azad M. Madni, and Garry Roedler</i>	
1.1	Introduction, 2
1.2	Trade-off Analyses Throughout the Life Cycle, 3
1.3	Trade-off Analysis to Identify System Value, 3
1.4	Trade-off Analysis to Identify System Uncertainties and Risks, 6
1.5	Trade-off Analyses can Integrate Value and Risk Analysis, 6
1.6	Trade-off Analysis in the Systems Engineering Decision Management Process, 8
1.7	Trade-off Analysis Mistakes of Omission and Commission, 9
1.7.1	Mistakes of Omission, 12
1.7.2	Mistakes of Commission, 15
1.7.3	Impacts of the Trade-Off Analysis Mistakes, 18

1.8	Overview of the Book, 20	
1.8.1	Illustrative Examples and Techniques Used in the Book, 24	
1.9	Key Terms, 24	
1.10	Exercises, 25	
	References, 26	
2	A Conceptual Framework and Mathematical Foundation for Trade-Off Analysis	29
	<i>Gregory S. Parnell, Azad M. Madni, and Robert F. Bordley</i>	
2.1	Introduction, 29	
2.2	Trade-Off Analysis Terms, 30	
2.3	Influence Diagram of the Tradespace, 31	
2.3.1	Stakeholder Needs, System Functions, and Requirements, 33	
2.3.2	Objectives, 33	
2.3.3	System Alternatives, 34	
2.3.4	Uncertainty, 36	
2.3.5	Preferences and Evaluation of Alternatives, 37	
2.3.6	Resource Analysis, 44	
2.3.7	An Integrated Trade-Off Analyses, 44	
2.4	Tradespace Exploration, 46	
2.5	Summary, 46	
2.6	Key Words, 47	
2.7	Exercises, 48	
	References, 48	
3	Quantifying Uncertainty	51
	<i>Robert F. Bordley</i>	
3.1	Sources of Uncertainty in Systems Engineering, 51	
3.2	The Rules of Probability and Human Intuition, 52	
3.3	Probability Distributions, 56	
3.3.1	Calculating Probabilities from Experiments, 56	
3.3.2	Calculating Complex Probabilities from Simpler Probabilities, 58	
3.3.3	Calculating Probabilities Using Parametric Distributions, 59	
3.3.4	Applications of Parametric Probability Distributions, 62	
3.4	Estimating Probabilities, 66	
3.4.1	Using Historical Data, 66	
3.4.2	Using Human Judgment, 68	
3.4.3	Biases in Judgment, 70	
3.5	Modeling Using Probability, 72	
3.5.1	Bayes Nets, 72	
3.5.2	Monte Carlo Simulation, 75	
3.5.3	Monte Carlo Simulation with Dependent Uncertainties, 76	

3.5.4	Monte Carlo Simulation with Partial Information on Output Values, 77	
3.5.5	Variations on Monte Carlo Simulation, 78	
3.5.6	Sensitivity Analysis, 78	
3.6	Summary, 81	
3.7	Key Terms, 81	
3.8	Exercises, 83	
	References, 86	
4	ANALYZING RESOURCES	91
	<i>Edward A. Pohl, Simon R. Goerger, and Kirk Michealson</i>	
4.1	Introduction, 91	
4.2	Resources, 92	
4.2.1	People, 92	
4.2.2	Facilities, 95	
4.2.3	Costs, 95	
4.2.4	Resource Space, 99	
4.3	Cost Analysis, 99	
4.3.1	Cost Estimation, 102	
4.3.2	Cost Estimation Techniques, 108	
4.3.3	Learning Curves, 120	
4.3.4	Net Present Value, 125	
4.3.5	Monte Carlo Simulation, 130	
4.3.6	Sensitivity Analysis, 134	
4.4	Affordability Analysis, 135	
4.4.1	Background, 136	
4.4.2	The Basics of Affordability Analysis Are Not Difficult, 137	
4.4.3	DoD Comparison of Cost Analysis and Affordability Analysis, 138	
4.4.4	Affordability Analysis Definitions, 139	
4.4.5	“Big A” Affordability Analysis Process Guide, 141	
4.5	Key Terms, 147	
4.6	Exercises, 149	
	References, 152	
5	Understanding Decision Management	155
	<i>Matthew Cilli and Gregory S. Parnell</i>	
5.1	Introduction, 155	
5.2	Decision Process Context, 156	
5.3	Decision Process Activities, 157	
5.3.1	Frame Decision, 159	
5.3.2	Develop Objectives and Measures, 163	
5.3.3	Generate Creative Alternatives, 171	

5.3.4	Assess Alternatives via Deterministic Analysis, 180	
5.3.5	Synthesize Results, 183	
5.3.6	Develop Multidimensional Value Model, 187	
5.3.7	Identify Uncertainty and Conduct Probabilistic Analysis, 190	
5.3.8	Assess Impact of Uncertainty, 192	
5.3.9	Improve Alternatives, 196	
5.3.10	Communicating Trade-Offs, 197	
5.3.11	Present Recommendation and Implementation Plan, 197	
5.4	Summary, 199	
5.5	Key Terms, 199	
5.6	Exercises, 200	
	References, 201	
6	Identifying Opportunities	203
<i>Donna H. Rhodes and Simon R. Goerger</i>		
6.1	Introduction, 203	
6.2	Knowledge, 205	
6.2.1	Domain Knowledge, 205	
6.2.2	Technical Knowledge, 205	
6.2.3	Business Knowledge, 205	
6.2.4	Expert Knowledge, 206	
6.2.5	Stakeholder Knowledge, 206	
6.3	Decision Traps, 207	
6.4	Techniques, 210	
6.4.1	Interviews, 210	
6.4.2	Focus Groups, 213	
6.4.3	Surveys, 215	
6.5	Tools, 219	
6.5.1	Concept Map, 219	
6.5.2	System Boundary, 220	
6.5.3	Decision Hierarchy, 220	
6.5.4	Issues List, 221	
6.5.5	Vision Statement, 221	
6.5.6	Influence Diagram, 222	
6.5.7	Selecting Appropriate Tools and Techniques, 223	
6.6	Illustrative Examples, 223	
6.6.1	Commercial, 223	
6.6.2	Defense, 226	
6.7	Key Terms, 228	
6.8	Exercises, 230	
	References, 230	

7 Identifying Objectives and Value Measures	233
<i>Gregory S. Parnell and William D. Miller</i>	
7.1 Introduction, 233	
7.2 Value-Focused Thinking, 234	
7.2.1 Four Major VFT Ideas, 235	
7.2.2 Benefits of VFT, 235	
7.3 Shareholder and Stakeholder Value, 236	
7.3.1 Private Company Example, 237	
7.3.2 Government Agency Example, 237	
7.4 Challenges in Identifying Objectives, 238	
7.5 Identifying the Decision Objectives, 239	
7.5.1 Questions to Help Identify Decision Objectives, 239	
7.5.2 How to Get Answers to the Questions, 240	
7.6 The Financial or Cost Objective, 241	
7.6.1 Financial Objectives for Private Companies, 241	
7.6.2 Cost Objective for Public Organizations, 242	
7.7 Developing Value Measures, 243	
7.8 Structuring Multiple Objectives, 243	
7.8.1 Value Hierarchies, 244	
7.8.2 Techniques for Developing Value Hierarchies, 245	
7.8.3 Value Hierarchy Best Practices, 247	
7.8.4 Cautions about Cost and Risk Objectives, 248	
7.9 Illustrative Examples, 248	
7.9.1 Military Illustrative Example, 248	
7.9.2 Homeland Security Illustrative Example, 250	
7.10 Summary, 250	
7.11 Key Terms, 252	
7.12 Exercises, 253	
References, 255	
8 DEVELOPING AND EVALUATING ALTERNATIVES	257
<i>C. Robert Kenley, Clifford Whitcomb, and Gregory S. Parnell</i>	
8.1 Introduction, 257	
8.2 Overview of Decision-making, Creativity, and Teams, 258	
8.2.1 Approaches to Decision-Making, 258	
8.2.2 Cognitive Methods for Creating Alternatives, 260	
8.2.3 Key Concepts for Building and Operating Teams, 260	
8.3 Alternative Development Techniques, 263	
8.3.1 Structured Creativity Methods, 263	
8.3.2 Morphological Box, 266	

8.3.3	Pugh Method for Alternative Generation,	270
8.3.4	TRIZ for Alternative Development,	271
8.4	Assessment of Alternative Development Techniques,	275
8.5	Alternative Evaluation Techniques,	276
8.5.1	Decision-Theory-Based Approaches,	276
8.5.2	Pugh Method for Alternative Evaluation,	276
8.5.3	Axiomatic Approach to Design (AAD),	277
8.5.4	TRIZ for Alternative Evaluation,	280
8.5.5	Design of Experiments (DOE),	280
8.5.6	Taguchi Approach,	282
8.5.7	Quality Function Deployment (QFD),	283
8.5.8	Analytic Hierarchy Process AHP,	287
8.6	Assessment of Alternative Evaluation Techniques,	290
8.7	Key Terms,	290
8.8	Exercises,	290
	References,	293
9	An Integrated Model for Trade-Off Analysis	297
	<i>Alexander D. MacCalman, Gregory S. Parnell, and Sam Savage</i>	
9.1	Introduction,	297
9.2	Conceptual Design Example,	298
9.3	Integrated Approach Influence Diagram,	300
9.3.1	Decision Nodes,	300
9.3.2	Uncertainty Nodes,	303
9.3.3	Constant Node,	310
9.3.4	Value Nodes,	314
9.4	Other Types of Trade-Off Analysis,	322
9.5	Simulation Tools,	322
9.5.1	Monte Carlo Simulation Proprietary Add-Ins,	324
9.5.2	The Discipline of Probability Management,	324
9.5.3	SIPmath TM Tool in Native Excel,	324
9.5.4	Model Building Steps,	325
9.6	Summary,	329
9.7	Key Terms,	330
9.8	Exercises,	331
	References,	335
10	EXPLORING CONCEPT TRADE-OFFS	337
	<i>Azad M. Madni and Adam M. Ross</i>	
10.1	Introduction,	337
10.1.1	Key Concepts, Concept Trade-Offs, and Concept Exploration,	341
10.2	Defining the Concept Space and System Concept of Operations,	345
10.3	Exploring the Concept Space,	346

10.3.1	Storytelling-Enabled Tradespace Exploration, 346
10.3.2	Decisions and Outcomes, 347
10.3.3	Contingent Decision-Making, 347
10.4	Trade-off Analysis Frameworks, 348
10.5	Tradespace and System Design Life Cycle, 349
10.6	From Point Trade-offs to Tradespace Exploration, 351
10.7	Value-based Multiattribute Tradespace Analysis, 351
10.7.1	Tradespace Exploration and Sensitivity Analysis, 353
10.7.2	Tradespace Exploration and Uncertainty, 354
10.7.3	Tradespace Exploration with Spiral Development, 356
10.7.4	Tradespace Exploration in Relation to Optimization and Decision Theory, 356
10.8	Illustrative Example, 359
10.8.1	Step 1: Determine Key Decision-Makers, 359
10.8.2	Step 2: Scope and Bound the Mission, 360
10.8.3	Step 3: Elicit Attributes and Utilities (Preference Capture), 360
10.8.4	Step 4: Define Design Vector Elements (Concept Generation), 362
10.8.5	Step 5: Develop Model(s) (Evaluation), 362
10.8.6	Step 6: Generate the Tradespace (Computation), 364
10.8.7	Step 7: Explore the Tradespace (Analysis and Synthesis), 365
10.9	Conclusions, 369
10.10	Key Terms, 371
10.11	Exercises, 372
	References, 372

11 Architecture Evaluation Framework 377

James N. Martin

11.1	Introduction, 377
11.1.1	Architecture in the Decision Space, 378
11.1.2	Architecture Evaluation, 379
11.1.3	Architecture Views and Viewpoints, 380
11.1.4	Stakeholders, 382
11.1.5	Stakeholder Concerns, 382
11.1.6	Architecture versus Design, 383
11.1.7	On the Uses of Architecture, 384
11.1.8	Standardizing on an Architecture Evaluation Strategy, 384
11.2	Key Considerations in Evaluating Architectures, 385
11.2.1	Plan-Driven Evaluation Effort, 386
11.2.2	Objectives-Driven Evaluation, 387
11.2.3	Assessment versus Analysis, 387
11.3	Architecture Evaluation Elements, 389
11.3.1	Architecture Evaluation Approach, 389
11.3.2	Architecture Evaluation Objectives, 390
11.3.3	Evaluation Approach Examples, 391

11.3.4	Value Assessment Methods, 391	
11.3.5	Value Assessment Criteria, 393	
11.3.6	Architecture Analysis Methods, 394	
11.4	Steps in an Architecture Evaluation Process, 396	
11.5	Example Evaluation Taxonomy, 398	
11.5.1	Business Impact Factors, 398	
11.5.2	Mission Impact Factors, 398	
11.5.3	Architecture Attributes, 399	
11.6	Summary, 400	
11.7	Key Terms, 400	
11.8	Exercises, 402	
	References, 402	
12	Exploring the Design Space	405
<i>Clifford Whitcomb and Paul Beery</i>		
12.1	Introduction, 405	
12.2	Example 1: Liftboat, 406	
12.2.1	Liftboat Fractional Factorial Design of Experiments, 406	
12.2.2	Liftboat Design Trade-Off Space, 409	
12.2.3	Liftboat Uncertainty Analysis, 411	
12.2.4	Liftboat Example Summary, 411	
12.3	Example 2: Cruise Ship Design, 411	
12.3.1	Cruise Ship Taguchi Design of Experiments, 411	
12.3.2	Cruise Ship Design Trade-Off Space, 412	
12.3.3	Cruise Ship Example Summary, 416	
12.4	Example 3: NATO Naval Surface Combatant Ship, 417	
12.4.1	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Stakeholder Need, 418	
12.4.2	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Box–Behnken Design of Experiments, 420	
12.4.3	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Cost-Effectiveness Trade-Off, 421	
12.4.4	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Design Tradespace, 421	
12.4.5	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Design Trade-Off, 422	
12.4.6	NATO Surface Combatant Ship Trade-Off Summary, 430	
12.5	Key Terms, 431	
12.6	Exercises, 433	
	References, 435	
13	SUSTAINMENT RELATED MODELS AND TRADE STUDIES	437
<i>John E. MacCarthy and Andres Vargas</i>		
13.1	Introduction, 437	
13.2	Availability Modeling and Trade Studies, 439	
13.2.1	FMDS Background, 439	
13.2.2	FMDS Availability Trade Studies, 449	

13.2.3	Section Synopsis, 453	
13.3	Sustainment Life Cycle Cost Modeling and Trade Studies ¹⁴ , 454	
13.3.1	The Total System Life Cycle Model, 454	
13.3.2	The O&S Cost Model, 456	
13.3.3	Life Cycle Cost Trade Study, 459	
13.4	Optimization in Availability Trade Studies, 464	
13.4.1	Setting Up the Optimization Problem, 464	
13.4.2	Instantiating the Optimization Model, 465	
13.4.3	Discussion of the Optimization Model Results, 468	
13.4.4	Deterministic Sensitivity Analysis, 469	
13.5	Monte Carlo Modeling, 471	
13.5.1	Input Probability Distributions for the Monte Carlo Model, 471	
13.5.2	Monte Carlo Simulation Results, 472	
13.5.3	Stochastic Sensitivity Analysis, 473	
13.6	Chapter Summary, 475	
13.7	Key Terms, 476	
13.8	Exercises, 478	
	References, 482	
14	Performing Programmatic Trade-Off Analyses	483
	<i>Gina Guillaume-Joseph and John E. MacCarthy</i>	
14.1	Introduction, 483	
14.2	System Acceptance Decisions and Trade Studies, 485	
14.2.1	Acceptance Decision Framework, 486	
14.2.2	Calculating the Confidence That a System Is “Good”, 491	
14.2.3	Acceptance Test Design and Trade Studies, 493	
14.2.4	A “Delay, Fix, and Test” Cost Model, 499	
14.2.5	The Integrated Decision Model, 504	
14.2.6	Conclusions, 511	
14.3	Product Cancelation Decision Trade Study, 512	
14.3.1	Introduction, 512	
14.3.2	Significance, 513	
14.3.3	Defining Failure, 514	
14.3.4	Developing the Predictive Model, 519	
14.3.5	Research Results, 522	
14.3.6	Model Implementation In Industry, 528	
14.3.7	Predictive Model Deployment in Industry, 530	
14.3.8	When the Decision Has Been Made to Cancel the System, 536	
14.3.9	Conclusion, 537	
14.4	Product Retirement Decision Trade Study, 538	
14.4.1	Introduction, 538	
14.4.2	Legacy HR Systems, 539	
14.4.3	The US NAVY Retirement and Decommission Program for Nuclear-Powered Vessels, 544	

14.4.4	Decision Analysis for Decommissioning Offshore Oil and Gas Platforms in California, 551	
14.4.5	System Retirement and Decommissioning Strategy, 559	
14.4.6	Conclusion, 561	
14.5	Key Terms, 562	
14.6	Exercises, 564	
	References, 566	
15	SUMMARY AND FUTURE TRENDS	571
	<i>Gregory S. Parnell and Simon R. Goerger</i>	
15.1	Introduction, 571	
15.2	Major Trade-Off Analysis Themes, 572	
15.2.1	Use Standard Systems Engineering Terminology, 572	
15.2.2	Avoid the Mistakes of Omission and Commission, 572	
15.2.3	Use a Decision Management Framework, 572	
15.2.4	Use Decision Analysis as the Mathematical Foundation, 573	
15.2.5	Explicitly Define the Decision Opportunity, 573	
15.2.6	Identify and Structure Decision Objectives and Measures, 574	
15.2.7	Identify Creative, Doable Alternatives, 574	
15.2.8	Use the Most Appropriate Modeling and Simulation Technique for the Life Cycle Stage, 575	
15.2.9	Include Resource Analysis in the Trade-Off Analysis, 575	
15.2.10	Explicitly Consider Uncertainty, 575	
15.2.11	Identify the Cost, Value, Schedule, and Risk Drivers, 575	
15.2.12	Provide an Integrated Framework for Cost, Value, and Risk Analyses, 576	
15.3	Future of Trade-Off Analysis, 576	
15.3.1	Education and Training of Systems Engineers, 577	
15.3.2	Systems Engineering Methodologies and Tools, 577	
15.3.3	Emergent Tradespace Factors, 580	
15.4	Summary, 581	
	References, 581	
Index		583

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Paul Beery, Systems Engineering Department, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, USA

Robert F. Bordley, Systems Engineering and Design, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI, USA; Booz Allen Hamilton, Troy, MI, USA

Matthew Cilli, U.S. Army Armament Research Development and Engineering Center (ARDEC), Systems Analysis Division, Picatinny, NJ, USA

Simon R. Goerger, Institute for Systems Engineering Research, Information Technology Laboratory (ITL), U.S. Army Engineer Research and Development Center (ERDC), Vicksburg, MS, USA

Gina Guillaume-Joseph, MITRE Corporation, McLean, VA, USA

Alexander D. MacCalman, Department of Systems Engineering, United States Military Academy, West Point, NY, USA

John E. MacCarthy, Systems Engineering Education Program, Institute for Systems Research, University of Maryland, College Park, MD, USA

Azad M. Madni, Department of Astronautical Engineering, Systems Architecting and Engineering and Astronautical Engineering, Viterbi School of Engineering, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA, USA

James N. Martin, The Aerospace Corporation, El Segundo, CA, USA

Kirk Michealson, Tackle Solutions, LLC, Chesapeake, VA, USA

William D. Miller, Innovative Decisions, Inc., Vienna, VA, USA

Gregory S. Parnell, Department of Industrial Engineering, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

Edward A. Pohl, Department of Industrial Engineering, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

Donna H. Rhodes, Sociotechnical Systems Research Center, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA, USA

C. Robert Kenley, School of Industrial Engineering, Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN, USA

Garry Roedler, Corporate Engineering LM Fellow, Engineering Outreach Program Manager, Lockheed Martin Corporation King of Prussia, PA

Adam M. Ross, Systems Engineering Advancement Research Initiative (SEArI), Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), Cambridge, MA, USA

Sam Savage, School of Engineering, Stanford University, Stanford, CA, USA

Andres Vargas, Department of Industrial Engineering, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

Clifford Whitcomb, Systems Engineering Department, Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, Monterey, CA, USA

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Gregory S. Parnell is Director, M.S. in Operations Management and Research Professor in the Department of Industrial Engineering at the University of Arkansas. He teaches systems engineering, decision analysis, operations management, and IE design courses. He coedited Decision Making for Systems Engineering and Management, Wiley Series in Systems Engineering, 2nd Ed, Wiley & Sons Inc., 2011, and cowrote the Wiley & Sons Handbook of Decision Analysis, 2013. Dr Parnell has taught at West Point, the United States Air Force Academy, Virginia Commonwealth University, and the Air Force Institute of Technology. He is a fellow of the International Committee on Systems Engineering (INCOSE), the Institute for Operations Research & Management Science, Military Operations Research Society, the Society for Decision Professionals, and the Lean Systems Society. During his Air Force career, he served in a variety of R&D positions and operations research positions including at the Pentagon where he led two analysis divisions supporting senior Air Force leadership. He is a retired Colonel in the US Air Force. Dr Parnell received a B.S. in Aerospace Engineering from the University of Buffalo, an M.E. in Industrial & Systems Engineering from the University of Florida, an M.S. in Systems Management from the University of Southern California, and a Ph.D. in Engineering-Economic Systems from Stanford University.

Robert F. Bordley is an adjunct professor of decision analysis and systems engineering at the University of Michigan and a full-time consultant for Booz Allen Hamilton. Bob was formerly technical Fellow at General Motors and a Program Director at the National Science Foundation. His Ph.D., M.S., and MBA in Operations Research are from the University of California, Berkeley with an M.S. in Systems Science, B.S. in Physics, and B.A. in Public Policy from Michigan State University. He is an INCOSE-certified expert systems engineering professional (ESEP), an

INFORMS-certified analytic professional (CAP), a professional statistician (PStat), and a certified Project Management Professional (PMP). Bob is a Fellow of the Institute for Operations Research and Management Sciences, a Fellow of the American Statistical Association, and a Fellow of the Society of Decision Professionals. Bob also received the 2004 Best Decision Analysis Publication Award. At the National Science Foundation, he served as Program Director for Decision, Risk and Management Sciences. As Technical Fellow at General Motors, he received GM's Chairman Award, President's Council Award, Research Award of Excellence, GM's Engineering Award of Excellence, and UAW-GM Quality Award. Bob led the mission analysis group in Project Trilby, which helped launch GM's vehicle systems engineering effort as well as its R&D portfolio management group. Bob was also a Technical Director on GM's corporate strategy staff and served as internal consultant to GM's marketing, product planning, and quality engineering staffs. At Booz Allen Hamilton, Bob supports requirements management and concept selection for the Army.

Matthew Cilli received his Ph.D. in Systems Engineering from Stevens Institute of Technology in Hoboken, NJ, and leads an analytics group at the US Army's Armament Research Development and Engineering Center (ARDEC) in Picatinny, NJ. His research interests are focused on improving strategic decision-making through the integrated application of holistic thinking and analytics. Prior to his current position, Dr Cilli accumulated over 20 years of experience developing proposals, securing resources, and leading effective technology development programs for the US Army. Dr Cilli graduated from Villanova University, Villanova, PA, with a Bachelor of Electrical Engineering and a Minor in Mathematics in May 1989. He is also a graduate of the Polytechnic University, Brooklyn, NY, with a Master of Science – Electrical Engineering received in January 1992 and in May 1998, graduated from the University of Pennsylvania, Wharton Business School, Philadelphia, PA, with a Masters of Technology Management.

Simon R. Goerger is the ERDC Director of the Institute for Systems Engineering Research (ISER) at the Information Technology Laboratory (ITL) of the Engineer Research and Development Center (ERDC) in Vicksburg, MS. He has been an Operations Research Analyst with the US Army Corps of Engineers since 2012. Prior to working for the Corps of Engineers, he was a Colonel in the US Army serving as the Director of the Department of Defense Readiness Reporting System (DRRS) Implementation Office (DIO). Simultaneously, he served as Senior Defense Readiness Analyst in the Office of the Undersecretary of Defense (Personnel and Readiness). Simon has served as an Assistant Professor and the Director of the Operations Research Center of Excellence in the Department of Systems Engineering at the United States Military Academy, West Point, NY, before deploying to serve as the Joint Multinational Networks Division Chief, Coalition Forces Land Combatant Command/US Army Central Command, Kuwait. He received his Bachelor of Science from the United States Military Academy, his Master of Science (M.S.) in National Security Strategy from the National War College, and his M.S. in Computer Science and Doctorate of Philosophy in Modeling and Simulations from the Naval Postgraduate School. He is a board member for the Military Operations Research Society. His

research interests include decision analysis, systems modeling, tradespace analysis, and combat modeling and simulations.

Dr Gina Guillaume-Joseph is an Information Systems Engineer at The MITRE Corporation in McLean, Virginia. In her current role, she acts as a trusted advisor to senior leadership in Federal Agencies by partnering with them to design enhancements to their work systems. Dr Guillaume-Joseph's work has led to improvements that allow the systems and processes to operate more efficiently and effectively in fulfillment of specific functions. Her various roles have included project manager, software developer, test engineer, and quality assurance engineer within the private, government consulting, nonprofit, and telecommunications arenas. Dr Guillaume-Joseph is President of the INCOSE Washington Metro Area (WMA) Chapter. Dr Guillaume-Joseph has a strong record of success based on direct personal contributions. She leads and develops teams that are adaptive, flexible, and highly responsive in the exceptionally dynamic environment of Government support. Her accomplishments and successes are based on strong program performance, leadership discipline, a commitment to developing relevant, innovative and adaptive solutions, and a vigilant focus on best value solutions for her clients. Dr Guillaume-Joseph has advanced knowledge of software development lifecycle activities, such as agile, waterfall, iterative, incremental, and associated processes including planning, requirements management, design and development, testing, and deployment. Her strong communication skills make her adept at conveying specialized technical information to nontechnical audiences. Dr Guillaume-Joseph received her B.A. in Computer Science from Boston College and M.S. in Information Technology Systems from the University of Maryland. She obtained her Ph.D. in Systems Engineering from George Washington University with a topic focused on Predicting Software Project Failure Outcomes using Predictive Analytics and Modeling.

C. Robert Kenley is an Associate Professor of Engineering Practice in Purdue's School of Industrial Engineering in West Lafayette, IN. He teaches courses in systems engineering at Purdue and has over 30 years of experience in industry, academia, and government as a practitioner, consultant, and researcher in systems engineering. He has published papers on systems requirements, technology readiness assessment and forecasting, Bayes nets, applied meteorology, the impacts of nuclear power plants on employment, agent-based simulation, and model-based systems engineering. Professor Kenley holds a Bachelor of Science in Management from Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), a Master of Science in Statistics from Purdue University, and a Doctor of Philosophy in Engineering-Economic Systems from Stanford University.

Azad M. Madni is a Professor of Astronautical Engineering and the Technical Director of the multidisciplinary Systems Architecting and Engineering (SAE) Program at the University of Southern California's Viterbi School of Engineering. He is also a Professor of USC's Keck School of Medicine and Rossier School of Education. Dr Madni is the founder and Chairman of Intelligent Systems Technology, Inc., a high-tech company specializing in modeling, simulation, and gaming technologies for education and training. His research has been sponsored by several

prominent government agencies including DARPA, DHS S&T, MDA, DTRA, ONR, AFOSR, AFRL, ARI, RDECOM, NIST, DOE, and NASA, as well as major aerospace companies including Boeing, Northrop Grumman, and Raytheon. He is the Co-Editor-in-Chief of Engineered Resilient Systems: Challenges and Opportunities in the 21st Century, Procedia Computer Science, 2014. His recent awards include the 2011 INCOSE Pioneer Award and the 2014 Lifetime Achievement Award from INCOSE-LA. He is a Fellow of AAAS, AIAA, IEEE, INCOSE, SDPS, and IETE. He is the Strategic Advisor of the INCOSE Systems Engineering Journal. He received his B.S., M.S., and Ph.D. degrees from the University of California, Los Angeles. He is also a graduate of AEA/Stanford Executive Institute for senior executives.

Alexander D. MacCalman is an Army Special Forces Officer in the Operations Research System Analyst Functional Area and has a Masters in Operations Research and a Ph.D. in Modeling and Simulations from the Naval Postgraduate School. He served in various assignments within the Special Operations and Army Analytical communities. He is currently an Assistant Professor in the Department of Systems Engineering at the United States Military Academy and works as the Systems Engineering Program Director. His research interests are in simulation experiments and how they can inform decision analysis and trade decisions.

John MacCarthy is currently serving as the Director of the Systems Engineering Education Program at the University of Maryland's Institute for Systems Research (College Park). Prior to taking this position, he completed a 28-year career as a systems engineer that included serving as a research staff member at the Institute for Defense Analyses, a senior technology and policy advisor for a senior government executive, as well as a variety of systems engineering leadership positions within Northrop Grumman and TRW (e.g., Senior Systems Engineer/Manager, Lead Systems Engineer, Manager of Proposal Operations, Deputy Director of the Center for Advanced Technology, and others). He has extensive experience in applying the full range of systems engineering processes to diverse domains that included very large defense systems and system of systems, a national nuclear waste disposal system, and a number of smaller state and local government systems. During his last 8 years in the industry, Dr MacCarthy taught a variety of graduate-level systems engineering courses as an Adjunct Professor at the University of Maryland, Baltimore County. He began his career as an Assistant Professor of physics at Muhlenberg College. He holds a Ph.D. in Physics from the University of Notre Dame, an M.S. in Systems Engineering from George Mason University, and a B.A. in Physics from Carleton College. His professional experience and interests include systems engineering; systems analysis, modeling and simulation; communications and sensor networks; sustainment engineering; life cycle cost analysis; the acquisition process; and science and engineering education.

James N. Martin is a Principal Engineer with The Aerospace Corporation. He teaches courses for The Aerospace Institute on architecting and systems engineering. Dr Martin is an enterprise architect and systems engineer developing solutions for information systems and space systems. He previously worked for Raytheon Systems Company as a lead systems engineer and architect on airborne and satellite

communications networks. He has also worked at AT&T Bell Labs on wireless telecommunications products and underwater fiber optic transmission products. His book, *Systems Engineering Guidebook*, was published by CRC Press in 1996. He is an INCOSE Fellow and was leader of the Standards Technical Committee. Dr Martin is the founder and current leader of INCOSE's Systems Science Working Group. He received from INCOSE the Founders Award for his long and distinguished achievements in the field. Dr Martin was a key author on the BKCASE project in development of the SE Body of Knowledge (SEBOK). His main SEBOK contribution was the articles on Enterprise Systems Engineering. Dr Martin led the working group responsible for developing ANSI/EIA 632, a US national standard that defines the processes for engineering a system. He is the INCOSE representative to ISO for international standards on architecture, one of which is dealing with architecture evaluation, the topic of the chapter he wrote for this book. Dr Martin received his Ph.D. from George Mason University in Enterprise Architecture as well as a BS from Texas A&M University and an M.S. from Stanford University.

Kirk Michealson is the President of Tackle Solutions, LLC, a consulting firm for operations research analysis, project management, and training. He is an Operations Research Analyst, Fellow of the Military Operations Research Society (MORS), Lean Six Sigma Black Belt, retired Naval Officer, and an Adjunct Professor for the University of Arkansas' M.S. in Operations Management program teaching Decision Support Tools, Analytics, and Decision Models. He has degrees in Operations Research, graduating with a B.S. from the United States Naval Academy and an M.S. from the Naval Postgraduate School. As a MORS Fellow, he leads the Affordability Analysis Community of Practice developing an affordability analysis process for government and industry and received the Clayton J. Thomas Award for lifetime achievement as an Operations Research Practitioner. Kirk was formerly a technical Fellow for Operations Research Analysis at Lockheed Martin where he was responsible for designing an Operations Analysis (OA) Practitioner's Success Profile and Competency Model determining the necessary skills and expertise to be a successful OA at Lockheed Martin and developing the corporate-wide experimentation process as the corporation's experimentation lead. Kirk is a retired Commander in the US Navy, and during his naval career, he was a surface warfare officer serving on ships and in various operations research positions supporting senior Navy and Department of Defense leadership.

William D. Miller is Executive Principal Analyst at Innovative Decisions, Inc. and adjunct professor at Stevens Institute of Technology in the School of Systems and Enterprises. He teaches courses in systems engineering fundamentals, system architecture and design, and systems integration. He coauthored with Dennis M. Buede *The Engineering Design of Systems: Models and Methods*, 3rd Ed, Wiley Series in Systems Engineering, Wiley & Sons Inc., 2016. He contributed content for *Systems Engineering: Coping with Complexity*, Prentice Hall Europe 1998, by Richard Stevens, Peter Brook, Ken Jackson, and Stuart Arnold. Mr Miller has over 40 years of professional experience as an engineer, manager, and consultant in the conceptualization and engineering of communications and information technologies, products, and services. His systems engineering work has encompassed resource

allocation, R&D priorities, strategic planning, trade studies, requirements definition, system modeling, system design, system acquisition, system development, system integration, and system test. He previously worked at Bell Labs and AT&T in systems integration of telecommunications systems and services as well as specific developments of wireless and fiber optic technologies. He is the editor-in-chief of *INCOSE INSIGHT* systems engineering practitioner's magazine, former INCOSE Technical Director, and was elected INCOSE secretary for several terms. He is a Life Member of the IEEE. Mr Miller received B.S. and M.S. degrees in electrical engineering from the Pennsylvania State University.

Edward A. Pohl is a Professor and holder of the 21st Professorship in the Department of Industrial Engineering at the University of Arkansas. Prior to his appointment as Department Head, Ed served as the Director of the Operations Management Program, the largest graduate program at the University of Arkansas. Ed currently serves as Director of the Center for Innovation in Healthcare Logistics (CIHL), Codirector for the Emerging Institute for Advanced Data and Analytics at the University of Arkansas, and the Director of Distance Education in the College of Engineering. He has participated and led several reliability, risk, and supply chain related research efforts at the University of Arkansas. Before coming to Arkansas, Ed spent 20 years in the United States Air Force, where he served in a variety of engineering, analysis, and academic positions during his career. Previous assignments include the Deputy Director of the Operations Research Center at the United States Military Academy, Operations Analyst in the Office of the Secretary of Defense where he performed independent cost schedule, performance, and risk assessments on Major DoD acquisition programs, and as a munitions logistics manager at the Air Force Operational Test Center. Ed received his Ph.D. in Systems and Industrial Engineering from the University of Arizona. He holds an M.S. in Systems Engineering from the Air Force Institute of Technology, and an M.S. in Reliability Engineering from the University of Arizona, an M.S. in Engineering Management from the University of Dayton, and a B.S. in Electrical Engineering from Boston University. His primary research interests are in reliability, engineering optimization, supply chain risk analysis, decision-making, and quality. Ed is a Fellow of IIE, a Senior Member of IEEE and ASQ, and a member of ASEM and INCOSE.

Donna H. Rhodes is a principal research scientist and senior lecturer at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and director of the Systems Engineering Advancement Research Initiative (SEArI), a research group focused on advancing theories, methods, and practice of systems engineering applied to complex sociotechnical systems. She conducts research and consults on innovative approaches and methods for architecting complex systems and enterprises, designing for uncertain futures, and creating anticipatory capacity in enterprises. During her prior industry career, Dr Rhodes held senior management positions at IBM, Lockheed Martin, and Lucent. She has been very much involved in the evolution of the systems engineering field, including corporate education and development of several university graduate programs. She has served on numerous industry, academic, and government advisory boards focused on advancement of systems practice and education, as well as on study panels for issues of national and international importance. Dr Rhodes is a

Past President and Fellow of the International Council on Systems Engineering (INCOSE). She is a recipient of the INCOSE Founders Award and associate editor of the INCOSE journal Systems Engineering. She received her Ph.D. in Systems Science from the T.J. Watson School of Engineering at Binghamton University.

Garry Roedler is a Fellow and the Engineering Outreach Program Manager for Lockheed Martin and the President-elect for the International Council on Systems Engineering (INCOSE). His systems engineering (SE) experience spans the full life cycle and includes technical leadership roles in both programs and systems engineering business functions. Garry holds degrees in mathematics education and mechanical engineering from Temple University and the ESEP certification from INCOSE. Garry is an INCOSE Fellow, author of numerous publications and presentations, and the recipient of many awards, including the INCOSE Founders Award, Best SE Journal Article, IEEE Golden Core, Lockheed Martin Technical Leadership Award, and Lockheed Martin NOVA Award. His other leadership roles across many technical organizations include Past Chair of the INCOSE Corporate Advisory Board; member of the INCOSE Board of Directors; steering group member for the National Defense Industrial Association Systems Engineering Division; working group chair for the IEEE Joint Working Group for DoD Systems Engineering Standardization; editor of ISO/IEC/IEEE 15288, Systems Life Cycle Processes, and several other standards; and key editor roles in the development of the Systems Engineering Body of Knowledge (SEBoK) and the INCOSE Systems Engineering Handbook. This unique set of roles has enabled Garry to influence the technical coevolution and consistency of these key SE resources.

Adam M. Ross is a senior innovator at The Perduco Group and cofounder and former lead research scientist for the MIT SEArI, a research group focused on advancing the theories, methods, and effective practice of systems engineering applied to complex sociotechnical systems through collaborative research with industry and government. Dr Ross has published over 90 papers in the areas of space systems design, systems engineering, and tradespace exploration. He has received numerous paper awards, including the Systems Engineering 2008 Outstanding Journal Paper of the Year. He has led over 15 years of research and development of novel systems engineering methods, frameworks, and techniques for evaluating and valuing system tradespaces and the “ilities” across alternative futures during early phase design. He uses a transdisciplinary approach, leveraging techniques from engineering design, operations research, behavioral economics, and interactive data visualization. He serves on technical committees with both AIAA and IEEE and is recognized as a leading expert in system tradespace exploration and change-related “ilities.” He consults for government agencies, applying analytic techniques for decision support and optimization for acquisition planning. Application domains have included civil transportation, defense and civil aerospace, and commercial and defense maritime systems. Dr Ross holds a dual bachelor’s degree in Physics and Astrophysics from Harvard University, two master’s degrees in Aeronautics and Astronautics Engineering and Technology & Policy from MIT, as well as a doctoral degree in Engineering Systems from MIT.

Sam Savage is the author of “The Flaw of Averages: Why We Underestimate Risk in the Face of Uncertainty” (John Wiley & Sons, 2009, 2012), in which he defines the discipline of probability management. He is also the inventor of the SIP, a data structure that allows simulations to communicate with each other. Dr Savage has been a Consulting Professor in the School of Engineering at Stanford University since 1990 and taught at the Graduate School of Business at the University of Chicago since 1974. He is also a Fellow of the Judge Business School at Cambridge University. In 2012, he incorporated ProbabilityManagement.org, as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit that has been cited in the MIT Sloan Management Review for “improving communication of uncertainty.” He serves as its Executive Director and is joined on the board by Harry Markowitz, Nobel Laureate in Economics. Sponsoring organizations include Chevron, General Electric, Lockheed Martin, and Wells Fargo Bank. Dr Savage holds a Ph.D. in the area of computational complexity from Yale University.

Clifford Whitcomb is a Professor in the Systems Engineering Department at the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, CA. Dr Whitcomb’s research interests include design thinking, model-based systems engineering, naval construction and engineering, and leadership, communication, and interpersonal skills development for engineers. He is the coauthor of “Effective Interpersonal and Team Communication Skills for Engineers” published by John Wiley and Sons and has published several other textbook chapters. He is a principal investigator for the US Navy Office of Naval Research, Office of the Joint Staff, Office of the Secretary of the Navy, and the Veteran’s Health Administration. He is an INCOSE Fellow, has served on the INCOSE Board of Directors, and was a Lean Six Sigma Master Black Belt for Northrop Grumman Ship Systems. Dr Whitcomb was previously the Northrop Grumman Ship Systems Endowed Chair in Shipbuilding and Engineering in the department of Naval Architecture and Marine Engineering at the University of New Orleans, a senior lecturer in the System Design and Management (SDM) program at MIT, as well as an Associate Professor in the Ocean Engineering Department, at MIT. Dr Whitcomb is also a retired naval officer, having served 23 years as a submarine warfare officer and Engineering Duty Officer. He earned his B.S. in Engineering from the University of Washington, Seattle, WA, in 1984, an Engineer degree in Naval Engineering and S.M. in Electrical Engineering and Computer Science from MIT in 1992, and Ph.D. in Mechanical Engineering from the University of Maryland, College Park, MD, in 1998.

Paul T. Beery is a Faculty Associate for Research in the Systems Engineering Department at the Naval Postgraduate School. He has a Masters in Systems Engineering Analysis from Naval Postgraduate School and is working toward his doctoral degree in Systems Engineering at the Naval Postgraduate School. His research interests are the design and analysis of complex systems, simulation analysis, and the applications of advances in design of experiments.

Andres Vargas is a research assistant and graduate student in the Department of Industrial Engineering at the University of Arkansas. His research interests are focused on decision analysis, network optimization, and supply chain transportation