



palgrave pivot

Conflict, Culture and Identity in GP Training

Jennifer L. Johnston

palgrave
macmillan

Conflict, Culture and Identity in GP Training

Jennifer L. Johnston

Conflict, Culture and Identity in GP Training

palgrave
macmillan

Jennifer L. Johnston
Centre for Medical Education
Queen's University Belfast
Belfast, UK

ISBN 978-981-19-2963-2 ISBN 978-981-19-2964-9 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-19-2964-9>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. 2022

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover pattern © John Rawsterne/patternhead.com

This Palgrave Pivot imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd.

The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore 189721, Singapore

Problematising structures of GP training in the UK, this innovative approach combines empirical and theoretical scholarship in examining the experiences of GP trainees working in hospitals. Drawing on trainee narratives and privileging the analysis of social language-in-use, Johnston describes primary care medicine as a separate paradigm with its own philosophy, identity and practice. Casting primary care as in longstanding conflict with secondary care, the lower status of primary care in the world of medicine is explored, along with significant identity challenges for GP trainees positioned at the coalface of conflict.

As a result, radical changes to the structures of GP training are proposed.

Jennifer Johnston is a Clinical Reader at Queen's University Belfast, and a critical educationalist. She is a practising GP in a part of Belfast, Northern Ireland, with high socioeconomic deprivation and believes in education as a vehicle for social change in healthcare. This book has been developed from her original PhD work, which won the Association for the Study of Medical Education Best Original Research Paper in 2016.

For my family

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
	<i>A Note on Terminology and Positioning</i>	2
	<i>Setting the Scene</i>	3
	<i>Why Identities Are Important</i>	4
	<i>Medical Trajectories</i>	5
	<i>Identity Challenges</i>	7
	<i>Structures and Contexts of General Practice</i>	8
	<i>Historical Development</i>	8
	<i>Current Social and Cultural Contexts</i>	11
	<i>Figured Worlds</i>	13
	<i>Enduring Struggles</i>	14
	<i>Introducing the Stories</i>	15
	<i>References</i>	15
2	GP Identities in Hospital	21
	<i>Deciding to Become a GP</i>	22
	<i>First Steps to a New Identity</i>	26
	<i>Reconciling Past and Present Selves</i>	29
	<i>Outsider Identities in Hospital</i>	33
	<i>Alternative Communities</i>	35
	<i>What Makes a 'Good GP'?</i>	38
	<i>Conclusion</i>	41
	<i>References</i>	42

3 Maria's Narrative	43
<i>The 'Home' Metaphor</i>	45
<i>Moving through Training</i>	47
<i>Education Versus Service Provision</i>	50
<i>At the Coalface of Paradigm Conflict</i>	53
<i>Getting to Know Herself as a GP</i>	57
<i>Conclusion</i>	59
<i>References</i>	59
4 Paradigms in Conflict	61
<i>Theorising the Primary Care Paradigm</i>	62
<i>Commitment to Generalism</i>	62
<i>Complexity and Uncertainty</i>	62
<i>The GP Consultation</i>	63
<i>GP and Hospital Consultations as Speech Genres</i>	64
<i>Local Contentious Practice</i>	66
<i>Wider Impacts</i>	67
<i>'Big' Discourses and Paradigm Conflict</i>	68
<i>Healthcare as Industry</i>	68
<i>GP as Gendered Practice</i>	69
<i>Power Structures as Processes</i>	70
<i>References</i>	70
5 Pedagogy, Policy and Practice	75
<i>Current and Future Challenges</i>	76
<i>Conflicting Pedagogies</i>	77
<i>Possibilities for Change</i>	78
<i>Increasing the Visibility of General Practice</i>	78
<i>GP Training Schemes</i>	78
<i>Strengths, Limitations and Future Directions</i>	80
<i>'Take Home' Points for Educators</i>	81
<i>Conclusion</i>	81
<i>References</i>	82