

The International Library of Environmental,  
Agricultural and Food Ethics 22

Bernhard Freyer  
Jim Bingen *Editors*

# Re-Thinking Organic Food and Farming in a Changing World



Springer

# **The International Library of Environmental, Agricultural and Food Ethics**

Volume 22

## **Series Editors**

Michiel Korthals, *Wageningen University, Department of Applied Philosophy,  
The Netherlands*

Paul B. Thompson, *Michigan State University, Department of Philosophy, USA*

## **Editorial Board**

Andrew Brennan, *La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia*

Lawrence Busch, *Sociology, Michigan State University, USA*

Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, United Kingdom*

Richard Haybes, *University of Florida, USA*

Darryl Macer, *UNESCO Office in Bangkok, Thailand*

Clare Palmer, *Texas A&M University, USA*

Doris Schroeder, *University of Central Lancashire, United Kingdom*

Avner de-Shalit, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/6215>

Bernhard Freyer • Jim Bingen

Editors

# Re-Thinking Organic Food and Farming in a Changing World



Springer

*Editors*

Bernhard Freyer  
Department of Sustainable  
Agriculture Systems  
Division of Organic Farming  
University of Natural Resources  
and Life Sciences (BOKU)  
Vienna, Austria

Jim Bingen  
Department of Community Sustainability  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, MI, USA

ISSN 1570-3010

ISBN 978-94-017-9189-2

ISBN 978-94-017-9190-8 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-9190-8

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014952291

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2015

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Foreword

I met Bernhard Freyer at a coffee shop on Michigan Avenue in Lansing about 6 years ago. He came with his friend and my Michigan State University colleague Jim Bingen (who I have known for a long time—too long to recall). Bernhard and I hit it off at once, engaging in a very stimulating philosophical conversation that probed the ontological conditions that give rise to that phenomenon we call “ethics.” I would like to think that our conversation was (in some way or another) the impetus for this fine collection of essays on ethics and organic farming, though I am confident that my influence was too insignificant to deserve recognition as a contributing cause. Organic farming has almost always been conceptualized in light of ethics and the philosophy of agriculture. Some view it as an outcrop of Rudolf Steiner’s metaphysical reconstruction of human rationality, while others see it as the fruit of Sir Albert Howard’s ecological understanding of the relationship between soil health, on the one hand, and the health of plants grown in that soil and of animals that eat the plants, on the other. Still others have an ethic grounded in place-based social relationships that emerge among small, diversified farms and the localities of merchants, tradesmen, and professionals that they support—a vision now promulgated by the American poet Wendell Berry. Perhaps the main thing that all such advocates of organic farming would agree upon is that the version of organic food derived from the U.S. Department of Agriculture’s organic standard and its various global equivalents fails precisely because of its lack of responsiveness to the ethical commitments articulated in any of these founding statements of the organic creed.

But I would also say that proponents of organic farming have themselves failed to engage in the kind of critical and reflective conversation about ethics that is necessary to give life to ideas. I understand this. Farmers are, in part, venerated by moral philosophers precisely because they are few in words but rich in deeds. Their ethics are embodied in their actions. Yet, there needs to be an ongoing conversation—an ethical discourse—that subjects the implied norms or

moral commitments of organic farming to periodic reevaluation and assessment. It is not enough to simply presume that one's own vision is the ethical one or that the practitioners of industrialized farming are venal and lacking in ethics of any kind. Not only will visions and practices of organic farming flourish in response to dialogue and exchange of ideas among the various philosophical strands that have contributed to the organic ethos, it will also challenge the more utilitarian, efficiency-based ethics that continue to rationalize the development of technologically intensive methods of agricultural production. Such conversations and debates are the venue in which ethics are constructed and performed, as much or possibly more than in organic farming practices.

I commend the essays in this volume to a new generation of farmers, eaters, and readers. They exemplify the conversation all of us should be having.

W.K. Kellogg Professor of Agricultural,  
Food and Community Ethics, Michigan State University,  
East Lansing, MI, USA

Paul B. Thompson

# Acknowledgment

We are grateful to the organizers of the 2011 Agriculture, Food and Human Values Society Conference in Missoula, Montana, for the opportunity to bring diverse researchers from around the world together in a workshop on “Rethinking Organic.” The presentations and discussions gave us the idea to create this book. We thank the contributing authors for their great input and patience with the publication process. In addition, we thank the two anonymous reviewers who gave us profound and constructive feedback that helped us to improve the text and the structure of the book. We especially want to thank Valentin Fiala for his editing assistance. Finally, we thank Dr. Helene Murray and the committee of the Minnesota Institute of Sustainable Agriculture, University of Minnesota, that offered the financial and ideal background for this transatlantic collaboration. We also want to express our greatest appreciation to the University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vienna for supporting the sabbatical of Bernhard Freyer and to the Fulbright Austrian-American Education Commission for the fellowship to Jim Bingen that allowed us to launch our collaboration in Vienna.





# Contents

## Part I Overview and Foundations

- 1 Introduction** ..... 3  
Bernhard Freyer and Jim Bingen
- 2 Ethics in the Organic Movement** ..... 13  
Bernhard Freyer, Jim Bingen, and Milena Klimek

## Part II Standards and Certification

- 3 Organic Certification and the Rationalization  
of Alternative Food and Agriculture: Sustainable Shrimp  
Farming in Indonesia** ..... 45  
Maki Hatanaka
- 4 Differentiating Organics: Performing Multiple Objects  
to Organize Singular Markets for Organic Tea  
and Biscuits in the UK** ..... 61  
Allison Loconto and Maarten Van der Kamp
- 5 Feeding the World – The Contribution of IFOAM Principles** ..... 81  
Bernhard Freyer, Jim Bingen, Milena Klimek,  
and Rebecca Paxton

## Part III Markets and Consumers

- 6 Who Came First? The Egg or the Carton? An Analysis  
of Organic Packaging for Italian Retail Chain Esselunga** ..... 107  
Ginevra Adamoli

<b>7</b>	<b>Increasing Demand for Pasture-Based Dairy: What Attributes and Images Do Consumers Want?</b> .....	125
	Kristin L. Getter, Bridget K. Behe, Philip H. Howard, David S. Conner, and Lia M. Spaniolo	
<b>8</b>	<b>Post-national Organic: Globalization and the Field of Organic Food in Israel</b> .....	141
	Rafi Groszlik	
 <b>Part IV The Interplay of Conventional and Organic</b>		
<b>9</b>	<b>Engaging the Organic Conventionalization Debate</b> .....	161
	Douglas H. Constance, Jin Young Choi, and Damian Lara	
<b>10</b>	<b>Organic Farmers: Contributing to the Resilience of the Food System?</b> .....	187
	Lesley Hunt, Chris Rosin, Hugh Campell, and John Fairweather	
<b>11</b>	<b>From the Ground Up? The Principles of Australian Organic Agriculture</b> .....	213
	Rebecca Jones	
<b>12</b>	<b>Amish Dedication to Farming and Adoption of Organic Dairy Systems</b> .....	233
	Caroline Brock and Bradford Barham	
 <b>Part V Re-thinking Ethics in the Organic Movement</b>		
<b>13</b>	<b>Framework for Re-thinking Ethics in the Organic Movement</b> .....	259
	Bernhard Freyer, Jim Bingen, and Milena Klimek	
<b>14</b>	<b>Positioning Organic Ethics</b> .....	309
	Bernhard Freyer and Jim Bingen	
	<b>Index</b> .....	323

# Editors and Contributors

## Editors

**Dr. Jim Bingen** is a Professor Emeritus of Community, Food and Agriculture. He works on a range of food, farming, and rural development issues in Michigan, Western Europe, and French-speaking Africa. He has collaborated with many colleagues across the social and agricultural sciences on numerous applied research studies of farmers, markets, and farmer-market vendors in Michigan; the transition to organic farming by Michigan fruit and vegetable growers; farmer access to organic markets; and, more recently, the contribution of origin- or place-based and quality food to the development in Michigan. He is the Associated Codirector of the Working Group for Transdisciplinary Systems Research at BOKU, the national agricultural school in Vienna, Austria, and holds the *Chevalier d'Ordre du Mérite Agricole* (Order of Agricultural Merit) awarded by the Government of France. From October 2009 to January 2010, he was a Fulbright Distinguished Chair at the University of Natural Resources and Applied Life Sciences in Vienna.

Department of Community Sustainability, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA

**Dr. Bernhard Freyer** is a Professor at the University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vienna (Austria), Head of the Division of Organic Farming, Head of the Working Group for Transdisciplinary Systems Research, and Senior Fellow at the University of Minnesota (USA). He leads several research projects in the fields of organic agriculture, sustainable development, and societal transformation and organic agriculture in tropical and subtropical environments. His current research focus is on ethical and philosophical approaches to societal transformation processes and organic agriculture.

Department of Sustainable Agriculture Systems, Division of Organic Farming, University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Vienna, Austria

## Contributors

**Dr. Ginevra Adamoli** received her PhD in Communication from Florida State University. Her research focuses on social media, food communication, and social movements. She is currently a social media consultant for clients across Europe and the United States. She likes to keep different blogs where she talks about food, social media, and fashion.

School of Communication, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL, USA

**Bradford Barham** is a Professor in the Agricultural and Applied Economics Department at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. Brad's research and teaching areas include patterns and effects of agricultural technology/management system adoption and innovation (e.g., organic, fair trade, biotechnology) in Wisconsin and Latin America; the economic logic of specialization, diversification, and structural change in agriculture, and how these patterns relate to productivity and sustainability outcomes; and the impact of land, education, and credit policies and programs on rural poverty and the environment in Latin America.

Agricultural and Applied Economics, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI, USA

**Bridget K. Behe** is currently a Professor of Horticulture at Michigan State University. She teaches classes and conducts research on marketing horticultural products, both edible and ornamental. Each year, she teaches courses on marketing and management for horticulture majors at Michigan State. Bridget has conducted over 75 consumer and market research projects, written more than 500 publications in the trade press, and peer-reviewed journals.

Department of Horticulture, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA

**Caroline Brock** is an Assistant Professor in the Rural Sociology Department at the University of Missouri-Columbia. Caroline's research interests include value-based farm decision making within a bounded rationality framework among Amish, organic, graziers and conventional dairy farmers in Wisconsin. Caroline's main professional activities include teaching several undergraduate classes about the Amish community and science, technology, and society. She is researching in her course and other similar courses around the country what college students can learn from the Amish as they explore questions of values, technology adoption, and community and relate these questions to their own lives. In addition, she is currently working on creating informational support networks for agricultural and conservation professionals working with Amish and Mennonite farmers in the Midwest.

Rural Sociology, University of Missouri, Columbia, MO, USA

**Hugh Campbell** Over the past decade and a half, Hugh Campbell's research has mainly focused on the social dynamics involved in sustainable agriculture. He has been one of the research leaders of the \$13.5 m Agricultural Research Group on

Sustainability (ARGOS) program, a joint venture between the Agribusiness Group, Lincoln University, and the University of Otago.

Department of Sociology, Gender and Social Work, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

**Dr. Jin Young Choi** is an Associate Professor in the Department of Sociology at Sam Houston State University. Her research focuses on health, quality of life, and farming in rural communities.

Department of Sociology, Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, TX, USA

**David S. Conner** is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Community Development and Applied Economics at the University of Vermont. His teaching and research interests are centered on food systems economics and contributions to sustainable community development. His topics of interest include consumer demand, business management and entrepreneurship, and alternative supply chains. He holds a PhD in Agricultural Economics from Cornell University.

Community Development and Applied Economics, University of Vermont, Burlington, VT, USA

**Dr. Douglas H. Constance** is Professor of Sociology at Sam Houston State University. His research focuses on the community impacts of the industrialization and globalization of the agrifood system and alternative agrifood systems. He is Past President of the Southern Rural Sociological Association and the Agriculture, Food and Human Values Society.

Damian Lara is a master's candidate in the Department of Sociology at Sam Houston State University. His research interests include organizational practices of health-care actors and institutions and the resulting clinical outcomes.

Department of Sociology, Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, TX, USA

**John Fairweather** made a major contribution to the management of the ARGOS program and provided research results to sector organizations in order to better chart pathways to sustainability. His research work included a specific focus on the social aspects of different farming systems and a general focus on integrating the results by way of transdisciplinary research.

Agribusiness and Economics Research Unit, Lincoln University, Lincoln, New Zealand

**Kristin L. Getter** is an outreach specialist at Michigan State University. Her professional interests include educating and performing applied research to benefit Michigan producers.

Department of Horticulture, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA

**Rafi Groszlik** is a PhD candidate in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. He holds a master's degree in Sociology and Anthropology. Since 2008, he has been researching the cultural field

of organic food in Israel. His dissertation deals with the cultural globalization and sociology of Israeli culinary culture.

Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer-Sheva, Israel

**Dr. Maki Hatanaka** is an Assistant Professor of Sociology at Sam Houston State University. Her recent research examines global social movements that seek to make food production more environmentally sustainable and socially just. In particular, she is interested in issues of certification, labeling, and standards and relations between consumers in the global North and producers in the South.

Department of Sociology, Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, TX, USA

**Philip H. Howard** is Associate Professor of Community, Food and Agriculture at Michigan State University. He received his PhD in Rural Sociology from the University of Missouri. His scholarly interests focus on characterizing food system changes, particularly industry consolidation, and assisting communities to respond positively to these changes.

Department of Community Sustainability, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA

**Lesley Hunt** is a sociologist of work who is employed as a Senior Research Officer in the Agribusiness and Economics Research Unit at Lincoln University in New Zealand. She has had what could be called a varied career! It started with lecturing in statistics at the University of Otago, including teaching in schools in London and New Zealand, lecturing in research methods at the University of Canterbury and Lincoln University, teaching the piano, being a biometrician, and now, after her PhD study, working as a researcher in the Agriculture Research Group on Sustainability (ARGOS – [www.argos.org.nz](http://www.argos.org.nz)). Her PhD, an ethnographic study of scientists working in one of New Zealand's Crown Research Institutes, was titled "Compliance at work: protecting identity and science practice under corporatization." With her skills and experience, she brings to the fore the views of farmers and growers on sustainability and how people working in conventional and organic farming systems make meaning of their work.

Agribusiness and Economics Research Unit, Lincoln University, Lincoln, New Zealand

**Dr. Rebecca Jones** is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Centre for Environmental History and School of History at the Australian National University. Her research interests include agricultural sustainability and organic agriculture, rural social and emotional health and well-being, and environmental history. For many years, her research has addressed both history and the social aspects of health. Rebecca completed her PhD at Monash University, Department of Rural and Indigenous Health, exploring the history of Australian organic growing. She is the author of *Green Harvest: A History of Organic Farming and Gardening in*

*Australia*, published by CSIRO publishing. Rebecca is currently working on “Slow Catastrophes: drought resilience amongst farmers and agricultural communities in Australia, 1880s–2000s,” an ARC Discovery Early Career Research Award (DECRA)-funded project, exploring the way people in Australia respond to and survive drought.

School of History, College of Arts and Social Sciences, Australian National University, Canberra, ACT, Australia

**Milena Klimek** is a PhD candidate at the University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences in the Division of Organic Farming and a participant of the Working Group for Transdisciplinary Systems Research. Topics that she has explored or focuses on currently are food and farming issues concerning organic farming and direct marketing in Austria and Minnesota, farmer and consumer partnerships, and more specifically the role of values in farmers’ markets.

Department of Sustainable Agriculture Systems, Division of Organic Farming, University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Vienna, Austria

**Damian Lara** is a master’s of arts student in the Department of Sociology at Sam Houston State University. His research interests include organizational practices of health-care actors and institutions.

Department of Sociology, Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, TX, USA

**Dr. Allison Loconto** is a researcher at the French National Institute for Agricultural Research (INRA), Science in Society Laboratory (INRA-SenS), and the French Institute for Research and Innovation in Society (IFRIS) at the University of Paris-Est Marne-la-Vallée. She holds a PhD in Sociology from Michigan State University and an MA in International Affairs and Development from the American University in Washington, DC. Allison Loconto’s research examines the socioeconomic questions raised by the development, implementation, and evaluation of sustainability standards in global agrifood systems. Her recent research has been published in the *Review of International Political Economy*, *Regulation and Governance* and the *International Journal of Sociology of Agriculture and Food*. Allison Loconto is currently a Visiting Expert at FAO, where she is working on voluntary standards and institutional innovations that link sustainable agricultural practices with markets for sustainable goods.

Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique, Sciences en Société (INRA-SenS), Institut Francilien Recherche Innovation et Société, Université Paris-Est Marne-La-Vallée, Champs-sur-Marne, France

**Rebecca Paxton** is a PhD candidate at the University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences in the Division of Organic Farming and is a research assistant in the Working Group for Transdisciplinary Systems Research. Rebecca’s current research examines social representations of health and health practices within the



Austrian organic agrifood system, in relation to different roles and distributions of responsibility for public health provision.

Department of Sustainable Agriculture Systems, Division of Organic Farming, University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Vienna, Austria

**Dr. Chris Rosin** is Senior Research Fellow with the Centre for Sustainability: Agriculture, Food, Energy, Environment (CSAFE) at the University of Otago, New Zealand. His research includes land managers' responses to economic change and its impacts on human–environment relationships. As part of his involvement in the ARGOS project, he examines the social negotiation of sustainability in agriculture, including the processes through which concerns about and claimed achievements in social and environmental impacts of agricultural practice are communicated and legitimized within global food systems.

Centre for Sustainability: Agriculture, Food, Energy, Environment (CSAFE), University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand

**Lia M. Spaniolo** received an MS from the Department of Community, Agriculture, Recreation and Resource Studies at Michigan State University. Her thesis explored the role of new ecolabels in political consumerism efforts in the United States.

Department of Community Sustainability, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA

**Dr. Maarten Van der Kamp** is Managing Director of Value in Enterprise Limited, a consulting firm helping businesses and social enterprises build capacity around sustainability. He received his PhD in Management from Lancaster University, where his research examined the enactment of standards for organic agriculture in the UK through the practices of farmers, certification bodies, policy makers, and market actors. Grounded in science and technology studies, his research takes a practice-based approach to studying standardization processes. He is particularly interested in how the notions of “sustainability” and “responsibility” are enacted in everyday life through the production and consumption of food.

Value in Enterprise Limited, Cambridge, UK

# Acronyms and Abbreviations

ACB	IFOAM Accredited Certification Body
ACO	Australian Certified Organic
AFHVS	Agriculture, Food and Human Values Society
<i>Agrexco</i>	Agricultural Export Company Ltd. (trading as Carmel <i>Agrexco</i> )
AOFGS	Australian Organic Farming and Gardening Society
AQIS	Commonwealth Government Australian Quarantine and Inspection Service
ARGOS	Agricultural Research Group on Sustainability
ASFS	Association for the Study of Food and Society
BOKU	(Universität für) Bodenkultur
CFP	Corporate Financial Performance
CIW	Coalition of Immokalee Workers
CLA	Conjugated linoleic acid
CoMoRe	Corporate Moral Responsibility
COROS	Common Objectives and Requirements of Organic Standards
CSA	Community Supported Agriculture
CSP	Corporate Social Performance
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
EC	European Commission
ELLS-NA	Euro-League for Life Sciences and North America
EPOPA	Export Promotion of Organic Products from Africa
FAO	Food Agriculture Organization
FDA	U.S. Food and Drug Administration
FLO	Fairtrade Labeling Organizations International
GMO	Genetically modified organisms
IAR	IFOAM Accreditation Requirements
ICO	Indiana Certified Organic
ICS	International Control System
IFOAM	International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements
IMO	Institute of Market ecology

IOAS	International Organic Accreditation Service
IPM	Integrated pest management
IS	IFOAM Standard
ISO FAR	International Society of Organic Agriculture Research
ITC	International Trade Center
MAF	Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry
MRL	Maximum Residue Level
MSC	Marine Stewardship Council
NASAA	National Association for Sustainable Agriculture Australia
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NIS	New Israelian Shekels
NOP	National Organic Program
PA	<i>Perlindungan Alam</i>
PGS	Participatory Guarantee Systems
RA	Rainforest Alliance
rBST	recombinant Bovine Somatotropin
SAFN	Study of Food and Nutrition social movement organizations (SMOs)
SN	Sustainable Network
SOAAN	Sustainable Organic Agriculture Action Network
STS	Science and Technology Studies
TOAM	Tanzanian organic agriculture movement
TPC	Australian Trade Practices Commission
USDA	U.S. Department of Agriculture
WTO	World Trade Organization

# List of Figures

Fig. 7.1	Potential marketing label images developed by a graphic artist. Images were shown to participants in random order. For the first two focus groups, each image was shown twice (for a total of ten images); once as represented here and once with the same image, but substituting a brown cow. Due to a strong dislike of the brown cow images, only the images here were shown in the last four focus groups .....	129
Fig. 8.1	Evaluation axis of the new configurations contained in the Israeli field of organic food.....	144
Fig. 8.2	Organic food in Israel, 1983–2011 .....	152
Fig. 10.1	Shared knowledge and practices between practitioners of different farming systems .....	193



# List of Tables

Table 2.1	Five common human-nature relationships and how they may be practiced in agriculture .....	15
Table 2.2	IFOAM Principles.....	31
Table 5.1	The IFOAM Principles and food supply .....	89
Table 5.2	The IFOAM Principles and food processing.....	90
Table 5.3	The IFOAM Principles and food distribution/marketing.....	91
Table 5.4	The IFOAM Principles and food demand.....	92
Table 7.1	Dates and locations of six focus groups held in Lower Michigan .....	127
Table 7.2	Demographic characteristics of participants in six focus groups in Lower Michigan .....	130
Table 7.3	Themes from participant-generated images across six focus groups (n = 52) .....	131
Table 7.4	Wording found in participant-generated labels across six focus groups (n = 52) .....	132
Table 8.1	Increase in export volume of organic produce in Israel .....	146
Table 8.2	The growth in consumption of organic produce in Israel .....	147
Table 9.1	U.S. organic certified farm operations: 1992–2007; Certified organic farmland: 1992–2005 (in thousands of acres) and Certified livestock: 1992–2005 (in thousands) .....	163
Table 9.2	Texas organic certified farm operations: 1997–2008; Certified organic farmland: 1997–2008 (in acres) and Certified livestock/poultry: 1997–2008 .....	172
Table 9.3	Texas producer characteristics by orientation toward organics (percent) .....	173
Table 9.4	Attitudes regarding philosophy and production (percent).....	174

Table 9.5    Attitudes regarding marketing, information, and  
                 certification (percent) ..... 175

Table 10.1   Number of farms/orchards ..... 203

Table 10.2   Area in production (sown pasture/crop) in 2007 ..... 203

# **Part I**

## **Overview and Foundations**



# Chapter 1

## Introduction

Bernhard Freyer and Jim Bingen

### 1.1 Foreword

As we witness the continuing growth in organic food production and markets around the world, we join with many others in our concern that “organic has lost its way” or, lost sight of its first or fundamental philosophical principles and assumptions.

The discussions that led to this volume started in June 2007 during a short visit by Jim Bingen to the Division of Organic Agriculture, University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Vienna, Austria in order to explore of teaching and research exchanges between Michigan State University and BOKU under the auspices of ELLS-NA.<sup>1</sup> Based on shared concerns discussed during this visit, we organized an open roundtable to explore these concerns with other researchers at the Second Scientific Conference of ISO FAR<sup>2</sup> in Modena, Italy from 18 to 20 June 2008. At this meeting, Bernhard Freyer invited Jim Bingen to apply for a Fulbright Distinguished Chair position at BOKU. During this incredibly rich and stimulating 4-months (October 2009–January 2010), we jointly offered a seminar on Organic

---

<sup>1</sup>ELLS-NA, the Euro- League for Life Sciences and North America; June 2007.

<sup>2</sup>International Society of Organic Agriculture Research.

B. Freyer (✉)

Department of Sustainable Agriculture Systems, Division of Organic Farming,  
University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Vienna, Austria  
e-mail: [Bernhard.Freyer@boku.ac.at](mailto:Bernhard.Freyer@boku.ac.at)

J. Bingen

Department of Community Sustainability, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA  
e-mail: [Bingen@msu.edu](mailto:Bingen@msu.edu)

Agriculture, Politics and Society, co-advised students, and prepared several conference presentations that explored trans-disciplinary approaches to organic issues.

Bernhard Freyer's appointment as Senior Fellow at the Minnesota Institute for Sustainable Agriculture, University of Minnesota from late 2010 to June 2011 offered us a special opportunity to continue our Vienna conversations largely by Skype. We proposed a panel discussion on the principles and fundamental assumptions of organic practices for the 2011 annual meetings of AFHVS, ASFS, and SAFN Societies.<sup>3</sup> In response, the conference program committee invited us to organize five sets of panel discussions to address organic issues.<sup>4</sup>

In our call for papers for these meetings, we asked for empirically grounded discussions that focused on core principles and practices of organic food and farming. We specifically sought papers that drew upon clearly articulated and well-defined conceptual frameworks that might offer new insights into organic practices. Given the quality of the submitted papers, we decided to select some of them to be used for our proposal to Springer for this collection of original papers that offer several different perspectives on, and issues in the worldwide organic movement.

## 1.2 The Broader Idea of This Book

The explosive growth of organic food and farming in recent decades has raised numerous challenges throughout the organic sector (Willer and Kilcher 2011). Some of these include: a new generation of young organic farmers and others converting to organic; government subsidies for organic; the development of numerous new processed organic products; the emergence of diversified market opportunities that range from grass root food coops, to several types of farmer-consumer collaborative arrangements, farmers markets as well as other local markets, and organic supermarkets. Several revisions in the organic regulatory framework e.g., in Europe and in North America have accompanied this expansion and diversification of markets. Finally, several private and public sector groups and agencies have been established to deal with organic certification and control, to provide advisory services to farmers and processors, to carry-out organic research, and to publicize activities in the organic sector.<sup>5</sup>

All of these changes have been occurring within the context of a wide and diverse number of macro-level changes in food and farming in Europe and North

---

<sup>3</sup>Joint annual meetings of the Agriculture, Food and Human Values Society, the Association for the Study of Food and Society, and the Society for the Study of Food and Nutrition, "Food and Ag Under the Big Sky" held in Missoula, Montana.

<sup>4</sup>Challenges of Standardization; Between Diversification and Holism; Social and Gender Dimensions; Differentiations in Products, Markets and Consumers; and, Values and Ethics.

<sup>5</sup><http://www.isofar.org/>

America. Some of these that affect both organic and non-organic farmers (albeit somewhat differently), include: increasing land prices; increasing extreme weather events; energy costs; international trade regulations; genetically modified crops; the power of large retailers; and, the creation of consumer demand for new food products.

In response, the International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements (IFOAM 2012), representing over 100 country member organizations around the world, undertook far reaching revisions to the IFOAM Norms. These norms provide the foundation for the organic movement, and they include: the IFOAM Principles, the Standards and guidelines for certification agencies and firms.

The IFOAM Principles (Health, Ecology, Fairness and Care) represent the cornerstone of the organic movement (Luttikholt 2007). They offer the normative, ethical framework on which all the IFOAM regulatory instruments practice along the organic agrofood chain.

However, over the last two decades many in the organic movement have started to raise critical questions and concerns about the apparent loss of influence, and popular awareness of the IFOAM Principles on organic practices (IFOAM 2009). Instead of discussions related to the ethical ideas of the IFOAM Principles, more popular discussions of organic tend to focus on a different set of largely sociological or business-related features of organic such as: “professionalization, industrialization, conventionalization, bifurcation, competition, internationalization” and other socio-organizational features of organic. At the same time, many “pragmatic” organic actors, driven by ideas of a healthy and environmental friendly future, seek to keep alive ethically oriented organic practices through numerous forms of localisms and farmer-consumer relationships that embody the IFOAM Principles.

Confronted by these developments, we felt that it would be important to rethink the role of the IFOAM Principles and their potential to orient the future development of the organic idea. Three guiding questions helped us to select and organize the chapters in this volume: What was, is and could be the future role of an ethically based organic agriculture? What are the challenges of an ethically driven organic future? And what are the conditions for establishing an ethically driven organic agriculture for the future?

Our underlying premise is: solving the social, environmental and economic challenges of the future cannot be served only with a techno-economic approach or procedural, technical or social regulations. The absence of a more ethical orientation in future decision making, for food, feed, fiber and energy production and consumption will jeopardize future sustainable and resilient problem solving.

We are aware that this volume only addresses a selected number of the issues raised above. Nevertheless, we hope that we have assembled thoughtful and insightful reflections on several of the critical issues and ethical concerns in the organic movement. As such, we hope this volume offers a solid starting point for a reinvigorated debate on the development of an ethically centered organic future.

### 1.3 Structure of the Book

In Chap. 2, we introduce the IFOAM Principles and their ethical foundation. We provide an overview on the history of ethics in the organic movement starting in the 1920s (Part I, Chap. 2) and discuss the diverse streams of organic ethics that arose until the 1990s.

The following ten invited chapters discuss and explore different dimensions of organic ethics. These papers are presented in three parts. Each part includes a summary discussion that provides overview comments and highlights the ethical issues raised in the chapters. The parts are: Part II Standards and Certification (Chaps. 3, 4, and 5); Part III Markets and Consumers (Chaps. 6, 7, and 8); Part IV The Interplay of Conventional and Organic (Chaps. 9, 10, 11, and 12).

Our final Part V “Framework for Re-thinking Ethics in the Organic Movement,” first raises questions about the current role of ethics based on a typology that is sensitive to the different ethics that currently characterize the organic movement (Chap. 13). In doing so, we seek to shed light on the environment of organic that influences the organic future and to review the challenges for an ethically driven organic future. Chapter 14 summarizes and concludes our discussion and offers our reflections on “Positioning Organic Ethics”.

The following provides a brief overview of contributed chapters.

#### *Part I Overview and Foundations*

Chapter 2: The history of organic is not a homogeneous one, but is build on a colorful development based on different thinkers and societal movements over now approx. 100 years. Beginning with the current IFOAM Principles and their ethical foundations, Bernhard Freyer, Jim Bingen and Milena Klimek summarize and discuss the ethical foundations of the organic approach from their origins in the 1920s and follow the development of the different ethically/value driven streams until the 1990s.

The IFOAM Principles Health, Ecology, Fairness and Care, developed in a participatory process and with scientific support, serve as an ethical framework for the IFOAM Standards and certification issues. They are based on a normative ethic, grounded on an ecocentric/holistic approach, a moderate deontology and a virtue approach to human-nature relationships. Current ethical thinking about organic can trace its European origins to primarily in German-speaking countries and was heavily influenced during the 1920s by the life reform movement and by and the Philosopher Rudolf Steiner. Both introduced notions of a “circular agricultural economy” and nineteenth century Christianity that were at the foundation of many organic discussions. Since this time, organic has been characterized by diverse trends, largely in the UK, the US, New Zealand, Australia before becoming more “mainstream” through the establishment of IFOAM and its acceptance in more than 100 countries (see for details Chaps. 10 and 11). However, over this time, organic has been characterized by a remarkably consistent set of values that were embodied in the first set of IFOAM Principles and Standards in 1972.

## ***Part II Standards and Certification***

The maturing of the organic movement in recent years has brought significant pluralism to organic. Do government or other (e.g., IFOAM) regulations define organic, or are these simply official guidelines? What does organic certification mean, and what political and ethical principles does it embody? The three chapters in this part offer different, but complementary, responses to these questions and on the meaning of certification.

Chapter 3: Using a longitudinal study of a sustainable shrimp project in Indonesia, Maki Hatanaka examines how organic certification affects the principles, practices, and goals of the project. Her findings indicate that the emphasis on objectivity, calculability, and expert knowledge that characterize certification constrained both farmer and consumer participation in the governance of the sustainable shrimp project. Building on the case study, Hatanaka argues that certification may be producing alternative agrifood initiatives that are highly rationalized and embody shallow forms of social justice and environmental sustainability.

Chapter 4: Allison Loconto and Maarten Van der Kamp draw upon their separate research in Tanzania and in the UK to explore how context influences the way in which ‘organic’ is defined through its practices. Using the notion of performativity, they examine the organic standard as a calculative device that defines how organic tea is grown in Tanzania and how organic cereals are grown in the UK. They argue that while organic certification renders these products ‘singular’ in the UK market, the products embody ‘multiple’ production practices. They conclude that despite the use of standards to create a singular organic market, the practice of organic farming remains diverse. This tension between singularity and multiplicity is necessary for organic markets to develop and be maintained.

Chapter 5: Instead of being preoccupied with the mechanistic supply and demand formulation of world food security issues, Bernhard Freyer, Jim Bingen, Milena Klimek and Rebecca Paxton ask, what would happen if we started to focus on the idea of ethical values in the agrofood system? Their main thesis is: strengthening the discussion of the ethical values in the agrofood system should play a key role in our assessments of world food supply and demand in the future. This paper offers some preliminary reflections on selected ethical values raised by concerns with food supply, food demand and food access. The paper does not offer calculations of food and human nutrition, but instead discuss the critical relationships between ethical values and their quantitative influence on food security. The authors argue that a value-centered discussion is essential to explicating many of the issues related to organic practices and the question of how “to feed the world.” More specifically, they suggest that the ethics embodied in the IFOAM Principles offer a framework for identifying how organic agrofood systems might contribute to a sustainable food future. This has also consequences for standard and certification procedures.

## ***Part III Markets and Consumers***

For years, many academics have critically discussed how organic is advertised, and how consumers react to diverse marketing strategies. The three chapters in this part

offer insights into market and consumer issues raised by organics. They discuss the broad range of farmer-retailer-consumer chains and how consumers perceive, react and are affected by market strategies.

Chapter 6: Ginevra Adamoli explores the concept of organic marketing in terms of compliance marketing and green selling. In light of the growing organic products and the rise of the hybrid citizen-consumer, defined by Johnston (2008) as a concept that implies a social practice, she studies the connection between consumer's agency and organic packages of food products. She examines the concept of organic marketing based on King (1984) and Peattie and Crane's (2005) discussions of compliance marketing and green selling. Through a qualitative textual and visual analysis of the organic egg carton by *Esselunga*, one of the largest Italian chain supermarkets, she argues that these forms of textual and visual communication are consistent with practices of marketing, rather than serving to empower the buyer through valuable information. She concludes with a discussion of the implications of her findings for the citizen-consumer.

Chapter 7: Kristin Getter, Bridget Behe, Philip H. Howard, David Conner and Lia M. Spaniolo present the findings of their innovative research on the attributes and images that consumers prefer with respect to pasture-based dairy. They discuss the result of their research that created and tested promotional messages with potential consumers, while also investigating current consumer perceptions and attitudes about milk and its attributes. Their research asked participants in six focus groups around Michigan to create hand-drawn milk labels that represented attributes they sought when purchasing milk. Research participants also answered oral questions about their milk purchases and evaluated images designed by a graphic artist. The most common themes to emerge in the hand-drawn images included cows in pasture, blue skies, and sunshine. Words appearing on these same drawings indicated that participants generally wanted organic, local, and grass-fed milk products. By looking at the themes and concerns of milk drinkers, the authors identify the need for effective communication to consumers in order to improve profitable sales of pastured milk.

Chapter 8: Ralf Groszlik raises important questions that will command increasing analytic and policy attention as organic production and marketing spreads beyond North America and Western Europe. Based on his research in Israel, he examines the appearance of politicized organic practices in tandem with the globalization that Israel underwent. Groszlik points that the emergence of Israeli organic food is essentially a part of the economic and cultural globalization in Israel. Furthermore, he describes how a variety of production and distribution methods have responded to the increased demand for organic food by Israeli consumers. These new methods embody a variety of symbolic and materialistic aspects of globalization and anti-globalization. As these new activities emerge, they help us consider the political dimensions of a range of alternative organic practices.

#### ***Part IV The Interplay of Conventional and Organic***

The four chapters in this part allow us to gain fresh perspectives on the enduring questions related to the "conventionalization" of organic and to debates over the "co-existence" of conventional and organic production.