

Exploring Education Policy in a Globalized World:  
Concepts, Contexts, and Practices

Jian Li  
Eryong Xue



# Creating World-Class Universities in China

Ideas, Policies, and Efforts



Springer

# **Exploring Education Policy in a Globalized World: Concepts, Contexts, and Practices**

## **Series Editors**

Eryong Xue, Faculty of Education, Beijing Normal University, Beijing, China

Simon Marginson, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Jian Li, Faculty of Education, Beijing Normal University, Beijing, China

This book series explores education policy on Pre-K, K-12, post-secondary education, and vocational education, informing multiple experts from academia to practitioner, and specifically pays focuses on new frontiers and cutting-edge knowledge that transforms future education policy development. It has been initiated by a global group of education policy research centers and institutions, whose faculty and staff includes internationally recognized researchers in comparative education policy studies. The series' mission is to advance the modernization of the education and social construction.

This series provides policymakers and researchers with an in-depth understanding of international education policy from diverse perspectives. Topics include cutting-edge and multidisciplinary studies on identifying, analyzing and uncovering education policy reform and practice among the fields in education policy and pedagogy. It addresses how education policy shapes the development of education systems in different regions and seeks to explain how specific education policies concentrate on accelerating the development of quality education and social progress. More importantly, this book series offers policymakers and educational stakeholders, government, and private sectors a comprehensive lens to investigate the trends, rationales of education policy development internationally.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/16621>

Jian Li · Eryong Xue

# Creating World-Class Universities in China

Ideas, Policies, and Efforts

 Springer

Jian Li  
Faculty of Education  
Beijing Normal University  
Beijing, China

Eryong Xue  
Faculty of Education  
Beijing Normal University  
Beijing, China

The Beijing Social Science Foundation “A Study on the Physical Mechanism of High-quality Education Resource Sharing in Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Region” Major Project (No. 18ZDA03).

ISSN 2730-6356

ISSN 2730-6364 (electronic)

Exploring Education Policy in a Globalized World: Concepts, Contexts, and Practices

ISBN 978-981-16-6725-1

ISBN 978-981-16-6726-8 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-6726-8>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive license to Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. 2021

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore 189721, Singapore

# Preface

In China, creating world-class universities (“Double First-class”) refers to the construction of world-class universities and first-class disciplines. It is an important strategic decision made by the CPC Central Committee and the State Council, as well as an important strategy for the reform and development of higher education in China. This book explores how can we shape “World-class University” in China from the perspectives of ideas, policies, and efforts, specifically. It also examines the essence and logic of creating world-class universities and disciplines. It is to focus on the construction of several universities and disciplines, but in different historical periods, the purpose of supporting the construction of universities is different. In the 1950s and 1960s, the key university construction strategy was to concentrate limited resources to build a group of higher-level universities to better serve the country’s economic and social construction. At present, with the improvement of China’s education level, the higher education needs to “face modernization, face the world, face the future,” and have a broader vision to better connect with the world and the international community.

Chapter 1 concentrates on shaping double first-class university in China from a perspective of the policy analysis. After more than 40 years of reform, since opening and modernization, China’s higher education has made remarkable achievements. In terms of quantity, in 1999, the Ministry of Education issued the Action Plan for The Revitalization of Education in the 21st Century, which put forward the educational reform policy for the expansion of colleges and universities. Since 2002, the gross enrollment rate of higher education in China has reached 15% and entered the stage of higher education popularization. In 2019, the gross enrollment rate of higher education in China reached 51.6% and entered the stage of higher education popularization. Specifically, the policy connotation of “double first-class university” construction, the policy change of “double first-class university” construction, policies, and standards for the construction of “double first class” and summary of the policy for “double first-class” construction have been explored in this chapter.

Chapter 2 concentrates on shaping double first-class university in China from a perspective of data analysis. The construction of “double first class” will be based on the “211 Project” and “985 Project” high-level university construction and the

original “national key discipline construction” integration, not only to ensure the continuity of the key construction policy, but also to keep pace with The Times for China’s higher education reform and development of higher targets and positioning. The Outline of the National Medium—and Long-term Plan for Education Reform and Development (2010–2020) issued by the government in 2010 clearly states: “On the basis of the construction of key disciplines, we will continue to implement the ‘project 985’ and the construction of innovation platforms for advantageous disciplines, continue to implement the ‘Project 211’ and launch key discipline projects with distinctive features.” The overall landscape of shaping double first-class university, the major analysis of double first-class university, and summary of double first-class construction data have been offered to explore how to shape double first-class universities in China, contextually.

Chapter 3 focuses on exploring the teacher cultivation to shape double first-class universities in China. It is an important part in the process of teacher training to improve the teaching ability of college teachers. The ability of education and teaching is the basic ability that a teacher should have, including the ability of education and teaching. Educational ability means that teachers should guide students to establish correct three views, cultivate students’ sense of social responsibility and mission, and stimulate students’ patriotic and socialist feelings. Teaching ability refers to a teacher’s ability to prepare, implement, and reflect on teaching practice. Policy analysis on the construction of teachers in first-class universities, summary of policies for the construction of the faculty of double first-class universities, and the summary of double first-class university teachers’ cultivation have been offered in this chapter.

Chapter 4 involves examining the student cultivation for shaping double first-class university in China. Since 2015, the country has issued nine relevant policies on talent training. From the year of the document’s release, at least one policy document related to talent cultivation has been issued every year since 2015. At the same time, more and more policies have been issued in the past 2–3 years. On average, there are two documents each year focusing on talent training, which also reflects China’s growing determination to build an educational power, so the emphasis on education construction has been deepened. The overall review of student cultivation for shaping double first-class university in China, policy characteristics of student cultivation, and summary of student training have been explored in this chapter.

Chapter 5 concentrates on exploring the scientific research for creating double first-class university in China. As the key to knowledge innovation and discipline development, scientific research is of great significance to the construction of first-class universities and disciplines. The double first-class university research policy, the double top university discipline evaluation, analysis of the subject evaluation results of the double first-class discipline construction universities, characteristics of university Scientific research under the background of double first-class construction, and summary of scientific research of double first-class universities have examined in this chapter.

Chapter 6 involves exploring the transformation of science and technology to shape the double first-class university in China. It is found that the policy environment created by the government plays an important role in promoting the transformation of scientific and technological achievements, and the complicated approval procedures for policy implementation and low efficiency are the most direct factors affecting the effect of the transformation of scientific and technological achievements at the present stage. The policies for the transformation of scientific and technological achievements of first-class universities, policy characteristics, questions, and suggestions have been offered in this chapter.

Chapter 7 focuses on shaping double first-class university in China from the perspective of the financial input. From 2018, when allocating special funds, the central government will consider the construction of local “double first-class” programs and actively support local universities in building first-class disciplines. In terms of the use of funds, each region shall be given greater autonomy, and the funds shall be allocated according to factors, reaching the provincial level at a lower limit. The top university financial investment policy, the remuneration of teachers, financial input data of the two first-class universities, financial Investment analysis of double top universities, the relationship between the number of first-class disciplines and budgetary revenue, and problems and suggestions on financial Investment of double top universities have been explored in this chapter.

Chapter 8 concentrates on exploring the internationalization of higher education to build double first-class university. The internationalization of higher education refers to the mutual learning, penetration, and docking of higher education among countries and regions in the world. It not only includes the two-way or multi-directional flow of international students, but also reflects the communication, convergence, and integration of higher education in different countries and regions in terms of school-running philosophy, functional setting, operation mechanism, management mode, teaching content and methods, as well as the sharing of teaching resources. In short, it is the development process and general trend of a country’s higher education toward the international arena. The introduction, the internationalization policy of universities at the national level, policy analysis, limitations exist in the applicability of internationalization policies, and internationalization strategy of world-class universities have been explored in this chapter.

Chapter 9 involves exploring the university ranking to shape double first-class university in China. In addition, as a traditional old industrial base, this historical tradition also has a profound impact on its discipline distribution; that is, strong disciplines are concentrated in engineering, such as the typical example of Harbin Institute of Technology. The distribution of universities and disciplines, index analysis of domestic and foreign ranking lists, analysis of QS ranking indicators and methods, comparison of educational output indicators, index characteristics, index system, and subject evaluation index have been examined in this chapter.

Chapter 10 focuses on investigating the policy assessment for shaping double first-class university in China. The construction of a first-class university should be a university with advanced school-running idea, strong school-running strength, and high social recognition after long-term key construction. It should have a certain

number of high-level disciplines leading in China and leading in the world and achieve remarkable results in the reform and innovation and the construction of modern university system. To build first-class disciplines, universities should have high-level disciplines that are in the forefront of domestic or international disciplines, whose discipline level is in the forefront of influential third-party evaluation, or that are urgently needed by the country, have significant industry or regional influence, have outstanding discipline advantages, and are irreplaceable. Policy evaluation index of double first-class construction, analysis of evaluation indexes of the “double first-class” construction discipline, policy evaluation procedure for double first-class construction, evaluation results, characteristics of double first-class construction evaluation system and problems existing in the policy evaluation of the double first-class construction have been explored in this study.

Beijing, China

Jian Li  
Eryong Xue

# Acknowledgements

In the realization of this book, our contributors have been supportive and willing to share their opinions and perspective on how to explore the overall Chinese education policy landscape from a concept-added policy chain perspective. We are grateful for the generosity and positive spirit of collegiality. While most of the chapters in this book are original, several are adopted from our previously published material and editors are grateful for the kind permissions granted to facilitate this.

**Acknowledgement** Eryong, Xue, and Jian Li share the co-first authorship and contribute equally in this book.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Policy Analysis of Creating World-Class Universities in China</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1	The Policy Connotation of Creating Double First-Class University .....	1
1.1.1	The Implementation Background of Creating Double First-Class University .....	1
1.1.2	The Definition of Double First Class .....	2
1.2	The Policy Changes of Double First-Class University .....	4
1.2.1	Stage 1: The Introduction and Continuous Improvement of the Guiding Overall Plan (2015) .....	4
1.2.2	Stage 2: The State Improves Specific Implementation Plans, Speeds Up Construction, and Implements Them in Colleges and Universities (2017) .....	6
1.2.3	Stage 3: Evaluate and Summarize the Preliminary Construction Situation and Continue to Make Steady Progress (2019) .....	10
1.3	Principles, Policies, and Standards for Creating Double First-Class Universities .....	14
1.3.1	Advocate Talent Training as the Starting Point of Double First-Class Construction .....	14
1.3.2	Uphold Moral Education and Cultivate the Core Socialist Values .....	15
1.3.3	Promote Innovative Personnel Training Mode, Collaborative Education Mechanism and Entrepreneurship Education .....	16
1.3.4	Actively Promote the Reform of Curriculum System and Teaching Content .....	17
1.3.5	Scientific Research as an Important Support for the Construction of Double First Class .....	18

1.3.6	Social Services as the “Third Mission” of Double First-Class Construction .....	20
1.3.7	The Policy Implementation Measures on the Selection Criteria of Double First-Class in Social Service .....	20
1.3.8	The Policy Implementation Measures for the Cultural Inheritance .....	22
1.3.9	The Double First-Class Universities with Four Standards in Faculty Training .....	23
1.4	Summary of the Policy for Creating Double First-Class .....	26
1.4.1	The Standards for the Construction of First-Class Universities and the Construction of First-Class Disciplines Are Not Clear .....	26
1.4.2	The Connection Between the Double First-Class Construction and the “211 Project”, “985 Project” and Other Key Construction Projects Has not Been Properly Solved .....	27
1.4.3	The Policy Transmission of Double First-Class Construction Still Adopts the Traditional “Top-Down” Transmission Mode .....	28
1.4.4	Excessive Use of Coercive Policy Tools .....	29
1.5	Suggestions on Further Improving the Double First-Class Policy .....	29
1.5.1	Promote the Openness and Transparency of the Double First-Class Policy and Improve the Evaluation Criteria .....	29
1.5.2	Strengthen the Dynamic Adjustment of Double First-Class Construction, Improve the Competition Mechanism, and Break the Identity Solidification .....	30
1.5.3	Use Modern Information Technology to Build the Information Channel of Double First-Class Policy Implementation .....	31
1.5.4	Rational Use of Policy Tools to Establish a Multi-agent Participation Mechanism for Sustainable Development .....	31
	References .....	32
<b>2</b>	<b>The Data Analysis of Creating World-Class Universities in China .....</b>	<b>35</b>
2.1	The Overall Landscape of Shaping Double First-Class University .....	35
2.1.1	The Policy Text of Shaping Double First-Class University .....	35
2.1.2	The Policy Document Analysis of Shaping Double First-Class University .....	37

2.2	The Major Analysis of Double First-Class University .....	38
2.2.1	Discipline Construction as the Foundation Project of “Double First-Class” University .....	38
2.2.2	The Publication of the First-Class Discipline Construction List and the Promotion of the First-Class Discipline Construction Policy .....	39
2.2.3	The Types of the Selected First-Class Universities Are Unevenly Distributed, and the Selected First-Class Disciplines .....	40
2.2.4	The First-Class Construction Discipline with “Chinese Characteristics” .....	42
2.2.5	The Regional Distribution of the First-Class Universities .....	43
2.2.6	The Uneven Regional Distribution of the First-Class Universities .....	44
2.2.7	The Gap in Resource Allocation of Higher Education Among Provinces .....	45
2.3	Questions of Double First-Class Construction Data .....	46
2.3.1	How to Lay Out the Double First-Class Universities Facing Difficulties? .....	46
2.3.2	The Layout of Disciplines and Majors Is Facing Difficulties .....	47
2.3.3	The Allocation of Resources Between Central and Local Double First-Class Universities and General Universities .....	48
2.4	Suggestions of Double First-Class Construction Data .....	49
2.4.1	Establish a New Development View of Higher Education Based on System Theory and Ecological Theory .....	49
2.4.2	Adjust the Layout of Disciplines and Majors in Accordance with the Discipline Development Law .....	50
2.4.3	Build a Comprehensive and Interdisciplinary First-Class Discipline System .....	51
2.4.4	Deeply Participate in the “One Belt and One Road” Initiative to Improve the Internationalization Level of Higher Education in Western China .....	51
	References .....	52
<b>3</b>	<b>The Teacher Cultivation of Creating World-Class Universities in China .....</b>	<b>53</b>
3.1	Policy Analysis on Teachers’ Cultivation in First-Class Universities .....	53
3.1.1	The Policies for the Teaching Staff in China .....	53

- 3.1.2 The Policies for the Faculty of Double First-Class Universities ..... 54
- 3.1.3 The Reform of Teacher Evaluation System ..... 56
- 3.2 The Problems of Double First-Class University Teachers' Cultivation ..... 62
  - 3.2.1 Imperfect Talent Introduction Mechanism ..... 62
  - 3.2.2 Lack of Teachers and Weak Strength ..... 63
  - 3.2.3 The Unbalanced Content of Teacher Training ..... 64
  - 3.2.4 The Unbalanced Distribution of Scientific Research Tasks and Teaching Work ..... 64
  - 3.2.5 Uneven Geographical Distribution of Teachers ..... 64
- 3.3 Suggestions on the Construction of the Faculty of Double First-Class Universities ..... 65
  - 3.3.1 Improve the Talent Introduction Mechanism and Define the Functional Division of Labor ..... 65
  - 3.3.2 Optimize the Structure of the Teacher Team and Rationally Control the Ratio of Students to Teachers ..... 66
  - 3.3.3 Adjust the Content of Teacher Training and Balance Scientific Research and Teaching ..... 67
  - 3.3.4 Improve the Talent Evaluation System and Pay Attention to the Characteristics of Disciplines ..... 68
  - 3.3.5 Give Full Play to the Role of Teacher Development Center and Improve Its Quality ..... 68
- References ..... 69

- 4 The Student Cultivation of Creating World-Class Universities in China ..... 71**
  - 4.1 The Overall Review of Student Cultivation for Shaping Double First-Class University in China ..... 71
    - 4.1.1 The Overall Plan Policy Text of Student Cultivation ... 71
    - 4.1.2 The Other Relevant Policy Texts of Student Cultivation ..... 72
  - 4.2 Policy Characteristics of Student Cultivation ..... 74
    - 4.2.1 It Is the Task to Cultivate New People of the Era to Take on the Great Task of National Rejuvenation .... 74
    - 4.2.2 Based on Guiding Students to Grow and Become Talents ..... 76
    - 4.2.3 Disseminating Advanced Culture and Core Values ..... 77
    - 4.2.4 Strengthening Undergraduate and Graduate Education ..... 78
    - 4.2.5 Enhancing Innovation and Entrepreneurship as the Core ..... 79
    - 4.2.6 Focusing on Cultivating High-Level and High-Level Talents ..... 80

4.3	Hierarchical Analysis of Students in Double First-Class Universities .....	83
4.3.1	Institutional-Based Analysis of Students in Double First-Class Universities .....	83
4.3.2	Program-Based Analysis of Students in Double First-Class Universities .....	84
4.4	Problems of Student Cultivation in Creating Double First-Class Universities .....	85
4.4.1	Lack of Talent Cultivation Information .....	85
4.4.2	Convergence of Talent Cultivation Objectives .....	86
4.4.3	Regional Imbalance in Talent Cultivation .....	87
4.5	Suggestions of Student Cultivation in Creating Double First-Class Universities .....	87
4.5.1	Reasonably Adjust the Student Hierarchy Structure and Control the School Scale .....	87
4.5.2	Create the Characteristics of Double First-Class Talent Cultivation and Promote the Personalized Development of Talents .....	88
4.5.3	Rationally Allocate Higher Education Resources and Promote Balanced Distribution of Talents .....	89
	References .....	90
<b>5</b>	<b>The Scientific Research of Creating World-Class Universities in China</b> .....	<b>91</b>
5.1	The Double First-Class University Research Policy .....	91
5.1.1	The Outline of Policies .....	91
5.1.2	Policy Characteristics and Guidance .....	92
5.2	The Double First-Class University Discipline Evaluation .....	96
5.2.1	Analysis of Discipline Evaluation Mechanism .....	96
5.2.2	The Adjustment Process of the Evaluation Index System .....	97
5.2.3	The Content of the Index System Emphasizes Quality .....	97
5.2.4	The Standards of the Subject Evaluation .....	99
5.2.5	The Categories of the Subject Evaluation .....	100
5.3	Characteristics of University Scientific Research .....	101
5.3.1	The Distribution Proportion of All Fields Is Stable, with Basic Research and Applied Research as the Main Parts .....	101
5.3.2	Basic Research and Applied Research Maintain a Small and Stable Growth .....	102
5.3.3	The Gross Base Is Huge and Keeps Steady Growth ....	102
5.3.4	There Is a Wide Gap Between the Total Expenditure of Colleges and Universities .....	103

5.4	Problems of Scientific Research of Double First-Class Universities .....	106
5.4.1	The Level of Basic Research Still Needs to Be Improved .....	106
5.4.2	The Imbalance in Regional Development Is Significant .....	108
5.4.3	Insufficient Academic Research at the Undergraduate Stage .....	109
5.5	Suggestions of Scientific Research of Double First-Class Universities .....	110
5.5.1	Increase Input and Support in Personnel, Funds and Other Aspects of Basic Research .....	110
5.5.2	Strengthening Public Financial Support for Basic Research in Colleges and Universities .....	110
5.5.3	Reasonably Determine the Growth Target of Investment in Basic Research .....	111
5.5.4	Strengthen Overall Control and Promote Regional Cooperation in Scientific Research .....	111
	References .....	113
<b>6</b>	<b>The Transformation of Science and Technology of Creating World-Class Universities in China .....</b>	<b>115</b>
6.1	Policies for the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	115
6.1.1	Macro Policy Environment .....	115
6.1.2	Policy of Funding Support .....	116
6.1.3	Establishing Transformation Institutions .....	117
6.1.4	Intellectual Property Policies and Incentive Policies for Achievement Distribution .....	118
6.1.5	Policy Characteristics of the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	120
6.2	The Characteristics of the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	121
6.2.1	Continuously Optimize the Policy Environment for the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	121
6.2.2	Pay Attention to the Continuous Improvement of Professional Institutions and Service Platforms .....	121
6.2.3	New Breakthroughs Are Made in the Incentive Mechanism .....	122
6.2.4	Shift from Quantity to Quality .....	122
6.3	The Data Analysis of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	123
6.3.1	The Analysis of Overall Development Vitality .....	124

6.3.2	The Analysis of the Enterprise in the Production of High-Tech and Professional Products .....	126
6.3.3	The Analysis of Enterprises Among Regions and Universities .....	128
6.4	Problems of the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	130
6.4.1	Some Local Colleges and Universities Lack Experience in Implementing Transformation .....	130
6.4.2	Insufficient Execution of Policy Subjects .....	130
6.4.3	Unreasonable Organization and Management of Government Science and Technology Programs .....	131
6.4.4	The Restructuring of School-Run Industry Is Incomplete .....	131
6.4.5	The Fund Gap of Science and Technology Enterprises in Universities Is Serious .....	132
6.4.6	The Technology Conversion Rate of Science and Technology Enterprises in Universities Is Not High .....	133
6.4.7	Small University Science and Technology Enterprises Face Difficulties in Survival .....	134
6.5	Suggestions of the Transformation of Scientific and Technological Achievements .....	134
6.5.1	Improve the Organization and Management of Government Science and Technology Programs .....	134
6.5.2	Accelerate the Restructuring Process of University-Run Industries .....	135
6.5.3	Promote Diversification of Investment Subjects of Enterprises and Improve Financing Mechanism .....	136
6.5.4	Improve the Conversion Rate of Scientific Research Achievements of Universities and Enterprises in Multiple Ways .....	137
6.5.5	Streamline the Number of Science and Technology Enterprises in Colleges and Universities and Improve Their Operating Efficiency .....	138
6.5.6	Optimize the Legal Environment of Science and Technology Enterprises in Universities .....	139
	References .....	139
<b>7</b>	<b>The Financial Input of Creating World-Class Universities in China .....</b>	<b>141</b>
7.1	Central Financial Support for Colleges and Universities .....	141
7.1.1	Implementation Measures in the Overall Program .....	142
7.1.2	Support for Central and Provincial Universities .....	143
7.1.3	Main Contents of Financial Support .....	145
7.1.4	The Remuneration of Teachers .....	149

- 7.2 Financial Investment Analysis of Double First Universities ..... 152
  - 7.2.1 Horizontal Changes in the Financial Allocation for the Double First-Class Construction from 2016 to 2020 ..... 152
  - 7.2.2 The Difference of Financial Allocation Budget Between the Double First-Class Universities of Different Types ..... 154
  - 7.2.3 The Relationship Between the Number of the Double First-Class Disciplines and Budgetary Revenue ..... 155
- 7.3 Problems on Financial Investment of Double First-Class Universities ..... 156
  - 7.3.1 The Scale and Efficiency of Financial Input ..... 156
  - 7.3.2 Geographical Distribution of Financial Input ..... 157
  - 7.3.3 Differences in Financial Input Between Subordinate Units ..... 158
  - 7.3.4 School Level Solidification of Financial Investment ..... 158
- 7.4 Suggestions on the Financial Investment of the Double First-Class Universities ..... 159
  - 7.4.1 Steadily Promote the Double First-Class Universities and Give Consideration to Both the Scale of Financial Investment and Benefits ..... 159
  - 7.4.2 Financial Input Should Be Appropriately Tilted to the West to Establish a Scientific Performance System ..... 159
  - 7.4.3 The Combination of Strength Concentration and Priority Concerns Slows the Gradient of Resource Allocation ..... 160
  - 7.4.4 Provide Peer Support to Provincial Universities and Set up Local Special Funds ..... 160
  - 7.4.5 Improve the Performance Evaluation Mechanism and Break the Identity Barrier ..... 161
- References ..... 162
- 8 The Internationalization of Creating World-Class Universities in China ..... 163**
  - 8.1 The Internationalization Policy of Double First-Class Universities at the National Level ..... 163
    - 8.1.1 Specific Contents of the Policy Text of Internationalization Policy of Double First-Class Universities at the National Level ..... 164
    - 8.1.2 Policy Analysis of the Internationalization Policy of Double First-Class Universities at the National Level ..... 167

8.2	Problems in the Applicability of Internationalization Policies of Double First-Class Universities .....	168
8.2.1	Many Chinese Universities Fail to Consider Their Own Specific Conditions .....	169
8.2.2	There Are Various Forms of Internationalization Development, but Some Deficiencies Still Exist in Some Respects .....	171
8.3	Suggestions of Internationalization Development of Double First-Class Universities in China .....	172
8.3.1	The Development of Internationalization of First-Class Universities Should Emphasize Global and International Vision Rather Than International Competitiveness .....	172
8.3.2	We Should Focus on Internationalization of the Management in Double First-Class Universities .....	172
8.3.3	“One Belt and One Road” Should Have a Significant Impact on the Internationalization Development Strategy of Higher Education .....	173
	References .....	174
<b>9</b>	<b>The Rankings of Creating World-Class Universities in China .....</b>	<b>177</b>
9.1	The Overview of Universities and Disciplines in China .....	177
9.1.1	Uneven Regional Distribution of Universities and Disciplines .....	178
9.1.2	Index Analysis of Domestic and Foreign Ranking Lists .....	178
9.1.3	Analysis of QS Ranking Indicators and Methods .....	180
9.1.4	Comparison of Educational Output Indicators .....	180
9.2	Index Characteristics of Rankings .....	181
9.2.1	Index System of Rankings .....	182
9.2.2	Subject Evaluation Index of Rankings .....	183
9.3	Problems of Rankings for Creating Double First-Class Universities .....	184
9.3.1	China’s Main Rankings Do not Set Up Relevant Indicators .....	184
9.3.2	Lack of Attention to the Internationalization of Colleges and Universities .....	184
9.3.3	The Single Evaluation Index of University Internationalization Cannot Correctly Reflect the Level of University Internationalization .....	185
9.4	Suggestions of Rankings for Creating Double First-Class Universities .....	185
9.4.1	Attach Importance to the Establishment of Internationalization Indicators .....	186

- 9.4.2 Pay Attention to the Quality of Internationalization . . . . 186
- 9.4.3 Promote Construction by Evaluation, and Suggest  
the Establishment of Negative Indicators . . . . . 186
- 9.4.4 Combination of Qualitative and Quantitative  
Indicators . . . . . 187
- References . . . . . 187

**10 The Policy Assessment of Creating World-Class Universities  
in China . . . . . 189**

- 10.1 Policy Evaluation Index of Double First-Class Universities . . . . 189
  - 10.1.1 Specific Selection Indicators: Evaluation Index  
of Double First-Class Construction Published  
in the Documents of the Ministry of Education . . . . . 190
  - 10.1.2 University Ranking Organizations Published  
on the Double First-Class Assessment Indicators . . . . . 191
  - 10.1.3 Opinions of Other Scholars on the Evaluation  
Criteria of Double First-Class Disciplines . . . . . 192
- 10.2 Analysis of Evaluation Indexes of the Double First-Class  
Discipline . . . . . 193
  - 10.2.1 How to Evaluate the Development Quality After  
Graduation? . . . . . 194
  - 10.2.2 The Meaning of a World-Class University . . . . . 194
  - 10.2.3 The Goal of a Double First-Class University . . . . . 195
- 10.3 Policy Evaluation Procedure for Double First-Class  
Universities . . . . . 195
  - 10.3.1 Establishment of Expert Committee . . . . . 196
  - 10.3.2 Determine the Evaluation Criteria . . . . . 196
  - 10.3.3 List of Universities to Be Built . . . . . 196
  - 10.3.4 University to Compile Construction Scheme . . . . . 197
  - 10.3.5 Review by the Expert Committee . . . . . 197
- 10.4 Characteristics of Double First-Class Evaluation System . . . . . 198
  - 10.4.1 Clear Educational Objectives and Positioning . . . . . 199
  - 10.4.2 Take Students as the Foundation and Cultivate  
First-Class Talents . . . . . 200
  - 10.4.3 Build with the Gathering of Academic Masters . . . . . 200
  - 10.4.4 Pay Attention to Scientific Research and Produce  
First-Class Results . . . . . 201
  - 10.4.5 Actively Assume Social Responsibilities  
and Serve the National Strategy . . . . . 201
  - 10.4.6 Compatible with Package, High Level  
of Internationalization . . . . . 201
  - 10.4.7 Academic Freedom, Excellent School Spirit  
and Rich Characteristics . . . . . 202
- 10.5 Problems Existing in the Policy Evaluation of the Double  
First-Class Universities . . . . . 202

10.5.1	Evaluation Theory Lags Behind Practice .....	202
10.5.2	Single Assessment Subject .....	203
10.5.3	Unclear Positioning .....	203
10.5.4	Selection and Management of Construction Objects .....	203
10.5.5	Make Multiple Value Judgments .....	206
10.5.6	The Goal of Social Justice .....	207
10.6	Suggestions in the Policy Evaluation of the Double First-Class Universities .....	208
10.6.1	Highlight the Two Characteristics of “Chinese Characteristics” and “First-Class” .....	208
10.6.2	Create an Open Evaluation Dimension .....	208
10.6.3	Build an Independent Data Monitoring Platform .....	209
10.6.4	Promote the Benign Development of “Double First-Class” Universities and Disciplines .....	209
10.6.5	The Government Should Grant Full Autonomy to Colleges and Universities .....	210
References	.....	210

## About the Authors



**Jian Li** is the assistant professor in China Institute of Education Policy, Faculty of Education, Beijing Normal University, China. She received her Ph.D. degree in Educational Leadership and Policy Studies (ELPS), School of Education, Indiana University Bloomington. Her research interests focus on education policy studies, world-class universities, globalization, and internationalization of higher education. She has published over 60 articles and books regarding China's education policy and comparative higher education studies. She currently also serves as think tanker at China Institute of Education and Social Development, Beijing Normal University. Her general area of scholarship is on the assessment of education policy within education institutions comparatively. Within this general area, she has pursued four themes: the education policy studies, globalization of higher education, higher education policy and management, undergraduate students' global learning performance assessment, faculty academic innovation perspective within higher education and comparative higher education development as a framework for institutional research. She has published over 60 articles, 20 monographs and chapters and delivered over 60 workshops and seminars and offered more than 20 keynote, peer-reviewed, and invited presentations throughout the USA and in Europe, Africa, and Asia.



**Eryong Xue** is the professor in China Institute of Education Policy, Faculty of Education, Beijing Normal University, China. Changjiang scholars (young scholars) awarded by the Ministry of Education in China. He is also a research fellow of the center for science and technology and education development strategy in Tsinghua University. He is also a postdoctoral fellow in the public administration of Tsinghua University. He has published more than 100 Chinese and English papers in the field of educational research. He has produced more than 100 CSSCI and SSCI articles. He has won the seventh award for outstanding achievements in scientific research in institutions of higher learning, the fifth national award for outstanding achievements in educational scientific research, and the award for outstanding achievements in political participation and discussion by the central committee for China Association for Promoting Democracy (CAPD) for more than 60 times. More than 60 independent or co-authored consulting reports were adopted by decision-making departments or approved by leaders. He has presided over more than 10 national or provincial projects such as national social science fund, natural science fund, ministry of education humanities and social science fund, Beijing philosophy and social science project, participated in nine national or provincial key projects such as ministry of education philosophy and social science project, and two international cooperation projects. The project of national natural science foundation of China was awarded excellent. He has been honored as the advanced worker of summer social practice for students at Capital College and technical secondary school, the outstanding talent of Beijing division, the young talent of Beijing social science federation, the outstanding talent of Beijing universities and colleges, and the outstanding talent of Beijing. Main social part-time jobs are member of the 14th committee of the communist youth league of Beijing, deputy director of the working committee of college students and young teachers, special expert of China education association, China education development strategy society, national academic-level office, director of Beijing postdoctoral fellowship (the 20th session).