

Volume 1
of An Analytical Commentary on
the *Philosophical Investigations*

Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning

Part II: Exegesis §§1–184

G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker

Fellows of St John's College · Oxford

Second, extensively revised edition

by

P. M. S. Hacker

 **Blackwell**
Publishing

Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning

Part II: Exegesis §§1–184



Other volumes of this Commentary

Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity, Volume 2 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker

Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind, Volume 3 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

Part I: Essays

P. M. S. Hacker

Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind, Volume 3 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

Part II: Exegesis §§243–427

P. M. S. Hacker

Wittgenstein: Mind and Will, Volume 4 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

Part I: Essays

P. M. S. Hacker

Wittgenstein: Mind and Will, Volume 4 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

Part II: Exegesis §§428–693

P. M. S. Hacker

Epilogue:

Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth-Century Analytical Philosophy

P. M. S. Hacker

Companion to this volume

Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning, Volume 1 of An Analytical Commentary on the *Philosophical Investigations*

Part I: Essays

G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker

second, extensively revised edition by P. M. S. Hacker

Volume 1
of An Analytical Commentary on
the *Philosophical Investigations*

Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning

Part II: Exegesis §§1–184

G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker

Fellows of St John's College · Oxford

Second, extensively revised edition

by

P. M. S. Hacker

 **Blackwell**
Publishing

© 2005 by G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker

BLACKWELL PUBLISHING
350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
108 Cowley Road, Oxford OX4 1JF, UK
550 Swanston Street, Carlton, Victoria 3053, Australia

The right of G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker to be identified as the Authors of this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

This edition and *Wittgenstein: Understanding and Meaning. Part I: Essays* originally published together as *Wittgenstein — Understanding and Meaning* in 1980.
First published in two volumes 1983

Second, extensively revised edition published 2005 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Baker, G. P.

Wittgenstein : understanding and meaning / G. P. Baker & P. M. S. Hacker.
— Second, extensively rev. ed. / by P. M. S. Hacker.

p. cm. — (Analytical commentary on the Philosophical investigations; v. 1)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-4051-1987-X (hardcover : pt. 1 : alk. paper)

1. Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951. Philosophische Untersuchungen.
2. Philosophy. 3. Language and languages—Philosophy.
4. Semantics (Philosophy) I. Hacker, P. M. S.
(Peter Michael Stephan) II. Title II. Series.

B3376.W563P5323 2004

192—dc21

2004007861

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library.

Set in 10/12pt Bembo
by Graphicraft Ltd, Hong Kong
Printed and bound in the United Kingdom
by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

The publisher's policy is to use permanent paper from mills that operate a sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured from pulp processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices. Furthermore, the publisher ensures that the text paper and cover board used have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

For further information on
Blackwell Publishing, visit our website:
www.blackwellpublishing.com

For Anne and Sylvia

Contents

Acknowledgements	viii
Introduction to Part II: Exegesis	xi
Abbreviations	xiv
The history of the composition of the <i>Philosophical Investigations</i>	1
An overview of the structure and argument of the <i>Philosophical Investigations</i>	7
Exegesis	25
The Title	27
The Motto	29
The Preface	33
Chapter 1 The Augustinian conception of language (§§1–27(a))	43
Chapter 2 Illusions of naming: ostensive definition, logically proper names, simples and samples, and analysis (§§27(b)–64)	93
Chapter 3 Family resemblance, determinacy of sense, and the quest for essence (§§65–88)	145
Chapter 4 Philosophy (§§89–133)	191
Chapter 5 The general propositional form (§§134–142)	285
Chapter 6 Understanding and ability (§§143–84)	305
Index	357

Acknowledgements

Dr Erich Ammereller, Dr Hanoch Benyami, Professor Hans-Johann Glock, Professor Oswald Hanfling, Edward Kanterian, Dr Joachim Schulte, Dr Jonathan Witztum and Professor Eike von Savigny read and commented upon one or more chapters of exegesis. They saved me from a multitude of errors and oversights. I am most grateful to them for their generosity and for their constructive criticisms.

I owe thanks to Professor Brian McGuinness, Dr Joachim Schulte and the late Professor Georg Henrik von Wright, who have done so much to clarify the history of Wittgenstein's masterpiece, for reading and giving me their comments upon the essay entitled 'The history of the composition of the *Philosophical Investigations*' and upon the exegesis of the 'prelims' to Wittgenstein's book.

St John's College has, as always, been generous in its support of research and scholarship. I am, as I have now so often been, most grateful to Jean van Altena for her admirable copy-editing.

P. M. S. H.

Thoughts reduced to paper are generally nothing more than the footprints of a man walking in the sand. It is true that we see the path he has taken; but to know what he saw on the way, we must use our own eyes.

Schopenhauer

Introduction to Part II: Exegesis §§1–184

The exegesis of the second edition of Volume 1 is constructed on the same principles as that of the first edition. The text of the *Investigations* §§1–184, as before, is divided into six chapters. There is nothing sacrosanct about the chosen division — other ways of segmenting the text can readily be imagined and justified. The divisions were chosen partly for convenience of exposition, and because we thought, and I still think, that they correspond to fairly evident thematic changes (the exception is chapter 5, §§134–42, which is a bridging sequence of remarks). They enable readers to pause for breath, as it were, and to gain their bearings in the landscape.

Each chapter of exegesis is preceded by an introduction, which surveys the argumentative development of the sequence of Wittgenstein's numbered *Bemerkungen* (referred to as 'sections' to avoid ambiguity) and explains the structure of the argument. This is supplemented by tree diagrams that represent the relationships between the various sections. At the end of each such introduction, there is a table of sources. In the first edition, we were satisfied to correlate the numbered sections of the text with TS 220 (the Early Draft (*Frühfassung* (FF))), and TS 226_R, which is Rhees's 1938/9 translation of it up to §116, although, of course, the exegesis of individual sections made reference to many more texts. Subsequent volumes of the Commentary were more thorough in their attempts to track down sections to their manuscript sources. Now, with the publication of the Bergen edition of the *Nachlass* in electronic form, and the consequent availability of a search engine, I have endeavoured to give all the relevant sources of a given section in the tables of sources annexed to each introduction to a chapter of exegesis. Of course, an element of judgement is involved in thus selecting sources, and no doubt there are some passages that I decided not to be worth registering which another person might, with equal right, think to be relevant.

As it was decided to publish this volume of the Commentary in two parts *ab initio*, rather than, as hitherto, waiting on the publication of the paperback edition, I have followed the practice of the paperback editions and indicated in a text box the appropriate locus, relative to the exegesis, of each essay, and have specified, in the inserted box, the section headings of the relevant essay. This will indicate to anyone using the exegesis for the study of Wittgenstein's book that corresponding to a particular place in it, there is a comprehensive discussion of Wittgenstein's treatment of a topic in an essay printed in Part I of this volume of Commentary.

I observed in the Introduction to Part I that my reasons for wishing to write a second edition of this volume included the fact that much new material by way of both primary sources (manuscripts, diaries and letters) and derivative primary sources (students' lecture notes, dictations) has been published in the last quarter of a century. These materials often shed light on the interpretation of individual sections of Wittgenstein's text. Furthermore, many debates over the interpretation of individual remarks have been illuminating and have sometimes led me to revise the interpretations we gave in the 1970s. I am especially indebted to Professor Eike von Savigny's methodical criticisms in his *Wittgensteins 'Philosophische Untersuchungen': Ein Kommentar für Leser*, 2nd edn (Klostermann, Frankfurt am Main, 1994). I do not *always* agree with his strictures or with the interpretations he advocates, but I always learnt a great deal from his criticisms and discussions. It would be tedious and unbearably lengthy to list all the significant changes I have made throughout the text of the exegesis, for I have rewritten, compressed and revised it extensively. But the 'chapter' that has undergone the most transformation and supplementation is the exegesis of §§89–133 on philosophy and philosophical methodology. The interpretations here are importantly different from those offered in the first edition, and are supported with a great deal of new evidence. The upshot is that, despite compression, this chapter of exegesis is almost twice as long as the previous text, and sheds a great deal more light on Wittgenstein's criticisms of the *Tractatus* and on his new conception of philosophy, its aims and methods.

In this second edition, I have added a preliminary essay entitled 'The history of the composition of the *Philosophical Investigations*' that summarizes what has been learnt over the past half-century by various scholars working closely on the editing of Wittgenstein's texts. I have also added an essay, 'An overview of the structure and argument of the *Philosophical Investigations*', in which I have tried to survey the argument of the whole book, from §1 to §693. It is not easy to see how it all hangs together, and why the various discussions are located where they are. So I have tried to remedy this.

The structure of the exegesis of the sections is in essence the same as before. Each section is discussed separately, as are the *Randbemerkungen* (comments below the line at the bottom of certain pages). Different paragraphs in each section are referred to by lower-case letters (e.g. '§27(a)' refers to the first paragraph of §27). Five different kinds of comments are marked out by marginal numbers: 1, 1.1, 2, 2.1 and 3. The first, i.e. 1, consists of commentary on the section as a whole. 1.1 consists of comments on individual lines, phrases and words, as well as suggestions for rectification of mistranslations. 2 discusses parallel remarks from Wittgenstein's other writings, which sometimes offer elaborations of the thought expressed concisely in the *Investigations*, and sometimes contrast with the final text and therefore shed light on the development of his ideas. 2.1 consists of parallel lines or phrases in Wittgenstein's other works which amplify or illuminate matters of detail. 3, used infrequently, is reserved for any other

business. Lower-case roman numerals are used when an enumeration of points is necessary. Enumeration within enumeration has sometimes forced recourse to arabic numerals or lower-case letters. Since these conventions were chosen for their perspicuity, I have, as before, not hesitated to transgress them where, for some reason, they impeded clarity.

To save space, I have much reduced the quotations in the original German, which, in the first edition, accompanied our translations from the *Nachlass*. Since the whole of the *Nachlass* is now available on CD-rom, the translations can readily be checked against Wittgenstein's original.

P. M. S. Hacker
St John's College, Oxford
October 2003



Abbreviations

1. Wittgenstein's published works

The following abbreviations, listed in alphabetical order, are used to refer to Wittgenstein's published works.

- BB *The Blue and Brown Books* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1958).
- BIB Occasionally used to refer to the Blue Book.
- BrB Occasionally used to refer to the Brown Book.
- BT *The Big Typescript*: TS 213, tr. and ed. C. G. Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue (Blackwell, Oxford, 2005).
- C *On Certainty*, ed. G. E. M. Anscombe and G. H. von Wright, tr. D. Paul and G. E. M. Anscombe (Blackwell, Oxford, 1969).
- CL *Cambridge Letters*, ed. Brian McGuinness and G. H. von Wright (Blackwell, Oxford, 1995).
- CV *Culture and Value*, ed. G. H. von Wright in collaboration with H. Nyman, tr. P. Winch (Blackwell, Oxford, 1980).
- EPB *Eine Philosophische Betrachtung*, ed. R. Rhees, in *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Schriften 5* (Suhrkamp, Frankfurt, 1970).
- GB 'Remarks on Frazer's "Golden Bough"', tr. J. Beversluis, repr. in *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Philosophical Occasions 1912–1951*, ed. J. Klagge and A. Nordmann (Hackett, Indianapolis and Cambridge, 1993), pp. 118–55.
- LPE 'Wittgenstein's Notes for Lectures on "Private Experience" and "Sense Data"', ed. R. Rhees, repr. in *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Philosophical Occasions 1912–1951*, ed. J. Klagge and A. Nordmann (Hackett, Indianapolis and Cambridge, 1993), pp. 202–88.
- LW I *Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. I, ed. G. H. von Wright and H. Nyman, tr. C. G. Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue (Blackwell, Oxford, 1982).
- LW II *Last Writings on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. II, ed. G. H. von Wright and H. Nyman, tr. C. G. Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue (Blackwell, Oxford, 1992).
- NB *Notebooks 1914–16*, ed. G. H. von Wright and G. E. M. Anscombe, tr. G. E. M. Anscombe, 2nd edn (Blackwell, Oxford, 1979).
- PG *Philosophical Grammar*, ed. R. Rhees, tr. A. J. P. Kenny (Blackwell, Oxford, 1974).

- PI *Philosophical Investigations*, ed. G. E. M. Anscombe and R. Rhees, tr. G. E. M. Anscombe, 2nd edn (Blackwell, Oxford, 1958).
- PO *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Philosophical Occasions 1912–1951*, ed. J. Klagge and A. Nordmann (Hackett, Indianapolis and Cambridge, 1993).
- PR *Philosophical Remarks*, ed. R. Rhees, tr. R. Hargreaves and R. White (Blackwell, Oxford, 1975).
- PTLP *Proto-Tractatus: An Early Version of Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, ed. B. F. McGuinness, T. Nyberg and G. H. von Wright, tr. D. F. Pears and B. F. McGuinness (Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1971).
- RC *Remarks on Colour*, ed. G. E. M. Anscombe and G. H. von Wright, tr. L. L. McAlister and M. Schättle (Blackwell, Oxford, [1977]).
- RFM *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, ed. G. H. von Wright, R. Rhees and G. E. M. Anscombe, rev. edn (Blackwell, Oxford, 1978).
- RLF ‘Some Remarks on Logical Form’, *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, suppl. vol. 9 (1929), pp. 162–71.
- RPP I *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. I, ed. G. E. M. Anscombe and G. H. von Wright, tr. G. E. M. Anscombe (Blackwell, Oxford, 1980).
- RPP II *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology*, vol. II, ed. G. H. von Wright and H. Nyman, tr. C. G. Luckhardt and M. A. E. Aue (Blackwell, Oxford, 1980).
- TLP *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, tr. D. F. Pears and B. F. McGuinness (Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1961).
- Z *Zettel*, ed. G. E. M. Anscombe and G. H. von Wright, tr. G. E. M. Anscombe (Blackwell, Oxford, 1967).

Reference style: all references to *Philosophical Investigations*, Part I, are to sections (e.g. PI §1), except those to *Randbemerkungen* (notes below the line) on various pages. Reference to these pages is given by two numbers, the first referring to the page of the first and second editions, the second to the third edition. References to Part II are to pages, in a like manner (e.g. PI p. 174/148). References to other printed works are either to numbered remarks (TLP) or to sections signified ‘§’ (Z, RPP, LW); in all other cases references are to pages (e.g. LFM 21 = LFM, page 21) or to numbered letters (CL); references to *The Big Typescript* are to the original pagination of the typescript as given in the Bergen electronic edition of *Wittgenstein’s Nachlass* (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2000).

2. Derivative primary sources

- AWL *Wittgenstein’s Lectures, Cambridge 1932–35, from the Notes of Alice Ambrose and Margaret MacDonald*, ed. Alice Ambrose (Blackwell, Oxford, 1979).
- LA *Lectures and Conversations on Aesthetics, Psychology and Religious Beliefs*, ed. C. Barrett (Blackwell, Oxford, 1970).

- LFM *Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, Cambridge 1939*, ed. C. Diamond (Harvester Press, Hassocks, Sussex, 1976).
- LPP *Wittgenstein's Lectures on Philosophical Psychology 1946–47*, notes by P. T. Geach, K. J. Shah and A. C. Jackson, ed. P. T. Geach (Harvester Wheatsheaf, Hemel Hempstead, 1988).
- LWL *Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1930–32, from the Notes of John King and Desmond Lee*, ed. Desmond Lee (Blackwell, Oxford, 1980).
- M G. E. Moore's notes entitled 'Wittgenstein's Lectures in 1930–33', repr. in *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Philosophical Occasions 1912–1951*, ed. J. Klagge and A. Nordmann (Hackett, Indianapolis and Cambridge, 1993), pp. 46–114.
- PLP *The Principles of Linguistic Philosophy*, by F. Waismann, ed. R. Harré (Macmillan, London, and St Martin's Press, New York, 1965).
- RR *Discussions of Wittgenstein*, by R. Rhees (Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1970).
- VoW *The Voices of Wittgenstein*, transcribed and edited by Gordon Baker, tr. Gordon Baker, Michael Mackert, John Connolly and Vasilis Politis (Routledge, London, 2003).
- WWK *Ludwig Wittgenstein und der Wiener Kreis*, shorthand notes recorded by F. Waismann, ed. B. F. McGuinness (Blackwell, Oxford, 1967). The English translation, *Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1979), matches the pagination of the original edition.

3. Nachlass

All references to other material cited in the von Wright catalogue (G. H. von Wright, *Wittgenstein* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1982), pp. 35ff.) are by MS or TS number followed by page number ('r' indicating recto, 'v' indicating verso) or section number '§', as it appears in the Bergen electronic edition of *Wittgenstein's Nachlass*.

In the case of the first manuscript draft of the *Investigations*, MS 142 (the so-called *Urfassung*), references are to Wittgenstein's section number ('§'), save in the case of references to pp. 77f., which are redrafts of PI §§1–2 and to pp. 78–91, which Wittgenstein crossed out and redrafted on pp. 91ff., subsequently assigning them section numbers in the redrafts alone.

Manuscripts

MSS 105–22 are eighteen large manuscript volumes written between 2 February 1929 and 1944. These were numbered by Wittgenstein as Vols I–XVIII. In the first edition of this commentary they were referred to by volume number, followed by page number (e.g. 'Vol. XII, 271'). Since then it has become customary to refer to them by von Wright number alone. Here they are referred to on their first occurrence in a discussion by their von Wright number, followed by volume number in parentheses, followed by page number in the

Bergen edition (e.g. ‘MS 116 (Vol. XII), 271’). In the subsequent occurrence of a reference to the same volume in the same discussion, the volume number is dropped.

‘MS 114 (Vol. X) Um.’ refers to Wittgenstein’s pagination of the *Umarbeitung* (reworking) of the *Big Typescript* in MS 114. The *Umarbeitung* begins on folio 31v of MS 114 (Vol. X), and is paginated consecutively 1–228.

Typescripts

- B i *Bemerkungen I* (TS 228), 1945–6, 185 pp. All references are to numbered sections (§).
- B ii *Bemerkungen II* (TS 230), 1945–6, 155 pp. All references are to numbered sections (§).

All other typescripts are referred to as ‘TS’, followed by the von Wright number and pagination as in the Bergen edition.

The successive drafts of the *Investigations* are referred to as follows:

TS 220 is the typescript of the Early Draft (*Frühfassung* (FF)) of the *Investigations*, referred to in the first edition of this Commentary as ‘PPI’ (*Proto-Philosophical Investigations*), dictated from MS 142 (the *Urfassung* (UF)).

TS 226_R is Rhees’s pre-war translation of TS 220, §§1–116, referred to in the 1st edn of this Commentary as PPI(R).

TS 227a and 227b are the two surviving carbon copy typescripts of the *Investigations* (the top copy having been lost).

TS 238 is a reworking of TS 220, §§96–116, with renumberings, deletions, corrections and additions in Wittgenstein’s hand, referred to in the 1st edn of this Commentary as PPI(A).

TS 239 (the *Bearbeitete Frühfassung* (BFF)) is a reworking of TS 220.

ZF is the reconstructed Intermediate Draft (*Zwischenfassung*) of the *Investigations*, previously known as the Intermediate Version, and referred to in the 1st edn of this Commentary as PPI(I).

In transcriptions from the *Nachlass* I have followed Wittgenstein’s convention of enclosing alternative draftings within double slashes ‘//’.

4. Reference style to the other volumes of *An Analytical Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations*

G. P. Baker and P. M. S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein: Rules, Grammar and Necessity, Volume 2 of an Analytical Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations* (Blackwell, Oxford and New York, 1985).

P. M. S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind, Volume 3 of an Analytical Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations* (Blackwell, Oxford and Cambridge, Mass., 1990).

P. M. S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein: Mind and Will, Volume 4 of an Analytical Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations* (Blackwell, Oxford and Cambridge, Mass., 1996).

References to these are of the form ‘Volume’, followed by the volume number, the quoted title of an essay in the designated volume, and the section number of that essay. Occasionally reference to specific pages in an essay is made, in which case it is the paperback edition that is referred to. References to the exegesis are flagged ‘Exg.’, followed by section number prefixed with ‘§’ or page number (in the case of the *Randbemerkungen*).

References to Part I of this volume of the Commentary are given by essay title and section number or page number.

5. Abbreviations for works by Frege

BLA i *The Basic Laws of Arithmetic*, vol. i (1893); references to the preface by roman numeral indicating the original page number, all other references by section number (§).

BLA ii *The Basic Laws of Arithmetic*, vol. ii (1903); all references by section number (§).

CN *Conceptual Notation and Related Articles*, tr. and ed. T. W. Bynum (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1972).

CP *Collected Papers on Mathematics, Logic, and Philosophy*, ed. B. F. McGuinness (Blackwell, Oxford, 1984). To refer to individual articles in this volume, the following abbreviations are used:

- CO ‘Concept and Object’
- CT ‘Compound Thoughts’
- FC ‘Function and Concept’
- FG ‘Foundations of Geometry’
- N ‘Negation’
- SM ‘Sense and Meaning’
- T ‘Thought’

All page references to these articles are to the original German pagination, as it occurs in the margins of the English translation, followed by the page number in CP.

FA *The Foundations of Arithmetic*, tr. J. L. Austin, 2nd edn (Blackwell, Oxford, 1959).

NS *Nachgelassene Schriften*, ed. H. Hermes, F. Kambartel and F. Kaulbach (Felix Meiner, Verlag, Hamburg, 1969).

PW *Posthumous Writings*, ed. H. Hermes, F. Kambartel and F. Kaulbach, tr. P. Long and R. White (Blackwell, Oxford, 1979).

6. Abbreviations for works by Russell

- AM *The Analysis of Mind* (Allen and Unwin, London, 1921).
IMP *Introduction to Mathematical Philosophy* (Allen and Unwin, London, 1919).
IMT *An Inquiry into Meaning and Truth* (Allen and Unwin, London, 1940).
OK *Our Knowledge of the External World as a Field for Scientific Method in Philosophy*, rev. edn (Allen and Unwin, London, 1926).
PLAt ‘The Philosophy of Logical Atomism’, repr. in *The Philosophy of Logical Atomism and Other Essays 1914–1919*, ed. J. G. Slater, in *The Collected Papers of Bertrand Russell*, vol. 8 (Allen and Unwin, London, 1986), pp. 157–246.
PM *Principia Mathematica*, vol. i (with A. N. Whitehead), 2nd edn (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1927).
PrM *The Principles of Mathematics*, 2nd edn, rev. (Allen and Unwin, London, 1937).
PP *The Problems of Philosophy* (Oxford University Press, London, 1967; originally published 1912).
TK *Theory of Knowledge: The 1913 Manuscript*, ed. E. R. Eames in collaboration with K. Blackwell, in *The Collected Papers of Bertrand Russell*, vol. 7 (Allen and Unwin, London, 1984).



The history of the composition of the *Philosophical Investigations*

As Wittgenstein wrote in the preface to the *Investigations* that he dated January 1945, and which was used, with minor amendments, in the published version, the thoughts he was presenting were the precipitate of his philosophical investigations over the previous sixteen years, i.e. dating back to 1929. His efforts to compose a book incorporating his new ideas can be divided into different phases.¹

1. **The Big Typescript.** The first phase began in 1929. The first work to emerge was the typescript later published as *Philosophische Bemerkungen* (1964), compiled primarily to present to the Council of Trinity College in order to obtain a grant that would enable Wittgenstein to continue his work, and subsequently submitted as a Fellowship dissertation. It is doubtful whether this compilation of early 1930 was ever intended as a draft for a book. Concurrently, he was co-operating with Friedrich Waismann in writing the first volume of the Vienna Circle's series of publications *Schriften zur Wissenschaftliche Weltauffassung*. This was duly advertised as *Logik, Sprache, Philosophie*, for which Moritz Schlick wrote a preface. But the project never reached completion, and effectively collapsed with Schlick's murder in 1936. It was published under Waismann's name in English translation in 1965 as *The Principles of Linguistic Philosophy* (PLP).² These years of the early 1930s, however, were mainly dedicated to writing a book dismantling the edifice of the *Tractatus*, laying the foundations for Wittgenstein's new philosophical method, and applying it to the philosophy of logic and language, and to the philosophy

¹ For the historical data in the following discussion I am indebted to the bibliographical research of Georg Henrik von Wright, Joachim Schulte, Alois Pichler and Brian McGuinness, to the research of Stephen Hilmy and Anthony Kenny on *The Big Typescript*, and to the biographical research of Brian McGuinness and Ray Monk.

² The German text *Logik, Sprache, Philosophie* (Reclam, Stuttgart), ed. G. P. Baker and B. F. McGuinness, was published only in 1976, together with Schlick's preface. For the history of this ill-begotten co-operative project between Wittgenstein and Waismann, see G. P. Baker, 'Verehrung and Verkehrung: Waismann and Wittgenstein', in *Wittgenstein: Sources and Perspectives*, ed. C. G. Luckhardt (Cornell University Press, Ithaca, NY, 1979), pp. 243–85. The copious dictations that Wittgenstein gave to Waismann were published in 2003 in a bilingual edition as *The Voices of Wittgenstein* (Routledge, London), ed. G. P. Baker.

of mathematics. The fruits of this endeavour are evident in *The Big Typescript* (TS 213), a 768-page untitled typescript, with an eight-page annotated table of contents, made in 1933. It is divided into 19 chapters and 140 numbered sections. The typescript was based on MSS 105–114 (Vols I–X),³ which had been sifted into preliminary typescripts TSS 208–11, on which *The Big Typescript* is based. He immediately began reworking *The Big Typescript*, initially by making extensive handwritten modifications and additions, on both recto and verso, as well as inserting handwritten pages. He then reverted to fresh manuscript composition based on the modified typescript and on the pocket notebooks MS 156(a) and (b), and wrote the *Umarbeitung* ('Revision') in the second part of MS 114 (Vol. X) beginning on 31v, and paginated 1–228, and continuing in MS 115 (Vol. XI), 1–117, written in late 1933 and early 1934. This too was unsatisfactory, and in 1934 he tried a second reworking (the *Zweite Umarbeitung* ('Second Revision')) in MS 140 (the *Grosses Format* ('Large Format')) — a 42-page attempt to mould the material afresh.⁴ This too was abandoned, although *The Big Typescript* was to be quarried again later.

2. **Revision of the Brown Book (EPB).** The next attempt at the composition of a book was in Norway in autumn 1936. Wittgenstein had dictated the Brown Book to Francis Skinner and Alice Ambrose in Cambridge 1934/5. In August 1936 he travelled to Norway with the intention of continuing his philosophical work in solitude. The first effort was directed at the text of the Brown Book, which, at the end of August, Wittgenstein began translating into German⁵ and reworking (up to BrB, p. 154) under the title 'Philosophische Untersuchungen, Versuch einer Umarbeitung' ('Philosophical Investigations: attempted revision') in MS 115 (Vol. XI), 118–292. In early November, he abandoned the attempt, writing 'Dieser ganze "Versuch einer Umarbeitung" von Seite 118 bis hierher ist NICHTS WERT' ('This whole "attempted revision" from page 118 to here is COMPLETELY WORTHLESS' (MS 115 (Vol. XI), 292)). As he wrote to Moore, 'I found it all, or nearly all, boring and artificial. For having the English version before me had cramped my thinking.' So, he continued, 'I therefore decided to start all over again and not to let my thoughts be guided by anything but themselves' (CL 169 (20 Nov. 1936)).

³ Underlying these large MS volumes were first draft writings in small pocket notebooks. Only four of these survive from this period: MS 153a, which is a source for MSS 110–12 (Vols VI–VIII); MS 153b, a source for MSS 112–13 (Vols VIII–IX); MS 154, a source for MS 113 (Vol. IX); and MS 155, a source for MS 112 (Vol. VIII).

⁴ The published volume *Philosophical Grammar* (PG), ed. R. Rhees, is an editorial compilation from *The Big Typescript* and its various revisions. PG §§1–13, 23–40, and the final two paragraphs of 42 are derived from the second revision of BT, i.e. MS 140 (the *Grosses Format*). §§14–22, 41–2, 43–141 are derived from the first revision, i.e. MSS 114–15 (Vols X–XI). Most of the rest is derived from BT, but appendices 1–3 are from TS 214, and appendix 4b is from MS 116 (Vol. XII). For detailed information, see A. J. P. Kenny, 'From the Big Typescript to the *Philosophical Grammar*', repr. in his *The Legacy of Wittgenstein* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1984), pp. 24–37.

⁵ Now published as *Eine Philosophische Betrachtung* (EPB).

3. **The Proto-Draft and Early Draft (UF and FF).** The new attempt was MS 142, the manuscript of the first, pre-war, version of the *Investigations* that corresponds roughly to §§1–189(a) of the published book. This is a 167-page manuscript, written as consecutive paragraphed prose, with the title *Philosophische Untersuchungen*. It was compiled during two separate periods. Pages 1–76 were composed between early November and early December 1936. Pages 77–167 were written sometime between February and May 1937. Wittgenstein presented the unfinished manuscript volume to his sister Margarete for Christmas 1936, with the inscription ‘Gretl von Ludwig zu Weihnachten 1936 ein schlechtes Geschenk’ (‘Gretl from Ludwig for Christmas 1936 a poor gift’), but he obviously took the volume back with him to Norway in the new year. Pages 77–8 are a revision of the opening two pages, and pages 78 (bottom)–91 are crossed out and reworked on pp. 91ff. Though the manuscript is much amended, it was (initially) a ‘clean copy’ manuscript. This has now been published as the *Urfassung* (the Proto-Draft (UF)).⁶ Its surviving immediate sources are the pocket notebooks MSS 152, 157(a), 157(b), the reworked version of the Brown Book in MS 115 (Vol. XI), and MS 140 (the *Grosses Format*). It was, it seems, typed in two stages: pages 1–76, and pages 91 to the end. The typing was completed by either May or December 1937.⁷ The result was the 137-page typescript TS 220.

Wittgenstein returned to Norway in mid-August 1937, and began working on the sequel to TS 220. TS 220 had ended with the remark corresponding to *Philosophical Investigations* §189(a). On 11 of September, he began MS 117 (a ‘clean copy’ manuscript) by copying out the last sentence from TS 220. The next 97 pages are the basis of the first 67 pages of the subsequent dictation of TS 221 (for further detail, see below pp. 36–9). He continued working on themes in philosophy of mathematics until mid-October, after which he switched to other topics, and also mined *The Big Typescript* for usable remarks which he transcribed into MS 116 (Vol. XII).⁸ He left Skjolden in mid-December to return to Vienna. The first 117 pages (out of 134)⁹ of TS 221 were dictated in Cambridge sometime in mid-1938, the final 17 pages apparently in winter 1938/9. The first-level materials for this second part of the early version include MSS 118, 119 (for pp. 1–119), MS 115 (for pp. 120–30), MS 121 and MS 162(a) (for pp. 130–5). Wittgenstein had the ‘Preface’ to this early version of the *Investigations* typed (and dated) in August in Cambridge.

⁶ In *Ludwig Wittgenstein, Philosophische Untersuchungen, Kritisch-genetische Edition*, ed. J. Schulte (Suhrkamp, Frankfurt, 2001), but without the deleted pp. 78–91 that were redrafted on pp. 91ff.

⁷ There is some dispute about the dating of the two parts (cp. J. Schulte, ‘Einleitung’, *ibid.*, pp. 18f. with B. F. McGuinness, ‘Manuscripts and Works of the 1930s’, repr. in his *Approaches to Wittgenstein* (Routledge, London, 2002), pp. 278–80, and Schulte’s reply in his ‘Historisch-philologische Nachbemerkungen’, p. 1098).

⁸ See exegesis of the Preface, p. 38, n. 15.

⁹ Numbered as a sequel to TS 220, so the first page is numbered 138.

TSS 220–1 are published as the *Frühfassung* (Early Draft (FF)). It was with this typescript that Wittgenstein approached Cambridge University Press in August or early September 1938 with a view to publication in German with a parallel English translation, under the title ‘Philosophical Remarks’. The Syndics agreed to this proposal on 30 September. On Moore’s recommendation, Wittgenstein asked Rush Rhees to essay the translation. In consultation with Wittgenstein, Rhees worked on it throughout Michaelmas Term 1938 (TS 226_R). By January 1939 he had reached §116 (corresponding to PI §107),¹⁰ at which point he had to leave Cambridge for the USA on account of his father’s death. Wittgenstein, together with Yorick Smythies, revised Rhees’s translation by hand.¹¹ Dissatisfied with it and with TS 221, he shelved the publication project for the time being.¹²

4. **The Revised Early Draft (TS 239, BFF).** The next attempt consisted in a revision of the two typescripts. One of the copies of TS 220 was extensively revised by hand (TS 239) prior to late 1942 or early 1943. It has been printed as the *Bearbeitete Frühfassung* (the Revised Early Draft (BFF)). Sometime between 1939 and 1943, TS 221 was extensively reworked, cut up and rearranged. The result, TS 222, has been printed as Part I of the *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*. It was with the former of these texts, or with both texts, in mind that Wittgenstein approached the Press again in September 1943 with the suggestion of publishing a book entitled *Philosophical Investigations*, to be printed together with a reprint of the *Tractatus*. This idea, as he explained in the final Preface, had occurred to him in the course of rereading the *Tractatus* with Nicholas Bachtin. The Syndics agreed on 14 January 1944, but Wittgenstein again moved on to something else.

5. **The Intermediate Draft (ZF).** The next phase is exhibited in the *Zwischenfassung* (Intermediate Draft). This has been reconstructed by von Wright. It was a 195-page typescript, consisting of 300 numbered remarks, corresponding roughly to PI §§1–421. It is for this version that Wittgenstein, in late 1944, wrote the new drafts of a Preface (in MSS 128 and 129, see ‘Preface’, p. 42) dated January 1945. It consists of the reworked version of TS 220 (i.e. TS 239 (BFF)), roughly corresponding to PI §§1–189, together with eight pages from TS 221 (corresponding to PI §§189–97), followed by new material. The new material consists of 104 numbered remarks derived immediately from TS 241, mediately from MSS 129 and 124, and more remotely from MSS 130, 165, 179 and 180(a). It is possible that with this draft we see

¹⁰ Curiously, although TS 220 is *not* typed in the form of *Bemerkungen* (i.e. spaced remarks), Rhees typed his translation in this form.

¹¹ His corrections are often of interest and sometimes of importance, especially when he corrects a translation proposed by Rhees which happens to coincide with Anscombe’s 1953 translation.

¹² He was already having doubts in October, for the Minutes of the Syndics for 21 Oct. refer to Wittgenstein’s uncertainty about publishing his ‘Philosophical Remarks’.

the abandonment of the idea of including the mathematical materials in the book.¹³ How did this come about?

In February 1944, Wittgenstein left Newcastle, where he had been assisting in research on wound shock with Drs Grant and Reeve (and briefly with their successor, Dr Bywaters). He returned briefly to Cambridge and then went to stay in Swansea, where Rhees lived, from March until September. After some further work on philosophy of mathematics, he abandoned that subject¹⁴ in favour of reflections on a private language, on thinking, imagining, calculating in the head and consciousness (i.e. themes in the philosophy of psychology that bear directly or indirectly on meaning and understanding). These form the main topics of MS 129 (begun on 17 August 1944), which is a major source of these remarks in the Intermediate Draft. They were dictated, either in Wales or on his return to Cambridge, to form the 33-page TS 241. His new ideas led him to a fundamental change in his conception of the book. The material on following a rule, originally intended to lead into a fundamental investigation into philosophy of mathematics, was now to lead into an equally fundamental examination of the conceivability of a private language and associated themes in the philosophy of psychology that shed light on the nature of language, and on the relation between language and thought.

The fact that Wittgenstein dated the new Preface 'January 1945', even though it was written in late 1944, suggests that he was thinking of approaching Cambridge University Press again with a finished typescript early in the new year. He does not appear to have done this, however. Rather, he turned to a massive expansion of the Intermediate Draft.

6. **The Late Draft (SF).** On 13 June 1945, Wittgenstein wrote to Rhees, 'I am dictating some stuff, remarks, some of which I want to embody in my first volume (if there'll ever be one). This business of dictating will take roughly another month, or even six weeks.'¹⁵ The dictation in question is a typescript Wittgenstein called 'Bemerkungen I', consisting of 698 remarks. These are derived from post-war sources (the fourth part of MS 116 (Vol. XII), MSS 129–30)) and pre-war sources (MSS 115–17, 119). He selected 400 remarks from 'Bemerkungen I' to be included in his book,¹⁶ and on this basis dictated the last typescript draft, TS 227, in the course of the academic year 1945/6. The

¹³ This is uncertain, precisely because the 1945 draft of the Preface mentions the foundations of mathematics as one of the topics discussed in the book. It is unclear whether this signals an intention to continue, as before, with materials on mathematics, which would follow the new discussions of a private language and associated psychological concepts, or whether it is an oversight — as it evidently is in the final published version of the Preface.

¹⁴ He never returned to his work on the philosophy of mathematics, although it is evident (see below, p. 28) that he intended a book, entitled 'Beginning Mathematics', as a sequel to the *Philosophical Investigations*.

¹⁵ Quoted in G. H. von Wright, 'The Origin and Composition of the *Investigations*', in his book *Wittgenstein* (Blackwell, Oxford, 1982), p. 127.

¹⁶ Seventeen of the *Randbemerkungen* are also from 'Bemerkungen I'.

- grammar 19, 20, 241f., 246, 252, 254,
 260, 261f.
 ordering of 280–2
 grammatical explanation 257f., 270f.
 grammatical joke 249
 grammatical model 276
 grammatical proposition 19, 256
 Grant, R. T. 5
 Grillparzer, F. 240
 Grimm's fairy tales 215
 guidance 345f., 346f., 348f.
- Hacker, P. M. S. 73n.
 Haller, A. von 30
 Hardy, G. H. 264, 315
 Haydn, J. 345
 Henry IV 349
 Herder, J. G. 345
 Hertz, H. 30, 33, 202, 260, 264, 265
 Hilbert, D. 259, 267
 Holmes, E. 320n.
 Hume, D. 341, 353
 Humpty Dumpty 111
- 'I' 116, 251f., 276, 277
 ideal 181f., 210f., 220, 223–5, 226–8,
 228–34, 237f., 239f., 243f., 253, 258,
 264, 279
 ideal language 180, 239, 278, 280
 idols 255
 imagination 111, 133, 137
 imagism (mentalism) 17f., 135f., 160,
 165, 295, 297, 299, 300f.
 indefinables 110f., 127, 188
 indescribability 174f.
 indestructibility 135f., 136f., 137f.
 Indian mathematicians 315
 inductive reasoning 19f.
 infinity 246
 intend/intention 21, 212n., 301f.
 intentionality 18f., 22, 213f.
 internal property/relation 14, 19, 206
 interpretation 338
- Jackson, A. C. 33n.
 James, W. 66, 257, 340, 341, 343, 347
- Kant, I. 28, 239, 283
 Kenny, A. J. P. 2n.
 Kleist, H. von 228
- knowing how 329
 knowledge 167, 168, 172, 173, 251,
 253f., 320, 322f., 324, 325
 as ability 105, 319f., 328f., 330
 reservoir conception of 298, 317f.,
 319f.
 Kraus, K. 257, 260, 264
 Kreisel, G. 32
- language 20, 56, 57, 68, 89f., 152, 217,
 238, 258
 calculus conception of 179f., 182f.,
 184, 277f.
 completeness of 55, 57, 58, 72
 essence of 8, 10, 11, 12, 50f., 53,
 54, 56, 57, 58, 152, 206f., 209,
 218f.
 as family resemblance concept 10, 152,
 227
 foundations of 8, 9, 53, 54, 58
 ideal *see* ideal language
 idling 281f.
 'in order as it is' 11, 184, 220f.
 learning of 49
 ordinary 205, 221, 239, 253, 254, 257,
 258
 language-game 55–7, 59, 62, 87, 88,
 125, 152, 275, 278, 279, 280, 303
 language of thought 107, 215
 law of identity 263n.
 leaf 164f., 165f., 177
 lever 65f.
 Lichtenberg, G. C. 249
 light/dark language-game 75, 77
 lines of projection 302
 Locke, J. 231
 logic 11f., 179f., 181f., 200–3, 217, 218,
 219, 220, 226f., 241f., 243
 laws of 182
 sublimity of 11f., 201f., 208, 216, 216,
 240f.
 logical analysis *see* analysis
 logical compulsion 299f.
 logical connectives 292
 logical geography 33, 261
 logical possibility 203, 217
 logically proper name 9, 116, 123, 137f.,
 229
 Longfellow, H. W. 32
 Loos, A. 260, 261, 264

- McGuinness, B. F. 3n., 34
 magic 52
 Malcolm, N. 34, 35n., 243
 marrying money 108
 mathematics 266f.
 foundations of 5n., 267, 268
 W.'s book on 5n., 28
 Matisse, H. 233n.
 maxilla 262
 Maxwell, J. C. 276
 mean (*meinen*) 22f., 52, 74, 107, 110,
 111, 112, 160, 162, 179, 181, 182,
 211, 212, 213, 214, 226, 228, 237,
 298, 349
 meaning (of a word) 9, 13, 20, 52, 53,
 57, 59, 65, 117, 160, 254f., 257, 258,
 295
 and bearer 50, 53f., 116, 117, 118, 134
 and use 118–21, 294f., 297, 298
 meaning-body 294f., 296
 meaning, explanation of *see* explanation of
 meaning
 measurement 128–31, 303
 memory 133, 135f.
 mental image *see* imagism (mentalism)
 mental process 332
 mental state 13, 319, 320f., 321f., 323,
 327
 metaphysical statements 138f., 229
 metaphysical use of words 124, 231, 234,
 250, 252–4
 metaphysics 215, 245, 247, 252
 method of projection 181, 212f., 227,
 297, 300f., 302
 mind-model 321, 322, 327
 Möbius strip 154
 money 258
 Monk, R. 35n.
 Mont Blanc 172
 Moore, G. E. 2, 4, 32, 141, 206, 266
 morphological method *see* philosophy,
 morphological method in
 'Moses' 169n., 175–8, 179, 187f.
 Mozart, W. A. 320, 345
 MS 116, purpose of 38n.

n-place relation 207
 name 9, 12, 50f., 55, 100, 101, 112f.,
 114, 115, 117, 118, 122, 123, 134,
 230, 233, 257

 name-relation 112f., 114, 130f.
 naming 9, 53, 54, 67, 90, 91, 101,
 126f.
 Nedo, M. 34n.
 Nestroy, J. N. 29f., 31
 Nicod, J. 155, 275, 276, 278f.
 Nietzsche, F. 260n.
 nonsense 56, 255f., 263f., 294
 normative science 181f.
 Nothing 115, 116, 122, 134
 number,
 as family-resemblance concept 155f.,
 156f.
 general form of 289
 visual/inductive 63
 number, number-words, numerals 53f.,
 54, 55, 63, 69, 100, 101f., 104, 166,
 313
 number system 72

 object 51n.
 Odysseus 122
 Ogden, C. K. 20, 170, 221, 245
 opinion *see* philosophy, opinions in
 opportunity 328
 ostension (pointing) 55, 107, 108, 109,
 112
 ostensive definition 8, 9, 60, 100, 101,
 103, 104, 106, 107, 109
 ostensive explanation 100, 101, 102, 103,
 108
 ostensive teaching 60, 61, 100
 overview 259–64, 268, 269–71, 281

 pain 16f.
 parts of speech 50, 62, 70f.
 Peirce, C. S. 182n.
 person 116
 perspicuous representation *see* surveyable
 representation
 phenomenological language 257, 258,
 259, 263
Philosophical Investigations,
 history of composition 1–6
 Part II 6
 structure of 7–23
 philosophy 7, 12, 200–84
 and argument 59
 as clarification 263, 272, 281f., 282,
 283

- as descriptive 245f., 263, 268, 269, 283
 contrasted with science 245, 270
 disquietude in 284
 and explanation 245f., 269–71
 importance of 255
 leaves everything as it is 266, 267f., 269
 and linguistics 281
 morphological method in 260, 264n.
 and nonsense 255f.
 opinions in 272f.
 problems of 12, 246, 250, 263, 282, 284
 sublimity of 11f., 203, 208, 217
 theories in 245, 247
 theses in 271–3
 picture theory of the proposition 18, 227, 230
 plant 158f., 160, 165, 166, 173, 174, 177, 335
 Plato 10, 54, 123f., 125, 130n., 159n., 167, 201, 202, 231, 233, 251
 Platonism 101, 182
 pointing *see* ostension
 practice 14, 15, 302n.
 primal plant 220, 231, 235f.
 prison 222
 privacy, epistemic 16
 private language arguments 15–17
 private ownership of experience 16
 progress 29
 proof 281, 315
 proper names 114, 117, 122, 175–8, 184, 187, 345
 uses of 119
 property 130n.
 proposition 12, 209–17, 230, 236, 290–3
 essence of 10, 13, 210f., 216, 218, 288
 as a family-resemblance concept 152, 288f., 290
 propositional jingle (*Satzklang*) 289
 psychological concepts 20f., 303

 question *see* sentence-question

 Ramsey, F. P. 35, 181f., 207, 208n., 219, 245, 246, 267, 291
 Ranchetti, M. 34n.
 razor blade 158n.

 reading 333f., 334f., 336f., 337f., 339f., 341f., 342f., 343f., 344f., 345f.
 recollection/reminder 201, 202, 252f., 270, 271
 redeeming word *see* *erlösende Wort*
reductio ad absurdum 256
 Reeve, E. B. 5, 35
 representation 213f.
 Rhees, R. 4, 5, 6, 27, 86, 181, 282n.
 Richards, I. A. 20, 170, 245
 ritual 274
 river 234
 rules 11, 14, 84f., 133, 183f., 185, 187, 318
 completeness 187
 understanding a rule 187
 Rundle, B. 77n., 313n.
 Russell, B. 9, 19, 20, 35, 48, 53, 81, 83f., 88, 113, 114, 115, 116n., 123, 134, 138, 142, 180, 201, 203, 204, 205, 207, 208n., 220f., 239, 245, 249f., 251, 255, 257, 263, 264, 265, 268, 269, 275, 276n., 341, 342
 on proper names 175–8

 sack 223
 sample 9, 67f., 68f., 102, 120, 129, 130, 134f., 135f., 165f.
Satz 209n.
 Schiller, F. 220
 Schleiermacher, F. E. 182
 Schlick, M. 1, 29, 34, 35, 262
 Schopenhauer, A. 18n., 132, 264, 315n., 348
 Schubert, F. 344, 345
 Schulte, J. 3n.
 science 176, 254
 Searle, J. 323n.
 seeds 335f.
 seeing something in common 163–6
 self-reference 68f.
 sense, bounds of 20
 sentence 69, 73, 125f.
 complexity of 8
 elliptical 74, 75f.
 kinds of 87f.
 sense of 209, 211, 213f.
 uses of 72f., 76f., 87
 sentence-question 86, 88, 89
 sentence-radical 8, 79, 84–6, 88

- sigma 341
 signify 64, 66, 67
 sign-post 186f., 188
 similarities in the large/small 153f.
 simple/complex 9, 124, 125f.
 simples *see Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, on
 simple objects
 Skinner, F. 2
 sleep 124
 Smythies, Y. 4
 Socrates 10, 159, 167, 173, 250
 spectacles 224, 228, 229, 233
 Spengler, O. 232n., 260, 264f., 280
 Sraffa, P. 35, 227, 264
 standard metre 128–30
 state 321f.; *see also* mental state,
 disposition, conscious/unconscious
 state
 state of consciousness 322
 Stern, D. 29n.
 Stewart, D. 169f.
 Stonborough, M. 3
 sublimation 114, 202, 220, 238, 244,
 253, 258
 sublime 240
 superstition 248
 surveyable representation 259–64

 talking about 91
 teaching 60, 61, 100, 131, 313
 tennis 173f.
 Theory of Descriptions 140f., 142f., 203,
 204f., 277
 Theory of Types 268, 269
 thinking 12, 17, 56, 212, 213, 214, 215,
 217, 218f., 237, 247, 262f.
 ‘this’ 114, 115f., 122, 230
 thought-constituents 237
 time 167f., 202, 204, 249
 tool analogy 64f., 66, 67, 70
Tractatus Logico-philosophicus 7f., 10, 11,
 13, 18f., 27, 29, 52, 53, 75, 87, 104,
 107, 128, 180, 201, 208, 209, 210,
 213, 215, 216, 217f., 220f., 226, 228,
 232f., 237, 245, 252, 253, 255f., 257,
 261, 266, 270, 272, 288f.
 on application of logic 208
 on complexes 232
 names in 114
 on philosophy 245
 picture theory of *see* picture theory of
 meaning
 section 3.263 49n., 110f.
 on simple objects 116, 123, 124,
 125, 126, 128, 130, 135, 139–41,
 232
 on understanding 302
 training 60, 313, 316
 truth 290–3
 correspondence theory of 291
 redundancy theory of 291
 Turing, A. 268

Übersicht 207
 understanding 13, 104f., 108f., 159, 167,
 181, 298, 301, 313f., 322, 331f., 333,
 349f.
 as ability 13, 165, 296f., 321, 322–7,
 328f., 330
 avowal of 331f., 333, 350f., 351f.,
 352f.
 criteria of 13, 318f., 323, 324f., 326f.,
 350
 as disposition 324, 329
 as a process 330–2
 as state 13, 317f., 319f., 320f., 321f.,
 322–7
 at a stroke (instantaneous) 295, 297,
 298, 301, 303, 318, 320, 330, 331
 use 13, 20, 51, 118–21, 140, 142, 238f.,
 242, 243, 245, 246, 252f., 254f., 258,
 269f., 294f., 297, 298, 299f.

 vagueness 11, 158, 177, 178, 222, 225,
 226, 231, 241
 possibility of 178f.
 verification 276, 277
 voluntary action 21
 von Ficker, L. 284
 von Hartmann, E. 315n.
 von Savigny, E. 52n.
 von Wright, G. H. 4, 5n., 6n., 28n.,
 125, 169n., 171n.
 von Zenge, W. 228

 Waismann, F. 1, 33, 34, 35, 53n., 54,
 72n., 104, 120, 127, 177, 215, 272,
 276f., 296
 war 154
 water 234f.