

**EXPANDED
EDITION**

SCHOLARSHIP RECONSIDERED

PRIORITIES OF THE PROFESSORiate

Ernest L. Boyer

Updated and Expanded by Drew Moser,
Todd C. Ream, John M. Braxton, and Associates

 THE CARNEGIE FOUNDATION
for the ADVANCEMENT of TEACHING

 **JOSSEY-BASS™**
A Wiley Brand

SCHOLARSHIP RECONSIDERED



SCHOLARSHIP RECONSIDERED

Priorities of the Professoriate

EXPANDED EDITION

Updated and Expanded by
Drew Moser, Todd C. Ream,
John M. Braxton, and Associates

J JOSSEY-BASS™
A Wiley Brand

Copyright © 2016 by the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching.
All rights reserved.

Published by Jossey-Bass
A Wiley Brand

One Montgomery Street, Suite 1000, San Francisco, CA 94104-4594—www.josseybass.com

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning, or otherwise, except as permitted under Section 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act, without either the prior written permission of the publisher, or authorization through payment of the appropriate per-copy fee to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400, fax 978-646-8600, or on the Web at www.copyright.com. Requests to the publisher for permission should be addressed to the Permissions Department, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 111 River Street, Hoboken, NJ 07030, 201-748-6011, fax 201-748-6008, or online at www.wiley.com/go/permissions.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and author have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. No warranty may be created or extended by sales representatives or written sales materials. The advice and strategies contained herein may not be suitable for your situation. You should consult with a professional where appropriate. Neither the publisher nor author shall be liable for any loss of profit or any other commercial damages, including but not limited to special, incidental, consequential, or other damages. Readers should be aware that Internet Web sites offered as citations and/or sources for further information may have changed or disappeared between the time this was written and when it is read.

Jossey-Bass books and products are available through most bookstores. To contact Jossey-Bass directly call our Customer Care Department within the U.S. at 800-956-7739, outside the U.S. at 317-572-3986, or fax 317-572-4002.

Wiley publishes in a variety of print and electronic formats and by print-on-demand. Some material included with standard print versions of this book may not be included in e-books or in print-on-demand. If this book refers to media such as a CD or DVD that is not included in the version you purchased, you may download this material at <http://booksupport.wiley.com>. For more information about Wiley products, visit www.wiley.com.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Boyer, Ernest L., author.

Scholarship reconsidered : priorities of the professoriate / Ernest L. Boyer ; updated and expanded by Drew Moser, Todd C. Ream, John M. Braxton, and associates. – Expanded edition.
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-118-98830-5 (pbk.), ISBN 978-1-119-00575-9 (ePDF),

ISBN 978-1-119-00586-5 (epub)

1. Education, Higher—United States. 2. College teachers—United States. 3. Learning and scholarship—United States. 4. Research—United States. I. Moser, Drew, editor. II. Ream, Todd C., editor. III. Braxton, John M., editor. IV. Title.

LA227.4.B69 2015

378.73—dc23

2015029127

Cover design by Wiley

Cover image: Abstract Background © iStock.com/Gile68, Texture Paper © iStock.com/Malsveta

Printed in the United States of America

EXPANDED EDITION

PB Printing 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

CONTENTS

About Ernest L. Boyer vii

About the Editors ix

About the Contributors xi

Editors' Acknowledgments xv

A Note to the Reader xvii

Foreword: *Scholarship Reconsidered's* Influence in Later Carnegie
Foundation Work xxi

Mary Taylor Huber

PART ONE: THE IMPACT OF *SCHOLARSHIP RECONSIDERED* ON TODAY'S ACADEMY 1

The Origins of *Scholarship Reconsidered* 3

Drew Moser and Todd C. Ream

Boyer's Impact on Faculty Development 13

Andrea L. Beach

The Influence of *Scholarship Reconsidered* on Institutional Types and
Academic Disciplines 19

John M. Braxton

Scholarship Reconsidered's Impact on Doctoral and Professional Education 31

Ann E. Austin and Melissa McDaniels

How *Scholarship Reconsidered* Disrupted the Promotion and Tenure System 41

KerryAnn O'Meara

Acknowledgments 49

PART TWO: SCHOLARSHIP RECONSIDERED BY ERNEST L. BOYER 53

Scholarship over Time 55

Enlarging the Perspective 67

The Faculty: A Mosaic of Talent 77

The Creativity Contract 91

The Campuses: Diversity with Dignity 99

A New Generation of Scholars 109

Scholarship and Community 117

Appendix A: National Survey of Faculty (1989) 123

Appendix B: Technical Notes 157

Appendix C: Carnegie Classifications 159

Afterword: Advancing the Conversation around *Scholarship Reconsidered* 161

Cynthia A. Wells

Discussion Guide 167

Notes 173

Index 195

ABOUT ERNEST L. BOYER

Ernest L. Boyer (1928–1995) served as the president of the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, the United States Commissioner of Education, the chancellor of the State University of New York, and held a wide variety of other faculty and administrative roles at colleges and universities such as the University of California, Santa Barbara, and Upland College. During his time as president of the Carnegie Foundation, Boyer and his colleagues produced a wide array of influential reports on topics ranging from early childhood education to an international study of the professoriate. The original edition of *Scholarship Reconsidered* was produced during that time.

Boyer was raised in Dayton, Ohio, and earned his undergraduate degree at Greenville College in Greenville, Illinois. Following graduation, he and his wife, Katherine Boyer, moved to Orlando, Florida, where Boyer served as pastor of a Brethren in Christ church. The Boyers then moved to Southern California, where Boyer began his career in education as an administrator at Upland College. After earning his PhD at the University of Southern California, Boyer conducted postdoctoral work at the University of Iowa.

After Boyer lost a three-year battle with lymphoma in 1995, William H. Honan wrote in the *New York Times* that Boyer had “never tired of his role as an evangelist of education.” Through his later years he remained a sought-after speaker on higher and adult education and the importance of civics education. Boyer also held some 140 honorary degrees and numerous awards, including the Charles Frankel Prize in the Humanities, the Horatio Alger Award, and the Britannica Achievement in Life Award.

ABOUT THE EDITORS

Drew Moser (PhD, Indiana State University) is dean of experiential learning and associate professor of higher education at Taylor University. Drew has written extensively on the life and legacy of Ernest Boyer and is coauthoring (with Todd C. Ream) *Ernest L. Boyer: A Cultural Biography* for SUNY Press. He is also co-director of *The Vocation in College Project*, a multiphased research project examining vocation formation in the college student experience. Drew writes frequently on his website, HigherEdReconsidered.com, and can be reached via his Twitter account, @drewmoser.

Todd C. Ream (PhD, Pennsylvania State University) is professor of higher education at Taylor University and a research fellow with the Institute for Studies of Religion at Baylor University. Todd has contributed articles, editorials, interviews, and reviews to a wide range of journals, magazines, and newspapers. His books include *Christian Faith and Scholarship: An Exploration of Contemporary Developments* (with Perry L. Glanzer, Jossey-Bass); *Christianity and Moral Identity in Higher Education* (with Perry L. Glanzer, Palgrave Macmillan); *A Parent's Guide to the Christian College: Supporting Your Child's Mind and Spirit during the College Years* (with Timothy W. Herrmann and C. Skip Trudeau, Abilene Christian University Press); and *The Idea of a Christian College: A Reexamination for Today's University* (with Perry L. Glanzer, Cascade Books). Todd also serves as the book review editor (with Perry L. Glanzer) for *Christian Scholar's Review*.

John M. Braxton (EdD, Pennsylvania State University) is professor of education in the Higher Education Leadership and Policy Program at Vanderbilt University. His research interests center on the study of college and university faculty members and on the college student experience. He has contributed publications in the form of refereed journals, book chapters, edited books, and books. His books include *Professors Behaving Badly: Faculty Misconduct in Graduate Education* (Johns Hopkins University Press); *Faculty Misconduct in Collegiate Teaching* (with Alan E. Bayer, Johns Hopkins University Press); *Rethinking College Student Retention* (with William R. Doyle and associates, Jossey-Bass); *Understanding and Reducing College Student Departure* (with Amy S. Hirschy and Shederick A. McClendon, Jossey-Bass); and *Institutionalizing a Broader View of Scholarship through Boyer's Four Domains* (with William Luckey and Patricia Helland, Jossey-Bass). John currently serves as editor of the *Journal of College Student Development* and as associate editor (faculty issues) for *Higher Education: A Handbook of Theory and Research* (Springer). He is also a past president of the Association for the Study of Higher Education.

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Ann E. Austin (PhD, University of Michigan) is professor of higher, adult, and lifelong education at Michigan State University, where she held the Mildred B. Erickson Distinguished Chair from 2005 to 2008 and again in 2014. Beginning in January 2015, she is serving as a program director in the Division of Undergraduate Education at the National Science Foundation. Her research concerns faculty careers and professional development, teaching and learning in higher education, the academic workplace, organizational change, and doctoral education. She is a fellow of the American Educational Research Association and past president of the Association for the Study of Higher Education, and a Fulbright Fellow in South Africa (1998). Ann has published extensively, including *Educating Integrated Professionals: Theory and Practice on Preparation for the Professoriate* (with Carol L. Colbeck and KerryAnn O'Meara, Jossey-Bass); *Rethinking Faculty Work: Higher Education's Strategic Imperative* (with Judith M. Gappa and Andrea G. Trice, Jossey-Bass); and *Paths to the Professoriate: Strategies for Enriching the Preparation of Future Faculty* (with Donald H. Wulff, Jossey-Bass).

Andrea L. Beach (PhD, Michigan State University) is associate professor of educational leadership, research, and technology and director of faculty development at Western Michigan University. Her research centers on organizational change in higher education, support of innovation in teaching and learning, faculty learning communities, and faculty

development as a change lever. She has been primary investigator and co-primary investigator on NSF-funded grants that have produced several articles on instructional change strategies. She is a coauthor of *Creating the Future of Faculty Development: Learning from the Past, Understanding the Present* (Jossey-Bass) and is currently lead author on a ten-year follow-up to that work, *Faculty Development in the Age of Evidence*. She is most recently director of a \$3.2 million project funded by the US Department of Education's First in the World program to undertake, document, and measure outcomes of institutional transformation aimed at improving the persistence and academic success of students from low-income families and disadvantaged backgrounds.

Mary Taylor Huber (PhD, University of Pittsburgh) is senior scholar emerita at the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. Since joining the foundation in 1985, she has written widely on cultures of teaching in higher education, integrative learning, and faculty member rewards and roles. Author of the influential Carnegie Foundation report, *Scholarship Assessed: Evaluation of the Professoriate* (with Charles E. Glassick and Gene I. Maeroff, Jossey-Bass), her recent books include *Disciplinary Styles in the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning* (with Sherwyn P. Morreale, Stylus Publishing); *Balancing Acts: The Scholarship of Teaching and Learning in Academic Careers* (Stylus Publishing); *The Advancement of Learning: Building the Teaching Commons* (with Pat Hutchings, Jossey-Bass); and *The Scholarship of Teaching and Learning Reconsidered: Institutional Integration and Impact* (with Pat Hutchings and Anthony Ciccone, Jossey-Bass).

Melissa McDaniels (PhD, Michigan State University) is assistant dean of the graduate school and director of the Teaching Assistant Program at Michigan State University. McDaniels has more than twenty years of experience in graduate student and faculty development, undergraduate and graduate teaching, and learning and organizational change. From 2008 to 2012, McDaniels served as director of Michigan State University's NSF ADVANCE Grant (in the Office of the Provost), where she spearheaded the institution's efforts to diversify the faculty in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) fields. Prior to 2008, she held full-time positions at Northeastern University, Boston College, and the National Geographic Society. She has consulted domestically and internationally on topics related to programmatic and learning assessment in higher education, graduate student research capacity development, and graduate student teaching development. The primary focus of McDaniels's research is graduate student, postdoctoral, and faculty professional development.

KerryAnn O'Meara (PhD, University of Maryland) is professor of higher education, co-principal investigator, and co-director of the Advance Program, and an affiliate faculty member in women's studies at the University of Maryland. KerryAnn spent two years working as a research associate at Harvard University's Project on Faculty Appointments and six years on the faculty at the University of Massachusetts Amherst before joining the faculty at the University of Maryland College Park in fall 2007. KerryAnn's scholarship explores organizing practices that support diverse faculty members and diverse forms of scholarship, especially within academic reward systems, faculty development, and in the careers of women and engaged scholars. She has consulted with individual campuses and nationally since 2000 on ways to reform promotion and tenure policies to acknowledge broader definitions of scholarship, including engaged scholarship.

Cynthia A. Wells (PhD, Ohio State University) is assistant professor of higher education, director of the Ernest L. Boyer Center, and program director for the master of arts in higher education program at Messiah College. Cynthia served for several years as a fellow in the Boyer Center and in that capacity provided leadership for the Boyer Partnership Assessment Project—a Fund for the Improvement of Post-secondary Education (FIPSE) funded research project that examined student affairs and academic affairs partnership programs. Her current scholarship focuses on general education and common learning, vocational formation in higher education, and personal narrative pedagogy. Cynthia recently served as a NetVUE Scholar through the Council of Independent College's Network for Vocation in Undergraduate Education (NetVUE).

EDITORS' ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Any record of the debts we owe must first and foremost begin with Ernest L. Boyer and his family, in particular his wife, Kay, and their four children—Ernie Jr., Beverly, Craig, and Paul. Ernest Boyer's leadership in education contributed mightily to the vision, completion, and eventual success of *Scholarship Reconsidered*. Those ideas, combined with his charisma and relentless work ethic, resulted in seismic changes in academe. This work does, and always will, belong to him and the colleagues who assisted him with it. Through many subsequent efforts Kay and the Boyer children have sought to honor their husband and father through their own efforts to serve the needs of a wide variety of people in places as different as New Hampshire, California, and Belize.

This edition of Boyer's work would have proved impossible without the wisdom offered by its contributors—Ann Austin, Andrea Beach, Mary Taylor Huber, Melissa McDaniels, KerryAnn O'Meara, and Cynthia Wells. Thank you for your efforts and for your willingness to share your wisdom with a new generation of audience members for *Scholarship Reconsidered*. In the face of so many declension narratives attacking higher education, we find hope that the academy is led by such bright, committed scholars.

Our colleagues on our own respective campuses continue to also serve as a means of hope. Drew and Todd specifically want to thank colleagues at Taylor University: Skip Trudeau, Tim Herrmann, Scott Gaier,

Steve Bedi, Dan Bowell, Bill Ringenberg, Tom Jones, Felicia Case, Steve Morley, Kevin Diller, Jess Fankhauser, Jeff Aupperle, Kelly Yordy, Heather Sandlin, and Emily Bryan. We thank our Taylor colleagues for embodying the best of what Boyer envisioned for academic community. John offers heartfelt thanks to his colleagues in the Association for the Study of Higher Education community along with his colleagues in the Peabody School of Education at Vanderbilt University.

Our families are the ones to whom we likely owe the greatest debt. Scholarship is a consuming endeavor with ill-defined boundaries and, at times, uncertain rewards. Through it all, our families have been unwavering in their support and encouragement.

FROM DREW: Thanks to my wife, Rebekah, for her love and care throughout this process. To echo Ernest Boyer's words to his spouse, Kay, in *High School*, "Words fail." Thanks to my children, Benjamin, Eloisa, Samuel, Stella, and William. As the beginning of your own higher education journeys draws near, with apparent acceleration, I am increasingly aware of the very personal nature of my work. That work in higher education, symbolized in part by this book, is for you and your future. Thank you for your inspiration, your imagination, and your unconditional love for your father.

FROM TODD: My thanks to my wife, Sara, for the gracious ways she keeps me focused on what is truly important. To our children, Addison and Ashley, who draw closer every day to being the direct recipients of what Boyer envisioned for higher education—when you arrive, I will be filled with the mixed feelings of pride over your accomplishments and sorrow over knowing experiences such as our Saturday conversations over breakfast (for Addison) and sushi (for Ashley) will be reserved for your precious trips home. In between those trips, I hope the best of Boyer's words find their way to educators striving to cultivate your created potential.

FROM JOHN: Thanks to my wife, Dr. Ellen M. Brier.

We now entrust Boyer's words into your hands—a new generation of readers. We hope that anything we and our fellow contributors offer here only enhances your appreciation of Boyer's ideas. In order to appreciate those ideas, please remember Boyer did not intend for them to be passively accepted but to become part of a lively dialogue that draws together colleagues who are willing to disagree without succumbing to being disagreeable. Please take, hold, read, discuss, and, if needed, discuss again.

*Drew Moser
Todd C. Ream
John M. Braxton*

A NOTE TO THE READER

In today's seemingly frenetic publishing world, it is rare to find a work that persists beyond its first printing. The year 2015 marks the twenty-fifth anniversary of *Scholarship Reconsidered: Priorities of the Professoriate* by Ernest L. Boyer (1928–1995). Boyer, an internationally known educational leader, was best known for his leadership as chancellor of the SUNY system (1971–1977), United States Commissioner of Education (1977–1979), and president of the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching (1979–1995). As his stature as an educational leader became more pronounced, so did his inclination and ability to draw scholars together. This is arguably best evidenced in *Scholarship Reconsidered*.

Written by Boyer and his Carnegie Foundation colleagues (most notably Eugene Rice), *Scholarship Reconsidered* has sold more than thirty-five thousand copies since Jossey-Bass took over its publication in 1997. It has also been cited over 6,675 times, according to Google Scholar. Sales and citations aside, it remains a text germane to the conversation about scholarship in the academy. When *Scholarship Reconsidered* was released in 1990, it sparked conversations that have only grown in strength and complexity to this day. These conversations expanded beyond the traditional research agenda to include four domains: application, discovery, integration, and teaching. In honor of this work's twenty-fifth anniversary, what you hold in your hands is an edition that not only critically engages

that legacy but also offers space for speculation about its future. Given the challenges and opportunities facing higher education today, we believe Boyer's work will prove to be even more relevant over the course of the next quarter century.

Determining the veracity of this claim of Boyer's continued relevance is, in many ways, up to you, your colleagues, and the communities you serve. The essays provided offer you a host of ways to think through the legacy of *Scholarship Reconsidered* and its relevance to your work as higher education scholars, administrators, and policy makers.

The text begins, appropriately, with a foreword from Mary Taylor Huber, entitled "*Scholarship Reconsidered's* Influence in Later Carnegie Foundation Work." Huber was with the Carnegie Foundation as a senior scholar for the duration of Boyer's tenure as president. She was a pivotal voice in Carnegie Foundation work and continued the conversation *Scholarship Reconsidered* launched after Boyer's untimely death in 1995. She is perhaps best positioned to write on the impact of *Scholarship Reconsidered* on the Carnegie Foundation's later work. Think of Huber's contribution as primary source account of *Scholarship Reconsidered's* development and impact, providing a Carnegie Foundation perspective to serve as a contextual backdrop for assessing the report's influence over the past twenty-five years. This foreword is followed by five chapters from Boyer scholars that focus this exploration through five important lenses: history, faculty development, institutional type and academic discipline, doctoral and professional education, and promotion and tenure.

The first chapter, "The Origins of *Scholarship Reconsidered*," is authored by two of us (Drew Moser and Todd C. Ream). It examines the lesser known influences and experiences that shaped Ernest Boyer's development of *Scholarship Reconsidered*. It chronicles his early life and career and the context, events, and key individuals that shaped this new domain of scholarship.

The second chapter, authored by Andrea L. Beach, is titled "Boyer's Impact on Faculty Development." It provides a helpful perspective into the role *Scholarship Reconsidered* played in the emergence of the scholarship of teaching and learning (SoTL) and faculty development. It also highlights potential trajectories for these movements into the future.

Third, John M. Braxton contributes "The Influence of *Scholarship Reconsidered* on Institutional Types and Academic Disciplines." It is a technical examination of how institutions and disciplines have responded to the expansive view of scholarship provided in *Scholarship Reconsidered*.

By analyzing scholarly activity through the delineation of *Scholarship Reconsidered's* four domains, you can read the extent to which certain types of institutions and certain academic disciplines have embraced this framework.

Ann E. Austin and Melissa McDaniels collaborated on this book's fourth chapter, "*Scholarship Reconsidered's* Impact on Doctoral and Professional Education." Austin and McDaniels explore the influence of *Scholarship Reconsidered* on doctoral education, with specific attention to hallmark professional programs such as law and medicine. They provide important insight into *Scholarship Reconsidered's* relevance for these modes of learning.

The fifth chapter, written by KerryAnn O'Meara, examines what is often the most contentious conversation surrounding *Scholarship Reconsidered*: promotion and tenure. "How *Scholarship Reconsidered* Disrupted the Promotion and Tenure System" argues for the prominent place this work holds in the revision of promotion and tenure guidelines over the past twenty-five years. O'Meara explores how Boyer provided a new language for a new approach to promotion and tenure.

Last, Cynthia A. Wells, director of the Ernest L. Boyer Center at Messiah College, provides an afterword at the end of expanded edition. Appropriately titled "Advancing the Conversation around *Scholarship Reconsidered*," Wells conducts the many voices of this edition into a chorus that collectively assesses the relevance of Ernest L. Boyer's views to the present and future of higher education. She also provides an understanding of how the Ernest L. Boyer Center seeks to continue the dialogue *Scholarship Reconsidered* began in 1990.

Twenty-five years provides many avenues for exploration, too many to consider in one book. Collectively, these seven contributions attempt to examine twenty-five years of influence, and in so doing, refocus our view of *Scholarship Reconsidered* for many years to come. The text of *Scholarship Reconsidered*, of course, is included in this book and remains unchanged. However, as with the first twenty-five years, Boyer's work is at its best when it is read and debated by communities of scholars. To support such efforts, we also provided a discussion guide. In the end, however, we leave it up to you to decide how to use this book. Some may read it from cover to cover and then add their own questions to the discussion guide. Some may read only the essays and selections from the text that prove to be most relevant to them at a particular point in time. Others may find its use as a reference work to prove most beneficial. Regardless, we hope you find that engaging

this work is of great benefit to your vocation as a scholar. Ernest L. Boyer is perhaps remembered most for being a scholar of scholars. He consistently tried to determine how to best draw scholars together into relationships that would enable them to flourish. It is our hope that this new book cultivates generative, robust conversations among scholars on the very nature of scholarship.

Drew Moser

Todd C. Ream

John M. Braxton

FOREWORD

***Scholarship Reconsidered's* Influence in Later Carnegie Foundation Work**

Mary Taylor Huber

We believe the time has come to move beyond the tired old “teaching versus research” debate and give the familiar and honorable term “scholarship” a broader, more capacious meaning, one that brings legitimacy to the full scope of academic work.¹

The publication of *Scholarship Reconsidered: Priorities of the Professoriate* in 1990 propelled Ernest L. Boyer, author of the report and president of the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, onto another of his many ambitious speaking tours. Keynoting events on campuses and at conferences around the country, Boyer would speak engagingly and persuasively about *Scholarship Reconsidered's* major theme. As suggested in my epigraph, Boyer believed that the term “scholarship” had come to be too narrowly interpreted in American higher education. Only by broadening its scope beyond basic research could colleges and universities fulfill their wide range of institutional commitments.

The ideas presented in *Scholarship Reconsidered* have enjoyed a long history as a potent inspiration for reform—but not entirely on their own. What force they’ve had has been enhanced by the work of many colleagues who have elaborated on their meaning, explored ways to institutionalize them, and provided exemplars of what it looks like to embrace a broader understanding of the scope of scholarly work. Not least among these efforts has been continuing work at the Carnegie Foundation itself—my topic in this foreword. As a member of the teams that Boyer assembled at the Carnegie Foundation to help with *Scholarship Reconsidered* and its follow-up