Markku Suksi

Sub-State Governance through Territorial Autonomy

A Comparative Study in Constitutional Law of Powers, Procedures and Institutions



Sub-State Governance through Territorial Autonomy

Markku Suksi

Sub-State Governance through Territorial Autonomy

A Comparative Study in Constitutional Law of Powers, Procedures and Institutions



Professor Markku Suksi Abo Akademi University Department of Law Gezeliusgatan 2 20500 Åbo Finland msuksi@abo.fi

ISBN 978-3-642-20047-2 e-ISBN 978-3-642-20048-9 DOI 10.1007/978-3-642-20048-9 Springer Heidelberg Dordrecht London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011933721

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2011

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Violations are liable to prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Cover design: SPi Publisher Services

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

"Sovereignty, like the atom, can be split." (Trías Monge 1997, p. 170)

"In modern times, sovereignty is divisible." (S.M.Z. v. Machano Khamis Ali & 17 Others, Court of Appeal of Tanzania, 2000)

Foreword

Territorial autonomy is an important constitutional phenomenon, but because the sub-state entities that can be identified as territorial autonomies are relatively small, the phenomenon is often overlooked in systematic presentations of constitutional law. This is not to say that treatises of national constitutional law would completely lack information about territorial autonomies, but the internal functioning of sub-state entities, in particular, is not known to a wider audience. Yet at the same time, each sub-state entity operates on the basis of its own constitutional law in the broad sense of the term, whatever the normative nature of that constitutional law might be. Therefore, the inner normative lives of territorial autonomies deserve to be opened up for a systematic review, which is comprehensive and comparative in nature so as to point out similarities and differences between the various sub-state existences.

The similarities may be fewer than the differences, but what is striking in this context is that each of the autonomies included in this inquiry are by and large constructed along common elements, those of the distribution of powers, participation, the executive power, and foreign relations. Incidentally, these elements seem to hold the answer to what it means to be autonomous, that is, what it means not to be an independent state and not a symmetrical part of the governmental structure of the state, but autonomous. Although territorial autonomy may be unknown to the regular constitutional scholar or practitioner, I am convinced that the information contained in this inquiry will be useful for anybody interested in this constitutional phenomenon. At the same time, the inquiry will be interesting and useful for those who deal with sub-state issues, such as law-makers, politicians and civil servants of sub-state entities and of such states in which they exist, because the detailed information and analysis contained in this inquiry may function as a point of reference when, for instance, the development of an existing sub-state entity is planned or when the creation of a new territorial autonomy is on the drawing board. A further purpose of this inquiry is to simply recognize this particular institutional mode of organization.

Autonomy has been on my research agenda since the mid-1990s, and after a number of articles and books about specific issues related to the concept of viii Foreword

autonomy, the time was ripe for collecting some of the research strands into a more comprehensive volume. The opportunity to do so was provided by the Academy of Finland, which granted me funding as a so-called Senior Researcher. Obviously, I am very grateful for the grant, which was placed at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy of Tufts University in Massachusetts, USA. At the same time, I am very grateful to my own university, Åbo Akademi University, for the leave of absence during the academic year of 2008–2009, and to Fletcher School for receiving me as a Senior Researcher/Research Professor during that year.

At Fletcher, I wish to thank Professor Hurst Hannum for his kind and collegial support, and Dean Peter Uvin and his academic staff for hosting me in the most pleasant environment. In addition, the Fletcher staff with Celia C., Celia M., Ben, Sandi, Fran and John at the administration and Jeff, Ellen, Miriam, Mariesmith, and Paula at the Library, as well as Giuliana and Linda at the cafeteria and Jane and Lois at the International Centre, deserve warm thanks for all the help and attention, as well as Mr. Risto Vilkko of the Academy of Finland. I also benefited tremendously from the co-operation between Fletcher and the Law School of Harvard University, which gave me access to the excellent collections of Harvard Law Library. I also wish to thank Professor Yash Ghai for his empowering autonomy research and his inspiring example.

During my research, I had the benefit of discussing autonomy-related issues with a great number of persons, around 70 individuals in Puerto Rico, Aceh, Hong Kong, Scotland, Zanzibar and the Åland Islands. They helped me with materials, they functioned as interlocutors concerning particular issues, and they assisted me in all possible ways during my research. It is not possible to mention all of them or to explain what each of them did for my project, but I trust that they will understand how crucial their role was when they see the final product.

In addition, I had the benefit of discussing the various autonomy arrangements with a number of persons and receiving their learned comments, namely Mr. Albeniz Couret-Fuentes, LL.M. (Fletcher), for Puerto Rico, Professor Chris Himsworth for Scotland, Professor Mawardi Ismail for Aceh, Assistant Professor Kelley Loper for Hong Kong, and Mr. Mohamed Hamad, LL.M. (Oslo), for Zanzibar. It should be understood that none of these persons are responsible for any of the faults or omissions that may be attributed to my text, and none of them is responsible for any formulations in the text. However, I am sure that my research would have gone in the wrong direction if it were not for the critical comments of these persons. Obviously, I am solely responsible for what I have written in this inquiry and for how I have analyzed the different sub-state entities, but at the same time, I am deeply grateful to these persons.

At my home base, the Department of Law of Åbo Akademi University in Finland, I wish to thank everybody from this community, and in particular Professor Elina Pirjatanniemi and Ms. Kati Frostell, Lic.Pol.Sc., for their support. I am also grateful to Mrs. Jody Merelle, Mr. Henno Parks and Ms. Darcy Hurford for linguistic editing. Finally, I wish to thank Springer Verlag for accepting my inquiry for publication and Kluwer Law International for giving the permission to use portions of my article on 'Sub-national issues: Local government reform,

Foreword ix

re-districting, and the Åland Islands in the European Union', published originally in European Public Law 13, pp. 390–404.

The information in the text is good for Puerto Rico as of June 2009, for Hong Kong as of August 2009, for Aceh as of October 2009, for Scotland as of April 2010, for Zanzibar as of October 2010, and for the Åland Islands as of November 2010. Some additions of fact, such as election results, may have taken place after these points of time. The structure of the book is such that it is possible to acquire an overview over the topic of territorial autonomy by means of reading the sections at the end of the different chapters entitled "Reflections" and the concluding chapter. These overviews are based on the more detailed interpretations of the thematic sections. The reader who is interested in a particular autonomy of those included in this study is requested to follow the structure of the book through the various thematic chapters, where each of the six sub-state entities are featured.

I dedicate this book to my family.

In Åbo, Finland, on a beautiful day during the Christmas week of 2010.

Markku Suksi

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	1.1 Identifying the Sub-State	1
	1.2 Identifying Governance and Research Issues	6
	1.3 Method and Materials	
	1.4 Previous Research	17
	1.5 Description of the Sub-State Entities Included	
	in the Study as Core Cases	28
2	The Autonomy of Memel	39
	2.1 Link to Minority Rights	39
	2.2 The Elements of Autonomy in Memel	48
	2.2.1 Powers	48
	2.2.2 Participation	56
	2.2.3 The Executive	64
	2.2.4 International Relations	74
	2.3 Reflections	77
3	The Relationship between Federalism and Autonomy	81
	3.1 Terminological Confusion	81
	3.2 The Characteristics of Federalism v. Autonomy	85
	3.2.1 Classical Understanding of Federalism	85
	3.2.2 Expanding the Frames of Federalism	89
	3.2.3 Institutional and Substantive Dimensions Distinguished	96
	,	01
	3.3.1 Indications of a Separate Category of Autonomy	01
	3.3.2 Autonomy as a Distinct Category	106
	3.4 The Notions of Regional State, Devolution, and Regional	
	Self-Government	109
	ϵ	109
		114
	3.4.3 Regional Self-Government in Europe	123

xii Contents

	3.5 Conclusions	125
	3.5.1 Compiling the Building-Blocks of Autonomy	125
		130
		132
		138
4	Conflict Resolution in a Self-Determination Context	
		141
	S S	141
	4.2 The Åland Islands: From Risk of Secession and War	
	to Peaceful Conflict Resolution	142
	4.2.1 Domestic Preliminaries in Anticipation	
	of International Involvement?	142
	4.2.2 Decision by the League of Nations	146
	4.2.3 Domestic Implementation by a Special Act	152
	4.2.4 Recognition in the Constitution	156
	4.2.5 Involving the Åland Islands in the European Union	158
		161
	e	165
	3	170
	11	171
		172
	1	172
	1	176
	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e	181
		184
	4.4 Zanzibar: Appeasing Internal Conflict by Uniting	
		188
	•	188
	1	192
		195
		198
		203
	4.4.6 The Unimplemented Constitutional Jurisdiction	205
		207
	e e	209
		210
		214
		214
		217
	•	224
	4.5.4 Guarantee of Capitalist Economy and Common	229
	Law to Residents	114

Contents xiii

	4.6 Scot	land: Avoiding Even a Remote Possibility of Conflict	
		Franting Autonomy	234
	4.6.1	Deepening the Pre-existing Treaty-Based Autonomy	234
	4.6.2	Devolution by Referendum	236
	4.6.3	A Constitutional Convention as the Safeguard	240
		Parliamentary Sovereignty and Constitutional Review	242
		n: Resolution of Internal Conflict by Internal Agreement	244
		Particular Form of Decentralisation	244
		2 A Special Solution for a Special Place	250
		A Multi-layered Jurisdiction	256
		Islamic Characteristics of the Jurisdiction	262
		Rights of Persons, Residents and Citizens	265
	4.8 Refle	ections	269
_		n	
5		ribution of Powers	277
		Enumeration through Residual Powers	
		pen Arrangements	277
		g Kong: Enumeration (or Delegation under the Plenary	270
		ers of the National Legislature?)	279
		High Degree of Autonomy	279
		Complete Legal Powers by Enumeration in Almost All Areas	282
	5.2.3	Possibility to Expand National Powers and to Return	200
	504	Hong Kong Legislation	286 291
		Interpreting the Basic Law: $1 + 1 = 1$?	291
		From Residual to Enumerated Powers	293 295
		2 Competence of Åland Mainly in Public Law	293 298
		Acts of Mixed Nature and Acts of Reference	304
		Bipolar Competence Control	304
		Making Ålandic Norms and Consent Decrees:	300
	3.3.3	Some Peculiarities of Norm Hierarchy	311
	5.4 Scot	land: Lawmaking Against the Background of Parliamentary	311
		ereignty	314
		The Pledge of the Sewel Convention	314
		The Area of Residual Powers Dotted with UK Competence .	316
		Multiple Competence Control of the Scottish Powers	322
		Consenting to Lawmaking by the UK Parliament	
		within Scottish Powers	333
	5.4.5	Joint Discussions as a Mechanism for Resolving	
	2	Competence Issues in Advance	337
	5.5 Zanz	tibar: Clear Residuality but Unclear Implementation	
		Federal-Type Residual Competences	
		The Principle of Duality	345

xiv Contents

		5.5.3 Problems in Implementing Competences	349
		5.5.4 Weak Forms of Consultation and Consent	351
		5.5.5 Two Lawmakers with a Joint Pool of Sovereignty	352
	5.6	Aceh: Unclear Implementation of the Settlement	355
		5.6.1 Residual Powers as the Starting Point?	355
		5.6.2 Large Amount of Overlap to Be Negotiated	359
		5.6.3 'Consultation and Consent' or 'Consultation	
		and Consideration'?	363
		5.6.4 Bylaws Issued under National Law and National Standards	
		as the Normative Tool	366
	5.7	Puerto Rico: Residual Powers under Pressure of the Plenary	
		Powers of Congress	370
		5.7.1 Matters Not Locally Inapplicable: Vast Area	
		of Concurring Powers	370
		5.7.2 Treated as a State in the Federation	374
		5.7.3 Attenuated Power to Make Constitution and Laws	380
	5.8	Reflections	385
		5.8.1 Construction of Separate Legal Orders	385
		5.8.2 Accommodation of Different Legal Systems through	
		Sub-state Jurisdictions	392
6	Par	ticipation in Decision-Making	395
U		Elections, and Some Referendums	395
		The Åland Islands: Legitimacy from Regional Citizenship	396
	0.2	6.2.1 Two Levels of Participation and Different Constituencies	396
		6.2.2 Proportional Elections with Political Groupings	398
		6.2.3 The Use of the Referendum in the EU Context	401
		6.2.4 Presidential and Parliamentary Elections	403
		6.2.5 Initiatives to the National Parliament	405
		6.2.6 Expanding Participation in Local Government	408
	6.3	Aceh: Creating a Regional Polity	410
	0.0	6.3.1 Participation at the Core of the Peace Agreement	410
		6.3.2 Local Political Parties	411
		6.3.3 Elections Administered within the National Frame	416
		6.3.4 Post-conflict Elections of the Governor	417
		6.3.5 Post-conflict Representation through an Elected Body	422
		6.3.6 Local Government and National Elections	427
		6.3.7 Other Forms of Public Bodies	430
	6.4	Scotland: The British Electoral Tradition Modernized	431
		6.4.1 Elections, Referendums and Consultations	431
		6.4.2 Combining Majoritarian and Proportional Elections	
		Under UK Law	433
		6.4.3 National Parties	437
		6.4.4 Counting Votes in the Additional Member System	439

Contents xv

		6.4.5 The Scottish Parliament in Relation to the UK Parliament:	
		The West Lothian Question	442
		6.4.6 Elections at Other Levels: UK, Europe, and Local	
		Government	444
	6.5	Puerto Rico: Participation Confined to the Territory	446
		6.5.1 No Representation at the Federal Level	446
		6.5.2 Bicameral Representation through Voting in a Mixed System	448
		6.5.3 Party Constellations According to the Status Issue	452
		6.5.4 Referendums on the Status Issue, Constitutional Amendments	
		and Other Matters	457
	6.6	Zanzibar: Troubled Forms and Practices of Participation	465
		6.6.1 From One Party to Two Parties and Beyond (or Back?)	465
		6.6.2 The Right to Vote in Divisive Elections	468
		6.6.3 Electing the Powerful Executive	473
		6.6.4 Over-Representation at the National Level	475
		6.6.5 Two Different Election Commissions	477
	6.7	Hong Kong: Participation Contained	479
		6.7.1 Towards Universal Suffrage	479
		6.7.2 Elections through Geographical and Functional	
		Constituencies	481
		6.7.3 Indirect Election of the Chief Executive	489
		6.7.4 Elections in Local Government and within the Indigenous	400
		Community	492
	<i>(</i> 0	6.7.5 Selection of Delegates to the NPC and to the NPCSC	494
	0.8	Reflections	497
7	The	e Executive Power	507
		Both Parliamentary and Presidential Governance	507
		The Åland Islands: Normal Parliamentarism with a Slight	
		Modification	508
		7.2.1 Implementing Three Legal Orders	508
		7.2.2 Political Accountability	510
		7.2.3 The Implementing Organs of the Government	512
		7.2.4 Contacts with the National Government	514
		7.2.5 The Role of the Language	518
	7.3	Scotland: Traditional Parliamentary Environment	522
		7.3.1 Horizontal Political Accountability	522
		7.3.2 Integration with the National Government	526
		7.3.3 Implementation of Devolved Competence	529
	7.4	Zanzibar: Presidential Governance in a Power-Sharing Context	533
		7.4.1 Presidentialism with the Opposition Involved or Revolutionary	
		One-Man Government?	533
		7.4.2 Impeachment and Accountability	535
		7.4.3 Particular Governmental Structures	538
		7.4.4 Regional and Local Government	541

xvi Contents

	7.5	Aceh: Regional Authority and National Presence through	
		the Governor	543
		7.5.1 Broad Powers of the Governor	543
		7.5.2 Link to National Government	545
		7.5.3 Complicated Impeachment and Weak Forms	
		of Accountability	547
		7.5.4 The Upward Connection of Governmental Departments	549
	7.6	Puerto Rico: The Model of the National Executive Duplicated	551
		7.6.1 Executive Powers Detailed in the Constitution	551
		7.6.2 Impeachment in Its Original Form	552
		7.6.3 General and Special Inter-governmental Contacts	553
	7.7	Hong Kong: National Interest in the Executive	
		7.7.1 Little Horizontal Accountability	554
		7.7.2 Impeachment in the Hands of the National Government	557
		7.7.3 The Chief Executive as the Focal Point in the Executive	
		Council	559
		7.7.4 Hierarchically Led Administrative Structures	561
		7.7.5 Reciprocal Administrative Presence of the Central	
		Government and the HKSAR	564
	7.8	Reflections	
8	Int	ernational Relations	575
	8.1	From Exclusion to Inclusion	575
	8.2	Puerto Rico: No Involvement in Foreign Powers	577
		Zanzibar: Clearly a Union Matter	579
		Aceh: Low-Level Activity Permitted	583
	8.5	Scotland: Some Involvement	585
	8.6	The Åland Islands: Involvement with Some Problems	590
		8.6.1 Conclusion and Implementation of Treaties	590
		8.6.2 The Åland Islands in the European Union	593
		8.6.3 Breaches of EU Law	599
		8.6.4 Pecuniary Liability for Breaches of Treaty Law	603
		8.6.5 Bringing in Autonomous Territories in Nordic Cooperation .	606
	8.7	Hong Kong: Competence Granted	611
		8.7.1 Broad Competence in International Relations	611
		8.7.2 Distribution of Powers in the Conclusion	
		and Implementation of Treaties	613
		8.7.3 Relations with States, Inter-governmental Organizations	
		and Non-governmental Organizations	615
	8.8	Reflections	618
9	Coi	ncluding Remarks	623
		Confirming the Definition of Territorial Autonomy	623
		Applying the Elements of Autonomy	626
		11.	

9.3 Conflict-Resolution and Self-Determination	534			
9.4 Various Autonomy Positions	536			
9.5 Specific Reflections Concerning the Sub-state Entities	639			
9.5.1 Particular Issues in Particular Places	639			
9.5.2 Zanzibar 6	640			
9.5.3 The Åland Islands	643			
9.5.4 Hong Kong 6	647			
9.5.5 Scotland 6	649			
9.5.6 Puerto Rico 6	652			
9.5.7 Aceh 6	654			
9.6 General Trends of Sub-state Organization	556			
Appendix 6	561			
References 66				
Index 6	577			

List of Abbreviations

AMM Aceh Monitoring Mission AMS Additional Member System

APBA Aceh income and expenditure budget

APBK Income and expenditure budget of a Kapubaten (district) in Aceh

APEC Asia-Pacific Economic Community
ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ASP Afro-Shirazi Party

CALRE Conférence des assemblées legislatives régionales

CCM Chama Cha Mapinduzi

CCPR Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

CE Chief Executive of Hong Kong

CEDAW Covenant on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women

CFA Court of Final Appeal of Hong Kong

CMI Crisis Management Initiative
CPG Central People's Government
CSIF Constituent States in Federations

CUF Civil United Front

DPD Regional Representative Council of Indonesia
DPP Director of Public Prosecution of Zanzibar
DPR House of Representatives of Indonesia
DPRA House of Representatives of Aceh

DPRD Representative bodies of lower administrative levels in Aceh DPRK House of representatives of *Kapubaten* (district) in Aceh

EAEC European Atomic Energy Community

EC European Community

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice

ECSC European Coal and Steel Community

ECT European Community Treaty
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

xx List of Abbreviations

EEA European Economic Area EEZ Exclusive Economic Zone

EU European Union

ExCo Executive Council of Hong Kong FC Functional Constituency in Hong Kong

FPTP First-Past-The-Post Election GAM Gerakan Acheh Merdeka

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GDP Gross Domestic Product

HDu Opinion of the Supreme Court of Finland HKSAR Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

ICJ International Court of Justice
IMO International Maritime Organisation
IOM International Organization for Migration
JKU Economic development force of Zanzibar

JMC Joint Ministerial Committee KIP Aceh election committee

KMKM Special force for the prevention of smuggling in Zanzibar

KPU National Elections Commission of Indonesia

LCM Legislative Consent Motion LegCo Legislative Council of Hong Kong

LoGA Law on the Governing of Aceh
MEP Member of European Parliament
MMP Mixed Majority-Proportional Election
MoU Memorandum of Understanding

MP Member of Parliament

MPR People's Consultative Assembly in Indonesia

MPU Clerics' Deliberation Council
 MSP Member of Scottish Parliament
 NAD Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam
 NGO Non-Governmental Organization
 NPC National People's Congress of China

NPCSC Standing Committee of the National People's Congress of China

NPP New Progressive Party

OIC Organisation of Islamic Conference

PA Partai Aceh

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

PDP Popular Democratic Party

PIP Puerto Rican Independence Party
PRC People's Republic of China

RGZ Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar SAC Supreme Administrative Court of Finland

SAR Special Administrative Region

SMZ Serikali ya Mapinduzi Zanzibar (Revolutionary Government of Zanzibar)

List of Abbreviations xxi

SNP Scottish National Party
SNTV Single Non-Transferable Vote
SoÅ Statutes of the Åland Islands

SoF Statutes of Finland STV Single Transferable Vote

TANU Tanganyika African National Union

TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UK United Kingdom UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

USA United States of America

VAT Value Added Tax

WTO World Trade Organization
ZEC Zanzibar Electoral Commission
ZNP Zanzibar Nationalist Party

ZPPP Zanzibar and Pemba People's Party

List of Figures

Fig. 1.1	Various autonomy positions I	15
Fig. 3.1	Institutional and material dimensions of sub-state arrangements .	131
Fig. 3.2	Four models of sub-state organization	131
Fig. 9.1	Two dimensions of sub-state organization	625
Fig. 9.2	Various autonomy positions II	638

List of Tables

Table 2.1	Political support of Memel-oriented parties	62
Table 2.2	Distribution of political support in Memel city council	63
Table 5.1	The principal conceptual relationship between the national	
	legal order and the legal order of the sub-state entity	392
Table 6.1	Elections to the Legislative Assembly of the Åland Islands	
	between 1983 and 2007	399
Table 6.2	Election results for elections of Governor of 2006 in Aceh	421
Table 6.3	Seats in the Scottish Parliament and electoral support	
	in 2007 of Scottish parties by constituency and list seats	441
Table 6.4	Total seats in the Scottish Parliament and electoral support	
	in 2007 of Scottish parties	441
Table 6.5	Seats and support in general elections to UK Parliament	
	in Scotland 1992–2010	444
Table 6.6	Elections to the European Parliament in Scotland	445
Table 6.7	Support differences between the PDP and the NPP between	
	1968 and 2008	454
Table 6.8	Elections of Governor in Puerto Rico between 1968	
	and 2008	455
Table 6.9	Elections of Resident Commissioner in Puerto Rico	
	between 1980 and 2008	456
Table 6.10	Referendums in Puerto Rico since 1951	458
Table 6.11	Elections to the House of Representatives between	
	1995 and 2010 by seats allocated to the two parties	
	in the elections	470
Table 6.12	Presidential elections in Zanzibar between 1995 and 2010	
	by party of the contestant in per cent	474
Table 6.13	Elections to the Legislative Council of Hong Kong	
	1997–2009	483

List of Cases and Other Interpretations

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Katangese Peoples' Congress v. Zaire, African Comm. Hum. & Peoples' Rights, Comm. No. 75/92 (not dated), pp. 29–30.

Kevin Mgwanga Gunme et al. v. Cameroon, African Comm. Hum. & Peoples' Rights, Comm. No. 266/03, p. 30.

Court of Appeal of Tanzania

Haji v Nungu and Another, Court of Appeal of Tanzania, [1987] LRC (Const) of 27 September 1986, pp. 206, 346, 349.

Seif Sharif Hamad v. S.M.Z., Court of Appeal of Tanzania, [1998] T.L.R. of 24 February 1993, pp. 194, 205, 208, 349, 351, 643.

S.M.Z. v. Machano Khamis Ali & 17 Others, Court of Appeal of Tanzania at Zanzibar, Criminal Application No. 8 of 2000 on 3 April 2000, pp. 192, 199, 202, 212, 347, 348, 351, 579, 642, 643, 673.

Court of Final Appeal of Hong Kong

Ng Ka Ling and Others v Director of Immigration (1999) 2 HKCFAR 4, p. 231. Ng Ka Ling & Others v Director of Immigration (No 2) [1999] 1 HKLRD 577, pp. 232, 291.

Hong Kong Special Administrative Region v Ng Kung Siu (1999) 2 HKCFAR 442, pp. 230, 231, 287.

Director of Immigration v Chong Fung Yuen [2001] 2 HKLRD 533, pp. 291, 292. Gurung Kesh Bahadur v Director of Immigration [2002] 2 HKLRD 775, pp. 230, 231.

Shum Kwok Sher v HKSAR [2002] 2 HKLRD 793, p. 564.

A Solicitor v Law Society of Hong Kong (SJ, intervening) [2004] 1 HKLRD 214, p. 231.

Leung Kwok Hung & Others v HKSAR [2005] 3 HKLRD 164, pp. 230, 231. C v Director of Immigration, [2008] HKCU 256, p. 614.

Kong Yunming v The Director of Social Welfare [2009] 4 HKLRD 382, p. 231.

European Court of Justice

Case C-42/02 *Diana Elisabeth Lindman*, Judgment (Fifth Chamber) of 13 November 2003 (preliminary ruling referred by the Administrative Court of the Åland Islands), p. 600.

C-88/03 Portuguese Republic v Commission of the European Communities, European Court of Justice (Grand Chamber), Judgment of 6 September 2006, pp. 4, 10.

C-292/03 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Fourth Chamber) of 8 July 2004 (the so-called *End-of-life vehicles* case), p. 600.

C-344/03 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Second Chamber) of 15 December 2005 (the so-called *Spring hunting* decision), pp. 599, 600.

C-327/04 *Commission of the European Communities* v *Republic of Finland*, Judgment (Fifth Chamber) of 24 February 2005 (the so-called *Equal treatment* case), p. 599.

C-107/05 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Fifth Chamber) of 12 January 2006 (the so-called *Greenhouse gases* case), p. 599.

C-343/05 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Fourth Chamber) of 18 May 2006 (the so-called *Oral tobacco* case), pp. 599, 601–602.

C-152/06 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Fourth Chamber) of 26 October 2006 (the so-called *Hazardous electrical equipment* case), p. 599.

C-154/06 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Fourth Chamber) of 26 October 2006 (the so-called *Waste electrical equipment* case), p. 599.

C-159/06 Commission of the European Communities v Republic of Finland, Judgment (Sixth Chamber) of 26 October 2006 (the so-called Assessment of environmental effects case), p. 599.

C-428/06 to C-434/06 (joined cases), *Unión General de Trabajadores de La Rioja (UGT-Rioja) and Others* v *Juntas Generales del Territorio Histórico de Vizcaya and Others*, European Court of Justice, (Third Chamber), Judgment of 11 September 2008, pp. 4, 10.

C-428/07 Mark Horvath v Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, Judgment of the European Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) of 16 July 2009 (preliminary ruling), p. 10.

European Court of Human Rights

Belgian Linguistics (case "Relating to Certain Aspects of the Laws on the Use of Languages in Education in Belgium" v. Belgium (merits), application no 1474/62; 1677/62; 1691/62; 1769/63; 1994/63; 2126/64, Judgment of 23 July 1968, Ser. A, No. 6, pp. 153, 519.

Mathieu-Mohin and Clerfayt v. Belgium, Judgment of 2 March 1987, Publications of the European Court of Human Rights, Series A, No. 113, p. 16.

Féderacion Nacionalista Canaria v. Spain, Decision of 7 June 2001, Reports of Judgments and Decisions 1999-VI, p. 16

Santoro v. Italy, Judgment of 1 July 2004, Application No. 36681/96, p. 16 Py v. France, ECtHR, Judgment of 11 January 2005, p. 397 Ekholm v. Finland, Judgment of 24 July 2007, p. 605

European Commission of Human Rights

Timke v. Germany, Decision of 11 September 1985, 82 DR 158, p. 16

High Court of Justiciary

Logan and Other v. Procurator Fiscal, [2008] HCJAC 61, pp. 331, 332.

High Court of Zanzibar

S.M.Z. v. Machano Khamis Ali & 17 Others (High Court of Zanzibar, Session Case No. 17 of 1999), pp. 348, 349, 642.

Seif Sharif Hamad v. S.M.Z., 28 August 1992, criminal sessions case No. 1 of 1991, pp. 194, 205.

International Court of Justice

Accordance with International Law of the Unilateral Declaration of Independence in respect of Kosovo, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J., 22 July 2010, p. 4 Western Sahara, Advisory Opinion, I.C.J. Reports 1975, p. 275