Serdar Yüksel Tamer Başar

Stochastic Teams, Games, and Control under Information Constraints





Systems & Control: Foundations & Applications

Series Editor

Tamer Başar, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Urbana, IL, USA

Editorial Board

Karl Johan Åström, Lund University, Lund, Sweden Han-Fu Chen, Academia Sinica, Beijing, China Bill Helton, University of California, San Diego, CA, USA Alberto Isidori, Sapienza University of Rome, Rome, Italy Miroslav Krstic, University of California, San Diego, CA, USA H. Vincent Poor, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA H. Mete Soner, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA

Former Editorial Board Member

Roberto Tempo, (1956-2017), CNR-IEIIT, Politecnico di Torino, Italy

Stochastic Teams, Games, and Control under Information Constraints



Serdar Yüksel Mathematics & Statistics Queen's University Kingston, ON, Canada Tamer Başar (5)
Coordinated Science Laboratory
University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign
Urbana, IL, USA

ISSN 2324-9749 ISSN 2324-9757 (electronic) Systems & Control: Foundations & Applications ISBN 978-3-031-54070-7 ISBN 978-3-031-54071-4 (eBook)

https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-54071-4

Mathematics Subject Classification: 93E20, 93E03, 91A10, 94A15, 93E15

@ The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2024

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This book is published under the imprint Birkhäuser, www.birkhauser-science.com by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

If disposing of this product, please recycle the paper.

To Adem, Helin, Kate, Sait, and Saibe Yüksel (S.Y.) and Altan, Koray, Eren, Zara, Alya, and Reya (T.B.)

Preface

The progress in the field of stochastic decision making since the publication of our 2013 book *Stochastic Networked Control Systems: Stabilization and Optimization Under Information Constraints* in the same Series, and expansion and evolution of the topical areas the field encompasses, has given us the impetus to expand on our earlier coverage, to go also beyond stochastic teams to include stochastic games as well.

Given our initial motivation, this book may first be viewed as an addendum to our 2013 book. However, the progress in the field and the encouraging response we have received from the community have led us to make such substantial changes in the coverage (as noted below) that the current book can no longer be viewed as a *2nd edition*. Accordingly, some of the material in our 2013 book have not been included in this book and most of the new material here cannot be found anywhere else in such a complete and unified manner.

Our goal here has been to provide a comprehensive, mathematically rigorous, and accessible treatment of the interaction between information, decision, and control in multi-agent systems. We provide a comprehensive theory and coverage on information structures for stochastic teams as well as stochastic games.

The fields of decentralized stochastic control and networked control have reached a high level of maturity. On decentralization, there has been significant progress on existence, approximations, and optimality analyses, and many outstanding issues have been resolved, even though some still remain open. On networked control, there have been major findings on solution methods for both stabilization and optimization under various information constraints for both linear and non-linear models, and it is perhaps fair to say that the field is slowly converging to a phase where the rate of progress does not have the bursts of initial stages of discovery. Notably, non-linear systems have also found their place toward a broad treatment of information design in control theory and the theory of multi-agent decision making. Importantly, the fields noted above are now important, closely related subdisciplines of their own, and will likely keep generations of students immersed in the problems involving the interaction of information and control, and decision making in general.

viii Preface

Additionally, we have included in the book a comprehensive treatment of information structures as they arise in stochastic game theory. Game theoretic framework brings in a multitude of additional intricacies with regard to the value and shaping of information, and even the most elementary arguments on the role of information in stochastic teams do not find universal applicability in game theory due to the competitive nature of equilibrium concepts, and fragility of information structure dependent properties, which we cover in detail in the book. We present foundational material regarding the interaction of information and decisions, toward a comprehensive theory of information structures in stochastic teams, games, and (networked) control.

As in the 2013 book, we take information structures both as passively provided (as, for example, in the theory of partially observed Markov decision processes, decentralized stochastic control as well as dynamic game theory) and as actively designed (via encoding and decoding policies when a physical information channel is present, as in communication theoretic problems or signaling game problems). For the latter case, in the context of networked control and signaling games, we may view encoders and decoders also as agents.

Finally, we provide in the book a comprehensive discussion on reinforcement learning theory in the context of the topics presented in the book. Reinforcement learning algorithms use feedback information to improve performance in a control task. The field of reinforcement learning has advanced significantly both in terms of fundamental theoretical contributions and applications. However, it is important to also understand the limitations of learning theory in the presence of model uncertainty and limited information. To this end, we found it appropriate to present several fundamental results toward generating a more complete book. Accordingly, a systematic discussion on reinforcement learning theory under a variety of information structures is presented.

To keep the length of the book within a manageable size, proofs of certain results with particularly tedious derivations have not been included, with relevant references provided as appropriate. Also, we have kept the analysis throughout the book primarily in the discrete-time domain, while we recognize that much research has been done in the continuous-time setup as well. Bibliographic remarks provide some references in this domain.

The book draws and utilizes a diverse set of tools (of both conceptual and analytical nature) from various disciplines, including stochastic control, team theory, game theory, information theory, probability theory, and dynamical systems, and amalgamates them into a unified, coherent, and applicable theory. It could be used as a textbook or as an accompanying text in a graduate-level course on the topic.

Kingston, ON, Canada Urbana, IL, USA Serdar Yüksel Tamer Başar

Acknowledgements

As in the 2013 book, the work here would not have been possible had we not have the opportunity of interacting with several outstanding scholars and extremely resourceful students.

We would like to thank many individuals whose works, either independently or through collaboration, have shaped the contents of the book. Of particular mention are Fady Alajaji, Gürdal Arslan, Graeme Baker, Diego Cardenas, Giacomo Como, Alexander Condello, Liam Cregg, Philippe Furrer, Nicolas Garcia, Sinan Gezici, Meysam Ghomi, Adina Goldberg, Abhishek Gupta, Ian Hogeboom-Burr, Nuh Aygün Dalkıran Alireza Jalaeian, Andrew Johnston, Ali Devran Kara, Christoph Kawan, Ertan Kazıklı, Jonathan Keeler, Tamás Linder, Aditya Mahajan, Nuno C. Martins, Curtis McDonald, Sean Meyn, Tobias Oechtering, Ayça Özçelikkale, Daniel Quevedo, Naci Saldi, Sina Sanjari, Serkan Sarıtaş, Ryan Simpson, Mikael Skoglund, Nevroz Şen, Sekhar Tatikonda, Richard Wood, Emily Wright, Bora Yongaçoğlu, and Ali Zaidi.

We also had the honor of working with three outstanding scholars who are unfortunately not with us today. Prof. Ari Arapostathis, Prof. Milan Derpich, and Ramiro Zurkowski contributed to several results in the book, both directly and indirectly. It has been a privilege to be able to work with them.

Awni AlTabaa, Liam Cregg, Nicolas Garcia, Meysam Ghomi, Ian Hogeboom-Burr, Ali D. Kara, Ertan Kazıklı, Jonathan Keeler, Curtis McDonald, Lorenzo Miretti, Somnath Pradhan, Naci Saldi, Nevroz Şen Sina Sanjari, Ryan Simpson, Serkan Sarıtaş, Bora Yongaçoğlu, and Omar Mrani-Zentar have read different various sections or versions of the book, and provided substantial technical comments.

The book has also benefitted from technical discussions with many of our colleagues and students, including Tansu Alpcan, Yücel Altuğ, Orhan Arikan, Charalambos D. Charalambous, Debasish Chatterjee, Alexander Condello, Tolga Duman, Atilla Eryilmaz, Adina Goldberg, Orhan Çağri Imer, Akshay Kashyap, Ankur Kulkarni, Marcos M. Vasconcelos, Ather Gattami, Rayadurgam Srikant, Sekhar Tatikonda, Anant Sahai, Demos Teneketzis, and Venu Veeravalli, to whom we also convey our thanks.

x Acknowledgements

Finally, we acknowledge the stimulating, conducive environment of the Coordinated Science Laboratory, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, where the initial seeds of this book project were planted when the first author was a graduate student under the supervision of the second. The bulk of the work was carried out after the first author joined Queen's University, which provided a very stimulating environment in the Department of Mathematics and Statistics for the project to be completed in the company of outstanding scholars and students, notably through the Mathematics and Engineering Program (also known as Apple-Math at Queen's). Bilkent University, where the first author holds an adjunct appointment, also provided a productive venue for collaborations over many years. We thank all these institutions and many of our colleagues there.

Contents

Int		
1.1	Informa	ation in Decision and Control Theory, Networked
	Control	, and Stochastic Games
1.2	Conten	ts of the Book
	1.2.1	Parts I and II: Mathematical Theory of
		Information Structures for Stochastic Teams
		and Games
	1.2.2	Parts III and IV: Information Structure Design
		Under Data Constraints via Signaling/Coding
		in Stochastic Teams and Games
	1.2.3	Part V: Reinforcement Learning Under Full
		and Partial, Decentralized, and Networked
		Information
art I		Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures
	Informatio	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures
An	Informatio Introduction	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of
An	Informatio Introductiontic Teams	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta	Informatio Introduction Introduction Introduction	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta 2.1	Informatio Introduction Introduction Introduction	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta 2.1	Informatio Introduction Introduction Introduction Static I	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta 2.1	Informatio Introduction Introduction Introduction Static I 2.2.1 2.2.2	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta 2.1 2.2	Informatio Introduction Introduction Introduction Static I 2.2.1 2.2.2	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to
An Sta 2.1 2.2	Informatio Introduction Introduction Static I 2.2.1 2.2.2 Dynam	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to ction Decision Problems A General Introduction to Static Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Stochastic Team ic Decision Problems
An Sta 2.1 2.2	Informatio Introduction Introduction Static I 2.2.1 2.2.2 Dynam 2.3.1 2.3.2	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to ction Decision Problems A General Introduction to Static Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Stochastic Team ic Decision Problems A General Introduction to Dynamic Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Dynamic Team
An Sta 2.1 2.2	Informatio Introduction Introduction Static Introduction Static Introduction 2.2.1 2.2.2 Dynam 2.3.1 2.3.2 Team-Communication Introduction Introduct	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to ction Decision Problems A General Introduction to Static Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Stochastic Team ic Decision Problems A General Introduction to Dynamic Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Dynamic Team Optimal Solutions for Static Teams
Sta 2.1 2.2 2.3	Informatio Introduction Introduction Static I 2.2.1 2.2.2 Dynam 2.3.1 2.3.2	Teams and a Mathematical Theory of n Structures on to Stochastic Team Theory and Solutions to ction Decision Problems A General Introduction to Static Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Stochastic Team ic Decision Problems A General Introduction to Dynamic Decision Problems An Example of a Finite Dynamic Team

xii Contents

		2.4.3	Static Teams with Quadratic Loss and a	
			Hilbert Space Argument to Optimality and	
			Stationarity	54
		2.4.4	Positively Exponentiated Quadratic Loss	71
	2.5	Conclu	ding Remarks	77
	2.6		graphic Notes	77
3	Inforn	nation St	tructures in Decentralized Stochastic Control	81
	3.1	Introdu	ection	81
	3.2	Witsenl	hausen's Intrinsic Model and Classification of	
			ation Structures	84
	3.3	Noncla	ssical Information Structures and Witsenhausen's	
			rexample	88
		3.3.1	Witsenhausen's Counterexample with	
			Discrete Distributions	90
		3.3.2	Witsenhausen's Counterexample (in Original Form)	91
		3.3.3	Numerical Procedures and a Convergence	
			Result for Asymptotic Optimality of	
			Quantized Policies	94
		3.3.4	Generalized Gaussian Test Channel	95
	3.4	Static F	Reduction of Sequential Dynamic Teams:	
			Dependence Under Partially Nested and	
			Independence Under Non-classical Information	97
		3.4.1	Static Reduction I: Classical and	
			Quasi-Classical Information Structures and	
			Their Policy-Dependent Reduction	98
		3.4.2	Static Reduction II: Non-classical Information	
			Structures and Their Policy-Independent Reduction	100
		3.4.3	Further Differences Between	
			Policy-Dependent and Policy-Independent	
			Static Reductions	104
		3.4.4	Two Refinements of Policy-Dependent Static	
			Reduction	105
		3.4.5	All Stochastic Dynamic Teams Are Nearly	
			Static (with Independent Measurements) Reducible	106
	3.5	Beyond	d the One-Shot DM Model: An Agent-Wise	
		Intrinsi	c Model and Agent-Wise Reductions	106
		3.5.1	An Agent-Wise Intrinsic Model with Agents	
			(or Sub-teams of DMs) Acting Multiple Times	107
		3.5.2	Agent-Wise (or Sub-team-wise)	
			Independent-Data, Nested Independent and	
			Partially Nested Independent Reductions	107
	3.6		lent Static Reductions Preserve Optimality but	
		May No	ot Person-by-Person-Optimality or Stationarity	108

Contents xiii

	3.7	Convex	kity of Stochastic Team Problems: Information	
		Structu	re and Cost Dependent Convexity Properties	113
		3.7.1	Convexity of Static Team Problems and an	
			Equivalent Representation of Cost Functions	114
		3.7.2	Convexity of Dynamic Teams	117
		3.7.3	Revisiting Non-classical Information,	
			Witsenhausen's Counterexample and Lack of	
			Convexity Due to Signaling for LQG Teams	118
	3.8	Expans	sion of Information Structures, and Signaling via	110
			l and Stochastic Relaxations of Nestedness	120
		3.8.1	Expansion of Information Structures: A	120
		5.0.1	Recipe for Identifying Sufficient Information	120
		3.8.2	Signaling Through Control Actions and	120
		3.0.2	Bismut's Method	125
		3.8.3	No-Incentive for Signaling Under Partial	123
		3.0.3	Nestedness and Stochastic Partial Nestedness	127
	3.9	Non co	quential Decentralized Stochastic Control:	127
	3.9		•	129
		3.9.1	ity, Solvability and Static Reduction	129
		3.9.1	•	120
		202	Control	130
		3.9.2	Causality, Causal Implementability and Solvability	131
		3.9.3	Static Reduction of Non-sequential Stochastic	107
	2.10	G 1	Dynamic Teams Under Property C	137
	3.10		ding Remarks	139
	3.11	Bibliog	graphic Notes	139
4	Existe	ence, Stru	ucture, and Approximations to Optimality:	
	Strate	gic Meas	sures in Decentralized Stochastic Control	141
	4.1	Decent	ralized Strategic Measures	142
		4.1.1	Measurable Policies as a Subset of	
			Randomized Policies and Strategic Measures	143
		4.1.2	Sets of Strategic Measures for Static Teams	144
		4.1.3	Sets of Strategic Measures for Dynamic	
			Teams in the Absence of Static Reduction	148
		4.1.4	Measurability Properties of Sets of Strategic	
			Measures	152
	4.2	Relativ	e Compactness and Closedness of Strategic	102
	2		res, and Existence of Optimal Policies	153
	4.3		Relaxations	162
	4.5	4.3.1	Non-signaling Relaxation	163
		4.3.1	Quantum Correlations and Quantum Team	103
		7.3.4	Decision Policies	166
		4.3.3	Relations Between Convex Relaxations	170
		+.5.5	Relations Detween Convex Relaxations	1/0

xiv Contents

	4.4	Near O	ptimality of Finite Approximations in	
		Decenti	ralized Stochastic Control via Quantization of	
		Measur	ements and Actions	174
		4.4.1	Finite Measurement Approximate Models	178
		4.4.2	Specific Results for Witsenhausen's Problem	181
	4.5	Conclud	ding Remarks	182
	4.6		raphic Notes	183
5	Contr	ol Policy	Topologies and Dynamic Programming	
	Metho	ds in De	centralized Stochastic Control	185
	5.1	Introdu	ction	185
	5.2	Dynami	ic Programming I: Common Information as	
			ation State	186
	5.3	Dynami	ic Programming II: Witsenhausen's Standard	
		•	or Sequential Finite Teams	190
	5.4		ic Programming III: Universal Dynamic Program	
			Sequential Teams in General Spaces	192
		5.4.1	Controlled Markov Model Formulation for	
			the Dynamic Program	193
		5.4.2	Well-Posedness of the Dynamic Program (5.8)	196
		5.4.3	Existence of Optimal Policies Through the	
			Dynamic Programming Formulation	199
	5.5	Control	Topology via a Cartesian Product of Individual	
			Policies	203
		5.5.1	On Classical Deterministic and Stochastic	
			Control and Utility of Young Measures	203
		5.5.2	Trading-Off Continuity with Compactness:	
			A Product Space Approach on Individual	
			Control Policies	206
		5.5.3	A Weak*-Topology on Randomized Team	
			Decision/Control Policies	207
		5.5.4	Hilbert Space Construction for Static LQG Teams	211
	5.6		Applications and Revisiting Existence Results for	
	5.0		al (Single-DM) Stochastic Control	212
		5.6.1	Witsenhausen's Counterexample with	
		5.0.1	Gaussian Variables	213
		5.6.2	Existence for Partially Observable Markov	-10
		3.0.2	Decision Processes (POMDPs)	213
		5.6.3	Revisiting Fully Observable Markov Decision	213
		5.0.5	Processes with the Construction Presented in	
			the Chapter	214
	5.7	Conclud	ding Remarks	
	5.8		raphic Notes	215

Contents xv

	n-Field)	
6.1		action
6.2	Convex 6.2.1	Asymptotically Optimal Policies as a Limit of
		Finite Team Optimal Policies
	6.2.2	Symmetric Teams
	6.2.3	Optimal Solutions for Mean-Field Teams as
		Limits of Optimal Policies for Finite
		Symmetric Teams
	6.2.4	An Existence Theorem on Globally Optimal
		Policies for Mean-Field Team Problems
	6.2.5	Examples
6.3		Dynamic Teams with Large Numbers of DMs
	6.3.1	Finite Horizon Convex Dynamic Team
		Problems with a Symmetric Information Structure
	6.3.2	Optimality of Symmetric Policies for
		Convex Dynamic Teams with a Symmetric
		Information Structure
	6.3.3	Convex Mean-Field Teams with a Symmetric
		Information Structure
6.4		onvex Exchangeable Teams and Mean-Field
		ality of Randomized Symmetric Policies with No
		on Randomness
	6.4.1	Exchangeable Static Teams with Large
		Numbers of DMs.
	6.4.2	Dynamic Exchangeable Teams
	6.4.3	Approximate Optimality of Symmetrically
		Independent Policies for Exchangeable
		N-DM Stochastic Teams
6.5		dix: Proofs
	6.5.1	Proof of Theorem 6.2.1
	6.5.2	Proof of Theorem 6.2.5
	6.5.3	Proof of Proposition 6.2.1
6.6		ding Remarks
6.7	Bibliog	graphic Notes
Com	parison o	f Information Structures and Their Blackwell
7.1		ection
7.2		of Information and Preliminary Results on
- · -		rison of Information Structures
7.3		vell Ordering and Comparison of Information Structures .
		Blackwell Ordering: Forward
	7.3.1	Blackwell Ordering: Forward

xvi Contents

	7.4	Multi-Agent Setting a	nd Correlated Garblings	274
	7.5	Appendix: Proofs		275
			eorem 7.3.4	275
			eorem 7.4.1	278
	7.6	Concluding Remarks.		280
	7.7			281
8	Conti	nuity, Existence and T	Opological Properties of	
		• •	f Information Structures	285
	8.1	Introduction		285
	8.2		rization of Measurement Channels	286
	8.3	Single Stage: Continu	ity of the Optimal Cost in Channels	288
		8.3.1 Continuity	Properties Under Weak Convergence	288
		8.3.2 Continuity	Properties Under Setwise Convergence	291
		8.3.3 Continuity	Under Total Variation	293
		8.3.4 Further Suf	ficient Conditions for Continuity	
		Under Weal	Convergence	294
	8.4	Single Stage: Compac	etness Properties of Spaces of Channels	296
	8.5	Quantizers as a Class	of Channels	298
	8.6	The Multi-Stage Case		304
	8.7	Continuity and Robus	tness to the Prior Probability Model	307
		8.7.1 Single-Stag	e Setup	307
		8.7.2 Robustness	to Incorrect Priors and Mismatch	
		Bounds for	Single Stage Problems	309
		8.7.3 Continuity	and Robustness to Incorrect Priors	
		and Mismat	ch Bounds for Multi-Stage Problems	309
	8.8	Multi-Agent Setting.		311
	8.9	All Stochastic Dynan	nic Teams Are Nearly Static	
		Reducible via Additiv	re Perturbation of Information Structures	315
	8.10	Appendix: Proofs		317
		8.10.1 Proof of Le	mma 8.2.1	317
		8.10.2 Proof of Th	eorem 8.3.1	318
		8.10.3 Proof of Le	mma 8.4.3	319
		8.10.4 Proof of Th	eorem 8.5.4	320
		8.10.5 Proof of Th	eorem 8.7.2	321
		8.10.6 Proof of Th	eorem 8.9.1	322
		8.10.7 Proof of Th	eorem 8.9.2	327
	8.11	Concluding Remarks.		330
	8.12	Bibliographic Notes		331
P ₉	rt II S	tochastic Game Theor	y and Information Structures	
1 a 9			ic Game Theory	335
,	9.1			335
	9.1		c for Static Stochastic Games	
	2 · L	11 Ocherul I runic WOII	cross static stochastic Gallies	223

Contents xviii

	9.3	An Illus	strative Example of a Finite Stochastic Game:	
		Variatio	ons on the Team Theoretic Examples	342
		9.3.1	Multiple Subjective Probabilities	343
		9.3.2	Directly Conflicting Goals	347
	9.4	Conclud	ding Remarks	350
	9.5		raphic Notes	350
10	Inform	nation St	ructures in Stochastic Dynamic Games and	
	Inform	national 1	Properties of Equilibria	351
	10.1	Informa	tion Structures in Stochastic Game Theory	352
		10.1.1	A Mathematical Characterization of	
			Information Structures for Stochastic	
			Dynamic Games	352
		10.1.2	An Agent-Wise Intrinsic Model for Games	
			with Players Acting Multiple Times	353
	10.2	Solution	n Concepts for Dynamic Games	354
		10.2.1	Nash Equilibrium	355
		10.2.2	Stackelberg Equilibrium	355
		10.2.3	Perfect Bayesian Equilibrium and Backward	
			Induction	356
		10.2.4	Markov Perfect Equilibria	358
		10.2.5	Time-Consistency Revisited	358
		10.2.6	Global vs. Stage-Wise Stackelberg Equilibria	
			for Multi-Stage Games	360
		10.2.7	Saddle-Point (Nash) Equilibria via Markov	
			Policies Under State Information for	
			Zero-Sum Games	363
		10.2.8	Some Additional Equilibrium Refinements	364
	10.3		ation Structure Dependent Properties of	
			ria in Game Theory	365
		10.3.1	Value of Additional Information Can Be	
			Positive or Negative in Non-Zero Sum Games	365
		10.3.2	Salient Information-Structure Dependent Properties	367
		10.3.3	Zero-Sum Games Admit Several Regularity	
			Properties	368
		10.3.4	Lack of Equilibrium Equivalence Under	
			Policy-Dependent vs. Policy-Independent	
			Static Reductions	
		10.3.5	Deterministic Games and Information Structures	371
	10.4		Quadratic Games and Dependence of	
		-	rium Solutions on Information Structures	373
		10.4.1	Static LQG Games: Nash Equilibria	373
		10.4.2	LQG Multi-Stage Non-zero-Sum Games:	
			Information Expansion May Lead to	27.
			Non-unique Nash Equilibrium Costs	376

xviii Contents

		10.4.3	Linear Quadratic Games with Subjective Priors	381
		10.4.4	Stackelberg Equilibria for Static and Dynamic	
			LQG Games and Optimality of Affine Policies	383
	10.5		ce of Equilibria: Implications of the Geometric	
		-	es of Information Structures and Strategic	
			es Approach	384
	10.6		ve Priors in Dynamic Games Revisited:	
		Commo	n Knowledge, Agreement, Robustness and Learning	
		10.6.1	Common Knowledge	388
		10.6.2	Asymptotic Agreement and Common	
			Knowledge with Common Priors but Different	
			Posteriors	389
		10.6.3	Inconsistent Priors, Merging with Increasing	
			Information, and Bayesian and Non-Bayesian	
			Subjective Equilibria	390
	10.7		ling Remarks	
	10.8	Bibliogr	raphic Notes	392
11	Inforn	nation De	ependent Properties of Equilibria: Existence,	
			ontinuity and Team-against-Team Games	395
	11.1		etion	395
	11.2		tic Zero-Sum Games and Existence	
		of Saddl	le-Point Equilibria	397
		11.2.1	Existence of Saddle-Point Equilibria (SPE)	399
	11.3	Compar	ison of Information Structures in Zero-Sum Games	400
	11.4	Continu	ity Properties of Equilibrium Values in the Space	
			mation Structures	402
	11.5	General	Games: Lack of Continuity and Lack of Positive	
		Value of	f Information	404
	11.6	Team A	gainst Team Games: Zero-Sum, General and	
		Exchang	geable Games, and Role of Common Randomness	405
		11.6.1	Zero-Sum Games Between Teams of Finitely	
			Many Agents: Existence of Equilibria and	
			Comparison and Regularity in Information	406
		11.6.2	Non-Zero-Sum Games Between Teams of	
			Finitely Many Agents: Existence of Equilibrium	409
		11.6.3	Nash Equilibria for Exchangeable Team	
			Against Team Games, the Mean-Field Limit	
			and Absence of Common Randomness	410
	11.7		ix: Proofs	418
		11.7.1	Proof of Theorem 11.2.1	418
		11.7.2	Proof of Theorem 11.2.2	420
		11.7.3	Proof of Lemma 11.3.1	421
		11.7.4	Proof of Lemma 11.3.2	422
		11.7.5	Proof of Theorem 11.4.1	424

Contents xix

		11.7.6	Proof of Theorem 11.4.2	425
		11.7.7	Proof of Theorem 11.4.3	428
		11.7.8	Proof of Theorem 11.4.4	428
		11.7.9	Proof of Theorem 11.6.1	429
		11.7.10	Proof of Theorem 11.6.3	430
		11.7.11	Proof of Theorem 11.6.6	431
		11.7.12	Proof of Theorem 11.6.7	433
	11.8	Concludir	ng Remarks	434
	11.9		phic Notes	434
Par	t III 1	nformation	n Design via Information Theory in Networked	
	\$	Systems and	d Control	
12	Codin	g for Conti	rol and Connections with Information Theory	439
	12.1		on	439
	12.2		ion and Real-Time Coding	440
	12.2		Real-Time Coding	440
			Information Structures for Real-Time	110
			Encoders and Controllers: Policies, Actions	
			and Measurability	441
	12.3		on Theoretic Preliminaries and Performance	771
	12.5		zers	446
		_	Information Theoretic Preliminaries	446
			Fixed or Variable Rates of a Quantizer/Encoder	448
			Rate-Distortion Theory	449
			•	449
	12.4		Channel Coding and Shannon Capacity	430
	12.4		ent Aspects where Information Theory in	452
			Differs from Classical Shannon Theory	432
			Infinite-Dimensional Coding vs.	450
			Finite-Dimensional Coding	452 454
			Coding for Stable vs. Unstable Sources	434
			Adaptive vs. Non-adaptive Coding, Uniform	
			Distribution Approximation and Design	156
	12.5		Considerationsnental Bound on Information Rates for	456
	12.3		e Stabilization over Noiseless Channels	457
	12.6			
	12.6		: Proofs	
	10.7		Proof of Theorem 12.5.1	
	12.7		ng Remarks	460
	12.8	Bibliograp	phic Notes	461
13			ization of Linear Systems Under	
			straints	463
	13.1		on	463
	13.2		of Discrete Noiseless Channels	466
		13.2.1	Stochastic Stability Analysis for a Scalar System	467

xx Contents

		13.2.2	The Multi-Dimensional Case	472
		13.2.3	The Partially Observed Case	475
		13.2.4	Multi-Sensor and Multi-Controller Case:	
			Decentralized Stabilization	476
	13.3	Stabiliz	ation of Linear Systems Over Noisy Channels:	
			nental Bounds	484
		13.3.1	Control and Communication Model	484
		13.3.2	Converse Theorem on Stochastic Stability	
			Over a Discrete Memoryless Channel (DMC)	485
	13.4	Stochas	tic Stabilization Over Erasure Channels with Feedback	487
		13.4.1	Connections with Random-Time Drift Criteria	491
		13.4.2	Simulation	492
	13.5	Stochas	tic Stabilization Over General DMCs with Feedback	493
	13.6	Channe	ls with Memory and Multi-Dimensional Sources	497
	13.7	Stabiliz	ation with Noisy Forward and Feedback/Reverse	
			ls: When Adaptation Is Infeasible	499
	13.8	Append	ix: Proofs	500
		13.8.1	Proof of Theorem 13.2.1	500
		13.8.2	Proof of Theorem 13.2.3	501
		13.8.3	Proof of Theorem 13.2.5	503
		13.8.4	Proof of Theorem 13.2.8	505
		13.8.5	Proof of Theorem 13.6.2	506
		13.8.6	Proof of Lemma 13.6.1	508
		13.8.7	Proof of Theorem 13.6.3	511
		13.8.8	Proof of Proposition 13.4.1	512
	13.9	Conclud	ding Remarks	514
	13.10	Bibliog	raphic Notes	515
14	Stabili	zation of	Non-Linear Systems: Information Theoretic	
17			Analysis	517
	14.1		ction	518
	14.2		ation Theoretic Approach to Arriving at Lower	310
	17.2		and Fundamental Limits	519
		14.2.1	Sublinear Entropy Growth and a	317
		17.2.1	Generalization of Bode's Integral Formula for	
			Non-linear Systems	519
		14.2.2	A Generalization of Bode's Integral Formula	317
		17.2.2	for Non-linear Systems	521
		14.2.3	Asymptotic Mean Stationarity and Ergodicity	522
		14.2.4	Stationarity and Positive Harris Recurrence	322
		17.4.7	Under Structured (Stationary) Policies	523
	14.3	Stochas	tic and Geometric Volume Growth Approach	525
	17.5	14.3.1	Some Intuition via a Visit to the Deterministic Setup	525
		14.3.1	A New Concept: Stabilization Entropy	528
		14.3.3	Volume-Expanding Systems	530
		17.5.5	Totalic Expanding Dystems	220

Contents xxi

		14.3.4	The Noisy Channel Case	532		
	14.4	Case wi	th Ergodicity via the Stochastic Geometric Method	534		
		14.4.1	Proof Ideas Under the Ergodicity Criterion	535		
		14.4.2	A Utility of Geometric Analysis: Refined			
			Bounds via Coordinate Splitting	538		
	14.5	Achieva	ability: Discrete Noiseless Channels and a			
		Stationa	ary and Ergodic Construction	542		
	14.6	Discuss	ion: Comparison of the Information Theoretic			
		and Sto	chastic Growth (Dynamical Systems) Approaches	544		
	14.7	Append	ix: Proofs	546		
		14.7.1	Proof of Theorem 14.2.1	546		
		14.7.2	Proof of Lemma 14.2.1	549		
		14.7.3	Proof of Theorem 14.2.5	554		
		14.7.4	Proof of Lemma 14.3.1	557		
	14.8	Conclud	ding Remarks	558		
		14.8.1	Comparison with Invariance Entropy and			
			Deterministic Non-linear Systems Controlled			
			Over Noiseless Channels	559		
		14.8.2	Some Open Directions on Stationary Coding			
			and Control Policies and Information Theory	560		
	14.9	Bibliog	raphic Notes	560		
15	Optimal Real-Time Coding and Control Under Information					
15			cructural and Existence Results	563		
	15.1		ction	563		
	15.2		and Action Spaces for Encoding	564		
	15.3		I Causal Coding of a Markov Source	566		
		15.3.1	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	566		
		15.3.2	Partially Observed Markov Source	568		
		15.3.3	Structural Results for Systems with Control	571		
		15.3.4	Case with Noisy Channels and Noiseless Feedback	571		
	15.4		led Markov Optimality Analysis: Existence of			
			I Zero-Delay Quantizers and a Topology on Quantizers	572		
	15.5	-	Horizon Setup and Optimality of Stationary			
			and Near Optimality of Finite Memory Codes	575		
		15.5.1	Finite Markov Sources	575		
		15.5.2	Linear Markov Sources	579		
	15.6	Multi-T	Perminal (Decentralized) Setting			
		15.6.1	Memoryless Sources	582		
		15.6.2	Markov Sources and a Counterexample Under			
			Signaling	583		
	15.7	Append	ix: Proofs	585		
		15.7.1	Proof of Theorem 15.3.1	585		
		15.7.2	Proof of Theorem 15.3.2	587		
		15.7.3	Proof of Theorem 15.3.6	589		

xxii Contents

		15.7.4	Proof of Theorem 15.4.2	590
	15.8	Conclud	ling Remarks	594
	15.9	Bibliogr	raphic Notes	594
16	Codin	a and Ca	ontrol for Linear Gaussian Systems:	
LU			timality and Linearity	597
	16.1		neous Design of Coding and Control Over	371
	10.1		c Channels: Optimality of Separation of Coding	
			ntrol	598
		16.1.1	Optimal LQG Coding and Control for the	370
		10.1.1	Fully Observed Case: Optimality of Predictive	
			Quantizers Separating Quantization and Control	599
		16.1.2	Partially Observed Setup: Separation of	
		10.1.2	Estimation, Quantization and Control	608
	16.2	The Gar	ussian Channel Case: Optimality of Linear	000
	10.2		and Control Policies	611
		16.2.1	Optimality of Linear Coding Policies Over a	011
		10.2.1	Gaussian Channel with Matching Between	
			the Source and the Channel	612
		16.2.2	Optimization of Coding and Control for	012
		10.2.2	Linear Systems Controlled Over Noisy Channels	615
		16.2.3	An Entropy-Power Based Bound for Ergodic	010
		10.2.0	Cost Under General Noisy Channels and	
			Tightness for the Gaussian Setup	619
		16.2.4	Multi-Dimensional System Case and a	
			Dynamic Program for Optimal Linear Policies	620
		16.2.5	Structural Results for Optimal Encoders for	
			Partially Observed LQG Problems	621
		16.2.6	Revisiting Stabilization: Sufficiency of	
			Shannon Capacity Bounds for Gaussian Channels	621
	16.3	General	Information Theoretic Bounds and Methods	624
		16.3.1	Information Theoretic Methods and Design	
			for Upper and Lower Bounds	624
		16.3.2	Looseness of Information Theoretic	
			Bounds for Multi-Terminal Models and	
			Counterexamples on Suboptimality of Linear	
			Policies	626
	16.4	An Asy	mptotically Rate-Optimal Two-Part Stationary	
		Coding	Scheme	631
	16.5	Append	ix: Proofs	635
		16.5.1	Proof of Theorem 16.1.2	635
		16.5.2	Proof of Theorem 16.2.5	638
		16.5.3	Proof of Theorem 16.2.6	639
	16.6	Conclud	ling Remarks	642
	16.7	Bibliogr	raphic Notes	642

Contents xxiii

17	Optimal Coding Under Small Estimation Error and			
	Obser	rvability (Criteria	645
	17.1	Introduc	ction	646
	17.2	Coding	for Deterministic Dynamical Systems	
		in the S	mall Error Regime	647
		17.2.1	The Problem	647
		17.2.2	Eventual Almost Sure Estimation	649
		17.2.3	Asymptotic Almost Sure Estimation	649
		17.2.4	Asymptotic Estimation in Expectation	651
	17.3 Coding for Stochastic Dynamical Systems in the Sma		for Stochastic Dynamical Systems in the Small	
		Error Ro	egime	652
		17.3.1	A Dynamical Systems Approach	653
		17.3.2	An Information-Theoretic and a	
			Probability-Theoretic Approach	656
		17.3.3	An Achievability Result: Coding of	
			Deterministic Dynamical Systems Over Noisy	
			Communication Channels	657
	17.4	Discuss	ion, Comparison and a Review of Related	
		Results	in the Literature	658
		17.4.1	Deterministic Model	658
		17.4.2	Stochastic Model	660
	17.5	Conclud	ding Remarks	661
	17.6	Bibliog	raphic Notes	661
Par	t IV	Informati	on and Signaling Games	
18	Signa	ling Gam	es: Equilibria Under Criteria or Prior	
	Mism	atch Betv	veen an Encoder and a Decoder	665
	18.1	Introduc	ction to Signaling Games: Nash and Stackelberg	
			n Concepts, and Some Basic Results	666
	18.2		tic Signaling Games	671
		18.2.1	Quadratic Signaling Game with Costless	
			Communication (Cheap Talk)	671
		18.2.2	Multi-Dimensional Cheap Talk	681
		18.2.3	Quadratic Cheap Talk: Stackelberg Equilibria	
			(Bayesian Persuasion)	683
		18.2.4	Quadratic Signaling Game: Noisy Channel Case	684
	18.3	Signalir	ng Games with Subjective Priors Between	
			oder and a Decoder	685
		18.3.1	The Commitment Setup with Quadratic Costs:	
			Stackelberg Equilibria	686
		18.3.2	The Non-cooperative/No-commitment Setup	
			(Nash Equilibria)	695
		18.3.3	Signaling Under Subjective Priors Without	
			Channel Noise: Cheap Talk Revisited	696
			±	

xxiv Contents

	18.4	Conclud	ing Remarks	697
	18.5	Bibliogr	aphic Notes	698
19	Two (Classes of	Signaling Games: Reputation and	
	Inform	nation Pri	ivacy Games	701
	19.1	Reputati	on Games as Signaling Games	702
		19.1.1	The Model	702
		19.1.2	Optimal Strategies and Equilibrium Behavior	704
		19.1.3	Undiscounted Time-Average Payoff Case and	
			an Upper Payoff Bound for the Arbitrarily	
			Patient Long-lived Player	711
	19.2	Informat	tion Privacy Games	714
		19.2.1	Nash Equilibria	716
		19.2.2	Stackelberg Equilibria	721
		19.2.3	The MMSE Gaussian Information Bottleneck	
			Problem	723
	19.3	Conclud	ing Remarks	729
	19.4	Bibliogr	aphic Notes	730
20	Zomo (Cum Info	rmation Games: Jamming and	
20			Counterexample as a Game	733
	20.1		ausen's Counterexample as a Zero-Sum	133
	20.1		•	733
		20.1.1	g Game	734
		20.1.1	Zero-Sum Signaling Games	134
		20.1.2	Witsenhausen's Counterexample as a	
			Zero-Sum Signaling Game and Optimality of	734
	20.2	Iommin	Linear Policies	736
	20.2	20.2.1	g Games	739
		20.2.1	Equilibrium Solutions	139
		20.2.2	Discussion	742
	20.3	Annandi		742
	20.3	20.3.1	ix: Proofs Proof of Theorem 20.2.1	743
	20.4	-0.0.1	ing Remarks	748
	20.4		aphic Notes	748
	20.3	Dionogi	apine Notes	740
Par	t V R	einforcem	nent Learning Under Full, Partial,	
ı aı			zed, and Networked Information	
21			Learning for Fully Observable Models:	
			Near Optimality under Weak Feller Continuity	753
	21.1		tion	753
	21.2		l Q-Learning for Finite Models and Full State	
			tion	754
		21.2.1	Classical Q-Learning for Finite Fully	
			Observed Models	755

Contents xxv

	21.3	Near Optimal Planning for Continuous Space MDPs: Near Optimality of Finite Models under Weak Feller	
		Continuity	759
		21.3.1 Finite Action Approximation to MDPs	759
		21.3.2 Finite State Approximation to MDPs	762
	21.4	Reinforcement Learning for Continuous Space Models	
		under weak Feller Continuity: Quantized Q-Learning	764
	21.5	Concluding Remarks.	768
	21.6	Bibliographic Notes.	768
22	Reinfo	orcement Learning for Partially Observable Models	769
	22.1	Introduction	769
	22.2	Reinforcement Learning for the Partially Observed	
		Setup I: Near Optimality of Quantized Policies Under	
		Weak Feller Property of Non-linear Filters	770
	22.3	Reinforcement Learning for the Partially Observed	
		Setup II: Near-Optimality of Finite Window Policies	771
		22.3.1 Near-Optimality of Finite Window Policies	
		Under Filter Stability	771
		22.3.2 An Alternative Finite Window Belief-MDP	
		Reduction and Its Approximation	771
		22.3.3 Q-Learning Convergence of Finite Window Policies	775
	22.4	Concluding Remarks	780
	22.5	Bibliographic Notes	780
23		Agent Reinforcement Learning with General	= 0.2
		nation Structures: Convergence to Equilibria	783
	23.1	Introduction	783
	23.2	A General Paradigm for Multi-Agent Learning: Two	
		Time Scales and a Markov Chain over Play Path Graphs	785
	23.3	Learning with Local Information for Stochastic Teams	
		and Weakly Acyclic Games with Deterministic Baseline	
		Policies	787
		23.3.1 Stochastic Teams and Weakly Acyclic Games	
		with Local Action and Global State Information	787
		23.3.2 Weakly Acyclic Games	789
	23.4	Satisficing Paths and Independent Multi-Agent	
		Reinforcement Learning with Possibly Randomized Policies	795
	23.5	Subjective Reinforcement Learning for Mean-Field	
		Problems with General Information Structures	798
		23.5.1 <i>N</i> -Player Weakly Coupled (Mean-Field) Games	798
		23.5.2 On the Observation Channel	802
		23.5.3 Stationary Equilibrium Policies: Existence Results	802
		23.5.4 Existence of Stationary Equilibrium Under	
		Global State Observability	803

xxvi Contents

		23.5.5	Existence of Stationary Equilibrium Under	004
		22.5.6	Mean-Field State Observability	804
		23.5.6	Convergence of Subjective Single-Agent	907
		22 5 7	Learning Under Stationary Policies	807
		23.5.7	Existence of Subjective Equilibrium Under Global or Mean-Field State Observability	809
		23.5.8	Equilibria Under Compressed Mean-Field	809
		23.3.6	State and Local State Information	810
	23.6	Cubicati	ve Satisficing, Policy Update Dynamics	810
	23.0	•	jective Q-Learning	810
		23.6.1	Naively Learned Subjective Functions and	810
		23.0.1	<i>ϵ</i> -Satisficing	812
		23.6.2	Quantization of the Policy Space	815
		23.6.3	Learning Algorithm and Convergence to	613
		23.0.3	Subjective Q-Learning Equilibria	818
	23.7	Conclud	ling Remarks	822
	23.7		raphic Notes	822
	23.6	Dionogi	apine Notes	022
24			Learning for Networked Control and	
	-	_	ization	825
	24.1		ction	826
	24.2		elay Source-Channel Coding as an MDP	827
		24.2.1	Topology on Quantizers	829
		24.2.2	Predictor and Filter Stability and Unique	
			Ergodicity Under an Exploration Policy	830
	24.3	_	nms	831
		24.3.1	Quantizing π_t	832
		24.3.2	Quantized Q-Learning for Source-Channel Coding	832
		24.3.3	Connection to the Average Cost Problem	833
		24.3.4	Simulations	834
	24.4		ling Remarks	835
		24.4.1	Controlled Models	836
	24.5	Bibliogi	raphic Notes	836
A	Topol	ogical No	tions and Optimization	837
	$A.\overline{1}$			837
	A.2		Metric, Hilbert, Banach and Standard Borel Spaces	838
	A.3	Matrice	S	841
	A.4	Convex	Sets and Functionals	842
	A.5	Optimiz	ration of Functionals	843
	A.6	-	tion Mappings and Fixed-Point Theorems	844
В	Proba	bility The	eory and Stochastic Processes	847
_	B.1	•	lity	847
			Measurable Spaces	847

Contents xxvii

		B.1.2	Integration	848
		B.1.3	Probability Spaces and Random Variables	850
	B.2	Conditi	onal Expectation and Estimation	851
	B.3	Stochas	stic Processes	853
C	On S _J	paces of P	Probability Measures	855
	C .1		gence of Sequences of Probability Measures	855
	C.2	Some N	Measurability Results on Spaces of Probability Measures.	857
	C.3	A Gene	eralized Dominated Convergence Theorem	858
	C.4	The w	s Topology	858
	C.5	Lusin's	Theorem	859
D	Mark		s, Martingales and Ergodic Processes	861
	D.1		Chains	861
	D.2		e-Time Martingales	864
	D.3		stic Stability of Dynamical Systems and Random	
		Process	ses	865
		D.3.1	Stationary, Ergodic, and Asymptotically Mean	
			Stationary Processes	865
E	Mark		on Theory and Optimality of Markov Policies	867
	E.1		lled Markov Models	867
	E.2	-	bserved Markov Control Problem Model	867
		E.2.1	Classes of Control Policies	868
		E.2.2	Optimality of Markov Policies and	
			Elimination of Irrelevant Information	869
		E.2.3	Markov Decision Processes (MDPs) and	
			Optimality of Markov Policies	869
		E.2.4	Dynamic Programming and Measurable	
			Selection Criteria	869
		E.2.5	Discounted Cost Criterion	871
	E.3		y Observable MDPs (POMDPs)	873
	E.4		Filter and the Linear Quadratic Gaussian	
		Optima	l Control Problem	875
F	Relax		ol Topologies	879
	F.1		Topology on Control Policies	879
	F.2		(Weak*) Topology on Control Policies	880
	F.3	Some P	Properties of Young and Borkar Topologies	881
G	Stoch	astic Stal	bility of Markov Chains and Random-Time	
	State-		nt Stochastic Drift	883
	G .1	Stochas	stic Stability and Drift Criteria	883
		G.1.1	One-Stage Foster-Lyapunov Drift Criteria	884
		G.1.2	State-Dependent Drift Criteria	884

xxviii Contents

	G.1.3	Random-Time State-Dependent Stochastic Drift Criteria	885
Н	Topological and	Metric Entropy in Dynamical Systems	887
Ref	erences		891
Ind	ex		925

Acronyms and Notations

trace(A)	Trace of a square matrix A
det(A)	Determinant of a square matrix A
1_E	Indicator function for event E
X	A generic vector space
$\langle x, y \rangle$	Inner product between x and y on a Hilbert space
$\mathcal{B}(\mathbb{X})$	The Borel σ -field on $\mathbb X$
$\sigma(y)$	σ -field generated by a random variable y
$\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{X})$	Set of probability measures on $\mathcal{B}(\mathbb{X})$
\mathbb{R}	Set of real numbers
\mathbb{R}^n	Vector space of <i>n</i> -dimensional real vectors
\mathbb{Z}	Set of integers
\mathbb{Z}_{+}	Set of non-negative integers
\mathbb{N}	Set of positive integers
Q	A space of quantizers
$egin{array}{c} \mathcal{Q} \ \mathcal{Q} \ \Pi^{comp,i} \end{array}$	Quantizer or channel depending on context
$\Pi^{comp,i}$	Composite quantization policy for encoder i
Q_t^i DM i	Quantizer used by Agent i at time t
	Decision Maker i
$\mathbf{A}i$	Agent i
$\underline{\gamma}^i$	Policy of DM <i>i</i> , that is $\{\gamma_t^i, t \ge 0\}$
At $\frac{\gamma^i}{\underline{\gamma}^i}$ or \mathcal{I}_t^i or \mathcal{I}_t^i	Ensemble of policies for all decision makers, that is $\{\underline{\gamma}^i\}$
I_t^i or \mathcal{I}_t^i	Information variable at Agent <i>i</i> at time <i>t</i>
$\underline{\eta}$	Information structure inducing map $\{\eta^1, \ldots, \eta^N\}$
$E^{\frac{\gamma}{p}}\{\cdot\}$	Expectation under policy γ , with initial condition measure P
E_x	Expectation conditioned on an initial condition realization x ,
	or with respect to a random variable x , depending on the
	context
Df(x) or $J(f(x))$	Jacobian of f at x
$H(\cdot)$	Discrete entropy
$h(\cdot)$	Differential entropy

 $I(\cdot; \cdot)$ Mutual information

 $D(P_1||P_2)$ Kullback-Leibler Divergence between P_1 and P_2

|x| Euclidean norm of a finite-dimensional real-valued vector x

A' or A^T transpose of matrix A |S| Cardinality of a set S

 $A \setminus B$ Ordered set difference: $\{x : x \in A, x \notin B\}$

 $A \triangle B$ $(A \setminus B) \cup (B \setminus A)$

ln(x) or log(x) Natural logarithm of positive real x

 \underline{o} Zero vector

Time/stage index set, $\{1, 2, ..., T\}$ or $\{0, 1, ..., T - 1\}$ $\mathcal{N}(\mathcal{L})$ Decision maker (DM) index set, $\{1, 2, ..., N\}$ ($\{1, 2, ..., L\}$) $u_{[k,s]}$ action (decision) variables from t = k to t = s for s > k,

 $\{u_k, u_{k+1}, \cdots, u_s\}$

u Collection of actions in \mathcal{N} (or \mathcal{L}): $\{u^1, u^2, \dots, u^N\}$