



THE HOLY SPIRIT
AND CHRISTIAN
FORMATION

Multidisciplinary Perspectives

Edited by
Diane J. Chandler

**Charis**
CHRISTIANITY & RENEWAL —
INTERDISCIPLINARY STUDIES



Christianity and Renewal - Interdisciplinary Studies

Series Editors

Wolfgang Vondey
Department of Theology and Religion
University of Birmingham
Birmingham, UK

Amos Yong
School of Intercultural Studies
Fuller Theological Seminary
Pasadena, California, USA

Aim of the series

Christianity and Renewal - Interdisciplinary Studies provides a forum for scholars from a variety of disciplinary perspectives, various global locations, and a range of Christian ecumenical and religious traditions to explore issues at the intersection of the pentecostal, charismatic, and other renewal movements and related phenomena, including: the transforming and renewing work of the Holy Spirit in Christian traditions, cultures, and creation; the traditions, beliefs, interpretation of sacred texts, and scholarship of the renewal movements; the religious life, including the spirituality, ethics, history, and liturgical and other practices, and spirituality of the renewal movements; the social, economic, political, transnational, and global implications of renewal movements; methodological, analytical, and theoretical concerns at the intersection of Christianity and renewal; intra-Christian and interreligious comparative studies of renewal and revitalization movements; other topics connecting to the theme of Christianity and renewal. Authors are encouraged to examine the broad scope of religious phenomena and their interpretation through the methodological, hermeneutical, and historiographical lens of renewal in contemporary Christianity. Under the general topic of thoughtful reflection on Christianity and renewal, the series includes two different kinds of books: (1) monographs that allow for in-depth pursuit, carefully argued, and meticulously documented research on a particular topic that explores issues in Christianity and renewal; and (2) edited collections that allow scholars from a variety of disciplines to interact under a broad theme related to Christianity and renewal. In both kinds, the series encourages discussion of traditional pentecostal and charismatic studies, reexamination of established religious doctrine and practice, and explorations into new fields of study related to renewal movements. Interdisciplinarity will feature in the series both in terms of two or more disciplinary approaches deployed in any single volume and in terms of a wide range of disciplinary perspectives found cumulatively in the series.

More information about this series at
<http://www.springer.com/series/14894>

Diane J. Chandler
Editor

The Holy Spirit and Christian Formation

Multidisciplinary Perspectives

palgrave
macmillan

Editor

Diane J. Chandler
School of Divinity
Regent University
Virginia Beach, USA

Christianity and Renewal - Interdisciplinary Studies
ISBN 978-3-319-42666-2 ISBN 978-3-319-42667-9 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-42667-9

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016954793

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2016

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Cover image © Cseh Ioan / Alamy Stock Photo

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

CONTENTS

1 Introduction	1
<i>Diane J. Chandler</i>	
Part I Interdisciplinary Perspectives	17
2 Spiritual and Relational Formation: How Contemplative Prayer and Psychodynamic Therapy Enhance Loving God and Others	19
<i>Kelly Breen Boyce and Nanci Fisher Erkert</i>	
3 Emotional Formation: A Trinitarian Interaction	33
<i>Ray S. Yeo</i>	
4 Psychological Formation: A Pentecostal Pneumatology and Implications for Therapy	49
<i>Stephen Parker</i>	
5 Suffering as Formation: The Hard Road to Glory	69
<i>M. Elizabeth Lewis Hall</i>	

Part II Theological Perspectives	89
6 Scriptural Formation: The Power of the Biblical Story <i>Cornelius J. Bekker</i>	91
7 Ethical Formation: The Theological Virtues <i>Michael D. Palmer</i>	107
8 Theological Formation: Dialogical Interplay Between Barth, Hauerwas, and Bonhoeffer <i>Derek W. Taylor</i>	127
Part III Practice-Oriented Perspectives	145
9 Sacramental Formation: The Role of the Eucharistic <i>Mary Patton Baker</i>	147
10 Vocational Formation: Navigating Leadership Disorientation <i>Philip T. Howard</i>	167
11 Physical Formation: Health Stewardship and Embodied Realities <i>Diane J. Chandler</i>	185
12 Character Convergence: The Prospect of Holy Living <i>Stanley Hauerwas</i>	205
Epilogue	219
Index	227

CONTRIBUTORS

Mary Patton Baker (Ph.D., Trinity Evangelical Divinity School) is Deacon and Pastor of Community Formation at All Souls Anglican Church in Wheaton, Illinois, and teaches Theology and Biblical Studies at North Park University in Chicago, Illinois.

Cornelius J. Bekker (D.Litt et Phil., Rand Afrikaans University) is the Dean and Professor of the Regent University School of Divinity in Virginia Beach, Virginia.

Kelly Breen Boyce (Psy.D., Biola University) is Assistant Professor of Counseling and Psychology at Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary and provides psychodynamic therapy to couples and adults at Bareiter Counseling Center in Charlotte, North Carolina.

Diane J. Chandler (Ph.D., Regent University) is Associate Professor of Christian Formation and Leadership at Regent University School of Divinity in Virginia Beach, Virginia.

Nanci Fisher Erkert (M.A., Gordon Conwell Theological Seminary) is a licensed marriage and family therapist and professional counselor associate in Waxhaw, North Carolina, who also contributes to the counseling services of Wycliffe Bible Translators.

M. Elizabeth Lewis Hall (Ph.D., Biola University) is Professor of Psychology at Rosemead School of Psychology, Biola University in La Mirada, California.

Stanley Hauerwas (D.D., University of Edinburgh) is the Gilbert T. Rowe Professor Emeritus of Divinity and Law in the Duke Divinity

School at Duke University in Durham, North Carolina, and the Chair of Theological Ethics in the School of Divinity, History, and Philosophy at Aberdeen University in Scotland.

Philip T. Howard (Ph.D., Trinity International University) is Professor of Ministry Leadership and Spiritual Formation at Toccoa Falls College in Toccoa Falls, Georgia.

Michael D. Palmer (Ph.D., Marquette University) is Professor of Philosophy at Regent University School of Divinity in Virginia Beach, Virginia.

Stephen Parker (Ph.D., Emory University) is Professor in the School of Psychology and Counseling at Regent University in Virginia Beach, Virginia, and is a licensed professional counselor.

Derek W. Taylor (M.Div., Princeton University) is a Th.D. candidate in Christian Theology at Duke University Divinity School in Durham, North Carolina.

Ray S. Yeo (Ph.D., King's College London) is a postdoctoral fellow of Theology at Prairie College in Alberta, Canada.

Wolfgang Vondey Department of Theology and Religion, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK.

Introduction

Diane J. Chandler

THE INTERDISCIPLINARY NATURE OF CHRISTIAN FORMATION

One can view Christian formation as one might view the facets of a cut diamond. No one facet represents the complete gemstone. In fact, each of the facets that comprise the diamond contributes to its overall brilliance and value. The job of the gem cutter, then, is to cut the diamond in a way that maximizes the quality and integrity of the stone to reflect light, so as to create its appealing sparkle. Such is the case with Christian formation. Several facets, or dimensions, comprise the Christian life, with each one contributing to the overall character of the individual, as he or she reflects the light and life of Christ as shaped and enlivened by the Holy Spirit.

Christian formation is best described as an interactive process by which God the Father conforms believers into the image of Jesus through the empowerment of the Holy Spirit by overseeing the development of the whole person in various life dimensions for the sake of others.¹ God the

D.J. Chandler (✉)
School of Divinity (DIV 394), Regent University, 1000 Regent University Drive,
Virginia Beach, VA 23464, USA
e-mail: diancha@regent.edu

Father oversees the process. As Redeemer, Jesus the Son provides the impetus and model as the perfect image of God into which followers are to be conformed. The Holy Spirit provides the divine love and power that causes the process to take place and advance.

The apostle Paul refers to this ongoing transformation process: “And all of us, with unveiled faces, seeing the glory of the Lord as though reflected in a mirror, are being transformed [Gr. *metamorphoōmai*] into the same image from one degree of glory to another; for this comes from the Lord, the Spirit” (2 Cor 3:18).² The process of Christian formation is ongoing, as well as the outcome of the Spirit’s dynamic work in and through the life of the believer. Romans 8:26–29 further attests to this process of being conformed to the likeness of God’s Son through the Spirit who assists in human weakness while also searching the heart.

Human dimensionality is robust in its composition, expression, and capacity for growth in a holistic manner into Christlikeness. Pope Benedict XVI highlighted the importance of viewing the holistic integration of human dimensions in a 2005 speech to the Pontifical Academies of Sciences and Social Sciences at the unveiling of a statue of Pope John Paul II. He noted, “According to God’s design, persons cannot be separated from the physical, psychological or spiritual dimensions of human nature.”³ The individual reflects multiple dimensions, such that human identity is shaped across time through the interactive effects of the sovereign grace of God, personal volition, life circumstances, and interpersonal relationships and interactions.

All elements of life contribute to the shaping of individual character, attitudes, values and beliefs, habits, personal calling, vocation, and worldview.⁴ From Christian anthropology, the perspective concerning what it means to be human, we intuit that humankind has capacity in several dimensions, not the least of which is the spiritual, emotional, psychological, theological, and vocational.⁵ God, however, also provides humankind with opportunity for growth into Christlikeness through other conduits, including the development of morality and virtue,⁶ the refining seasons of suffering,⁷ participation in the body of Christ,⁸ and even stewardship of one’s physical body.⁹ Embodiedness, as Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen emphasizes, is a vital part of theology: “Christian theology should hold fast to both the capacity for transcendence, which also enables a personal relation to the triune God, and the embodiedness of transcendence in materiality, the bodily nature of humanity.”¹⁰ Thus, all life dimensions are designed to converge into a life of holiness, such that the life of Christ is reflected through all facets of life for the sake of others.

What it means to be human in theological perspective has captivated scholars from various disciplines throughout the centuries. The early church fathers, such as Irenaeus in “Against Heresies” and Augustine in *De trinitate* and *Confessiones*,¹¹ through the medieval era with Anselm of Canterbury’s *Cur Deus Homo* (Lat. “Why Did God Become Man?”) and Thomas Aquinas’s *Summa Theologiae* to Karl Barth’s “The Basic Form of Humanity” in *Church Dogmatics*, all addressed these theological issues related to creation, human identity, and why these are significant.¹²

While biblical theologians have addressed these issues, secular writers have added to a cacophony of voices speaking into personhood (i.e., Martin Heidegger, Jean-Paul Satre, Albert Camus, and Paul Kurtz). Calling for a welcome return to a biblical account of human identity, theologian Richard Lints notes the “radical confusion about what it means to be human has ... brought an opportunity for renewed reflection on the nature of human identity” in light of the rise of humanism and naturalism in the twentieth century.¹³ In light of this confusion, we must locate our identity squarely in God as Creator, Savior, and Sustainer.

Theological anthropology provides clues as to the dynamics of the human person.¹⁴ For example, contemporary writers predictably cover perspectives related to the biblical text, philosophy, the doctrine of sin and evil, the differentiation between male and female, morality, human freedom, and human activity in the world. More recently, however, this dialogue has proliferated with conversational partners from the sciences, including biology and neuroscience, to tease out what science might add to an understanding of what it means to be human.

For example, in addressing theological anthropology, Hans Schwarz offers a Lutheran perspective, with formative content on biology, the human brain, and neuroscience.¹⁵ In David G. Kirchhoffer’s edited book from a Catholic perspective, various theologians take up Christian anthropology by evaluating broad topics inclusive of Karl Barth’s theology, the influence of the Catholic document *Gaudium et Spes*,¹⁶ and ecology.¹⁷ Yet other human dimensions relative to loving and serving God and others through holiness involve the emotions and care of the physical body, which are dimensions addressed within this volume.¹⁸ To augment this discussion, we briefly turn to an overview of the *imago Dei*, which further brings into focus human multidimensionality with a view toward Christian formation.

INSIGHTS FROM PERSPECTIVES ON THE *IMAGO DEI*

For centuries, speculation has proliferated relative to the meaning of the *imago Dei*, as observed in the Genesis creation narrative (Gen 1:27–28).¹⁹ What does it mean to be created in the image of God? And how should this influence our relationship with God, as we grow more into Christlikeness? From the onset, we must begin with the premise that God is love (1 Jn 4:8) and that God demonstrated divine love by creating all living things— inclusive of humankind.

Specifically, Paul Fiddes boldly asserts that God creates out of love and that love is “at the very heart of a doctrine of creation.”²⁰ Likewise, Jürgen Moltmann attests: “If God creates the world out of freedom, then he creates it out of love. Creation is not a demonstration of his boundless power; it is a communication of his love, which knows neither premises nor pre-conditions: *creatio ex amore Dei*.” By the Spirit, divine love expresses the mutuality of Father, Son, and Spirit as it reaches out in self-giving.²¹ By sending His Son “to be the atoning sacrifice for our sins” (1 Jn 4:10), the apostle John makes clear that through loving others, God lives within by which the love of God is perfected (vs. 12).²²

Thus, the Spirit of love beckons humanity into a relationship with Christ as Redeemer, in order to transform the individual into greater depths of Christlikeness in all life dimensions. This process of being perfected in Christ is what New Testament scholar, Michael J. Gorman, calls “cruciformity,” or the process of being conformed to the crucified Christ.²³ For Gorman, cruciformity is a more suitable term than “imitation” when describing how believers are formed in Christ (Gal 4:9), considering the reality of the cross (Phil 3:10).²⁴ The chapters included in this volume on various dimensions of Christian formation all interface in some way with divine love, which is perfectly manifested through the character and life of Jesus, his death on the cross, and the Spirit’s empowerment.

Perspectives on the *imago Dei* comprise a long history. For example, writers such as Augustine,²⁵ Irenaeus, Thomas Aquinas, Martin Luther, and John Calvin offered nuanced interpretations of the *imago Dei*. Contemporary authors such as Karl Barth emphasized God’s transcendence, Catholic theologian Hans Urs von Balthasar viewed the *imago Dei* solely through relationship in Christ, and Jürgen Moltmann offered a more expansive relational model of the *imago Dei*, emphasizing the dignity of humanity in intimate relationship with God.²⁶ As J. Richard Middleton concedes, interpreting the *imago Dei* is challenging, and interpreters retain

their own set of lenses in assessing its meaning.²⁷ However, interpreters agree that the *imago Dei* culminates in the person of Christ, whom the New Testament asserts is the very image of the invisible God (cf. Col 1:15–20). In affirmation, Wolfhart Pannenberg affirms: “the *Imago Dei* is existence in Jesus Christ, the Word made flesh. Jesus Christ is the true *Imago Dei*, which humanity regains when through faith it is ‘in Jesus Christ.’”²⁸

According to the *imago Dei*, all that we are, all that we do, and all that we aspire to become find convergence in Christ.²⁹ Christ is the perfect *imago Dei*.³⁰ While reducing the *imago Dei* to mere human characteristics would dwarf the grandeur and goodness of God, minimizing the identification of human dimensions worthy of growth into Christlikeness would likewise be problematic.³¹ We are continuously being transformed into the image of Jesus as a process in the present that leads into eternity (2 Co 3:18).

Accordingly this lifelong process involves what Stanley Grenz calls “a task in the present.”³² Every aspect of human existence is to come under the authority of Jesus and work deeply into all dimensions of life by the power of the Holy Spirit.³³ Hence, the Holy Spirit is at work continually developing the human spirit, theological understanding through the mind (especially through intake of Scripture), emotional maturity, relational connections that are expressed through the church and liturgy, physical health awareness in stewardship of the body, and vocational capacity—even in the midst of disillusionment and suffering. Not surprisingly, the process of Christian formation differs from individual to individual. What aligns each individual’s journey, however, is the active role of the Holy Spirit who ever moves to draw the individual closer to Christ.

THE SPIRIT MOVING

The Holy Spirit provides the very life of God in developing believers into Christlikeness. All of Christian formation locates in and through the Spirit’s activity, which truly is global in reach.³⁴ Rather than some illusive ecological and cosmic force, the Spirit is an equal Trinitarian partner who conveys the richness of the Father’s love through the reality of Christ’s life and redemptive mission to the individual and the world.³⁵ As the active presence of God, the Spirit’s role is to transform the heart, mind, soul, spirit, body, and all human activity into consonance with God’s highest purposes and uses the entity of the church to forge a people in relationship.³⁶ In other words, “The Spirit’s mission is to complete the program of the triune God in the world. ... En route to that day, the Spirit nourishes

the spiritual life he creates.”³⁷ This mission is accomplished through the church, as the formidable context which contributes to the Christian formation process. Thus, we can affirm with Emil Brunner, “For love can only operate in community.”³⁸

In surveying the Spirit’s activity, the Spirit’s dynamic work is replete throughout the biblical text.³⁹ The Spirit moved at creation, initiated the giving of the Torah, spoke through the prophets, conceived Jesus through the incarnation, infused Jesus at His baptism, anointed Jesus to fulfill all prophecy (Lu 4/Is 61:1–3), raised Jesus from the dead, and broke out at Pentecost to birth the nascent church. Today, the Spirit continues to work through individual believers and the corporate church as Christ’s body in the world to advance God’s Kingdom through gospel proclamation, as seen through Peter at Pentecost, Paul with the early churches, other mighty acts, human relationships, and life circumstances. As divine gift, the indwelling Holy Spirit is God’s personal and empowering presence.⁴⁰

This communal dynamic of the Holy Spirit is what makes the church the ecclesial shaping conduit for the expression of the love and life of God. Living in genuine *koinonia* magnifies the character of Christ in such a way as to reflect Christ in the world. Historically, liturgical practices, including Scripture reading and partaking in the Eucharist, affirm the presence of the risen Lord in the very midst of the community, allowing for continual transformation. Grenz aptly summarizes, “In short, the indwelling Spirit leads and empowers the church to fulfill its divinely mandated calling to be a sacrament of Trinitarian communion, a temporal, visible sign of the eternal, dynamic life of the triune God.”⁴¹ Thus, the reading of Scripture releases the life-giving flow of the Spirit and partaking in the Eucharist, along with other sacraments, further unifies the church around the crucified and risen Christ.

With all life dimensions coming under the influence of the Holy Spirit as individuals and as a corporate body, the church, how are we to think about developing into Christlikeness spiritually, scripturally, emotionally, psychologically, ethically through holiness, liturgically, vocationally, and physically through care of the body—such that Christ’s character is revealed?⁴² Given the realities of sin, temptation, and personal brokenness in an imperfect world, how might the body of Christ cooperate with the Spirit in order to bring each facet of life into conformity to Christ through the freedom offered by the Spirit? The chapters in this volume address these questions, given the lacuna in Christian literature addressing the holistic nature of formation.

Furthermore, the chapters draw on the most relevant scholarship to highlight how personhood is both integrated and multidimensional. Each chapter provides one facet of the gemstone of Christian formation. Taken together, they deepen the conversation about how believers are formed in Christ and how to cooperate with the Holy Spirit to become whole and healthy in order to reflect the light of Christ in the world (Mt 4:14–16).⁴³

An Overview of the Essays

The chapter essays included in this volume cluster around three primary themes: (1) interdisciplinary perspectives, (2) theological and ethical perspectives, and (3) Christian life and practice-oriented perspectives. Each chapter provides a facet that enhances our understanding of the breadth and interconnectivity of Christian formation. Most of the chapters were written by those who presented a paper or participated in the 2015 Annual Renewal Conference at Regent University in Virginia Beach, Virginia, entitled: “The Holy Spirit and Christian Formation.”⁴⁴ The conference was explicitly multidisciplinary and attracted those in the fields of spiritual formation, biblical studies, theology, psychology, philosophy, ethics, pastoral ministry, and physical health sciences, among others.

INTERDISCIPLINARY PERSPECTIVES

Setting the tone in Chap. 2, Kelly Breen Boyce and Nanci Fisher Erkert address spiritual and relational formation by evaluating the value of contemplative prayer when integrated with psychodynamic therapy related to loving God and others. For contemporary Christians, the discovery of the ancient practices of contemplative spirituality for spiritual growth cultivates attention to the presence and activity of the Holy Spirit. Contemplative prayer recognizes needful silences, which affirm that “we do not know what we ought to pray for” (Rom 8:26), with the Holy Spirit as our ultimate Intercessor. Just as the Trinitarian nature of God is relational, psychodynamic therapy uniquely emphasizes the relationship between therapist and client. For the Christian, contemplative spiritual practices and psychodynamic therapy share the chief goal of loving God, others, and self with a whole and undefended heart.

In Chap. 3, Ray S. Yeo provides an account of the emotions relative to Christian formation from the perspective of participation in the Father and the Sonship of Christ, as mediated by the Holy Spirit.

The first half of the chapter focuses on the Holy Spirit's identity as the Spirit of Sonship and explores the ways in which the deep emotional longings and intimacy of Christological Sonship are mediated by the Spirit. The discussion draws upon the theological psychology of Jonathan Edwards to help explicate the nature and phenomenology of the unique filial disposition of Christ that is pneumatologically formed within. The second half of the chapter directs attention to the filial emotions and considers what it means for one to emotionally interact with God as Father, while embodying the Christological filial emotions. Attachment theory is applied to highlight the significance of emotional interaction for robust Christian formation.

In Chap. 4, Stephen Parker articulates a Pentecostal pneumatology and then identifies implications of this perspective for the work of therapy and pastoral counseling. By considering therapy a subset of ministry contributing to Christian formation, he proposes that a Pentecostal pneumatology is characterized by a focus on the actual presence of God through the Spirit to transform and renew life in those seeking help. Furthermore, he argues that such a pneumatology is interwoven with a theological anthropology that emphasizes a fundamental relationality and freedom of human choice. From this Pentecostal pneumatology, Parker articulates goals of Christian formation that include healthy relationships with God and others and taking responsibility for one's choices. Means for achieving these goals include attention to relational, affective, autonomous, and narrative dimensions of human experience.

On the heels of Chaps. 2, 3 and 4, M. Elizabeth Lewis Hall takes a unique tact in Chap. 5 by addressing how the Holy Spirit contributes to formation through the process of suffering and trauma. She explores how God redeems suffering by repurposing it for one's good in one's spiritual, psychological, and relational formation. Theologically, the chapter focuses on the need for a Trinitarian understanding of suffering with two emphases. The first is a focus on the suffering Christ as a necessary foundation for "abiding in Christ," "walking in Christ," and "living in Christ," all metaphors indicating increasing movement toward glorification. The second is the Holy Spirit's role in preparing for suffering, along with coming alongside, comforting, and forming individuals through suffering. By drawing on psychological literature of post-traumatic growth, the chapter also explores how suffering of various kinds can lead to character change and reorientation, as a way of understanding the process of being formed into Christ's image.

THEOLOGICAL AND ETHICAL PERSPECTIVES

In Chap. 6, Cornelius J. Bekker discusses the centrality of reading the sacred Scriptures in the Hebrew and Christian spiritual traditions relative to Christian formation. Several lacunae, however, exist in contemporary theological research concerning the centrality of the Holy Spirit in the exegetical and hermeneutical disciplines proposed during the last two millennia. This chapter explores how the Hebrew believers and early Christian thinkers described the role, purpose, and operation of the Holy Spirit as central to the practice of biblical exegesis and hermeneutics. Taking its cue from the insights of twentieth century ressourcement theology, the contemporary convergence movement, neo-reformism, and paleo-orthodox proposals, the chapter reflects on how these early exegetical and hermeneutical proposals can assist and help contemporary Christians to rediscover the role of the Spirit as central to exegetical practice in the quest to being formed in the image of Christ.

Michael Palmer presents in Chap. 7 the theological virtues essential for ethical formation. When thirteenth-century theologian Thomas Aquinas argued that human beings are perfected by virtue, he repeated Aristotle's point made during the Classical Era. He went beyond Aristotle, however, when he observed that humankind's happiness is attributed not only to human nature but also to "the power of God alone." Exploring the dynamics of what Aquinas calls "participation of the Godhead," this chapter considers three related questions: (1) are the so-called theological virtues of faith, hope, charity acquired in fundamentally different ways than the moral virtues such as justice and prudence?; (2) in what way does the acquisition of the theological virtues make the moral person's character different than if that person had not acquired them?; and (3) what is meant by the expression "by the power of God alone"? Palmer develops the third question in light of Thomas's assertion that the Holy Spirit's proper name is Love (charity=*caritas*), whose mission is to move saints toward their God-given ends.

In Chap. 8, Derek W. Taylor presents the theological and intellectual dimension of Christian formation through a dialogical interplay between three of the twentieth century's most influential Protestant theologians: Karl Barth, Stanley Hauerwas, and Dietrich Bonhoeffer. Hauerwas and Barth will be considered on the issue of ecclesial formation by highlighting some of the key differences separating them. If Barth provides a robust account of the Spirit's agency but lacks an adequate account of the church

as the object of formation, then Hauerwas errs in the opposite direction by offering a thick account of the church but no Spirit to form it. Setting up the conversation in this way, Taylor points to Bonhoeffer who is presented as a mediating bridge between the two. The chapter concludes by showing how this theological analysis bears upon ecclesial practices so essential for Christian formation.

CHRISTIAN LIFE AND PRACTICE-ORIENTED PERSPECTIVES

Mary Patton Baker in Chap. 9 proposes that the celebration of the Lord's Supper receive more consideration as a core liturgical practice in Christian formation. The experience of union with Christ and the corresponding transformation of the participants through the work of the Holy Spirit are intensified in the Eucharistic celebration because of its accommodation to the human senses. The Holy Spirit transforms the assembly's receiving of the bread and cup into a profound realization of this union. Through a biblical examination of Paul's theology of Eucharistic *κοινωνία* (*koinonia*), vis-à-vis his exposition in 1 Corinthians 10–11, Baker likewise examines Calvin's pneumatological and theological focus of the Lord's Supper. This theological model for understanding the Holy Spirit's role in Eucharistic celebration offers possibilities for constructive ecclesial dialogue among various Christian renewal traditions. As an expression of the Holy Spirit's renewing work in the church and a central church practice, the Lord's Supper not only renews the believer but also strengthens the church's mission to the world.

In Chap. 10, Philip T. Howard explores how disorienting events influence the formation of a Christian leader's vocational trajectory. For example, the Psalmist makes repeated reference to such experiences and the impact these disorienting events have on reframing personal awareness of personhood, the character of God, and God's purposes in one's life. In addition, whether referred to as a leadership "crucible" (Bill George), an "optimal conflict" (Robert Kegan), a "conflict in context" (James Loder), or even a "dark night of the soul" (John of the Cross), contemporary leadership literature provides more meaningful consideration regarding the impact of these seasons of a Christian leader's vocational formation, as recovery from these events is often an arduous process. Through application of transformative learning theory, this chapter asserts that the way in which a Christian leader responds to disorienting events is indicative of an awareness of and submission to the activity of the Holy Spirit, resulting in an indispensable shaping process.

In Chap. 11, Diane J. Chandler argues from a pneumatological and practical standpoint that physical health stewardship is an essential, and often neglected, facet of Christian formation. First, Chandler addresses embodiment from a biblical and theological perspective, as the physical body is the temple of the Holy Spirit (1 Cor 6:19). The corporeal dwelling, then, provides the sacred location for God's Spirit and the tangible conduit for worship. Second, she focuses on the pneumatological dimensions of the whole person, and how the Spirit interacts within to bring conformity to Christ. Third, she discusses the importance of attending to one's physical health with appropriate care in order to honor God. Four health areas of nutrition, physical exercise, sleep, and stress reduction provide starting points for stewarding the physical body. Increasingly, the interconnectedness of body, mind, soul, and spirit as overseen by the Holy Spirit cannot be denied.

In Chap. 12, Stanley Hauerwas addresses how life in the Spirit fosters holiness as both individuals and the communal process through a proper understanding and application of Scripture. Hauerwas opens with a review of a Wesleyan approach to holiness, drawing on John and Charles Wesley as exemplars. The pursuit of holiness, as a grace provided through the power of the Holy Spirit, has been likened to a road leading to perfection and emerges through the sanctification process in order to free individuals from sin. Drawing on biblical exemplars from the Old Testament prophets to New Testament figures like Peter and Paul, Hauerwas reviews how the Spirit set apart the people of God to be holy, arguing that sanctification must never be separated from Christian ethics, since human behavior is to reflect life change. Prayer and participation in the community of faith become the essential conduits by which Spirit-guided worshippers are caught up in the life of the Trinity and become holy, as they are formed in Christ.

The epilogue offers a call to explore more finely tuned facets that influence the gem of Christian formation. These potential-research trajectories include the role of culture, family dynamics, gender, age, ethnicity, and previous church experience upon one's relationship to God and others. The book then closes by positioning Christian formation within a broader discussion of the *missio Dei* (Lat. mission of God). Participating in God's redemptive mission through the love of Christ by the empowerment of the Holy Spirit is the telos of Christian formation.

To participate in the life of the Spirit in all facets of Christian formation is a work of grace. The renewing work of the Spirit knows no bounds in

transforming individuals into Christlikeness. Yet the Spirit invites willing participation, such that one's spirit (emotional and psychological development through relational connectivity and suffering, ethical development through demonstrating the virtues, theological reflection, Eucharistic participation in the body of Christ, vocational buoyancy through times of discouragement, and stewardship of the physical body) comes under the Spirit's orchestration. As Pannenberg attests regarding the *imago Dei*, "If our creation in God's image means that we are to seek God, to honor him as God, ... and to thank him as the Author of life and of every good gift, then we may assume that there is a disposition to do so in every human life, no matter how little we see of it in a given case."⁴⁵ May we be open to the Spirit's moving through all facets of the Christian life, as we love and serve God and others in order to fulfill the *missio Dei* for God's glory.

NOTES

1. This definition is slightly amended from the one presented in Diane J. Chandler, *Christian Spiritual Formation: An Integrated Approach to Personal and Relational Wholeness* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Academic, 2014), 19.
2. All scripture references throughout this volume are taken from the New Revised Standard Version, unless otherwise noted.
3. Pope Benedict XVI, "Address of His Holiness Benedict XVI to the Members of the Pontifical Academy of Sciences and the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences," November 21, 2005, https://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/speeches/2005/november/documents/hf_ben_xvi_spe_20051121_academies.html
4. Dallas Willard provides a rare multidimensional approach to Christian formation in *Renovation of the Heart: Putting on the Character of Christ*, 10th anniversary edit. (Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress, 2012), esp. 30–39.
5. See Chandler's *Christian Spiritual Formation* for a robust theological/biblical model of multidimensionality of personhood from a multidimensional perspective.
6. Stanley Hauerwas, *A Community of Character: Toward a Constructive Christian Social Ethic* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame, 1981), esp. 129–52 on development of Christian morality, the virtues, and character.
7. For theological anthropology centered on the theme of suffering from a feminine voice, see Elizabeth O'Donnell Gandolfo, *The Power and Vulnerability of Love: A Theological Anthropology* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2015).

8. Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Life Together* (New York: Harper & Row, 1954).
9. Elizabeth Lewis Hall, "What Are Bodies For? An Integrative Examination of Embodiment," *Christian Scholars Review* 39, no. 2 (2010): 169–75.
10. Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *Creation and Humanity* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2015), 281.
11. For an analysis of the theological anthropology of Augustine, see Matthew Drever, *Image, Identity, and the Forming of the Augustinian Soul* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), esp. 16–47; and Paige E. Hochschild, *Memory in Augustine's Theological Anthropology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), esp. 137–224.
12. For an excellent edited volume featuring all of these aforementioned authors in addition to formative thinkers who addressed theological anthropology in their writings, see Ian A. McFarland, ed., *Creation and Humanity: The Sources of Christian Theology* (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2009).
13. Richard Lints, "Theological Anthropology in Context," in *Personal Identity in Theological Perspective*, ed. Richard Lints, Michael S. Horton, and Mark R. Talbot (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2006), 2.
14. Ray Anderson, *On Being Human: Essays on Theological Anthropology* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1982); Nonna Verna Harrison, *God's Many-Splendored Image: Theology Anthropology for Christian Formation* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2010); J. P. Moreland and David M. Ciochi, eds., *Christian Perspectives on Being Human: A Multidisciplinary Approach to Integration* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1993).
15. Hans Schwarz, *The Human Being: A Theological Anthropology* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2013), esp. 31–81, 125–57. Increasingly, science has pulled up a seat at the multidisciplinary dialogue table related to what it means to be human. For example, see Malcolm Jeeves, ed., *Rethinking Human Nature: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2011).
16. *Gaudium et Spes*, translated as *Joy and Hope*, was one of four documents resulting from Vatican II in 1965, which provided and set forth an overview of the Roman Catholic Church's perspectives on humanity's interface with economics, social justice, poverty, culture, science, and technology.
17. David G. Kirchhoffer, (with Robyn Horner and Patrick McArdle), ed., *Being Human: Groundwork for a Theological Anthropology for the 21st Century* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2013).
18. Harrison, *God's Many Splendored Image*, 107–22.
19. Most authors look to the Genesis creation narrative as the primary source for the *imago Dei*. One rare exception is David H. Kelsey, who primarily draws from biblical Wisdom literature, in *Eccentric Existence: A Theological Anthropology*, vol. 1 & 2 (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press,

- 2009), see esp. 1:186–89. I agree with Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, who objects to Kelsey’s exclusive use of Wisdom literature to explore the *imago Dei* but rather suggests Genesis, Wisdom literature, and the New Testament must combine to frame the canonical core of the *imago Dei*, in *Creation and Humanity* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2015), 268–71.
20. Paul S. Fiddes, “Creation Out of Love,” in *The Work of Love: Creation as Kenosis*, ed. John Polkinghorne (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2001), 167–91.
 21. Ian A. McFarland, *From Nothing: A Theology of Creation* (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox, 2014), 40–42.
 22. For two different approaches on divine love, see Thomas Oord, *The Uncontrolling Love of God: An Open and Relational Account of Providence* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Academic, 2015) on how to view tragedy and providence juxtaposed to God’s noncoercive love; and John C. Peckham, *The Love of God: A Canonical Model* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Academic, 2015) on a biblio-centric trajectory that looks at the emotional and volitional aspects of divine love, among others.
 23. Michael J. Gorman, *Cruciformity: Paul’s Narrative Spirituality of the Cross* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2001), 4–5.
 24. *Ibid.*, 48.
 25. For example, see an analysis of Augustine’s anthropology in Matthew Drever, *Image, Identity, and the Forming of the Augustinian Soul* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), esp. 45–47.
 26. For a comparative analysis of Barth, Balthasar, and Moltmann, see Dominic Robinson, *Understanding the ‘Imago Dei’: The Thought of Barth, Von Balthasar, and Moltmann* (Farnham, England: Ashgate, 2011). Robinson views Barth’s perspective as lacking an emphasis on humankind’s ascent to God and views Moltmann’s perspective as weak in Christology, preferring Balthasar’s view, which built upon Barth’s theology.
 27. J. Richard Middleton, *The Liberating Image: The Imago Dei in Genesis 1* (Grand Rapids: Brazos Press, 2005), 15–42.
 28. Alistair McGrath, “Emil Brunner on the Image of God,” in Alistair McGrath, ed., *The Christian Theology Reader*, 4th ed. (West Sussex, UK, 2011), 391.
 29. Kelsey refers to these three questions addressed in his tome as the “triple helix”: (1) “What is a human being?,” (2) “Who am I/Who are we?,” and (3) “How ought we to be existentially ‘set into, and oriented toward, our ultimate and proximate contexts?’” in *Eccentric Existence*, 2:1008–09.
 30. Stanley Grenz, *The Social God and the Relational Self: A Trinitarian Theology of the Imago Dei* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2001), 209–22.
 31. Richard Lints, *Identity and Idolatry: The Image of God and Its Inversion* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2015), 35. Lints juxtaposes *the*

- imago Dei* with idolatry, graven images, and ungodly desire in order to show how idolatry inverts and perverts the perfect image of Christ (103–28).
32. Grenz, *Social God and the Relational Self*, 251.
 33. Marc Cortez, *Theological Anthropology: A Guide for the Perplexed* (London: T & T Clark, 2010), 6.
 34. Amos Yong, *Who is the Holy Spirit: A Walk with the Apostles* (Brewster, MA: Paraclete Press, 2011), esp. 141–88.
 35. Jürgen Moltmann, *God in Creation: A New Theology of Creation and the Spirit of God*, trans. Margaret Kohl (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1993), 262–64; Jürgen Moltmann, *Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation*, trans. Margaret Kohl (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001), 10–11. Moltmann emphasizes that the Spirit takes up the whole person in relationality to others (p. 264). Not everyone agrees with Moltmann’s pneumatology, critiquing the lack of distinction between the Creator-creature tandem. For example, see Isaiah Nengean, *The Imago Dei as the Imago Trinitatis: Jürgen Moltmann’s Doctrine of the Image of God* (New York: Peter Lang, 2013), 5, 139–45.
 36. Grenz, *Social God and Relational Self*, 328–36.
 37. Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, *Creation and Humanity*, 81.
 38. Emil Brunner, *Man in Revolt: A Christian Anthropology*, trans. Olive Wyon (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1939), 106.
 39. Wolfgang Vondey, *Beyond Pentecostalism: The Crisis of Global Christianity and the Renewal of the Theological Agenda* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010), 66–77.
 40. Chandler, *Christian Spiritual Formation*, 59–63. Gordon D. Fee, *God’s Empowering Presence: The Holy Spirit in the Letters of Paul* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1994), 827–45.
 41. Grenz, *Social God and Relational Self*, 336.
 42. Chandler, *Christian Spiritual Formation*, 267–78.
 43. Willard, *Renovation of the Heart*, 217–32.
 44. See: http://www.regent.edu/acad/schdiv/renewalstudies/holy_spirit_christian_formation.cfm.
 45. Wolfhart Pannenberg, *Systematic Theology*, trans. Geoffrey W. Bromiley, vol. 2 (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1994), 227.