

An Introduction to Compassion in Healthcare Practice

Ian McGonagle

WILEY Blackwell

An Introduction to Compassion in Healthcare Practice

An Introduction to Compassion in Healthcare Practice

Ian McGonagle

University of Lincoln Lincoln, UK

WILEY Blackwell

This edition first published 2025 © 2025 John Wiley & Sons Ltd

All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial technologies or similar technologies. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by law. Advice on how to obtain permission to reuse material from this title is available at http://www.wiley.com/go/permissions.

The right of Ian McGonagle to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with law.

Registered Offices

John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 111 River Street, Hoboken, NJ 07030, USA John Wiley & Sons Ltd, New Era House, 8 Oldlands Way, Bognor Regis, West Sussex, PO22 9NQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, customer services, and more information about Wiley products visit us at www.wiley.com.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats and by print-on-demand. Some content that appears in standard print versions of this book may not be available in other formats.

Trademarks: Wiley and the Wiley logo are trademarks or registered trademarks of John Wiley & Sons, Inc. and/ or its affiliates in the United States and other countries and may not be used without written permission. All other trademarks are the property of their respective owners. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty

While the publisher and authors have used their best efforts in preparing this work, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this work and specifically disclaim all warranties, including without limitation any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. No warranty may be created or extended by sales representatives, written sales materials or promotional statements for this work. This work is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services. The advice and strategies contained herein may not be suitable for your situation. You should consult with a specialist where appropriate. The fact that an organization, website, or product is referred to in this work as a citation and/or potential source of further information does not mean that the publisher and authors endorse the information or services the organization, website, or product is referred to in this work. Further, readers should be aware that websites listed in this work may have changed or disappeared between when this work was written and when it is read. Neither the publisher nor authors shall be liable for any loss of profit or any other commercial damages, including but not limited to special, incidental, consequential, or other damages.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: McGonagle, Ian, author.

Title: An introduction to compassion in healthcare practice / Ian McGonagle.
Description: Hoboken, NJ : Wiley-Blackwell, 2025. | Includes index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2024045767 (print) | LCCN 2024045768 (ebook) | ISBN 9781394220458 (paperback) | ISBN 9781394220472 (adobe pdf) | ISBN 9781394220465 (epub)
Subjects: MESH: Empathy | Attitude of Health Personnel | Professional-Patient Relations
Classification: LCC R697.A4 (print) | LCC R697.A4 (ebook) | NLM W 62 | DDC 610.73/7-dc23/eng/20241203
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024045767
LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2024045768

Cover Design: Niall McGonagle Cover Image: © Loïc Fürhoff/Unsplash, adapted by Niall McGonagle

Set in 10.5/13pt STIXTwoText by Straive, Pondicherry, India

Contents

	Preface	xi
	Biography	XV
	Acknowledgments	xvii
CHAPTER 1	A Compassion Primer	1
	Introduction	1
	What is Compassion?	3
	Compassion as an Emotion	4
	Compassion as a State or a Trait?	5
	Compassion as a Motivation	5
	The Threat System	6
	The Drive System	6
	Safeness System	6
	Attributes of Compassion	8 9
	Care for Wellbeing	9
	Sensitivity	9
	Sympathy	10
	Empathy	10
	Approaching People in a Non-	
	judgemental Manner	11
	Tolerance of Distress	12
	Engaging with Compassionate Attributes	12
	Our Evolutionary Biology	13
	The Biological Basis of Compassion	14
	Evolution of the Brain	15
	The Science of Compassion	15
	Compassion in the Arts	17
	What Is the Price of Experience?	17
	Summary	18
	References	20

CHAPTER 2	Compassion for the Environment:	
	The Consequences for Health Workers	~ -
	and Patients (with Jess Bunn)	25
	Introduction	25
	Complexity and Complex Adaptive Systems	26
	Exercise	27
	Compassion at the Macro Level:	
	The Global Environment	29
	What Are the Compassionate Responses	
	We Can Take?	30
	Compassion for the Environment	31
	Compassion at the Meso Level: The Ward/	
	Team/Practice Environment	32
	The IoM Core Competencies	36
	Compassion at the Micro Level: The Person	
	Orientated Practice Environment	36
	Interoception and Neuroception	36
	Digging Deeper Into Polyvagal Theory	38
	How Does This Play Out in the Nervous	
	System?	38
	Developing our Compassionate Practice	
	Environment	39
	Case Studies	40
	References	42
	Artificial Intolligence (AI) and	
CHAPTER 3	Artificial Intelligence (AI) and	
	Compassion – Can You Have	47
	Compassionate AI? (with Dr Michael Rowe)	47
	Introduction	47
	What is the Role of Compassion in Al?	49
	Ethics and Al	50
	An Overview of Ethical Theories for Al	50
	Utilitarianism	50
	Deontology	51
	Principle Ethics	51
	Autonomy	52
	Beneficence	52
	Nonmaleficence	52
	Justice	52
	Virtue Ethics	52
	Care Ethics	53
	Consent for Care Provided by AI Technology	54
	Can Al Robotics Deliver 'Care'?	54
	The Role of Touch in Care Giving	55

	Case Study: What if AI Was More Compassionate than a Person? Conclusion Our Thoughts on Potential Benefits and Risks of AI in the Case Scenario References	57 59 59 63
CHAPTER 4	Compassion, Self-compassion and Being Mindful Introduction Developing Self-Compassion Narcissism and Self-Compassion Self-Compassion The Benefits of Being Self-Compassionate The Challenges of Self-Compassion Perfectionism Our 'Inner Critic' Shame How to Develop Self-Compassion Practicing Self-Compassion Exercise Resilience Burnout References	65 66 66 67 69 70 70 71 72 73 75 75 76 80
CHAPTER 5	Compassionate Encounters with Individuals Introduction	83 83
	Developing an Evolutionary Understanding of Compassion Pro-Sociality Working with Individuals – Empathy	84 86
	and Compassion Attributes when Working Compassionately:	87
	A Focus on Motivation What Is Motivation? Case Study: 'Going for a Drink with Dave' References	91 92 94 97
CHAPTER 6	Encounters with Groups: The Compassionate Team Introduction Professional Values Developing Values-Based Practice Values Based Practice What Is VBP?	103 103 104 105 106 106

	The Importance of Values in the Practice	
	of Health and Social Care Workers	108
	The Theory of Values-Based Practice	109
	Compassion and Team Working	113
	Complex Adaptive Systems (CAS) in Teamworking	114
	What Are the Implications	
	for Compassionate Practice?	115
	The 'Meitheal' as a Cultural Expression	
	of Compassionate Teamworking	116
	Compassionate Teams: Lessons	
	from Project Aristotle	117
	Case Study	119
	Context	119
	The Compassion Focused Multi-Disciplinary	
	Team (CF MDT)	120
	Meditation Content	120
	Post Meditation Discussion	121
	Questions	121
	References	121
CHAPTER 7	Compassionate Support for People:	
	The Role of Supervision	127
	Introduction	127
	What is Practice Supervision?	128
	Developing Self-Efficacy and Competence	129
	Supervision and the Issue of Identity	130
	A Model of Supervision	132
	Schwartz Rounds and Compassion	134
	A Revised Approach to Compassionate Supervision The Components of Compassion-Focused	135
	Supervision	138
	Promoting Courage Through Supervision	139
	Leadership and Supervision	139
	Case Study Exercise	141
	References	141
CHAPTER 8	Compassionate Leadership	147
CHAITENO	Compassionate Leadership Introduction	147
	An Overview of Leadership in Health	14/
	and Social Care	148
	The Context of Healthcare Leadership	140
	A Review of Existing Literature on Leadership Style	149
	A Word on The 'Alpha' Narrative on Leadership	153
	Compassionate Leadership	153
	Leadership From an Evolutionary Perspective	154

	Compassion, Resilience and Leadership Is Personal Resilience the Answer? 'Real-World' Leadership Compassionate Leadership and Social	155 156 158
	Relationships Safety Trustworthiness and Transparency Peer Support Collaboration and Mutuality Team-Based Approach Empowerment and Choice Cultural, Historical and Gender Issues	159 160 161 161 161 162 162 162
	Case Scenario: Compassionate Leadership in Healthcare Background Questions to Consider References	163 163 164 166
CHAPTER 9	Teaching Compassion (with Lyndsay Khan) Introduction Courage Wisdom Can Compassion be Taught? The Compassion and Caring Teaching Mindfulness Strategies for Teaching Compassion Case Study Teaching Compassion Case Study Scenario Learning Objectives Areas for Discussion Learning Activities Teaching Compassion: Case Study 2 Introduction Case Study Scenario Learning Objectives Discussion Questions Learning Activities	171 172 174 176 178 179 181 182 182 182 184 184 184 184 184 185 185 185 185 185 185 185 185 186 186 186 187 187

Preface

Compassion is fundamental to effective health and social care delivery. A simple review of complaints about health and social care practice will clearly indicate that 'not being treated as a person' or being 'a number rather than an individual' is the most cited reason for dissatisfaction with care giving. Therefore, while being compassionate seems obvious, maybe it is a little more challenging than we first think.

There has been a significant interest in "compassion" as being the basis of all formal therapeutic approaches. Additionally, there is an interest in the scientific understanding of compassion and how it affects human behavior. This book is **not** a book about being a compassion focused therapist or a compassion scientist. There are many fine books that will help with your therapy and scientific endeavors based on compassionate approaches. I hope you will find many key texts referenced throughout.

What this book **is** about rests on a concern to identify the core components of helping (of being compassionate and self-compassionate) so that we may be in a better place to attend to our health and to engage in helping others. It is a book that has a focus on our intention to help, and that we are best served by understanding what "helping" means. It is an attempt to view the therapeutic arts and healthcare practice (both art and science) through a compassionate lens.

A note on style: There is a very extensive scientific literature on compassion, and at times, it can be dense. Therefore, I have purposefully sought to try and write this book in a style that is true to the title – "an introduction." It is intended to be a springboard to additional and deeper reading – and so in order to achieve this I have attempted to present the material in an easy reading, somewhat "conversational" style and to simplify concepts.

AN IMPORTANT APOLOGY

In offering "an introduction," there is always the possibility of misrepresenting important compassion science concepts. While I have always sought to minimize these and be as explicit as possible, I have tried to make sense of what this word means for me and used my years of practice, in a range of settings to illustrate and contextualize theory. At times I have sought to be integrative and utilize other theoretical models (e.g. polyvagal theory, Values-Based Practice, and behavior change models such as the COM-B approach) to illustrate ideas. This integrative approach runs many risks of claiming definitive theoretical links where such links may be tenuous. Again, I have done this to support illustrations or attempt to make sense of the topic. Any errors remain my responsibility.

Effective health and social care rests on compassion being at the heart of what we do. Yet our understanding of compassion as a concept may be quite partial. The word "compassion" is just a word if it is not understood in terms of our practice. The Chief Nursing Officer, I am sure, had good intentions when she identified "Compassion" as one of the 6 Cs. Unfortunately, I never met a nurse who could really tell me what compassion really meant. Usually they tell me, it is a substitute for "being kind" – it isn't!

This book is aimed at people in healthcare provision, and it is drawn significantly from my practice as a mental health nurse. However, it also informed by many years working with colleagues from different health and social care professions and those who have none. Over the past 10 years, I have spent more time with wonderful students who work in nonprofessionally affiliated roles in health and social care. The whole health and social care sector would collapse without such people!

To support this introductory text for a broad readership, I have drawn on the work of Seedhouse (2009) who noted that we are all "*workers for health*" and as such we are engaged in a moral endeavor. We should examine our practice and reflect upon it to seek better ways to provide care and support to patients*. Part of this would also entail reflecting on our core concepts, such as "*compassion*."

This book reviews compassion from a number of viewpoints. It begins with an overview of one particular frame of compassion, as viewed through an evolutionary science perspective. In this view, we are "programmed" to be compassionate – but social forces may throw challenges or obstacles in our way. It maybe our upbringing creates barriers to being compassionate (enough) when engaged in caring behaviors. It may be our current life circumstances or the work environment and associated stressors. There is much interest in the science of compassion and how being compassionate affects our physiology. The opening chapter is important as it seeks to provide the foundation work for chapters that follow.

My aim is that the reader will examine compassion as a core element of their practice and consider how they can utilize a deeper understanding of the word/concept to care for their own health, the health of their colleagues, and most importantly, the health and need of people who use services.

REFERENCE

Seedhouse, D. (2009). Ethics: the Heart of Healthcare, 3e. London: Wiley.

Biography

Ian McGonagle (PhD) is a mental health nurse and an associate professor at the University of Lincoln. He began his nurse training in 1983 at Pastures Hospital in Derby. He has worked in a variety of roles in the NHS as a clinician, manager, and educator. He spent a number of years working on the New Ways of Working programs for the National Institute for Mental Health in England before accepting a position at Lincoln University.

Acknowledgments

Ar scáth a chéile a mhaireann na daoine – We live in the shadow of each other. (Irish proverb)

No man is an island, Entire of itself; Every man is a piece of the continent, A part of the main. John Donne (1623)

There are a number of people I would like to acknowledge in helping this book happen. First, to my sons Niall and Ryan, such beautiful people of whom I remain eternally proud. My brothers and sister and their families, who also fall into the category of beautiful people! There are so many of them, but they know who they are (I am acknowledging my bias here).

The BSc (Hons) Health and Social Care students at Lincoln who have endured so many lectures but allowed me to refine my ideas over many years. I have such fond memories of so many students as they make their positive mark on the world. My chapter co-authors, Jess, Michael, and Lyndsay, and Dave, Dr Lindsey Hampson and Dr Amanda Super for letting me make use of their impressive work, thank you all for your helpful contributions. Thank you to Debbie Craddock from Rauceby Primary School in Lincolnshire, who was a wonderful help and possesses supreme editing skills.

My colleagues at Lincoln University and my close friends and international colleagues in the Udine-C nursing network, who all have been steadfast, fun, and utterly fabulous over many years.

While working for the National Institute for Mental Health in England, Barry Nixon, Gill Walker, Professors Tony Butterworth, Christine Jackson, and Ian Baguley, all gave me opportunities to develop this work which has continued over many years. Professor Bill Fulford was very welcoming and supportive in developing a deeper understanding of Values Based Practice, which has stood me in good stead. In 1984, I started my mental health nurse training in Derby and was in the fortunate position to be in the same hospital as Professor Paul Gilbert. Paul was always welcoming, informative, and encouraging in my development as a Mental Health Nurse. He was particularly helpful with his comments on Chapter 1 of this book.

I have also been blessed to know expert nurses (sort of), who have provided me with so many laughs and so much wisdom over many years, so thank you Annette, Trisha, and Marcia, I have learned so much about compassion from you. My friend Gary has been a steadfast confidante over many years and along with his family have been sources of wonder and inspiration.

I also acknowledge H, Biggley, Jude, and Hope for being ever gorgeous and kind. Lastly, but not least, to Julia for all her encouragement, cups of tea, and resilience. I would not have been able to complete this without your compassionate love and support.

THE COVER

I have had a long fascination with bridges and stairs as such structures serve the purpose of connecting people. These structures help you move from one place (familiar) to another place that maybe not so familiar. They can take you from where you are to where you might want to be. They can help you learn new things from new people, you can imagine what life is like, 'over there' (empathy) but stairs or a bridge can take you there to be alongside people and be a purposeful aid (compassion). Seeking a deeper understanding of compassion means making a connection and travelling with, or to, someone. Sometimes it might be uncomfortable, strange, and unfamiliar. By taking the steps we can learn about being self-compassionate and experiencing the unfamiliar can only add to our sense of self-worth and the worth of others.

Footnotes I will use the word *patient* throughout the text while noting we could be talking about people as service users or clients (but never "customers"!). But everyone seems to be stuck in finding the right word to describe the desired relationship we wish to have with people which accurately defines the partnership in care. In the absence of such a word, I have chosen to use the word "patient."

Cover design adapted by Niall McGonagle (email: HYPERLINK "mailto:nallmcgonagle@hotmail.com"niallmcgonagle@hotmail.com / Instagram: nialldraws).

CHAPTER]

A Compassion Primer

INTRODUCTION

Being 'compassionate' is at the core of healthcare work, isn't it? There seems no place in our services for non-compassionate people. How could anyone possibly function in a hospital or any care giving setting, where their care was not based on the basic tenet of being 'compassionate'?

However, and sadly, we have too many cases (that continue to grow) where care has been found to be lacking in compassion. How can this happen? How can a healthcare worker go to work with the desire or the intention to be non-compassionate to patients? I don't believe they do. Yes, there have been professionals who have been found to act criminally and murderously. But while always regrettable and unfathomable, they are rare.

What is sadly less rare, is routine practice that is found to be uncaring. Consider the following:

Mrs H was a dignified woman who lived in her own home until the age of 88, needing relatively little support. She was deaf and partially sighted and

(continued)

An Introduction to Compassion in Healthcare Practice, First Edition. Ian McGonagle. © 2025 John Wiley & Sons Ltd. Published 2025 by John Wiley & Sons Ltd.

(continued)

although she could still read large print, communicated through British Sign Language and deaf-blind manual.

Following a fall at home, Mrs H was admitted to the Elderly Care Assessment Unit with acute confusion. Whilst Mrs H was in hospital she had a number of falls, one of which broke her collar bone, but her niece was not informed. Several additional injuries and falls were not included on her discharge summary. Poor nursing records were kept and no personalised plans for her non-medical needs were developed and although at low risk of malnutrition at admission, Mrs H lost about 11 lbs during her first three months in hospital.

Communication with Mrs H was difficult, and her specific needs were not met. No activities or stimulation were provided for her. The discharge arrangements for this lady were confused and no effective handover to the care home was completed.

When Mrs H arrived at the care home, the Manager noted that she had numerous injuries, was soaked with urine and was dressed in clothing that did not belong to her which was held up with large paper clips. She had with her several bags of dirty clothing, (most of which did not belong to her), and few possessions of her own. Mrs H was bruised, dishevelled and confused. She was highly distressed and agitated and the following day was admitted to a local hospital due to concerns about her mental state and her physical condition.

Sadly, Mrs H died soon after in August 2010.

Source: Parliamentary and Health Service Ombudsman (2011).

The above is clearly shocking, but this desperate situation needs to be understood at a deeper level. To achieve this, we need to reflect on the reasons why there was seemingly, a lack of compassion or care. Do I believe those involved in the care of this poor lady wanted to be unkind and careless? No, I don't. I do however, think we, as workers for health, may fail to seek what lies behind the experiences of Mrs H. This book seeks to create opportunities for discussion and deeper understanding of how such care can result and to promote compassionate responses to minimise their future occurrence.

The Chief Nursing Officer (Department of Health/Chief Nursing Officer 2012) instigated the 6C's which eventually formed a direct response to the Francis Inquiry into care and treatment at Mid Staffordshire NHS Trust (Francis 2013). These 6C's (Care; Communication; Courage;