

# Art Crime

Terrorists, Tomb Raiders, Forgers and Thieves

Edited by

Noah Charney



# Art Crime

*This page intentionally left blank*

# Art Crime

## Terrorists, Tomb Raiders, Forgers and Thieves

Edited by

Noah Charney

*Association for Research into Crimes against Art*

palgrave  
macmillan



Selection, introduction and editorial matter © Noah Charney 2016  
Foreword © Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen 2016  
Individual chapters © Respective authors 2016  
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2016 978-1-137-40756-6

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2016 by  
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-55370-9 ISBN 978-1-137-40757-3 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-1-137-40757-3

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Art crime : terrorists, tomb raiders, forgers and thieves / [edited by]

Noah Charney.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

1. Art thefts. 2. Art—Forgery. 3. Cultural property—Protection—Law and legislation—Criminal provisions. I. Charney, Noah, editor, writer of introduction. II. Association for Research into Crimes against Art.

N8795.A79 2015

364.16'287—dc23

2015021819

# Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	viii
<i>Foreword</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvi
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	xvii

## **Part I Forgers: Fakes and Forgeries**

Introduction to Part I <i>Noah Charney</i>	2
1 The Beltracchi Affair: A Comment and Further Reflections on the “Most Spectacular” German Art Forgery Case in Recent Times <i>Saskia Hufnagel and Duncan Chappell</i>	9
2 On “In Praise of Forgery” <i>Blake Gopnik</i>	21
3 Connoisseurship All the Way Down: Art Authentication, Forgery, Fingerprint Identification, Expert Knowledge <i>Simon A. Cole</i>	27
4 The Police Investigation of Art Fraud <i>Vernon Rapley</i>	33
5 The Grape War of China: Wine Fraud and How Science Is Fighting Back <i>Toby Bull</i>	41
6 Fingerprinting Objects for the Control of Illegal Trafficking <i>William Wei</i>	57

## **Part II Terrorists: Policing, Investigation and Terrorism**

Introduction to Part II <i>Noah Charney</i>	78
--	----

7	The Theft, Recovery and Forensic Investigation of Leonardo da Vinci's <i>Madonna of the Yarnwinder</i> <i>Martin Kemp</i>	87
8	Trying to Recover Two Francesco Guardi <i>Capricci</i> Stolen from Russborough, County Wicklow, in 1986 <i>Charles Hill</i>	95
9	The Role of the Police in the Co-Production of Art Security in London <i>John Kerr</i>	105
10	Thieves of Baghdad: And the Terrorists They Finance <i>Colonel Matthew Bogdanos</i>	118
11	Looting of Antiquities: Tearing the Fabric of Civil Society <i>Laurie W. Rush</i>	132
12	The Return of Iconoclasm: Barbarian Ideology and Destruction by ISIS as a Challenge for Modern Culture, Not Only for Islam <i>Francesco Rutelli</i>	143

### **Part III Tomb Raiders: Archaeology and Antiquities Looting**

	Introduction to Part III <i>Noah Charney</i>	152
13	Looting and Passion of Greek Vases from Etruria and Magna Graecia: The Birth of the Great Collections <i>Stefano Alessandrini</i>	159
14	Aramaic Incantation Bowls in War and in Peace <i>Neil Brodie</i>	169
15	Temple Looting in Cambodia: Anatomy of a Statue Trafficking Network <i>Simon Mackenzie and Tess Davis</i>	179
16	Something Is Confidential in the State of Christie's <i>Christos Tsirogiannis</i>	200
17	Polaroids from the Medici Dossier: Continued Sightings on the Market <i>David W.J. Gill and Christos Tsirogiannis</i>	229
18	Illicit Trafficking and Destruction of Cultural Property in Africa: A Continent at a Crossroads <i>George Abungu</i>	240

19	Antiquities Crime as a Policy Problem <i>Lawrence Rothfield</i>	255
<b>Part IV Thieves: Art Law, War and Policy</b>		
	Introduction to Part IV <i>Noah Charney</i>	264
20	Nazi-Looted Art from Kyiv Destroyed in East Prussia – New Hope for More Survivors? <i>Patricia Kennedy Grimsted</i>	281
21	Surviving War and Peace: The Long Road to Recovering the Malevich Paintings <i>Howard N. Spiegler</i>	308
22	What Is Due Diligence? Making the Case for a More Responsible Art Market <i>Christopher A. Marinello and Jerome Hasler</i>	316
23	Outline of the Benefits Coming from a National Prosecution Service in Cultural Heritage Protection <i>Paolo Giorgio Ferri</i>	320
24	A Permanent International Art Crime Tribunal? <i>Judge Arthur Tompkins</i>	327
25	Getting Governments to Cooperate against Looting: Insights from the American and British Experience <i>Asif Efrat</i>	337
	<i>Index</i>	359



# Figures

6.1	Roughness measurement/fingerprint of an oil painting	59
6.2	Schematic diagram showing the traditional method for measuring a roughness profile using a phonograph style needle	60
6.3	Schematic diagram showing principle of confocal white-light profilometry using two cones observed from above	61
6.4	$\mu$ Surf white-light confocal profilometer developed and manufactured by NanoFocus AG, Oberhausen, Germany	63
6.5	Fingerprint of the glaze of a porcelain cup	65
6.6	Fingerprints taken from two gold bracelets found in the ruins of Pompei	67
6.7	Fingerprints taken of the number 50 on two of the same map from two copies of the same book	69
6.8	Fingerprints taken from two new 2 Eurocent pieces	71
15.1	Map of sites visited and key locations	183
15.2	Trafficking routes in the “Channel 1” network	185

# Foreword

## **Advances in the study of art crime and the importance of protecting and identifying cultural property**

The title of this book triggers some questions. Normally when the term *art crime* is used, one thinks about thefts of paintings, sculptures and antiques, or new *objets d'art* or, in the worst case, a work of art that is so ugly or repulsive that some consider it an art crime in itself. But looking at the contents of this book, edited by Noah Charney, I found several chapters dealing with terms such as cultural property, collectable objects, antiquities, cultural heritage, art, archives and libraries. Nevertheless, taking into account the roots of the editor of this volume, namely the Association for Research into Crimes against Art (ARCA) and the criminological background of the majority of the contributing authors, I do understand, in this case, the use of art as the adjective to accompany the crime.

Still, I think that the term “cultural property” covers a broader perspective than just art and, at the same time, provides a legal reference that makes it clear that property cannot be damaged, stolen or completely destroyed without legal repercussions. Apart from that, cultural property does not have to be art, *per se*, and can stand for multiple material and immaterial cultural representations, often directly linked to identities. Of course, this all is food for thought, and we must not forget the international (academic) heritage debate.

Having said this, an important element that all types of art, cultural heritage, cultural properties and cultural resources can suffer from, which consequently then serves as a common denominator, is crime. To combat and prevent crimes related to cultural property, one still has to answer the much-debated question of what one may classify as cultural heritage or property. It should be simple to ascertain here that the scope of how different types of cultural heritage are classified begins and ends with tangible and intangible heritage, but that would be too easy. My aim is rather to reflect and contemplate on what is, in my opinion, a combination of these three types, triggering discussions about overlaps in the nature and identity of art and heritage, as well as the natural and intangible forms of cultural property. If cultural property is adequately identified, it will be easier to find and further develop the appropriate legitimate penal sanctions and legal protection instruments with which to protect it.

At the beginning of 2014, I visited the war-stricken areas of Mali. I traveled with our Blue Shield team, including Joris Kila, Christo Grozev and Siratigui Sogoba, to the town of Timbuktu. The goal was to assess and investigate

damage inflicted on cultural property but, to be more specific, destruction by the Ansar Dine group, a militant jihadist rebel organization that occupied the area. The jihadists were, at the time of the visit, already partly drawn back by French and national Malian troops. We found multiple types of inflicted damages, but I will focus on a form of iconoclasm exercised by the radical jihadists against the local Sufi population. In Timbuktu, we found that the Sufi Sidi Yahya mosque's "sacred door" had been demolished by the militant jihadists, in order to provoke the local population, who believe that the opening of this door would bring bad luck to the city. We also assessed the damage at the Ahmed Baba Institute, where parts of the famous Timbuktu manuscripts were housed. These manuscripts, dating back to the 13th century, consist of African documents ranging from scholarly works to short letters that have been preserved by private households in Timbuktu. The institute's Vice Director Cissé gave us a tour. He showed us the location where the militant jihadists had burned the manuscripts they found: those on display and those being worked on in the restoration studio. Though these incidents classify as forms of iconoclasm, I want to draw attention to the following problem.

In the city's Grande Mosque, several tombs of Sufi saints are embedded in the outside wall of the mosque. These were vandalized by the militant jihadists, some were booby trapped or filled with feces as a means of desecration but, luckily, they did not suffer the same fate as some neighboring Sufi tombs, which were completely demolished. The reason for the iconoclastic outbreak, as given by the radical jihadists, was that, according to Sharia Law, one is not allowed to worship either images of humans or human remains: in this case, the buried holy men of the Sufis, who we call the Sufi saints. Unfortunately, the devastation was not limited to the Sufi cultural properties. The Catholic Church of Timbuktu was completely devastated, and a wooden statue of the Virgin Mary was found lying on the altar, the statue's face totally scratched out – a classic iconoclastic deed, of the sort that has been practiced for millennia. Apart from establishing the return of religious-inspired iconoclasm, after it was already a phenomenon in the early part of the European Middle Ages, another question arises. Taking into account today's understanding that the destruction of cultural property is considered a crime or, in this case, a war crime, of which the perpetrators can be prosecuted and sentenced under national or, if this is not functioning, international criminal law, we have to wonder if human remains are cultural property. For instance, the "plastified" bodies created by German artist and scientist Gunther von Hagens are referred to in the press as "corpse art," but not everyone agrees with that. For instance, a spokeswoman for the British Nuffield Foundation was quoted in *The Observer* as saying, "Human tissue should not be bought and sold or otherwise treated as an object of commerce. Body parts, anatomical specimens or preserved bodies should not be displayed in connection with public entertainment or art" (*The Observer*

17 March 2002). At the same time, we do consider Egyptian mummies on display to be cultural heritage and, in some countries, remains of deceased royals are, in the legal sense, cultural properties owned by their respective governments. Indeed throughout history, human remains were kept and worshipped as relics, and they, too, are considered cultural property. The bodies of my family members, the Habsburgs, are technically considered the cultural property of the Austrian state.

There are good reasons to classify human remains as cultural property (including religious heritage), a combination of material, intangible and natural heritage. The intangible element is, for instance, the memory aspect that we also find in phenomena like traumascapes, narratives and *lieux de memoires*, either material, immaterial or a combination of both. Last but not least, and as said by French historian Pierre Nora, it is all about the link between memory and identity; therefore remembrance days, symbols, persons and even songs can trigger memories of a specific historical event. Consequently, symbolic places of memory are important components of national and local identity, or cultural distinctiveness. It would be very useful if all of these aspects could be topics of multidisciplinary research and debate, for instance between art-historians, legal experts, sociologists and anthropologists.

Apart from the terrible devastation of cultural property in, for instance, Syria, which takes place on a daily basis, there is a (global) safety risk connected with cultural property protection or cultural property destruction. Examples are the fact that fighting factions loot cultural objects to sell on the international markets; profits are used to buy weapons and ammunition, thus prolonging a conflict. In addition, and to illustrate the topicality of the subject, as I am writing this foreword, I heard on the news that the Turkish government is considering taking action in the Syrian conflict, in order to protect an important tomb located in Syria. In the same news broadcast, and according to the *Art Newspaper*, it is reported that Scythian gold and other rare artifacts from the Crimea, on loan to an Amsterdam museum, are in legal limbo after Russia's annexation of the Crimea.

These are reasons for multidisciplinary research on cultural property crimes, of which this book is a fine and important example. One way to begin is the creation of a university chair dealing with cultural property in the event of conflict and occupation. There are many requests from students all over the world that need supervision on this issue. I hope academia feels responsible enough to endow such a chair on shorter notice. Academic books like this one go a long way to promote the study of this relatively new multidisciplinary field, and I am proud to be a part of it.

*Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen, LL.M., MBA, MLE*

# Preface

Terrorists alternately sell looted antiquities for millions, and bulldoze entire ancient cities. A Cambodian statue is put up for auction, then withdrawn when its missing feet are found back at the temple from which it was looted, still attached to a plinth. Tomb raiders plunder Etruscan treasure troves in Italy and all the best material seems to be funneled to major museums through only three notorious dealers, who hold a miniature oligopoly cornering the illicit antiquities market. Thieves steal paintings from Ireland and are chased to Antwerp, in a heist of cinematic proportions, while a crafty detective, teaming up with a reformed gangster and bare-knuckle boxing champion, pursues. An art forger, once caught, launches a career of wealth and celebrity, raising the question of whether he wasn't better off found-out than when he was getting away with his crime.

These are just a few of the stories told and analyzed in this volume of essays on the understudied, yet endlessly fascinating world of art crime. Divided into four parts (Forgers, Terrorists, Tomb Raiders and Thieves), representing looks at fakes and forgeries; terrorism, policing and investigation; the illicit trade in looted antiquities; and law, war and policy as related to art, the collection features the leading scholars and professionals in what is a very small field – indeed, you could count on two hands the true experts *not* included in this volume, which truly represents a who's-who of the study of art crime. The authors are intentionally drawn from a variety of backgrounds, not all of them academic. You will find the former head of Scotland Yard's Arts Unit and a retired undercover detective writing alongside decorated professors, world-renowned lawyers and former Ministers of Culture. This diversity demonstrates the strength in unity against crimes that take advantage of, or worse, damage and destroy, cultural heritage. The voices of professionals who learn critical information in the field are as precious as the theoretical analyses of professors in their university offices, and we all have a common goal: protecting cultural heritage and impeding the progress of organized crime and terrorist groups, both of which benefit from traffic in stolen art and looted antiquities. We have allowed the authors to write in a voice most comfortable to them, which sacrifices some of the normal unity of style that is traditional to academic books like this one, in favor of providing a platform for more writers of various backgrounds. Some essays are conversational, others highly analytical, but all are clear, well-written and present not only interesting stories and analyses, but also concrete suggestions for future improvement, which is often lacking from academic texts that offer problems without solutions.

One thing that all of the authors have in common (as do just about all of the experts whose work is not included in this volume) is a connection with ARCA. ARCA was founded as a non-profit research group in 2007, after the success of a conference held at the University of Cambridge, where I was a student at the time. The conference was apparently the first to bring together police and academics from around the world to discuss art crime. It was covered in *The New York Times Magazine*,<sup>1</sup> and praised as having essentially established a new field of study. I established ARCA with the encouragement of those who attended the conference (many of whom served as the initial trustees), and this book is, in many ways, the fruit of that conference.

At ARCA's core, it is a research group which promotes the academic study of art crime in a variety of ways. We run an annual conference on this subject, held every June in Italy, at which we give out annual awards for those who have distinguished themselves in this field, many of whom are contributors to this volume.<sup>2</sup> We run what is the first (and to date the only) interdisciplinary academic program on art crime in our annual, summer-long Postgraduate Certificate Program in Art Crime and Cultural Heritage Protection. While students of all ages (our youngest has been 21, our oldest in their mid-60s) and from around the world gather in the beautiful Umbrian hill town of Amelia (about an hour outside of Rome) for ten summer weeks, we bring together experts to teach intensive, 25-hour-long courses in their specialty fields.<sup>3</sup> The former head of Scotland Yard's Arts Squad teaches a course in art policing and investigation, while storied professors teach courses in criminology, art and organized crime, art law and so on. This book represents our academic program in miniature, and is likewise a follow-up to ARCA's first book, *Art & Crime: Exploring the Dark Side of the Art World* (Praeger, 2009), similarly a collection of essays. This was followed by *The Thefts of the Mona Lisa: On Stealing the World's Most Famous Painting* (ARCA Press, 2011), a book-length essay on the many crimes involving or related to Leonardo's masterpiece. Like those books, any royalties from this one go directly to supporting ARCA's activities. No authors, nor I as the editor, receive any compensation, so your purchase is in support of a good cause.

In addition to books, conferences and an academic program, ARCA also publishes, twice-yearly, a peer-reviewed academic journal, *The Journal of Art Crime*. Now in its fifth year, this remains the only academic journal dedicated to this subject, and this book is something of a celebration of it. Around half of the chapters here began as articles in the journal, so this book is a sort of best-off from the journal's first years, though each article has been updated by its author. The remaining chapters were specifically written for this book, and are published here for the first time. If you are a student or enthusiast of this subject, we encourage you to subscribe to *The Journal of Art Crime*,

consider attending one of our conferences, or even our academic program. Information may be found at [www.artcrimeresearch.org](http://www.artcrimeresearch.org).

Before the book begins, it is useful to define a few terms. Some are confused by the interchangeable usage of fake and forgery. Technically there is a difference: a forgery is a new work, made from scratch, in fraudulent imitation of something else, whereas a fake is an existing work that is altered in some way so that it appears to be something else. But in practice, people tend to use these terms interchangeably, so the technical definitions are somewhat pedantic. Looted antiquities are distinct from “art theft” or “stolen art” in that looting involves the illicit removal of objects that remained buried in the earth (or sometimes the sea), and therefore have never existed before, for modern humans, which means that they will never appear on a listing of stolen works of art, because the last time they were seen was perhaps thousands of years ago. Stolen art, or art theft, tends to refer to stolen art or antiquities taken from extant collections, either public or private, but are known and accounted for, and therefore their loss can be reported. The term “organized crime” is often assumed to mean large international mafias, and it certainly can refer to such groups, but criminologically, it has a much broader definition: any group of three or more individuals working together in criminal enterprises for collective, long-term goals.

No one truly knowledgeable about art crime doubts that terrorist groups are involved in looted antiquities and that most art crime, since the Second World War, has involved organized crime at some level. Therefore, whether or not you are an art lover, it is objectively important to protect art and curb art crime, if you wish to impede the activities of organized criminals and terrorists. In 2005, it was announced at the annual Interpol Stolen Works of Art conference that intelligence efforts since 9/11 had demonstrated the links between stolen art/looted antiquities, terrorist funding and organized crime. It was even suggested that art crime was the third-highest-grossing annual criminal trade worldwide, behind only the drug and arms trades (all of which is discussed in several chapters here). This is the answer to the question that may arise, why should we care? Or, rather, is art crime *really* that serious? The simple answer is yes. This has been underlined in the weeks prior to my writing this introduction, specifically with international organizations confirming that ISIS has made millions selling looted antiquities, when it wasn't destroying them.

Thank you for your interest in art crime. We hope that the impressive essays in this book will be informative and inspire you to explore the field, and ARCA's activities, further.

**Noah Charney**  
ARCA Founder & President

## Notes

1. Mueller, Tom “To Sketch a Thief” in *The New York Times Magazine* (17 December 2007).
2. Past ARCA Award winners represented here include Duncan Chappell, Vernon Rapley, Charlie Hill, Laurie Rush, Neil Brodie, Simon MacKenzie, Paolo Giorgio Ferri, Francesco Rutelli, Karl von Habsburg, George Abungu and Howard Spiegler.
3. Past lecturers or professors on the ARCA Program represented in this book include Arthur Tompkins, Lawrence Rothfield, Christos Tsirogiannis, Neil Brodie, Stefano Alessandrini, Laurie Rush and Duncan Chappell.



# Acknowledgments

This book is the fruit of a collective effort. ARCA is an organization that I may have founded, but the success of which has little to do with me. Since it was conceived, back in Cambridge, England, in the summer of 2006, I might have hoped, but could not imagine, that it would become an established, internationally recognized authority in this unusual field, bringing together the disparate scholars, police, museum staff, investigators, conservators, lawyers, archaeologists, criminologists and more, who wish to protect art and study those who ill-use it, in order to better protect it in the future. There are too many to thank, and everyone who contributed to this volume and to *The Journal of Art Crime* over the years, its authors and editorial board, should be named, but you know who you are. The dedicated ARCA staff and trustees, led by Lynda Albertson and featuring Crispin Corrado and Monica di Stefano, are warm, passionate people and a pleasure to work with. *The JAC*, as we call it, could not exist without the stylings of Urška Charney, and the assistance of my co-editors, Marc Balcells and Christos Tsirogiannis.

At Palgrave, thanks go to Julia Willan, who saw this project as something special and eased it through the process ably, and to Dominic Walker, who put its intriguing but sometimes wayward pieces together. Meg Lambert and Christine Weirich assisted with Mackenzie and Davis' chapter, and Lauren Zaneikis assisted with proofreading.

This volume is a small gift to readers, and to ARCA, because all the contributors kindly offered to write without compensation for this book, all profits from which go directly to support ARCA's research and education activities.

It is surprisingly exhausting and difficult to establish and maintain a not-for-profit organization. It is inevitably a collaborative effort, even for a tiny organization like ARCA. We have been honored to collaborate with so many incredibly kind, generous, supportive and brilliant people, and so many storied organizations, over the years.

A humble and sincere thank you.

# Contributors

**George H.O. Abungu** is a Cambridge-trained archaeologist and former Director-General of the National Museums of Kenya. He is the founding chairman of Africa 2009, ISCOA (the International Standing Committee on the Traffic in Illicit Antiquities) and CHDA, the Centre for Heritage Development in Africa (ex-PMDA), among others. He has been a guest scholar at the Getty Conservation Institute in Los Angeles, chairman of the Kenya Cultural Centre, and is CEO of Okello Abungu Heritage Consultants. He has been a visiting lecturer at a number of universities, including Gothenburg University in Sweden, and the University of Western Cape in South Africa. He has over 60 publications in the disciplines of archaeology, heritage management, and museology, culture and development and has championed the role of the arts and its respect and protection in many of his publications, public forums and in his works as a museum professional, scholar and administrator. He has been an advisor to the Aluka project of the Mellon Foundation, the Global Heritage Fund, and is Vice President of the International Council of Museums (ICOM), a member of the International Jury of the UNESCO Melina Mecouri International Prize for Safeguard and Management of Cultural Landscapes and a board member for the Trust for African Rock Art (TARA), among others. He has sat on the World Monuments Watch panel and was Kenya's Representative to the UNESCO World Heritage Committee, and Vice President of its Bureau (2004–2009).

**Stefano Alessandrini** has worked for decades with the Archaeological Group of Rome (GAR), with a special focus on looting and the Etruscan necropolis of Cerveteri. In 1996, he became Head of the Office for the Protection of the Cultural Heritage for the Archaeological Groups of Italy, a position he served until 2010. In 2000, the Public Prosecutor's office in Rome appointed Alessandrini to examine the Medici files seized in Geneva, which included photographs of ancient objects. He identified more than 400 artworks illicitly exported to museums and collections around the world. He decided to involve Italia Nostra, the most important Italian Association dedicated to the protection of cultural heritage, in the proceedings and, in 2007, he was appointed to become a member of the Board of Directors of the Rome section of Italia Nostra. As an expert consultant appointed by Studio Legale A. Quarta, Alessandrini examined evidence, conducted research and provided expert advice during the preparation of the criminal trials against Marion True, Robert Hecht, Gianfranco Becchina and in further proceedings against traffickers of archaeological artifacts. He continues to investigate, research and write briefs, articles and reports on looted and/or

stolen artworks, identifying key elements and applicable legislation. Since 2006, he has been a specialist consultant to the Ministero per i Beni Culturali and the Advocate General Maurizio Fiorilli, for the negotiations with the Cleveland Museum of Art, the Ny Carlsberg Museum of Copenhagen and the Princeton Museum. Together with other experts and scholars, he assisted in the preparation of a scientific report on stolen Italian cultural artifacts which are presently stored in a warehouse owned by Robin Symes and now held by Mr. Symes's Receivers.

**Colonel Matthew Bogdanos** is a homicide prosecutor for the New York County District Attorney's Office. A native New Yorker raised waiting tables in his family's Greek restaurant in Lower Manhattan, he is a former middleweight boxer who joined the U.S. Marine Corps at 19. Leaving active duty in 1988 for the DA's Office, he remained in the reserves, led a counter-narcotics operation on the Mexican border and served in Desert Storm, South Korea, Lithuania, Guyana, Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan and Kosovo. Losing his apartment near the World Trade Center on 11 September 2001, he joined a counter-terrorism task force in Afghanistan, receiving a Bronze Star for actions against al-Qaeda. He then served in the Horn of Africa and three tours in Iraq, leading the international investigation into the looting of Iraq's National Museum. Exposing the link between antiquities trafficking and terrorist financing, and presenting those findings at the United Nations, Interpol, British Parliament and the Peace Palace in The Hague, he received a National Humanities Medal from President Bush in 2005, before deploying again to Afghanistan in 2009. He holds a classics degree from Bucknell University; a law degree, a master's degree in classics and a Recognition of Achievement in International Law from Columbia University; and a master's degree in strategic studies from the Army War College. In addition to dozens of military decorations, he received a 2007 Proclamation from the City of New York, a 2009 Proclamation from the City of Philadelphia and a 2011 Ellis Island Medal of Honor. Returning to the DA's Office in October 2010, he still boxes and continues the hunt for stolen antiquities. All royalties from his book, *Thieves of Baghdad*, are donated to the Iraq Museum.

**Neil Brodie** is a senior research fellow in the Scottish Centre for Crime and Justice Research at the University of Glasgow. He is an archaeologist by training, and has held positions at the British School at Athens, the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at the University of Cambridge, where he was Research Director of the Illicit Antiquities Research Centre, and Stanford University's Archaeology Center. He was co-author (with Jennifer Doole and Peter Watson) of the report *Stealing History*, commissioned by the Museums Association and ICOM-UK to advise upon the illicit trade in cultural material. He also co-edited *Archaeology, Cultural Heritage, and the Antiquities Trade* (with Morag M. Kersel, Christina Luke and Kathryn

Walker Tubb, 2006), *Illicit Antiquities: The Theft of Culture and the Extinction of Archaeology* (with Kathryn Walker Tubb, 2002) and *Trade in Illicit Antiquities: The Destruction of the World's Archaeological Heritage* (with Jennifer Doole and Colin Renfrew, 2001). He has worked on archaeological projects in the United Kingdom, Greece and Jordan, and continues to work in Greece. In 2011, he won the Anthony and Eleanor Vallombroso Award for Art Crime Scholarship.

**Toby J.A. Bull** holds three academic degrees, including a BA (Hons) in fine arts valuation and an MSc in risk, crisis and disaster management. He continued his studies in the arts by becoming a qualified art authenticator, studying at the Centre for Cultural Material Conservation and graduating from the University of Melbourne, Australia. He has extensive knowledge in forensic art authentication methods, as well as in the more theoretical and academic studies surrounding art fraud. His main interests include the topic of fakes and forgeries of Chinese ceramics and the problems of smuggled illicit antiquities emanating out of China. He has subsequently seen his work on this subject published in *Art & Crime: Exploring the Dark Side of the Art Market* (2009), as well as in *Cultural Property Crime* (2014). He also writes an editorial column for the *Journal of Art Crime*. Since 1993, he has worked for the Hong Kong Police Force. His expertise in the field of art crime has also led to him becoming an advisor to ARCA. He has lectured extensively on the art trade and beyond on topics surrounding art crime to the likes of Sotheby's Institute of Art and The World Congress of Forensics, Asia Art Week in London, as well as to the annual ARCA "Interdisciplinary Art Crime & Cultural Heritage Protection Conference" held in Italy. He recently chaired the Forensic DNA Panel at the World Gene Convention, where he presented a paper on synthetic DNA and its applications for the art and fine wine markets in helping to combat fakes. Seeing the disparity between public and private involvement in the field of art crime and its associated spin-offs, he founded TrackArt in 2011 – Hong Kong's first Art Risk Consultancy.

**Duncan Chappell** is a lawyer, criminologist and former Director of the Australian Institute of Criminology. He is also the chair of the Australian Research Council's Centre of Excellence in Policing and Security. Currently an adjunct professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of Sydney, he has researched and published on art crime as well as acting as an expert in art crime cases. His recent publications include *Crime in the Art and Antiquities World. Illegal Trafficking in Cultural Property* (co-author, 2011). In 2013, he won the Eleanor and Anthony Vallombroso Award for Art Crime Scholarship.

**Noah Charney** is Adjunct Professor of Art History, teaching at the American University of Rome, Brown University in Rome and the University of

Ljubljana. He is also the founder of ARCA, an international research group. He is editor-in-chief of *The Journal of Art Crime*, and writes regularly for a variety of magazines and newspapers, including *Esquire*, *The Atlantic*, *The Washington Post*, *The Daily Beast*, *Tendencias del Mercado de Arte*, *ArtInfo*, *The Art Newspaper*, *CNN*, *The Guardian* (for which he teaches a Guardian Masterclass called “How to write about art”) and many more. His many books include *The Art Thief*, *Art & Crime: Exploring the Dark Side of the Art World*, *Stealing the Mystic Lamb: The True Story of the World’s Most Coveted Masterpiece*, *The Thefts of the Mona Lisa* and *The Wine Forger’s Handbook*. His latest books are *The Art of Forgery* (2015), and *The Collector of Lives: Giorgio Vasari and the Invention of Art* (co-authored with Ingrid Rowland, 2016).

**Simon A. Cole** specializes in the historical and sociological study of the interaction between science, technology, law and criminal justice. He is the author of *Suspect Identities: A History of Fingerprinting and Criminal Identification* (2001), which was awarded the 2003 Rachel Carson Prize by the Society for the Social Studies of Science. He teaches courses in forensic science and society, surveillance and society, miscarriages of justice, the death penalty, historical criminology, and science, technology and law, and is co-editor of the journal *Theoretical Criminology*. He is Director of the Newkirk Center for Science & Society and is affiliated with the Department of History and the University of California–Irvine School for Social Ecology.

**Tess Davis** is an affiliate researcher in the Scottish Centre for Crime and Justice Research at the University of Glasgow. She comes to this project from the Lawyers’ Committee for Cultural Heritage Preservation – a not-for-profit institution based in the United States – where she was Executive Director until 2012. She previously worked for the nongovernmental organization Heritage Watch in Cambodia, first as Project Coordinator, and finally Assistant Director. Her career began at the Archaeological Institute of America. For the past decade, she has devoted herself to fighting the pillage of ancient sites and trafficking of artifacts, particularly in Southeast Asia. She has conducted extensive research on the illicit trade in Cambodian antiquities. She also conceptualized and implemented a number of exciting projects in the country, including an exhibition at Angkor Wat about threats facing the temple, a hotline for the public to report archaeological discoveries or looting, and a children’s book on preservation entitled *If the Stones Could Speak*. More recently, she spearheaded the creation of a heritage law database, as well as a legal internship program there. Due to this and her other work, she has been interviewed by *CNN*, *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times*, the Public Broadcasting Station (PBS), Voice of America (VOA), the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC), *The Phnom Penh Post* and *The Cambodia Daily*, among other national and international media outlets. While at the University of Glasgow, she aims to better comprehend the laundering of

antiquities, by tracing their journey from the ground in Cambodia, through the illicit and licit markets, to their stopping point in private and public collections. She will focus on a single style of statuary from a single site, Koh Ker, the brief capital of the Khmer Empire. Due to its remoteness, the temple complex was only “rediscovered” in the late 19th century and remained largely untouched until 1970, when Cambodia plummeted into decades of civil war, genocide and foreign occupation. During that time, throughout the turn of the millennium, the site was heavily plundered. For these reasons and others, it presents an opportunity to supplement other studies in the field, ask broader questions about trafficking and seek to answer them. Tess graduated magna cum laude from Boston University with a Bachelor of Arts in Archaeology and she holds a juris doctor degree from the University of Georgia School of Law. She now serves on the Advisory Board of Heritage Watch and the Ocean Foundation and is vice chair of the American Society of International Law’s Cultural Heritage and the Arts Interest Group. She is admitted to the New York State Bar, Third Department, and is a member of the New York State Bar Association. Tess is the research lead on “From Illicit to Licit: The Laundering of Looted Antiquities into Legitimate Artworks.”

**Asif Efrat** is Assistant Professor of Government at the Interdisciplinary Center (IDC) Herzliya, Israel. He holds a PhD in government from Harvard University and has taught at Cornell Law School. He is the author of the book *Governing Guns, Preventing Plunder: International Cooperation against Illicit Trade*.

**Paolo Giorgio Ferri** is a former Italian State Prosecutor and recipient of the 2011 ARCA Award for Art Policing and Recovery.

**David Gill** is Professor of Archaeological Heritage and Head of the Division of Humanities at University Campus Suffolk. He was a Rome Scholar at the British School of Rome and a Sir James Knott Fellow at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. He was subsequently part of the Department of Antiquities at the Fitzwilliam Museum, University of Cambridge, and Reader in Mediterranean Archaeology at Swansea University. He has published widely on archaeological ethics with Christopher Chippindale. He has recently completed a history of British archaeological work in Greece prior to the First World War.

**Blake Gopnik**, a longtime art critic at *The Washington Post* and *Newsweek*, is now working on a biography of Andy Warhol for HarperCollins. He is critic-at-large for Artnet News, and his Daily Pic appears there and at [BlakeGopnik.com](http://BlakeGopnik.com).

**Patricia Kennedy Grimsted** is a research associate at the Ukrainian Research Institute at Harvard University and an honorary fellow of the International Institute of Social History, Amsterdam. She holds a PhD in Russian history from the University of California, Berkeley (1964) and has taught at several universities, including American University and the University of Maryland in the Washington area. She has received many fellowships and awards; she was a fellow at the Center for Advanced Holocaust Studies of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum (2000–2001), and in 2002 she received the Distinguished Contribution to Slavic Studies Award from the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies. She is the West's leading authority on archives of the former Soviet Union, the Russian Federation, Ukraine and the other Soviet successor states. She is the author of several historical monographs, documentary publications and a series of directories and many other studies on Soviet-area archives, including the comprehensive *Archives of Russia: A Directory and Bibliographic Guide to Holdings in Moscow and St. Petersburg* (Russian edition, 1997; English edition, 2000). She has written widely on World War II displaced cultural treasures (see below). Her numerous other activities include direction of ArcheoBiblioBase, a collaborative electronic directory project with data from the Federal Archival Service of Russia and the National Committee on Archives of Ukraine, maintained by the International Institute of Social History, Amsterdam. She is currently consulting for the Conference on Jewish Material Claims against Germany, assisting in the preparation of a virtual reconstruction of remaining dispersed fragments of the wartime records of the Einsatzstab Reichsleiter Rosenberg (ERR), in cooperation with the Bundesarchiv (German Federal Archives).

**Karl von Habsburg-Lothringen** has been President of the Association of National Committees of the Blue Shield (ANCBS) since 2008. He is a former member of the European Parliament for Austria and has specialized in international humanitarian law and intangible cultural heritage protection. A former air force pilot, he is still serving in the reserve of the Austrian armed forces as a key Cultural Property Protection Officer. He is Vice President of the Austrian Society for the Protection of Cultural Heritage and a founder member of Blue Shield Austria. In addition to being a frequent lecturer, he is an author of several publications on the subject of intangible cultural heritage protection and military cultural property protection and has carried out multiple documentation missions in conflict zones. In 2012, he won, jointly with Joris Kila, the ARCA Award for Art Protection and Security.

**Jerome Hasler** specializes in strategic communications and reputation management for Art Recovery Group. He oversees the company's press office and external relations and advises clients on their media engagement. Upon graduating from the Courtauld Institute of Art, London, he spent two years

as a strategist within Bell Pottinger's Geopolitical division, working on international political and corporate accounts. He advised clients on communications for political campaigns, foreign direct investment, litigation, stakeholder relations and crisis management for clients in Europe, Africa and the Middle East.

**Charles Hill** is a former Detective Chief Inspector in the London Metropolitan Police. He served in Vietnam in the 173rd Airborne Brigade, US 51668287, and graduated from George Washington University with a BA in history. He was a Fulbright scholar at Trinity College Dublin. In retirement, he has worked as a sole trader, art crime researcher and security consultant. In 2010, he won the ARCA Award for Art Policing and Recovery.

**Saskia Hufnagel** is Lecturer in Criminal Law at Queen Mary University London. She previously worked as a research fellow at the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence in Policing and Security, Griffith University, Australia, and was a Leverhulme Fellow at the University of Leeds. During the completion of her PhD, she taught at the ANU College of Law, and between 2009 and 2011 she held a permanent teaching position at the University of Canberra. Her main research areas encompass law enforcement cooperation in Asia, North America, the EU and Australasia, comparative constitutional and human rights law with a focus on terrorism legislation and the policing of art crime. She has widely published on national and international police cooperation, security, comparative constitutional law and art crime.

**Martin Kemp** is Emeritus Research Professor of the History of Art at Oxford University. He has written and broadcast extensively on imagery in art and science from the Renaissance to the present day. He speaks on issues of visualization and lateral thinking to a wide range of audiences. Leonardo da Vinci has been the subject of a number of books, including *Leonardo* (2004). He has published on imagery in the sciences of anatomy, natural history and optics, including *The Science of Art: Optical Themes in Western Art from Brunelleschi to Seurat* (1992). He was trained in Natural Sciences and Art History at Cambridge University and the Courtauld Institute of Art, University of London. He was British Academy Wolfson Research Professor (1993–1998). For more than 25 years, he was based in Scotland (University of Glasgow and University of St Andrews). He has held visiting posts in Princeton, New York, North Carolina, Los Angeles and Montreal. He has curated a series of exhibitions on Leonardo and other themes, including "Spectacular Bodies" at the Hayward Gallery in London, "Leonardo da Vinci: Experience, Experiment, Design" at the Victoria and Albert Museum in 2006 and "Seduced: Sex and Art from Antiquity to Now," Barbican Art Gallery,



London, 2007. He was also guest curator for “Circa 1492” at the National Gallery of Art in Washington in 1992.

**John Kerr** is Lecturer in Criminology at the University of Roehampton, London. Until 2012, he was based at City University, London, and also lectured at London South Bank University.

**Simon MacKenzie** is a professor in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow and a member of the criminological research staff at the Scottish Centre for Crime and Justice Research. He is a socio-legal criminologist with a law degree from Edinburgh followed by several years of legal practice, an MPhil in criminological research from Cambridge and a PhD in criminology from Melbourne. He is the author of *Going, Going, Gone: Regulating the Market in Illicit Antiquities* (2005), which won the British Society of Criminology book prize in 2006. With Penny Green, he conducted an ESRC-funded evaluation of the Dealing in Cultural Objects (Offences) Act 2003, with the results published in their edited collection *Criminology and Archaeology: Studies in Looted Antiquities*, Oñati International Series in Law and Society (2009). He has held grants and research contracts from bodies including the ESRC, AHRC, UNODC, European Commission, UK Home Office, and in the case of the Trafficking Culture project, the European Research Council. As well as coordinating the Trafficking Culture project, he is Programme Director for SCCJR’s MSc in Transnational Crime, Justice and Security, an associate editor of the *Howard Journal for Criminal Justice*, a member of the editorial board of the *British Journal of Criminology* and sits on the Arts and Humanities Research Council’s Peer Review College. His main research interests are in white-collar crime, organized crime, policing and regulation, and transnational criminal markets. In 2014, he won the Eleanor and Anthony Vallombroso Award for Art Crime Scholarship.

**Christopher A. Marinello** is one of the world’s foremost experts in recovering stolen, looted and missing works of art. A lawyer for over 28 years, Chris began his legal career as a litigator and became uniquely proficient in negotiating complex title disputes between collectors, dealers, museums and insurance companies. He has recovered stolen and looted artwork valued at over \$350 million. In 2013, he founded Art Recovery Group – providing professional, authoritative due diligence and recovery services for the international art market and cultural heritage sectors. Art Recovery Group has also developed the ArtClaim Database – a new, technologically advanced system for the identification and cataloging of issues attached to works of art. As an adjunct professor at New York University, he has taught law and ethics in the art market and has recently co-developed an annual conference on art crime in London and New York City.

**Vernon Rapley** is Security Director at the Victoria & Albert Museum, London, UK. He is also founder and chairman of the National Museum Security Group, the UK lead for Tourism on the Cross-Sector Security and Safety Communications Group and a member of the ACPO (Association of Chief Police Officers) Heritage and Cultural Property Crime Working Group. Before joining the V&A in 2010, he served as a police officer for 24 years, the last ten years as the head of the Art & Antiques Unit at New Scotland Yard. During that time, he overtly and covertly investigated all manner of art and cultural property crime. He formed a number of long-lasting community partnerships, including the creation of ArtBEAT, a unique use of expert volunteers, drawn from the art community to assist the police. Toward the end of his police career, he organized two exhibitions of Fakes & Forgeries, the last one in early 2010 attracted 30,000 visitors in just three weeks. In 2009, he won the ARCA Award for Art Policing and Recovery.

**Lawrence Rothfield** is founder and former Faculty Director of the Cultural Policy Center at the University of Chicago. He has written or edited books and reports that have impacted policymaking on topics ranging from censorship and public funding of museums to the economic impact of urban cultural “scenes.” Rothfield’s main policy focus, however, is on heritage protection, in particular the problem of protecting archaeological sites and museums from looting. Publications on that topic include an edited volume, *Antiquities under Siege: Cultural Heritage Protection after the Iraq War*, and a book on the disastrous failure to secure Iraq’s sites and museums from looting in the wake of the 2003 US invasion, *The Rape of Mesopotamia: Behind the Looting of the Iraq Museum*.

**Laurie W. Rush** is an anthropologist and archaeologist who has served as a US Army civilian for 16 years managing Cultural Resources at Fort Drum, NY. She has a BA from Indiana University Bloomington and an MA and a PhD from Northwestern University, and is a fellow of the National Science Foundation and of the American Academy in Rome. Her research specialty is Native Americans of northeastern North America, and she serves as Native American Affairs Coordinator for the 10th Mountain Division and Fort Drum. She was the military liaison for return of the Mesopotamian City of Ur to the Iraqi People in 2009, represented US Central Command at Environmental Shuras in Kabul in 2010 and analyzed cultural property protection lessons learned from the Iraq and Afghan conflicts for the US Central Command Environmental Program. She is serving on an international panel writing cultural property protection policy and doctrine for NATO. She lectures widely to both military and civilian audiences on the importance of identification of and respect for cultural property on the battlefield. Educational materials developed by her team in partnership with Colorado

State University have reached over 150,000 US military personnel and are also being used by UNESCO, Blue Shield International and foreign allies. She has been recognized by her peers as a US Committee of the Blue Shield Board Member, with the Register of Professional Archaeologists Special Achievement Award, the Advisory Council for Historic Preservation Chairman's Award for Federal Achievement in Historic Preservation, many Army and DoD awards and the Booth Family Rome Prize for Historic Preservation. She is the editor of the recent book *Archaeology, Cultural Property, and the Military*, and author of numerous articles and book chapters concerning the importance of military education and planning for cultural property protection in crisis areas. She has also been recognized in the national media as a modern "Monuments Woman" and is featured in the new book *Lives in Ruins*.

**Francesco Rutelli** is an Italian politician, currently serving as President of Associazione Priorita Cultura and Honorary President of the Institute for Cultural Diplomacy, Berlin. He is the co-chairman of the European Democratic Party. He is the founder and President of the Centre for a Sustainable Future (a nonpartisan think-tank on climate change and environmental issues). He is also the co-chairman of the steering committee of the Silk Road Cities Alliance (a multilateral forum aimed at fostering cultural and economic cooperation along the historical Silk Roads from China). He was Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Culture and Tourism of Italy (2001–2008); he was the first Mayor of Rome (1993–2001) directly elected by the citizens. In 2009, he won the ARCA Award for Art Security and Protection.

**Howard Spiegler** is the co-chair of Herrick, Feinstein's International Art Law Group, which handles all aspects of commercial art matters. He has been involved in several well-known litigations brought on behalf of foreign governments and heirs of Holocaust victims and others to recover stolen artwork or other cultural property, including the settlement of the long-standing litigation brought on behalf of the Estate of Lea Bondi Jaray to recover a Schiele painting confiscated by a Nazi agent in Austria in the late 1930s, which resulted in the recovery of the full value of the painting by the Estate. Howard was also involved in the recovery by the heir of the famous Jewish art dealer Jacques Goudstikker of 200 Nazi-looted artworks from the Dutch Government; recoveries on behalf of the Republic of Turkey of numerous valuable antiquities; and the action brought on behalf of the heirs of Kazimir Malevich to recover Malevich artworks from the City of Amsterdam, which resulted in the recovery by the heirs of five Malevich paintings. He holds a JD degree from Columbia University School of Law. He regularly writes and speaks around the world on issues relating to art

law. In 2010, he won a Lifetime Achievement in Defense of Art Award from ARCA.

**Arthur Tompkins** was appointed a District Court Judge in New Zealand in 1997. He holds general and jury trial warrants, and is a Panel Convenor of the New Zealand Parole Board. He is also a Judge of the Supreme Court of Pitcairn Island. Prior to his appointment as a judge, he was in private practice in Auckland, New Zealand, as a commercial barrister. He holds a BA in law from Canterbury University, Christchurch, New Zealand (1983), and an MA in law from Cambridge University (1984). He teaches “Art in War,” part of the annual Postgraduate Certificate in Art Crime and Cultural Heritage Protection Studies, presented by ARCA, Amelia, Italy.

**Christos Tsirogiannis**, a Greek forensic archaeologist, studied archaeology and history of art in the University of Athens. He worked for the Greek Ministries of Culture and Justice (1994–2008) and voluntarily cooperated with the Greek police Art Squad (2004–2008). He was a member of the Greek Task Force repatriating looted, smuggled and stolen antiquities from the Getty Museum, the Shelby White/Leon Levy collection, the Jean-David Cahn AG galleries and others. Since 2007, he has been identifying illicit antiquities from the confiscated Medici, Becchina and Symes-Michaelides archives in museums, galleries, auction houses and private collections, notifying the relevant government authorities. In 2013, he won the annual Award for Art Protection and Security from ARCA. He holds a PhD from the University of Cambridge (2013), and his thesis was on the international illicit antiquities network viewed through the Robin Symes–Christos Michaelides archive. He has a regular column, “Nekyia,” in *The Journal of Art Crime* and has published various cases of previously undetected illicit antiquities. Since May 2014, he has been a research assistant in the Scottish Centre for Crime and Justice Research at the University of Glasgow.

**William Wei** is a senior conservation scientist in the conservation science department of the Cultural Heritage Agency of the Netherlands (RCE), and program manager for the RCE program “Sustainable Heritage.” He conducts research into the effects of aging, cleaning and treatments of objects on their appearance, including paintings, photographs and outdoor sculpture. He is also investigating the effect of vibrations on objects in order to provide practical solutions for their protection. The “Sustainable Heritage” program is helping owners and managers of historic buildings and museums find a balance between technologies for energy efficiency on the one hand, and maintaining cultural heritage value on the other. One of his major interests is how conservation decisions are influenced by major differences in how cultural heritage and its value are perceived by different cultural heritage

professions, related industries and the general public. He has trained as a Socratic dialogue moderator and, over the past three years, has organized dialogues on a number of controversial issues in conservation ethics and perception, in order to bring participants to a better understanding of each other's views.

# **Part I**

## **Forgers: Fakes and Forgeries**