

The Handbook of **Bilingual and Multilingual Education**



Edited by
**Wayne E. Wright, Sovicheth Boun,
and Ofelia García**

WILEY Blackwell

The Handbook of Bilingual and Multilingual Education

Blackwell Handbooks in Linguistics

This outstanding multi-volume series covers all the major subdisciplines within linguistics today and, when complete, will offer a comprehensive survey of linguistics as a whole.

Recent Titles Include:

The Handbook of Language and Globalization
Edited by Nikolas Coupland

The Handbook of Hispanic Linguistics
Edited by Manuel Díaz-Campos

The Handbook of Language Socialization
Edited by Alessandro Duranti, Elinor Ochs,
and Bambi B. Schieffelin

*The Handbook of Intercultural Discourse and
Communication*
Edited by Christina Bratt Paulston, Scott
F. Kiesling, and Elizabeth S. Rangel

The Handbook of Historical Sociolinguistics
Edited by Juan Manuel Hernández-
Campoy and Juan Camilo Conde-Silvestre

The Handbook of Hispanic Linguistics
Edited by José Ignacio Hualde, Antxon
Olarrea, and Erin O'Rourke

The Handbook of Conversation Analysis
Edited by Jack Sidnell and Tanya Stivers

The Handbook of English for Specific Purposes
Edited by Brian Paltridge and Sue Starfield

*The Handbook of Spanish Second Language
Acquisition*
Edited by Kimberly L. Geeslin

The Handbook of Chinese Linguistics
Edited by C.-T. James Huang, Y.-H. Audrey
Li, and Andrew Simpson

The Handbook of Language Emergence
Edited by Brian MacWhinney and William
O'Grady

The Handbook of Korean Linguistics
Edited by Lucien Brown and Jaehoon Yeon

The Handbook of Speech Production
Edited Melissa A. Redford

*The Handbook of Contemporary Semantic
Theory, Second Edition*
Edited by Shalom Lappin and Chris Fox

*The Handbook of Classroom Discourse and
Interaction*
Edited by Numa Markee

The Handbook of Narrative Analysis
Edited by Anna De Fina & Alexandra
Georgakopoulou

The Handbook of English Pronunciation
Edited by Marnie Reed and John M. Levis

*The Handbook of Discourse Analysis,
2nd edition,*
Edited by Deborah Tannen, Heidi
E. Hamilton, & Deborah Schiffrin

*The Handbook of Bilingual and Multilingual
Education*
Edited by Wayne E. Wright, Sovicheth
Boun, and Ofelia García

Full series title list available at
www.blackwellreference.com

The Handbook of Bilingual and Multilingual Education

Edited by

*Wayne E. Wright, Sovicheth Boun,
and Ofelia García*

WILEY Blackwell

This edition first published 2015

© 2015 John Wiley & Sons, Inc, except Chapter 27 © 2010 Information Age Publishing, Inc

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA

9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK

The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Wayne E. Wright, Sovicheth Boun, and Ofelia García to be identified as the editors of this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and editors have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The Handbook of bilingual and multilingual education / Edited by Wayne E. Wright, Sovicheth Boun, and Ofelia García – First Edition.

pages cm. – (Blackwell handbooks in linguistics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-118-53349-9 (hardback)

1. Multilingualism–Study and teaching–Handbooks, manuals, etc. 2. Education, Bilingual–Handbooks, manuals, etc. 3. Multicultural education–Handbooks, manuals, etc. I. Wright, Wayne E. editor.

II. Boun, Sovicheth, editor. III. García, Ofelia, editor.

P115.2.H35 2015

404'.2071–dc23

2015000030

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: Anneliese Everts, *The Children's Game*, c. 1955 (detail). Private Collection / Bridgeman Images.

Set in 10/12pt Palatino by SPi Publisher Services, Pondicherry, India

Dedications

*To my dear wife Phal Mao, and our beloved children Jeffrey Sovan,
Michael Sopat, and Catherine Sophaline Wright
(Wayne E. Wright)*

*To my mother Sivantha By and my father Saing Hak Chea
(Sovicheth Boun)*

*Para Ricardo, Eric, Raquel y Emma, y por un futuro de nietos bilingües
(Ofelia García)*

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Notes on Contributors	xiii
1 Introduction: Key Concepts and Issues in Bilingual and Multilingual Education WAYNE E. WRIGHT, SOVICHETH BOUN, AND OFELIA GARCÍA	1
Section 1 Foundations for Bilingual and Multilingual Education	17
2 Egalitarian Bi/multilingualism and Trans-semiotizing in a Global World ANGEL LIN	19
3 Bilingualism and Creativity: An Educational Perspective ANATOLIY V. KHARKHURIN	38
4 Language Acquisition in Bilingual Education GUADALUPE VALDÉS, LUIS POZA, AND MANEKA DEANNA BROOKS	56
5 Literacy in Bilingual and Multilingual Education VIV EDWARDS	75
6 Culture in Bilingual and Multilingual Education: Conflict, Struggle, and Power LAURA A. VALDIVIEZO AND SONIA NIETO	92
7 A Synthesis of Research on Bilingual and Multilingual Education COLIN BAKER AND GWYN LEWIS	109
8 Researching Bilingual and Multilingual Education Multilingually: A Linguistic Ethnographic Approach ANGELA CREESE, ADRIAN BLACKLEDGE, WITH ARVIND BHATT, CARLA JONSSON, KASPER JUFFERMANS, JINLING LI, PETER MARTIN, ANU MUHONEN, AND JASPREET KAUR TAKHI	127
9 Intersections of Language Ideology, Power, and Identity: Bilingual Education and Indigenous Language Revitalization in French Polynesia MIROSE PAIA, JIM CUMMINS, ISABELLE NOCUS, MARIE SALAÜN, AND JACQUES VERNAUDON	145

10	Language Policy and Planning in Education TERRENCE G. WILEY	164
11	Language Rights TOVE SKUTNABB-KANGAS	185
Section 2 Pedagogical Issues and Practices in Bilingual and Multilingual Education		203
<i>Practices and Pedagogies for Bilingualism and Multilingualism</i>		203
12	Programs and Structures in Bilingual and Multilingual Education NELSON FLORES AND HUGO BAETENS BEARDSMORE	205
13	Translanguaging, Bilingualism, and Bilingual Education OFELIA GARCÍA AND LI WEI	223
14	Multiliteracies, Pedagogies, and Academic Literacy MADHAV KAFLE AND SURESH CANAGARAJAH	241
15	Language Assessment: Past to Present Misuses and Future Possibilities ELANA SHOHAMY AND KATE MENKEN	253
16	Teacher Education and Support ANNE-MARIE DE MEJÍA AND CHRISTINE HÉLOT	270
17	Parent and Community Involvement in Bilingual and Multilingual Education M. BEATRIZ ARIAS	282
<i>School Levels and Special Populations</i>		299
18	Early Childhood Education and Dual Language Learners EUGENE E. GARCÍA AND AMY M. MARKOS	301
19	Primary School Bilingual Education: Pedagogical Issues and Practices MARÍA ESTELA BRISK, ESTER J. DE JONG, AND MEREDITH C. MOORE	319
20	Secondary Bilingual Education: Cutting the Gordian Knot CHRISTIAN FALTIS AND FRANK RAMÍREZ-MARÍN	336
21	Bi/Multilingual Higher Education: Perspectives and Practices CHRISTA VAN DER WALT	354
22	Bilingual Education and Students with Dis/Abilities and Exceptionalities TEDDI BEAM-CONROY AND PATRICIA ALVAREZ MCHATTON	372
23	Bilingual Deaf Education TIMOTHY REAGAN	391
24	Bilingual-Multilingual Education and Indigenous Peoples TIFFANY S. LEE AND TERESA L. MCCARTY	409
25	Nonformal Bilingual Education LESLEY BARTLETT AND MONISHA BAJAJ	428
Section 3 Global Dimensions of Bilingual and Multilingual Education		447
26	A Dual Language Revolution in the United States? On the Bumpy Road from Compensatory to Enrichment Education for Bilingual Children in Texas DEBORAH K. PALMER, CHRISTIAN E. ZUÑIGA, AND KATHRYN HENDERSON	449

27	Global Dimensions of Bilingual and Multilingual Education: Canada THOMAS RICENTO	461
28	Minority Languages, State Languages, and English in European Education JASONE CENOZ AND DURK GORTER	473
29	Contested Notions of Bilingualism and Trilingualism in the People's Republic of China ANWEI FENG AND BOB ADAMSON	484
30	Bilingual Education in Japan: Slow but Steady Progress AKIE TOMOZAWA AND JUNKO MAJIMA	495
31	Breaking the Façade of Linguistic and Cultural Homogeneity: Education for Multicultural Children in South Korea JIN SOOK LEE	506
32	Striving for Education for All through Bilingual Education in Cambodia WAYNE E. WRIGHT AND SOVICHETH BOUN	517
33	Bilingual and Multilingual Education in Brunei and Malaysia: Policies and Practices GARY M. JONES	531
34	Multilingual Education in South Asia: The Burden of the Double Divide MINATI PANDA AND AJIT K. MOHANTY	542
35	"Too Many Cooks Spoil the Broth": Tension and Conflict between Language Institutions in South Africa SINFREE MAKONI AND BUSI MAKONI	554
36	A Panoramic View of Bilingual Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: Reorienting the Lens for the Future LEKETI MAKALELA	566
37	Language Education in Mexico: Access, Equity, and Ideology PETER SAYER AND MARIO LÓPEZ GOPAR	578
38	Indigenous Youth and Adult Education in Latin America LUIS ENRIQUE LÓPEZ	592
39	Multilingual Education across Oceania JOSEPH LO BIANCO	604
40	Language, Conflict, and Social Change: Arabic Bilingual Education in the Middle East and North Africa ZEENA ZAKHARIA	618
41	Bilingual and Multilingual Education in the Former Soviet Republics: The Case of Latvia GATIS DILĀNS AND BRIGITA ZĒPA	632
	Index	645

Acknowledgments

We wish to sincerely thank Danielle Descoteaux, Senior Acquisitions Editor for Wiley-Blackwell, for her vision, for her invitation to edit a handbook on bilingual and multilingual education, and for her helpful suggestions and expert advice as we shaped its structure, scope, and content. Julia Kirk, Senior Project Editor for Wiley-Blackwell, provided us with tremendous support, kept us motivated throughout the long process, and ensured smooth communication between the chapter contributors, the publisher, and ourselves. We also express our deep gratitude to Stephen Curtis for his excellent copyediting work. In addition, we thank the many others at Wiley-Blackwell who worked behind the scenes.

The final draft of the handbook was completed and submitted while our lead Editor, Wayne E. Wright, was a faculty member in the Department of Bicultural-Bilingual Studies, College of Education and Human Development, at the University of Texas at San Antonio (UTSA), and Co-Editor Sovicheth Boun was a doctoral candidate in Culture, Literacy, and Language at UTSA. We wish to thank Robert Milk, former Chair of the Department of Bicultural-Bilingual Studies at UTSA, and Betty Merchant, Dean of the College of Education and Human Development, for their support and encouragement from the beginning of this process, and also to current department chair Belinda Flores for her enthusiastic support. The college and department approved a Faculty Development Leave for Wright, which proved to be highly beneficial at the beginning stages of the development of this handbook. We thank UTSA graduate research assistants Yeng Yang and Matthew Kraft for their assistance with proofreading and formatting the final drafts of several chapters. We also thank Maryann Santos de Barona, Dean of the College of Education, and Phillip VanFossen, Head of the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at Purdue University who likewise proved very supportive by providing Wright a course release during his first semester at Purdue which enabled him to focus on proofreading and finalizing the page proofs prior to publication. Also at Purdue, we express our gratitude to graduate research assistant Alsu Gilmetdinova for her help with indexing.

Finally, we wish to thank all of the outstanding scholars who contributed their wealth of knowledge and expertise on bilingual and multilingual education and who made this handbook possible.

Notes on Contributors

Bob Adamson is Chair Professor of Curriculum Reform and Head of Department of International Education and Lifelong Learning at Hong Kong Institute of Education. His research covers language policy, curriculum studies, and comparative education and his most recent book is *Trilingualism in Education in China: Models and Challenges* (2015, with Anwei Feng).

M. Beatriz Arias is Vice President and Chief Development Officer of the Center for Applied Linguistics and Associate Professor Emerita, Arizona State University. She is author and editor of several books and numerous articles addressing language policy, bilingual education, school desegregation, and equity for Latino students. She is co-editor of the book *Implementing Educational Language Policy in Arizona*.

Hugo Baetens Beardsmore is Emeritus Professor at the Dutch and French Universities of Brussels. He is a consultant on bilingual education for the European Commission, the Council of Europe (Language Education Policy in Ireland and the Val d'Aoste, Italy), Brunei, the Basque Country, Catalonia, California, Abu Dhabi, and Kazakhstan.

Monisha Bajaj is Associate Professor of International and Multicultural Education at the University of San Francisco. She is the editor of the *Encyclopedia of Peace Education* and author of *Schooling for Social Change: The Rise and Impact of Human Rights Education in India* (winner of the Jackie Kirk Outstanding Book Award of the Comparative and International Education Society), as well as numerous articles.

Colin Baker is Emeritus Professor at Bangor University. His 17 books and over 60 articles on bilingualism reveal specific interests in language planning and bilingual education. His best-known book, *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (2011, 5th edn.), has been translated into Japanese, Spanish, Latvian, Greek, Vietnamese, and Mandarin.

Lesley Bartlett is Associate Professor of Education Policy Studies at University of Wisconsin, Madison. She specializes in anthropology and international and

comparative education. Her books include: *Teaching in Tension: International Pedagogies, National Policies, and Teachers' Practices in Tanzania* (2013, with Fran Vavrus); *Refugees, Immigrants, and Education in the Global South: Lives in Motion* (2013, with Ameena Ghaffar-Kucher); *Additive Schooling in Subtractive Times: Bilingual Education and Dominican Immigrant Youth in the Heights* (2011, with Ofelia García), and *The Word and the World: The Cultural Politics of Literacy in Brazil* (2010).

Teddi Beam-Conroy is Associate Professor of Bilingual and ESL Education at Heritage University in Seattle, WA. In addition to 20 years as a bilingual classroom teacher, she was the Bilingual/ESL Gifted and Talented Teacher Consultant for the Northside Independent School District in San Antonio, TX for 12 years.

Adrian Blackledge is Professor of Bilingualism in the School of Education, and Director of the MOSAIC Centre for Research on Multilingualism, University of Birmingham. His recent publications include *The Routledge Handbook of Multilingualism* (2012, with Marilyn Martin-Jones and Angela Creese), *Multilingualism, A Critical Perspective* (2010, with Angela Creese), and *Discourse and Power in a Multilingual World* (2005).

Sovicheth Boun is Visiting Assistant Professor of TESOL at the State University of New York, Fredonia. He was a Lecturer in Applied Linguistics in the Department of Bicultural-Bilingual Studies at the University of Texas at San Antonio, and a Lecturer in English at the Institute of Foreign Languages of the Royal University of Phnom Penh in Cambodia. His research interests include language ideologies, language teacher identities, global spread of English, and bi-/multilingual education for linguistic minority students.

María Estela Brisk is Professor of Education at the Lynch School of Education, Boston College. Her research and teacher-training interests include bilingualism, bilingual education, methods of teaching literacy and specifically writing, and preparation of mainstream teachers to work with bilingual learners. Dr. Brisk is the author of six books and multiple articles and chapters.

Maneka Deanna Brooks is Assistant Professor at Texas State University where she is engaged in teaching and research about literacy. Her primary research focus is on the reading practices of bilingual and bidialectal adolescents.

Suresh Canagarajah is the Edwin Erle Sparks Professor of Applied Linguistics and English at Penn State University. He teaches World Englishes, language socialization, and teaching and research in composition. His latest publication is *Literacy as Translingual Practice: Between Communities and Classrooms* (2013).

Jasone Cenoz is Professor of Research Methods in Education at the University of the Basque Country, UPV/EHU. Her research focuses on multilingual

education, bilingualism and multilingualism. She has published a large number of articles, book chapters, and books, and the award-winning monograph *Towards Multilingual Education* (2009).

Angela Creese is a founding member of the MOSAIC Centre for Research on Multilingualism, University of Birmingham, and Professor of Educational Linguistics. Her research and teaching interests cross-reference anthropology, sociolinguistics, and education. She uses linguistic ethnography to investigate ideologies and interactions in educational and other social settings. Her research publications cover urban multilingualism, language ecology, multilingual ethnography, language education, and social identities. Recent publications include *Multilingualism: A Critical Perspective* (2010, with A. Blackledge) and *The Routledge Handbook of Multilingualism* (2012, with M. Martin-Jones and A. Blackledge).

Jim Cummins is Professor Emeritus in Ontario Institute for Studies in Education at the University of Toronto. His research focuses on literacy development in educational contexts characterized by linguistic diversity. He is the author of *Identity texts: The Collaborative Creation of Power in Multilingual Schools* (2011, with Margaret Early) and *Big Ideas for Expanding Minds: Teaching English Language Learners across the Curriculum* (2015).

Ester J. de Jong is Professor in ESOL/Bilingual Education at the University of Florida, Gainesville. Her research interests include bilingual education, language policy, and teacher preparation. Her work has focused on two-way immersion education, mainstream teacher preparation for working with bilingual learners, and policy appropriation.

Anne-Marie de Mejía is Professor at the Center for Research and Professional Development in Education at Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia. Her recent publications include *Forging Multilingual Spaces* (2008), *Empowering Teachers across Cultures* (2011, with Christine Hélot), and *Bilingüismo en el Contexto Colombiano* (2011, with Alexis López and Beatriz Peña).

Gatis Dilāns is Assistant Professor and Director of the Centre for Applied Linguistics at Ventspils University College, Latvia. He has investigated societal bilingualism in the former Soviet republic of Latvia, and has published and reviewed articles about the topic. His current research is focused on second and foreign language acquisition.

Viv Edwards is Professor of Language in Education at the University of Reading. She is editor of the international journal, *Language and Education*, and for the *New Perspectives in Language and Education* series from Multilingual Matters. She has published very widely in the area of learning and teaching in multilingual classrooms.

Christian Faltis is the Dolly and David Fiddymment Endowed Chair in Teacher Education, Director of Teacher Education, and Professor of Language, Literacy, and Culture at University of California, Davis. He received his PhD in Bilingual Education from Stanford University. His research interests are bilingual learning in academic contexts, immigrant education, and critical arts-based learning.

Anwei Feng is Professor of Education and Head of School of Education in the University of Nottingham Ningbo China. His research areas include bi/multilingual education, and intercultural studies in education. Recent publications include *English Language across Greater China* (2011) and *Bilingual Education in China: Practices, Policies and Concepts* (2007).

Nelson Flores is Assistant Professor in Educational Linguistics at the University of Pennsylvania Graduate School of Education. His research merges critical social theory and critical applied linguistics to develop a political economy of language and racialization. He received his PhD in Urban Education from the CUNY Graduate Center.

Eugene E. García is Professor Emeritus of Education at Arizona State University (ASU). He served as Vice President and Dean at ASU before assuming emeritus status. He continues to do research in areas of bilingual development and the education of bilingual children, particularly those living in families from immigrant backgrounds.

Ofelia García is Professor in the PhD Program in Urban Education at The Graduate Center, The City University of New York. She has been Professor of Bilingual Education at Columbia University's Teachers College and Dean of the School of Education at Long Island University. She is Associate General Editor of *The International Journal of the Sociology of Language*. Her extensive publications can be found on her website, www.ofeliagarcia.org.

Durk Gorter is Ikerbasque Research Professor at the University of the Basque Country, UPV/EHU in Spain. He does research on multilingual education, European minority languages, and linguistic landscapes. His recent publications include *Focus on Multilingualism in School Contexts* (2011, with J. Cenoz) and *Minority Languages in the Linguistic Landscape* (2012, with H. Marten and L. Van Mensel).

Christine Hélot is Professeure des Universités at Université de Strasbourg, France. Her recent publications include *Language Policies for the Multilingual Classroom: Pedagogy of the Possible* (2011, with Muiris Ó Laoire), *Linguistic Landscape, Multilingualism and Social Change* (2012, with Monica Barni, Rudi Jannsens, and Carla Bagna), and *Développement du langage et plurilinguisme chez le jeune enfant* (2013, with Marie-Nicole Rubio).

Kathryn Henderson is a doctoral student in Bilingual/Bicultural Education in the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at the University of Texas, Austin. She

taught bilingual education for five years in Mexico. Her research interests include bilingual program implementation and language ideologies.

Gary M. Jones is Associate Professor and former Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences as well as the Institute of Asian Studies at the University of Brunei Darussalam. Prior to Brunei, he worked in the United Kingdom, Sri Lanka, Germany, and the United Arab Emirates. His research interests and publications include language planning, bilingualism, and applied linguistics.

Madhav Kafle is a doctoral candidate in Applied Linguistics at The Pennsylvania State University. He has taught English in rural Nepal and currently teaches academic writing at Penn State. His research interests include multilingual academic literacies, the global spread of English, and critical pedagogy.

Anatoliy V. Kharkhurin is Associate Professor of Psychology at the American University of Sharjah. His research focuses mainly on multilingualism and creativity. He authored a monograph *Multilingualism and Creativity* as well as a number of peer-reviewed articles, book chapters, and encyclopedia entries. Currently, he works on implementation of Bilingual Creative Education programs.

Jin Sook Lee is Professor of Education at the University of California, Santa Barbara. Her work focuses on the language-learning experiences of children of immigrants. She serves on the editorial board of the *International Multilingual Research Journal*, *Language Arts*, and *The Journal of Asia TEFL*.

Tiffany S. Lee (Diné and Lakota) is Associate Professor in Native American Studies at the University of New Mexico. Her recent publications include *Critical Language Awareness among Native Youth in New Mexico* (2014), and a co-authored article, "Leadership and Accountability in American Indian Education: Voices from New Mexico" (*American Journal of Education*, 2013).

Gwyn Lewis is former Deputy Head of the School of Education, Bangor University, Wales, where he was also Director of Teaching and Learning. His research publications concern Welsh-medium and bilingual education, especially translanguaging as a methodology in bilingual classrooms. He has held various advisory posts with the Welsh Government and the *Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol* (the Welsh National College), which reflect this expertise.

Angel Lin is Full Professor at the Faculty of Education, University of Hong Kong. She is well respected for her interdisciplinary research in classroom discourse analysis, bilingual education, language policy in postcolonial contexts, and critical cultural studies. She has published over 90 research articles and co/authored/edited six research books.

Joseph Lo Bianco is Professor of Language and Literacy Education, Graduate School of Education at the University of Melbourne, and Research Director, Language and Peacebuilding initiative in Malaysia, Myanmar, and Thailand under the auspices of UNICEF. He publishes and teaches on language policy and planning, multilingualism, and social cohesion.

Luis Enrique López is a Peruvian sociolinguist and educator who has worked with Indigenous populations and organizations in different countries of Latin America as researcher, program planner, implementer, and evaluator. At present he is Director of the GIZ Education Quality Support Program in Guatemala.

Mario López Gopar is Professor in the Department of Languages of Universidad Autónoma Benito Juárez de Oaxaca. His main research interest is the intercultural and multilingual education of Indigenous peoples in Mexico, and he works with preservice Mexican English teachers to collaboratively recreate critical language pedagogies.

Junko Majima is Professor of Japanese Language Education at the Graduate School of Language and Culture, Studies in Japanese Language and Culture, Osaka University. She teaches pedagogy, and SLA and bilingualism in the teacher-training program for teachers of Japanese as a Second/Foreign Language.

Leketi Makalela is Associate Professor and Chair of the Division of Languages, Literacies, and Literatures at the University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa. He is rated by South Africa's National Research Foundation on biliteracy, multilingualism, and World Englishes. He edits the *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Languages Studies Journal*. His latest book publication is *Language Teacher Research in Africa*.

Busi Makoni teaches in the African Studies program at Pennsylvania State University. She has written extensively in the area of gendered language use and linguistic human rights, language and masculinity, African feminism, language and migration. Her publications have appeared in *Gender and Language*, *Feminist Studies*, and *Journal of Multicultural Discourses*.

Sinfree Makoni teaches in the Department of Applied Linguistics and Program of African Studies at Pennsylvania State University. He has published extensively in language planning and policy in Africa, and language and health. He co-edited a book on *Disinvention and Reconstituting Languages* and has authored numerous articles in a variety of journals in the broad field of Applied Linguistics.

Amy M. Markos is a teacher educator, specializing in preparing teachers to support linguistically and culturally diverse learners. Her research interests include understanding teachers' dispositions about language learners, the use of critical reflection in teacher learning, and action research that explores education policies and pedagogical practices related to language learners' access to quality education.

Teresa L. McCarty is the G. F. Kneller Chair in Education and Anthropology at the University of California, Los Angeles. Her books include *Ethnography and Language Policy* (2011), *Language Planning and Policy in Native America – History, Theory, Praxis* (2013), and *Indigenous Youth and Multilingualism – Language Identity, Ideology, and Practice in Dynamic Cultural Worlds* (2014, with L. T. Wyman and S. E. Nicholas).

Patricia Alvarez McHatton is Professor and Associate Dean for Teacher Education at the University of Missouri-Kansas City. Her research interests include culturally responsive teacher preparation, collaboration, school experiences of diverse youth and families, and the use of arts-based methods for research and reflection.

Kate Menken is Associate Professor of Linguistics at Queens College of the City University of New York (CUNY), and a Research Fellow at the Research Institute for the Study of Language in Urban Society at the CUNY Graduate Center. Further information can be found on her website: katemenken.org.

Ajit K. Mohanty is a former Professor and Indian Council of Social Science Research National Fellow in Jawaharlal Nehru University and Chief Adviser of the National Multilingual Education Resource Consortium (www.nmrc-jnu.org). He was Fulbright Visiting Professor (Columbia University), Fulbright Senior Scholar (University of Wisconsin), Killam Scholar (University of Alberta). Known for his publications on Multilingual Education, he developed MLE Policy documents for Nepal and Odisha (India).

Meredith C. Moore is a doctoral student in Curriculum and Instruction at the Lynch School of Education, Boston College. Her research interests include educational change, and teacher induction and professional development.

Sonia Nieto is Professor Emerita of Language, Literacy, and Culture in the College of Education at the University of Massachusetts-Amherst. Her specializations include multicultural education, bilingual education, the education of Latinos and other students of culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds, and teacher education.

Isabelle Nocus is Lecturer at the Centre for Educational Research at the University of Nantes. Her research focuses on children's plurilingual development (both oral and written language) and the impact of bilingual teaching methods on the language development and academic achievement of primary school students in France, in the French overseas communities (New Caledonia, French Polynesia, and French Guiana), Haiti, and sub-Saharan Africa.

Mirose Paia is Lecturer in Tahitian Language and Literature at the University of French Polynesia. She has coordinated the implementation of bilingual education programs in primary school and still contributes both to the training of teachers of Polynesian languages and literature and the creation of instructional tools and multilingual support.

Deborah K. Palmer is Associate Professor of Bilingual/Bicultural Education in the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at the University of Texas, Austin and a former two-way dual language teacher. Her research interests include bilingual education policy and practice, critical additive bilingual education, and bilingual teacher leadership.

Minati Panda is Professor and Chair in Zakir Husain Centre for Educational Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, and Director of National Multilingual Education Resource Consortium. She was a Fulbright Senior Scholar at the University of California-San Diego and Commonwealth Visiting Scholar at Manchester University. Her books and publications are in the areas of culture, cognition and mathematics, and multilingual education. She is actively involved in planning the education of tribal children in India.

Luis Poza is Assistant Professor of Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Education in the School of Education and Human Development at the University of Colorado Denver. He is a former teacher in dual language programs and his research investigates matters of ideology in the teaching and learning of languages, particularly in multilingual classrooms.

Frank Ramírez-Marín directs the Language Center of the Universidad Veracruzana at Veracruz, Mexico, where he is a language professor. He received his PhD in Language and Literacy from Arizona State University. His research interests relate to sociocultural perspectives of second language learning, bilingualism, and foreign language education.

Timothy Reagan is Dean of the Graduate School of Education at Nazarbayev University (Astana, Kazakhstan). His research focuses on language planning and policy, especially with respect to signed languages. His most recent book is *Language Planning and Language Policy for Sign Languages*, published by Gallaudet University Press in 2010.

Thomas Ricento is Professor and Chair, English as an Additional Language, University of Calgary, Canada. He publishes in the field of language policy, language ideologies, and language education. Recent publications include *Language Policy and Political Economy: English in a Global Context* (2015) and *The consequences of official bilingualism on the status and perception of non-official languages in Canada* (2013).

Marie Salaün is Professor in the Centre de Recherche en Education at the University of Nantes. Her research focuses on indigenous issues in Oceania, with a special interest in postcolonial education reforms in former French colonies (French Polynesia, New Caledonia).

Peter Sayer is Associate Professor in the Department of Bicultural-Bicultural Studies at the University of Texas at San Antonio. He is the author of the book *Ambiguities and*

Tensions in English language Teaching: Portraits of EFL Teachers as Legitimate Speakers. His research has examined linguistic ideologies in language education in Mexico, and his recent work focuses on young emergent bilinguals in South Texas and Mexico.

Elana Shohamy is Professor at Tel Aviv University where she researches co-existence and rights in multilingual societies within language testing, language policy, migration, and linguistic landscape. She authored *The Power of Tests* (2001), *Language Policy* (2006), and is editor of *Language Policy* and winner of the ILTA lifetime achievement award (2010).

Tove Skutnabb-Kangas has authored or edited some 50 books and over 400 articles and book chapters in almost 50 languages (see www.tove-skutnabb-kangas.org). She has been actively involved with struggles for language rights for five decades. Her research interests cover linguistic human rights and mother-tongue-based multilingual education of Indigenous, tribal, minority, and minoritized children.

Akie Tomozawa is Professor of Japanese Language Education in the Faculty of International Studies and Liberal Arts at Momoyama Gakuin (St. Andrew's) University. Her research includes language policies of linguistic minorities in Japan. She has published articles on the bilingualism of Japanese returnees from China and of ethnic Chinese students.

Guadalupe Valdés is the Bonnie Katz Tenenbaum Professor of Education at Stanford University. She specializes in language pedagogy and applied linguistics. Her work has focused on bilingualism and education and maintaining heritage languages among minority populations.

Laura A. Valdiviezo is Associate Professor of Language, Literacy, and Culture in the College of Education at the University of Massachusetts-Amherst. Her interests are in ethnography of language policy in the Americas, pedagogy for language and knowledge diversity, multiculturalism, and teachers as researchers and organic intellectuals. With S. C. Galman, Laura is Editor in Chief of *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*.

Christa van der Walt is Professor in the Department of Curriculum Studies at Stellenbosch University, South Africa. Her interest is in the teaching of English in multilingual contexts. She has published in *World Englishes*, *Current Issues in Language Planning* and *Language, Culture and Curriculum*. She is the author of *Multilingual Higher Education: Beyond English-medium Orientations* (2013).

Jacques Vernaudon has been Associate Professor in Oceanic Linguistics at the University of French Polynesia since 2013. He previously served 12 years at the University of New Caledonia. His research focuses on the metalinguistic description of Oceanic languages and comparative analysis with French, and on the teaching of these languages.

Li Wei is Chair of Applied Linguistics at the UCL Institute of Education, University College London, UK. He was until recently Pro-Vice-Master of Birkbeck College, University of London. He is a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, UK and Chair of the University Council of General and Applied Linguistics (UCGAL), UK. He is Principal Editor of the *International Journal of Bilingualism*, author of *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education* (2014, with Ofelia Garcia), and editor of *Applied Linguistics* (2014).

Terrence G. Wiley is President and Chief Executive Officer of the Center for Applied Linguistics, Professor Emeritus, Arizona State University, Editor of the *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, and author of the book *Literacy and Language Diversity in the United States* in addition to numerous other articles and books addressing issues of language policy and education of language minority students.

Wayne E. Wright is Professor and Barbara I. Cook Chair of Literacy and Language in the College of Education at Purdue University. He is Editor of the *Journal of Southeast Asian American Education and Advancement*, author of *Foundations for Teaching English Language Learners* (2015, 2nd edn.), and a former Fulbright Scholar in Cambodia.

Zeena Zakharia is Assistant Professor of International and Comparative Education at the University of Massachusetts Boston. Her publications examine the interplay of language, conflict, and peacebuilding in education. She is co-editor, with Ofelia García and Bahar Octu, of *Bilingual Community Education and Multilingualism: Beyond Heritage Languages in a Global City* (2013).

Brigita Zepa is Professor at the University of Latvia, and Director of the Baltic Institute of Social Sciences. She has led numerous international and local projects, and has authored more than 40 publications on ethnopolitics, civil society, societal integration, social identity, education policy, and bilingual education.

Christian E. Zuñiga is a doctoral student in Bilingual/Bicultural Education in the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at the University of Texas, Austin. She is a former bilingual teacher of recent immigrants. Her interests include language education policy, language minority education, and language use in borderland contexts.

1 Introduction

Key Concepts and Issues in Bilingual and Multilingual Education

WAYNE E. WRIGHT, SOVICHETH BOUN,
AND OFELIA GARCÍA

What is bilingual and multilingual education? In the simplest definition, bilingual education is the use of two languages for learning and teaching in an instructional setting and, by extension, multilingual education would be the use of three languages or more. In a narrower definition, literacy is developed and/or specific content areas are taught through the medium of two or more languages in an organized and planned education program. In most cases, one of these is the “home,” “native,” or “mother-tongue” language, and one is the “dominant” societal language or a “powerful” international language. In multilingual education settings, the other languages may be dominant regional languages. However, as will be shown throughout this handbook, even these basic concepts such as language, home language, dominant language, native speaker, bilingual, multilingual, and bilingual and multilingual education are highly complex and contested constructs; thus considerations about which languages or varieties of languages to use as media of instruction are not always straightforward. Because education is most often the responsibility of nation states with artificial (and contested) geographical boundaries encompassing many—and oftentimes dividing—linguistic groups, decisions about bilingual and multilingual education are highly political, and influenced by a variety of historical, economic, and sociocultural factors.

For example, in 1998 a formal debate over bilingual education was held at California State University Long Beach, in the context of the Proposition 227 Campaign to pass a law restricting the state’s bilingual programs through mandates for English-medium instruction. The first author (Wright) was present during the heated exchanges, and listened incredulously as the local chairperson for the Proposition 227 Campaign—an elementary school teacher in Orange County—claimed that bilingual education was a “failed experiment,” that “we only do bilingual programs for Spanish speakers,” and that “other countries don’t do bilingual education, only the United States!”

At the time of this debate, Wright was teaching in a Cambodian (Khmer) bilingual education program at an elementary school just a few miles away. The second author (Boun) was a senior in high school in Cambodia learning both English and Khmer, and later studied at a multilingual university—the Royal University of Phnom Penh. The third author (García) was a former Spanish–English bilingual teacher in New York City, a professor conducting research on bilingualism and bilingual education in New York City and internationally, that year along the Uruguay–Brazil border as a Fulbright Scholar.

As our personal experiences illustrate, political attacks, misinformation, and outright falsehoods often permeate debates over bilingual and multilingual education. Ironically, during this period of renewed attacks on bilingual education in the United States, other countries around the world were turning to bilingual and multilingual education to address linguistic realities and student needs. UNESCO and UNICEF, for example, promote mother-tongue-based multilingual education as a key component of education reform assistance to developing nations struggling to provide universal access to a basic education. Other nations with historically homogeneous populations are also beginning to turn to bilingual and multilingual education to address the realities of demographic change.

In the United States between 1998 and 2002, three states (California, Arizona, and Massachusetts) passed anti-bilingual education laws (G. McField, 2014), and federal education policy—the No Child Left Behind Act of 2001—removed all mention, encouragement, and direct financial support of bilingual education (Menken, 2008). However, the tides are beginning to change. After 15 years of anti-bilingual legislation in these three states, bilingual programs have been *restricted*, but *not eliminated*. Waiver provisions, loopholes, and differing interpretations of the laws by various policy makers provided space for many schools to continue or even expand bilingual education programs. In California, legislative efforts are now underway to reverse Proposition 227 and undo the harm caused by the ill-informed law (McGreevy, 2014). Even with Proposition 227 still in place, California became the first state in the United States to recognize the valuable linguistic skills of graduating bilingual students by awarding a “Seal of Biliteracy” on their high school diplomas—a model now being replicated in other states, including New York and Texas (see <http://sealofbiliteracy.org/>).

Thus, bilingual and multilingual education is alive and well and expanding. Indeed, in a world with only 196 “nation states” but over 7,000 named spoken languages (Lewis, Simons, & Fennig, 2013), bilingual and multilingual education is essential. As García (2009) has argued, in the 21st Century “bilingual education, in all its complexities and forms, seems to be the only way to educate as the world moves forward” (p. 6).

Nonetheless, there are a wide variety of often conflicting ideologies, theories, policies, and practices surrounding bilingual and multilingual education throughout the world. In some cases, bilingual education may even be misused to limit access and opportunities for linguistic minority students. This speaks to the great need for a comprehensive *Handbook of Bilingual and Multilingual Education* to: (1) discuss the theoretical foundations and present bilingual and multilingual education as a

current, strong, and cutting-edge field; (2) provide a broad overview of the historical development and current status of the field; (3) provide vivid critical examples of policy and practice in action; and (4) move the field forward by rethinking older constructs and introducing fresh ideas that better reflect and address the reality of our multilingual, multicultural, and increasingly globalized world.

The only attempt at a comprehensive internationally focused handbook on bilingual education was in 1988 in an edited volume by Christina Bratt Paulston containing 27 chapters each focused on a different country or region of the world. While this collection of individual case studies was highly informative, it did not lay out the theoretical foundations of the field. Important textbooks in the late 1980s and early 1990s helped solidify the field of bilingual education by providing educators with theory, research, and practical suggestions, including, for example, Ovando and Collier (1985), Crawford (1989), and Baker (1993). These key early textbooks have all subsequently been updated to 5th editions (Baker, 2011; Crawford, 2004; Ovando & Combs, 2011). The *Encyclopedia of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* edited by Baker and Jones (1999), and the more recent *Encyclopedia of Bilingual Education* edited by González (2008), in addition to the 2nd edition of the ten-volume *Encyclopedia of Language and Education* (May & Hornberger, 2008) with Volume 5 focused on Bilingual Education (edited by Jim Cummins and Nancy Hornberger) cover a wide range of topics, and have further established bilingual and multilingual education as an important academic field. Recent books and scholarship, including García's (2009) *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century*, have helped challenge some of our cherished constructs and underlying theoretical foundations, and have introduced new terms and ways of conceptualizing key issues as we move forward in our rapidly changing world.

Overview and organization

This Handbook builds on the excellent prior work described above by providing both depth and breadth across three major sections: (1) Foundations for Bilingual and Multilingual Education, (2) Pedagogical Issues and Practices in Bilingual and Multilingual Education, and (3) Global Dimensions of Bilingual and Multilingual Education. The 41 chapters in this Handbook are authored by 78 distinguished, well-known, and rising scholars from around the world. Collectively their chapters provide case studies of, or draw examples from, specific countries and regions from all continents of the earth except Antarctica.

Authors in Sections 1 and 2 were asked to provide an historical overview of their topic, discuss the current state of knowledge with a focus on methodological and theoretical issues and problem areas, and discuss future directions. Authors of the country/region-specific chapters in Section 3 were asked to provide a brief historical overview, a brief summary of the current state of bilingual/multilingual education, and then discuss a specific case or provide a focus on one or more of the specific issues in their region/country. These chapters in Section 3 provide vivid examples of the issues raised and discussed in Sections 1 and 2.

Foundations for bilingual and multilingual education

Given the interdisciplinary nature of the field of bilingual and multilingual education, the 10 chapters in Section 1 bring in a wide variety of theoretical foundations informed by diverse academic fields. The authors in this section challenge some long-held notions and push us to consider new ways of conceptualizing and understanding our multilingual world. In Chapter 2 Angel Lin argues that, while sociolinguistics has focused on sociopolitical and sociocultural aspects of bi/multilingualism, there is a need for a better understanding of bi/multilingualism and bilingual education as a response to the human condition in a contemporary world marked by global crises, oppression, resistance, and increasing fragmentation. She introduces the term “grassroots trans-semiotizing” to highlight the varied ways local and trans-local actors make creative use of multiple kinds of semiotics (not just written and spoken language) to make meaning and build trans-local internetworks and communities. Lin gives specific examples of trans-semiotizing practices of a Hong Kong-based hip-hop artist who meshes local vernaculars and musical styles in a manner that has global (trans-local) currency.

At one low point in academic reasoning about bilingualism, some scholars in the early to mid 20th century conjectured that bilingualism was negatively correlated with attempted measures of “intelligence” (see Hakuta, 1986 for a review). In Chapter 3 Anatoliy Kharkhurin provides evidence that bilingual practices not only lead to cognitive advantages in some areas, but also that these strengthened cognitive mechanisms may also increase the creative potential of bilinguals. Based on these findings, Kharkhurin proposes an educational model that incorporates bilingual and creative aspects of human development.

Bilingual and multilingual education, along with other language education fields, has been strongly influenced by theories from the field of second language acquisition (SLA). In Chapter 4, Guadalupe Valdés, Luis Poza, and Maneka Brooks challenge longstanding cognitivist orientations of SLA that focus on language as an individual process with the goal of linear progress in acquiring a grammatical system and language proficiency equivalent to that of a “native speaker.” Valdés, Poza, and Brooks identify and discuss two important shifts that have resulted from the “social turn” in SLA research: changing perspectives on language, and changing theoretical positions in SLA. These socially oriented shifts move away from unrealistic deficit-oriented expectations for students such as “native-like proficiency,” error-free production, or becoming balanced bilinguals (i.e., two fully proficient monolinguals in one). Instead, the authors argue for a sociocultural view of SLA as a process “leading to repertoires or linguistic resources termed multi-competence or plurilingualism.” This in turn has the “potential of informing and enriching the design of classroom environments in which students would be able to experience multiple ways of using both their home language and English for a variety of academic purposes in both their written and oral forms.”

Literacy instruction is typically the most contested and ideologically driven content area in the school curriculum (Edelsky, 2006). Viv Edwards in Chapter 5 notes that teachers in bilingual and multilingual classrooms must often resort to

reinventing “pedagogical practices devised with monolingual, more culturally homogenous populations in mind.” However, she argues that, with our broader and deeper understanding of the extent, nature, and complexity developed over recent decades, we “now have a much clearer idea of the pedagogies that more closely meet the needs of multilingual learning communities in relation to both learning in general and literacy learning in particular.” Despite this clearer picture of *what* needs to be included in teacher education, and *why* it needs to be included, the real challenge, Edwards asserts, is “*how* teachers can best be supported to make the necessary changes.”

In Chapter 6, Laura Valdiviezo and Sonia Nieto acknowledge cultural diversity as foundational in bilingual/multilingual education; culture is learned, thus biculturalism is one of the goals of bilingual education. However, Valdiviezo and Nieto argue that culture has been misunderstood theoretically and misapplied in practice. Given that culture is “dynamic, multifaceted, embedded in context, influenced by social, economic, and political factors, created and socially constructed, learned, and dialectal,” becoming bicultural is a complex process. Valdiviezo and Nieto note that, when internalizing at least two cultural systems, “sometimes their inherent values can be contradictory or even diametrically opposed.” To challenge assumptions about cultural diversity, they argue for more critically based research examining local cultural practices to understand the complex relationships of language and culture in bilingual and multicultural classrooms.

Conducting research in bilingual and multicultural classrooms and contexts, however, is not a simple straightforward task, as detailed in Chapters 7 and 8. While there is strong research evidence of the effectiveness and benefits of bilingual education over education provided solely through a dominant societal language (August & Shanahan, 2006; Genesee, Lindholm-Leary, Saunders, & Christian, 2005; G. P. McField & McField, 2014; Ramirez, Yuen, Ramey, Pasta, & Billings, 1991; Rolstad, Mahoney, & Glass, 2005; Slavin & Cheung, 2005), Colin Baker and Gwyn Lewis warn in Chapter 7 that “the search for the Holy Grail of a perfect piece of research on bilingual education is not elusive. It is unattainable.” While noting many specific examples of research findings favorable to bilingual education, they also note the boundaries and limitations of these studies, argue that research findings need to be treated critically and cautiously, and warn against our cravings for simple conclusions. They do not dismiss such research, however, because, without it, “our understandings and actions will be unrefined, conformist, naïve, even mindless.” They conclude that “such research illuminates and challenges, makes our thinking more sophisticated and structured, celebrates as well as contradicts, ensuring informed debates as well as doubts, even leading to more coherent and rational decisions ... for the sake of children.” While Baker and Lewis focus on the methodologies and findings of academic research, in Chapter 8 Angela Creese and Adrian Blackledge, with seven of their research colleagues, focus on issues related to the process of conducting research “multilingually.” They note that language and linguistic varieties make up an essential dimension of researcher identities, which, in turn, can shape research designs and arguments made in interpretive research. Given the overlap of method and theory, the authors

argue for linguistic ethnographies to “explore this overlap” and understand the ways in which “individual trajectories feed into interpretive practices.” To illustrate the power of linguistic ethnography, the authors share vignettes of researcher narratives written by members of their research team as they undertook a large study in bilingual classroom contexts.

As noted at the beginning of this chapter, decisions about bilingual and multilingual education are often driven by ideologies and politics. In Chapter 9, Mirose Paia, Jim Cummins, Isabelle Nocus, Marie Salaün, and Jacques Vernaudon explore the intersections of language ideologies, power, and identity in the context of efforts in French Polynesia related to bilingual education and indigenous language revitalization. The authors first examine how societal power relations in this colonial context “transformed the population from one of the most literate in the world in the early 1800s to being only minimally literate in their mother tongues by the 1960s.” They then describe the Polynesian Languages and Cultures Project designed to reverse low literacy rates by promoting “students’ total linguistic and cognitive potential at school focusing particularly on early bilingual education.” In studying this program, Paia and colleagues found that the key to academic success was not simply a matter of incorporating the first language into instruction, but rather “the extent to which the interactions between teachers and students generate a sense of empowerment among the students.” They conclude “students will learn the target language (both L1 and L2) if they are given opportunities to use it for powerful purposes.” We wish to acknowledge another empowering feature in connection with this important chapter. The study highlighted in this chapter is part of a larger research collaboration between Jim Cummins from the University of Toronto in Canada, local researchers from the University of French Polynesia (Paia & Vernaudon), and colleagues from France at the University of Nantes (Nocus & Salaün). We wish to acknowledge Jim’s efforts to work with and help translate his colleagues’ work—which was conducted and written in first draft in French. This is in keeping with Angel Lin’s call in chapter 2 to develop “trans-local mechanisms to translate and/or make available diverse local research work.”

Chapter 10, by Terrence Wiley, considers the political contexts of bilingual and multilingual education programs through the framework of language policy and planning. He notes that in institutional contexts “policies and practices related to prescribing and governing behaviors are instruments of social control.” Traditionally, language planning has been viewed as institutional policymaking to “prescribe or influence language(s) ... that will be used and the purposes for which they will be used.” However, Wiley raises a number of important questions about this process: “Who gets to define what language problems are? How, why, and for whom, have they become problems? And does the process of language planning itself cause language and communication problems? In other words, why should we assume that the process is only for benevolent purposes?” To address these questions, Wiley, extending Kloss (1998), provides a useful framework for classifying and analyzing language policies as promotion-oriented, expediency-oriented, tolerance-oriented, restriction-oriented, or repression-oriented; in addition there may be policies of