

**Developments in Mathematics**

Christopher S. Hardin  
Alan D. Taylor

# The Mathematics of Coordinated Inference

A Study of Generalized Hat Problems



# Developments in Mathematics

---

## VOLUME 33

---

*Series Editors:*

Krishnaswami Alladi, *University of Florida*  
Hersh M. Farkas, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

For further volumes:  
<http://www.springer.com/series/5834>



Christopher S. Hardin • Alan D. Taylor

# The Mathematics of Coordinated Inference

A Study of Generalized Hat Problems



Springer

Christopher S. Hardin  
Jane Street  
New York, NY, USA

Alan D. Taylor  
Department of Mathematics  
Union College  
Schenectady, NY, USA

ISSN 1389-2177

ISBN 978-3-319-01332-9

ISBN 978-3-319-01333-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-01333-6

Springer Cham Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013948882

Mathematics Subject Classification (2010): 03E05, 03E17

© Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

*To Novem*

C.S.H.

*To Joel and Alan*

A.D.T.



# Preface

This book deals with the question of how successfully one can predict the value of an arbitrary function at one or more points of its domain based on some knowledge of its values at other points. In large part because of the axiom of choice, the degree of success turns out to be quite remarkable in a number of different situations. For example, there is a method of predicting the value  $f(a)$  of a function  $f$  mapping the reals to the reals, based only on knowledge of  $f$ 's values on the interval  $(a - 1, a)$ , and for every such function the prediction is incorrect only on a countable set that is nowhere dense. In many cases we are able to show that there is a “predictor” that is as successful as possible, and that it is essentially unique.

We collect together most of what is known regarding this problem and we provide a number of extensions of the results that we have published in a series of seven papers over the past six years. We also indicate a number of open questions, ranging from the combinatorially difficult finite to those arising from some results that we show are independent of ZFC plus a fixed value of the continuum.

New York, NY, USA  
Schenectady, NY, USA

Christopher S. Hardin  
Alan D. Taylor



# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	1
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Set-Theoretic Preliminaries	3
1.3	Two Basic Negative Results	4
1.4	One Basic Positive Result: The $\mu$ -Predictor	6
1.5	A Preview of What Is to Come	7
<b>2</b>	<b>The Finite Setting</b>	11
2.1	Background	11
2.2	Minimal Predictors	12
2.3	Optimal Predictors	14
2.4	The Role of the Tutte-Berge Formula	14
2.5	A Variable Number of Hat Colors	16
2.6	Variations on the Standard Hat Problem	17
2.7	Open Questions	18
<b>3</b>	<b>The Denumerable Setting: Full Visibility</b>	19
3.1	Background	19
3.2	The Gabay-O'Connor Theorem	20
3.3	Lenstra's Theorem and Sequential Guessing	21
3.4	The Role of the Axiom of Choice	24
3.5	The Role of Square Bracket Partition Relations	26
3.6	Open Questions	27
<b>4</b>	<b>The Denumerable Setting: One-Way Visibility</b>	29
4.1	Background	29
4.2	Optimal and Minimal Predictors for Transitive Graphs	30
4.3	Characterizing Graphs Yielding Finite-Error Predictors	31
4.4	ZFC Results for the Parity Relation	33

4.5	Independence Results for the Parity Relation.....	34
4.6	The Role of P-Point and Ramsey Ultrafilters .....	37
4.7	$\mathcal{U}$ -Predictors .....	40
4.8	Blass's Evasion and Prediction Setting .....	44
4.9	Open Questions .....	46
<b>5</b>	<b>Dual Hat Problems, Ideals, and the Uncountable .....</b>	<b>49</b>
5.1	Background .....	49
5.2	Dual Hat Problems .....	50
5.3	Hat Problems and Ideals .....	51
5.4	The Role of Non-regular Ultrafilters .....	55
5.5	A Hat Problem Equivalent to the GCH .....	57
5.6	Open Questions .....	59
<b>6</b>	<b>Galvin's Setting: Neutral and Anonymous Predictors .....</b>	<b>61</b>
6.1	Background .....	61
6.2	Applications to Logic and Set Theory .....	63
6.3	Neutral and Anonymous Predictors .....	64
6.4	Neutralizing Predictors .....	66
6.5	Combining with Robustness .....	67
6.6	Robust Neutral Predictors and the Axiom of Choice .....	68
<b>7</b>	<b>The Topological Setting .....</b>	<b>71</b>
7.1	Background .....	71
7.2	The Scattered Sets Result .....	72
7.3	Corollaries .....	75
7.4	Guessing the Future .....	76
7.5	The Philosophical Problem of Induction .....	77
7.6	Proximity Schemes .....	78
7.7	Anonymity in $\mathbb{R}$ .....	81
7.8	Open Questions .....	82
<b>8</b>	<b>Universality of the <math>\mu</math>-Predictor .....</b>	<b>83</b>
8.1	Background .....	83
8.2	Scattered Sets .....	84
8.3	Dynamics of Scattered-Error Predictors .....	85
8.4	Getting an Ordering from a Predictor .....	87
8.5	Visibility Graphs .....	88
8.6	Variations on the $\mu$ -Predictor .....	90
8.7	Results Without the Axiom of Choice .....	91
8.8	Open Questions .....	92
<b>9</b>	<b>Generalizations and Galois-Tukey Connections .....</b>	<b>93</b>
9.1	Background .....	93
9.2	Galois-Tukey Connections .....	94

<b>Contents</b>	<b>xi</b>
9.3 Two-Agent Problems and Morphisms .....	96
9.4 Norms.....	98
9.5 Applications of the Metaphor .....	98
9.6 Scattered-Error Predictors .....	99
9.7 Pseudo-scattered Sets .....	100
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	<b>103</b>
<b>Index</b> .....	<b>107</b>